

Support material on dispositions for draft 1.3

Marco Hernandez, CWC Univ. of Oulu, Finland

Maintenance Technical Committee

July 15th, 2026, revision 0

Introduction

- First of, an apology for the delay. Things changed for me, so I had to postpone this project.
- The dispositions of comments on Draft D1.3 were done several months ago.
 - At that time, it was not clear the final state (text) for the primitives required for 802.1ACea.
 - That was reflected in D1.3, some clauses were referred to as X, because it was not clear/known the final clause number and text in the 15.6ma draft.
- Meanwhile, 802.15.6ma got approval from RevCom for publication in April 2026.
 - This fact changed the drafting of D1.4, because the precise references and text in 802.15.6-2026 were clear now.
 - Also, Jessy suggested to use the draft of 802.1AC-revision. Hence, I used the reference IEEE Std 802.1AC-2026 as this is standard will be published soon (before ACea), and clause 12 for ACea (it was 13 before).
- As you can imagine, some dispositions for D1.3 were not implemented as is, on the light of the new information mentioned above.
- I am pleading to 802.1 WG to take D1.4 as the base for further discussions.

Comment 13

CI 13	SC 13.8	P15	L 10	# 13
Rouyer, Jessy		Nokia		
Comment Type	TR	Comment Status A		
"The convergence function of IEEE Std 802.15.6 is defined in clause X. The convergence function" is confusing and incomplete, compared to how other 802.1AC convergence functions are specified.				
SuggestedRemedy				
Change "The convergence function of IEEE Std 802.15.6 is defined in clause X. The convergence function" to "The wireless Body Area Network (BAN) MAC access methods are specified in IEEE Std 802.15.6-2025. In that standard, Clause 6 specifies the MAC Service interface and reference model, Clause 7 specifies the MAC frame structure, and Clause 8 specifies the MAC transmission and reception procedures. The wireless BAN convergence function".				
Response	Response Status C			
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.				
The sentence in 13.8 aims to provide general information about MAC information relevant to 802.1AC, as stated in the different use cases in Clause 13. For a better understanding, change "The convergence function of IEEE Std 802.15.6 is defined in clause X." to a new 13.8.1 General with the text: "Clause 6 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the High Repetition Pulse MAC service specification. Clause 6.1.1.2 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the user priorities. Clause 6.1.4 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the MAC service interface, clause 6.1.5 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the provision of the MAC service, and clause 6.2 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the MAC data service specification. "				

Text in D1.4

12.5 Wireless Body Area Network convergence function

12.5.1 General aspects

The wireless body area network MAC service is specified in IEEE Std 802.15.6™-2026, clause 6. Clause 6.1.1.2. defines the user priorities. Clause 6.1.4. defines the MAC service interface, clause 6.1.5. defines the provision of the MAC service, and clause 6.2. defines the MAC data service specification. MAC frames use Type 3 PIF (protocol identification) encoding.

The disposition is accept in principle. No need to repeat IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx for every clause. Clause 13.8.1 changed to 12.5.1 according to AC-revision.

Comment 14

CI 13	SC 13.8	P15	L11	# 14
Rouyer, Jessy		Nokia		
Comment Type	TR	Comment Status	A	
"UNITDATA service primitive" is unexpected when referring to Figure 13 page 68 of P802.15.6/D0.5. "provided" is inconsistent within 802.1AC.				
SuggestedRemedy				
Change "UNITDATA service primitive provided" to "MAC SAP offered".				
Response	Response Status C			
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.				
The sentence in 13.8 aims to provide general information about MAC information relevant to 802.1AC, as stated in the different use cases in Clause 13. For a better understanding, add clause 13.8.1 General with the text: "Clause 6 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx defines the High Repetition Pulse MAC service specification. Clause 6.1.1.2. defines the user priorities. Clause 6.1.4. defines the MAC service interface, clause 6.1.5. defines the provision of the MAC service, and clause 6.2. defines the MAC data service specification. "				

Text in D1.4

The wireless body area network MAC service is specified in IEEE Std 802.15.6™-2026, clause 6. Clause 6.1.1.2. defines the user priorities. Clause 6.1.4. defines the MAC service interface, clause 6.1.5. defines the provision of the MAC service, and clause 6.2. defines the MAC data service specification. MAC frames use Type 3 PIF (protocol identification) encoding.

The disposition was “accept in principle”. Hence, I slightly modified with the same meaning and add Type 3 PIF as in AC-revision.

Comment 20

CI 13	SC 13.8.1.1	P16	L1	# 20
Rouyer, Jessy		Nokia		
Comment Type	TR	Comment Status	A	
There is a "drop eligible" parameter in an IEEE Std 802.15.6 UNITDATA.request primitive. Are you sure this need not be mapped from the drop_eligible parameter of an M_UNITDATA.request primitive?				
SuggestedRemedy				
If needed, do not ignore this parameter, and consider merging it in 13.8.1.1 item a).				
Response	Response Status W			
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.				
Move "drop_eligible" to bullet "a)"				

“drop_eligible” is defined in 6.2 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-2026, but it was finally decided not to use it (at least for this revision). Hence it was move to the bullet c) to be ignored in ACea.

Text in D1.4

When an M_UNITDATA.request primitive is received, the IEEE Std 802.15.6™-2026 coordinator convergence function generates the corresponding IEEE Std 802.15.6™-2026 UNITDATA.request primitive as follows:

- a) The destination_address, source_address, and priority parameters are passed unaltered as the destination address, source address and priority, respectively
- b) The M_UNITDATA mac_service_data_unit parameter is transformed as specified in 12.1 and passed as the IEEE Std 802.15.6™-2026 UNITDATA data parameter.
- c) The ISS M_UNITDATA drop_eligible, frame_check_sequence, service_access_point_identifier, and connection_identifier parameters are ignored.
- d) The IEEE Std 802.15.6™-2026 UNITDATA routing information parameter is null.

Comment 22

CI 13	SC 13.8.1.2	P16	L11	# 22
Rouyer, Jessy		Nokia		
Comment Type	TR	Comment Status	A	
There is a "drop eligible" parameter in an IEEE Std 802.15.6 UNITDATA.request primitive. Are you sure this need not be mapped to the drop_eligible parameter of an M_UNITDATA.indication primitive?				
SuggestedRemedy				
If needed, pass this drop eligible parameter unaltered as the drop_eligible parameter, and consider merging it in 13.8.1.2 item a).				
Response	Response Status W			
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.				
Move "drop eligible" in line 11 to "a)" in line 6.				

Same as comment 20. This is one of issues of working on an unapproved draft standard.

Comment 25

Cl 13	SC 13.8	P11	L 10	# 25
KIESSLING, Marcel		Beckhoff Automation		
Comment Type		T	Comment Status	
			A	
This chapter includes the description of the convergence function - there is no clause X in 802.1ACea or Std 802.15.6-2012.				
SuggestedRemedy				
Change line 10 to read "The convergence function of IEEE Std. 802.15.6 offers an"				
Response		Response Status		
		C		
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.				
The sentence in 13.8 aims to provide general information about MAC information relevant to 802.1AC, as stated in the different use cases in Clause 13. For a better understanding, change "The convergence function of IEEE Std 802.15.6 is defined in clause X." to a new 13.8.1 General with the text: "Clause 6 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the High Repetition Pulse MAC service specification. Clause 6.1.1.2 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the user priorities. Clause 6.1.4 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the MAC service interface, clause 6.1.5 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the provision of the MAC service, and clause 6.2 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the MAC data service specification. "				

Same as in comment 13 (page 6).

Comment 26

CI 1	SC 1	P1	L1	# 26
KIESSLING, Marcel		Beckhoff Automation		
Comment Type T		Comment Status A		
Chapter 5.2 provides an overview of different mechanisms, but the Table has currently no entry to the 802.15.6 Media Type.				
SuggestedRemedy				
Add a Table entry in Table 5-1 chapter 5.2				
Response		Response Status C		
ACCEPT.				

This is already addressed in D1.4

D1.4

5. Conformance

Insert a new row in Table 5-1 MAC procedure and convergence conformance of clause 5.2 as follows:

5.2 Support of the ISS by different MAC procedures

Media type	Applicable standard	Convergence function
IEEE 802.15.6 Wireless Body Area Network	IEEE Std 802.15.6 TM -2026	12.5

Comment 28

CI 13	SC 13.8	P11	L10	# 28
Specht, Johannes		Self		
Comment Type	TR	Comment Status A		
The first sentence in 13.8, "The convergence function of IEEE Std 802.15.6 is defined in clause X." reads as if it refers to the enclosing clause "13.8 Wireless ... Convergence Function", so "X" would be "13.8" in this regard. But from the commenters view, this sentence can be entirely deleted.				
SuggestedRemedy				
Delete the first sentence in 13.8.				
Response		Response Status C		
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. The sentence in 13.8 aims to provide general information about MAC information relevant to 802.1AC, as stated in the different use cases in Clause 13. For a better understanding, change "The convergence function of IEEE Std 802.15.6 is defined in clause X." to a new 13.8.1 General with the text: "Clause 6 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the High Repetition Pulse MAC service specification. Clause 6.1.1.2 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the user priorities. Clause 6.1.4 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the MAC service interface, clause 6.1.5 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the provision of the MAC service, and clause 6.2 of IEEE Std 802.15.6-xxx specifies the MAC data service specification. "				

Same as in comment 13 (page 6).

Comment 30

CI 13	SC 13.8.1	P11	L17	# 30
Specht, Johannes		Self		
Comment Type	TR	Comment Status A		
Delete clause 13.8.1 (only the heading, not the contents) and change 13.8.1.1 and 13.8.1.2 to become 13.8.1 and 13.8.2, respectively.				
SuggestedRemedy				
Per comment.				
Response		Response Status C		
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.				
Remove heading " IEEE Std 802.15.6 parameters mapping"				
Change heading "Parameters mapping of Request primitives" to become a level 3 heading (i.e., 13.8.x)				
Change heading "Parameters mapping of Indication primitives" to become a level 3 heading (i.e., 13.8.x)				

This comment generated some friction.

The cause is because this comment does not have a rationale for justifying a change. It is not a comment, it is a command.