

# P802.1ASdm/D1.0 Editor's Report

## Proposed Comment Resolution for WG Ballot

### Version 2

**Geoffrey M. Garner**  
**Analog Devices, Inc. (Consultant)**

**[gmgarner@alum.mit.edu](mailto:gmgarner@alum.mit.edu)**

*IEEE 802.1 TSN TG*  
2023.03.13

# Ballot Statistics - 1

---

☐ Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Yes (voters)	21	61.76
No (voters)	13	38.24
Voting Yes or No	34	100
Abstain Time	2	
Abstain Expertise	11	
Abstain Total	13	27.66
Respondents (who are voting members)	47	64.38
Voting Members	73	100
Non-voting member commenters	0	

Ballot statistics to be updated

# Ballot Statistics

---

☐ Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Number of Commenters	17	36.17 (percentage of voters responding)
Number of Comments	145	100.00
TR	71	48.97
T	9	6.21
ER	31	21.38
E	34	23.45

# Comments by Category - 1

---

- In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses; they will be discussed together
- Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (36 comments)
  - All the following comments will be accepted or accepted in principle, and will not be discussed unless someone indicates a desire to discuss them (they will be left in proposed mode for an adequate time period for participants to review them)
    - 4, 130, 5, (49, 102, 151), 60, 26, 7, 56, (104, 153) 105, (73, 89), (107, 159) 109, 110, 40, 31, 93, 113, (94, 142, 160), 95, 82, (98, 99), 145, 138, (146, 147, 148, 149)
- The comments on the following pages will be discussed (117 comments)
  - Note that some of the ones marked E or ER are nontrivial and must be discussed in detail (even though they are marked E or ER)
  - Note that the listed topics are not necessarily full descriptions of the comments; they are mainly to aid the editor in the comment resolution

# Comments by Category - 2

---

□ Comments to be discussed (124 comments; grouped comments are shown in parentheses):

- PAR Revision: 9, 43, 141
- Inclusion of 802.1ASdr: 3, 144, (58, 59)
- Use of the term “Explicit”: 11, 41
- Referencing IEEE 1588 and ITU-T G.781.1: (47, 48), (6, 45, 46, 101, 121)
- Use of the term “default” and BMCA requirements: 10, 50, 52, 71, 143
- Support of Signaling messages: 69, 70, 88
- SyncIntervalSetting state machine optional: 53, 61
- Domain 0 optional: 72, 75, 103
- Figure 7-3: (62, 64, 65, 66)
- NOTES in figures: 51, 55, 57, 63, 67, 68
- Sending Announce immediately after PTP Port state change or receipt of Announce, in external port configuration: 42
- Ranges for timeouts: 36, 126
- Use of PTP Instance states when hot standby is not implemented: 1, 77, 78, 79, 92, 108, 112

# Comments by Category - 3

---

## □ Comments to be discussed (Cont.):

- HotStandbySystemLogSyncTimeThreshold1 and 2: 96, 97
- Subclause 17.1: 131, 132, 22, 133, 134, 135, 23, 32, 33, 90
- Subclause 17.2: (136, 139), (24, 25), 137, 83, 91, 116, 117, 140
- Description needed for why hot standby is an improvement over BMCA with respect to flapping: 13
- Timeframe for supplying YANG module: 38
- “Timing” versus “Timing information”: 154
- Miscellaneous: 128, 129, (54, 27, 128), (14, 15), 28, 29, (18, 16, 21, 17, 20, 19), (8, 156), (106, 155, 157) 74, 76, 80, 30, 37, 81, (35, 127), 12, 111, (44, 150) 39, 114, 115, 118, 34, 119, 100, 120, 125, 123, 87, 124, 86, 84, 85, 122, 152, 158