

# IEEE 802.1 Minutes, July 1998

## Opening Working Group Plenary, Monday, July 6, 1998

### Plenary Meeting Fees – Bill Lidinsky

You have to pay the fees!  
Students will get a special discount.

### Status of .1 Standards – Bill Lidinsky

802.1r PAR – GPRP – Approved for submission to NESCOM in September.  
802.1s PAR – Multiple Spanning Trees – Approved for submission to NESCOM in September.  
802.1t PAR - .1D Maintenance – Approved for submission to NESCOM in September.  
802.1u PAR - .1Q Maintenance - Approved for submission to NESCOM in December.

Currently REVCOM requires twenty copies of each would be standard. Bill is attempting to change this to a more realistic number. The Executive committee will discuss this some more.

### Executive Committee Report – Bill Lidinsky

Overview and Architecture can go for conditional approval for sponsor ballot.  
The viewers cost 32K the budget for them was 28K.  
15802-3, the new 10038, is being circulated for 2-month ballot at JTC-6. This is a yes – no ballot.  
SC6 Reorganization – Tony and Alan gave short overview of the reorganization of SC6.  
JTC-1, SC6 currently received \$100 of the 802 meeting fees. Bill has placed a motion before the executive committee to stop this.  
Why we need JTC-1 and SC6 – Jim Carlo. Jim defended the \$100 going to JTC-1 and SC6, saying having international bodies producing our standards makes them more acceptable in many parts of the world.  
A discussion about whether JTC-1 and SC6 publishing our standards occurred.  
The discussions ended with Bill asking that .1 have a position about this on Thursday.  
Revision to the operating rules:  
    Chair of hibernation committee can vote for 3 more meetings.  
    Book distribution rules changed to if name in book get book else no book.  
    Voting status clarified.  
Complaints about .14 voting procedures, block voting, were received by the executive. The problem may have been resolved.  
IEEE Standards staff budget is 800K short therefore the CDROM distribution is being stopped.  
There will be further discussions.  
Tonight's tutorial – Global Local Area Networks. This will be an agenda item for the technical plenary.  
802.5 PAR for Source Routing for .1Q will be voted on in November. We need to look at it to make sure it is okay.  
Meeting Locations – Hyatts only and meeting over the fourth of July. Bill will take a straw poll about meeting over the fourth of July.

### Ethertype field Acquisition – Mick Seaman

Replacement of the Ethertype for Bay will be completed by November.

### 802.1 Web Page – Sundar Subramaniam

PARs need to go on web.  
The .1 “management team” will meet to discuss what should be added to the web page.

### 802 Overview and Architecture – Alan Chambers

Text is done. A confirmation ballot and then a sponsor ballot has to be completed.



Comment 16 – Do it  
Comment 17 – Do it  
Comment 18 – Convert to a note  
Comment 19 – Do it  
Comment 20 – Reject, leave table 8-9 in the document  
Comment 21 – 8.14.3 Page 69, Line 24 – 26. Reworded sentence. Discussion about “shall not” versus “should not.” Phrase changed to “should not”  
Comment 22 – Rejected  
Comment 23 – Do it  
Comment 24 – Do it  
Comment 25 – BPDUs shall be transmitted untagged.  
<Discussion>  
Add a bullet in 8.14.7, Page 74 that a received tagged BPDU and GVRP frame are not forwarded or recognized.  
Comment 26 – Make a third bullet item.  
John Messenger – All comments were editorial  
Geoff Thompson – Comment 44 – Some discussion. Changed to “Mac Service Entities”  
Alijeza Ghazizahedi – Comment 47 – Rejected  
Comment 48 – Rejected

#### Multiple Spanning Trees – Norm Finn

Do we have a consensus on goals and terminology?

### **Working Group Session, Tuesday PM, July 7, 1998**

.1 meet with .3 for Link Aggregation, therefore no minutes for Tuesday afternoon.

### **Working Group Session, Wednesday AM, July 8, 1998**

#### Congestion Control – Fouad Tobagi

Professor Tobagi and two of his students presented their findings about Congestion Control. The presentation is in the docs98 directory on the ftp server. Filename:

[http://p8021.hep.net/go\\_wildcats/docs98/079802.pdf](http://p8021.hep.net/go_wildcats/docs98/079802.pdf)

#### Follow up on Monday night’s tutorial – Khaled Amer

There was a discussion about flow control and its uses and effectiveness.

To get on the flow control reflector contact Khaled Amer at [Khaladamer@usa.net](mailto:Khaladamer@usa.net) or phone 714-424-0147

### **Working Group Session, Wednesday PM, July 8, 1998**

.1 meet with .3 for Link Aggregation, therefore no minutes for Wednesday afternoon.

### **Working Group Session, Thursday AM, July 9, 1998**

#### Review of .1Q Ballot Disposition – Tony Jeffree

Pat Thaler accepted resolution to her comments.

Rich Seifert wants to see the changes before he agrees. Tony will work with Rich to make sure the document is ready and there will be no “no votes” before it is sent out for recirculation ballot.

#### Presentation to Mick Seaman – Jim Carlo

IEEE Medallion Award was presented to Mick for his work on 802 standards.

#### Multiple Spanning Trees – Norm Finn and Michael Smith

GMRP – GVRP effects.

Filename: [http://p8021.hep.net/go\\_wildcats/docs98/079801.pdf](http://p8021.hep.net/go_wildcats/docs98/079801.pdf)

Protocol Sensitive VLANs – David Delany

Filename: [http://p8021.hep.net/go\\_wildcats/docs98/079803.pdf](http://p8021.hep.net/go_wildcats/docs98/079803.pdf)

Next step is to draft a PAR and five criteria. These documents must be circulated by forty days before the next executive meeting.

**Closing Working Group Plenary, July 9, 1998**

Approve Minutes – Bill Lidinsky

Resolution: That the minutes from the March 802.1 Plenary be approved

Move: Tony Jeffree

Second: Norm Finn

YES: 17

NO: 0

ABSTAIN: 1

Poll for meeting over a July 4<sup>th</sup> – Bill Lidinsky

A plenary is schedule for over July 4<sup>th</sup>. Is this a problem? Consensus was it is a problem. Bill will pass this information on to the executive.

Voters List – Alan Chambers

IPF Funding – Bill Lidinsky

IEEE Standards have a 250K budget short fall.

What does it do for us? Consensus – Nothing.

We would have to do our own sponsor ballots if we did not use the IPF. The consensus was that it would probably be better if we did our own.

Bill will vote in the executive committee for cutting the IPF funding.

Naming Conventions – Bill Lidinsky

No more upper or lower cases in document titles.

Current PARs – Bill Lidinsky

The current PARs are r – GPRP, s – Multiple Spanning Tree, t - .1D Maintenance, u - .1Q maintenance. They will be approved at this evening's executive meeting.

Resolutions

Resolution: 802.1 instructs the editor for P802.1Q to revise the document in accordance with the resolution of sponsor ballot comments, as agreed at this meeting. The resultant text, P8021Q/D11, to be recirculated to the sponsor ballot pool for confirmation.

Move: Tony Jeffree

Second: Michael Wright

YES: Unanimous

NO:

ABSTAIN:

Resolution: 802.1 requests approval from the executive committee of 802 to forward P802.1Q to REVCOM, conditional upon P802.1Q passing its recirculation ballot with no new negative votes. (Currently one outstanding negative from Rich Seifert; he has indicated that he expects to be able to change the vote to affirmative, but wishes to see the final text before making that decision.)

Move: Tony Jeffree  
Second: Michael Wright

YES: 21                      NO: 0                      ABSTAIN: 0

Resolution: 802.1 instructs David Delany to develop a proposed PAR and five criteria for protocol sensitive VLAN classification in P802.1Q. The draft PAR and five criteria will be circulated on the exploder for comment and amendments prior to Bill Lidinsky circulating them to the 802.0 for approval at the November executive committee meeting.

Move: David Delany  
Second: Andrew Smith

YES: Unanimous                      NO:                      ABSTAIN:

Resolution: 802.1 requests that the 802 Executive take the necessary procedural steps to allow sponsor ballots to be conducted by Project 802, rather than by the IEEE balloting service, if it so desires.

Move: Tony Jeffree  
Second: Michael Wright

YES: 20                      NO: 0                      ABSTAIN: 1

Resolution: P802.1 instructs the editor for P802, Overview and Architecture, to prepare a revised version of the draft in accordance with the 3/98 ballot resolution and to circulate it for 802.1 confirmation ballot.

Move: Alan Chambers  
Second: Tony Jeffree

YES: Unanimous                      NO:                      ABSTAIN:

Resolution: P802.1 requests approval from the 802 SEC to forward P802, Overview and Architecture, for sponsor ballot, conditional upon passing its working group recirculation ballot with no negative votes.

Move: Alan Chambers  
Second: Tony Jeffree

YES: 19                      NO:                      ABSTAIN:

Resolution: 802.1 instructs Alan Chambers, the editor for P802.1s, to incorporate his view of the consensus, justifications, and open issues with regard to multiple spanning trees in 802.1Q, as expressed at the July 1998 802.1 meeting, into a draft 802.1s document.

Move: Norm Finn  
Second: Steve Adams

YES: Unanimous                      NO:                      ABSTAIN:

Resolution: 802.1 resolves to hold an interim meeting on Monday August 31, 1998 (afternoon only), co-located with the 802.3 interim meeting.

802.1 also resolves to hold a pre-meeting on the Monday morning of the November Plenary.

Move: Tony Jeffree  
Second: Norm Finn

YES: 18                      NO:                      ABSTAIN: 1

Global Local Area Networks – Bill Lidinsky

The Global LAN (G-LAN) stuff got moved off to .1. It is fuzzy and Bill doesn't know what to do with it.

Discussion of "Does 802 need to work on flow control and where should such work reside in 802?"

Does someone want to make a motion to sponsor this work? Answer: No

ISO documentation of Ethertypes – Tony Jeffree

The issue of documenting the Ethertypes has been raised in ISO. They do not have the text, therefore Tony has become the editor to create the text.

Motion to Adjourn – Bill Lidinsky

Resolution: That the meeting be adjourned.

Move: Michael Wright  
Second: David Delany

YES: Unanimous                      NO:                      ABSTAIN: