

P802.1Qdy

YANG Data Models for the Multiple Spanning Tree Protocol

Resolution of Comments on
Project Authorization Request (PAR) and Criteria for Standards Development (CSD)

2023-07-12

802.3 comments on the PAR and CSD and their resolution

- PAR
 - No comments.
- CSD
 - Comment:
 - 1.2.1 – The first use of MSTP is not accompanied by an unexpanded name next to the acronym – “Multiple Spanning Tree Protocol (MSTP) ...”.
 - Optionally, add “(MSTP)” to title on PAR and CSD (this might produce better search results)..
 - Response:
 - Resolve the acronym at fist occurrence.

802.11 comments on the PAR and their resolution

- Comment:
5.2b suggest remove “Additionally, this amendment addresses errors or omissions in existing functionality” as this technically opens the entire project to anything.
- Response:
Remove the sentence as this project is not intended to address errors or omissions.
- Comment:
5.2b “This amendment specifies YANG that allows configuration a...” is this a YANG module or YANG model or both. This sentence should reflect the proper representation. We think you mean a YANG module. “ A YANG module defines a data model through its data, and the hierarchical organization of and constraints on that data.”
- Response:
Replace “This amendment specifies YANG” with “This amendment specifies YANG modules”. Furthermore, replace “The YANG Data Model ” with “The YANG modules ” in 6.1.2.

802.11 comments on the PAR and their resolution – cont'd

- Comment:
5.2b suggested edit “YANG capabilities” – “YANG module capabilities” ?
- Response:
Replace “YANG capabilities” with “capabilities of the YANG modules ”
- Comment:
5.2b suggested edit: change “allows” to “enable”
- Response:
Make the suggested change.
- Comment:
5.5 Suggest using MSTP for “Multiple Spanning Tree Protocol ‘ which is already defined in the PAR.
- Response:
Make the suggested change.

802.11 comments on the CSD and their resolution

- Comment:
In the title: “YANG for the Multiple Spanning Tree Protocol” add “(MSTP)”
- Response:
We prefer to avoid acronyms in the title of a standard. The title of the PAR and the CSD should match the standard. Therefore, we prefer to keep the title as is. Please note that a change similar to the suggested one is made in the body of the CSD: the MSTP acronym is introduced at first occurrence as per a comment from the 802.3 WG.
- Comment:
1.2.4 Suggest change “YANG data models” to “YANG data modules”
- Response:
This text is about YANG in general, not about the MSTP YANG module to be developed by the proposed project. Therefore, “YANG data models” is more appropriate in 1.2.4.

802.15 comments on the PAR and CSD and their resolution

- No comments