

Comments on P802.15 PAR & CSD

From 802.1

DRAFT

PAR

1.1 Project Number:

- The project number can't be the same as the standard.
- Suggest using a suffix to denote the project number (e.g. P802.15.4ac)

DRAFT

PAR

5.2.b Scope of the project:

- “This amendment specifies modifications to the IEEE Std 802.15.4 medium access control (MAC) specification to specify new mechanisms that address and improve user privacy.”
- Is this too broad and not specific enough??

PAR

8.1 Additional Explanatory Notes:

- The sentence “This is similar activity that is ongoing in other IEEE standards, like IEEE Std 802.11 for privacy addresses.” is not a complete sentence. Suggest rewording as follows, “The scope and need for this amendment is similar to other IEEE standards, such as IEEE Std 802.11bi and IEEE Std 802.11bh.”
- The project should do more than “try to learn”. Suggest deleting the last sentence.

CSD

Title

- “IEEE Standard for Enhanced Privacy for IEEE Std 802.15.4-2020”
- Is this a proper title? Shouldn't it be something like
- IEEE Standard for Low-Rate Wireless Networks Amendment: Enhanced Privacy

CSD

1.1.1 Managed objects

- Based on the current response, the proper response to this area would be item c) and an appropriate explanation for why no managed objects are needed must be provided. How will the functionality be managed?
- Change the response to item c) and provide an explanation.

DRAFT

CSD

1.1.2 Coexistence

- If no CA document will be created, then an explanation is required.
- Provide an explanation why the CA document is not applicable.

DRAFT

CSD

1.2.2 Compatibility

- a) Will the proposed standard comply with IEEE Std 802, IEEE Std 802.1AC and IEEE Std 802.1Q? **No. While the amendment shall comply with IEEE Std 802, it cannot comply with IEEE Std 802.1Q and IEEE Std 802.1AC because IEEE Std 802.15.4 uses 64-bit MAC addresses.**
- IEEE 802.1 believes there are additional issues with compatibility that are not listed. In particular:
 - 802.15.4 has a restricted MTU size which makes bridging to other IEEE 802 media impossible without suitable fragmentation/reassembly support
 - The use of other Addressing Modes beyond the extended address (64-bit) are also incompatible with IEEE Std 802.1Q and IEEE Std 802.1AC
- Provide a complete list of all aspects of IEEE Std 802.15.4 that do not comply with IEEE Std 802.1Q and IEEE Std 802.1AC