Comments on IEEE P802.19.3a PAR & CSD

From IEEE 802.1
These comments are on the PAR and CSD found in:

PAR

4.3 *Projected Completion Date for Submittal to RevCom*

• No date is provided.
  • Provide one.
5.2.b Scope of the project

• Editorial: The first sentence needlessly uses “address” twice.
  • Delete the second occurrence.

• The second sentence and subsequent sentences in the rest of the PAR use “project” (in 5.2.b, and 5.5), and the future tense (in 5.2.b, 5.4, 5.5, and 8.1).
  • Change “project” to “amendment” and, except perhaps in the third sentence of 5.5, use the present tense in the listed sections of the PAR.

• The last sentence uses “revision”; however, IEEE Std 802.19.3-2021 was not a revision.
  • Change “revision” to “edition”.
5.5 Need for the project

- Editorial: The last sentence of the second paragraph needlessly uses “with each other” following “coexist” and uses “is critical” for two subjects.
  - Delete “with each other”, and change “is” to “are”.

- The second sentence of the third paragraph uses “incorporating”, which may be interpreted as supporting content duplication.
  - Change “incorporating” to “based on”.

- Editorial: The last sentence of the third paragraph uses “recompenses”.
  - Change “recompenses” to “recommendations”.

- The last sentence of the fourth paragraph uses “users of this standard”.
  - Change “users of this standard” to “users of this recommended practice”.

- Editorials: The last paragraph uses “referenced standards”, which could be clearer.
  - Insert “(the referenced standards)” after “IEEE Std 802.15.4 and IEEE Std 802.11ah-2016”.

PAR
8.1 Additional Explanatory Notes

• 5.2 does not indicate that the recommended practice will cite IEEE Std 802.11-2020 and IEEE Std 802.15.4-2020.
  • Change “As indicated in 5.2, the” to “#5.2.b: The”

• Editorial: The titles of IEEE Std 802.11-2020 and IEEE Std 802.15.4-2020 are not provided.
  • Provide their titles.
CSD

1.1.2 Coexistence

- Editorial: “the referenced standards” could be clearer.
  - Change to “IEEE Std 802.11-2020 and IEEE Std 802.15.4-2020 (the referenced standards)”.

1.2.1 Broad market potential

  - Change to “IEEE Std 802.11-2020”.

1.2.2 Compatibility

- Recheck 1.2.2.b
CSD

1.2.4a *Demonstrated system feasibility*
   - Editorial: The third sentence uses “standard”.
     - Change to “Recommended Practice”.

1.2.5.a *Known cost factors.*
   - Editorial: The first sentence inconsistently uses “subject”.
     - Change to “referenced”.

1.2.5.d *Consideration of operational costs (e.g., energy consumption).*
   - Editorial: The sentence uses “operating”.
     - Change to “operational”.