IEEE 802.1 Minutes, July 1998

Opening Working Group Plenary, Monday, July 6, 1998

Plenary Meeting Fees – Bill Lidinsky
You have to pay the fees!
Students will get a special discount.

Status of .1 Standards – Bill Lidinsky
802.1r PAR – GPRP – Approved for submission to NESCOM in September.
802.1s PAR – Multiple Spanning Trees – Approved for submission to NESCOM in September.
802.1t PAR - .1D Maintenance – Approved for submission to NESCOM in September.
802.1u PAR - .1Q Maintenance - Approved for submission to NESCOM in December.

Currently REVCOM requires twenty copies of each would be standard. Bill is attempting to change this to a more realistic number. The Executive committee will discuss this some more.

Executive Committee Report – Bill Lidinsky
Overview and Architecture can go for conditional approval for sponsor ballot.
The viewers cost 32K the budget for them was 28K.
15802-3, the new 10038, is being circulated for 2-month ballot at JTC-6. This is a yes – no ballot.
JTC-1, SC6 currently received $100 of the 802 meeting fees. Bill has placed a motion before the executive committee to stop this.
Why we need JTC-1 and SC6 – Jim Carlo. Jim defended the $100 going to JTC-1 and SC6, saying having international bodies producing our standards makes them more acceptable in many parts of the world.
A discussion about whether JTC-1 and SC6 publishing our standards occurred.
The discussions ended with Bill asking that .1 have a position about this on Thursday.
Revision to the operating rules:
Chair of hibernation committee can vote for 3 more meetings.
Voting status clarified.

Complaints about .14 voting procedures, block voting, where received by the executive. The problem may have been resolved.
IEEE Standards staff budget is 800K short therefore the CDROM distribution is being stopped. There will be further discussions.
Tonight’s tutorial – Global Local Area Networks. This will be an agenda item for the technical plenary.
802.5 PAR for Source Routing for .1Q will be voted on in November. We need to look at it to make sure it is okay.
Meeting Locations – Hyatts only and meeting over the fourth of July. Bill will take a straw poll about meeting over the fourth of July.

Ethertype field Acquisition – Mick Seaman
Replacement of the Ethertype for Bay will be completed by November.

802.1 Web Page – Sundar Subramaniam
PARs need to go on web.
The .1 “management team” will meet to discuss what should be added to the web page.

802 Overview and Architecture – Alan Chambers
Text is done. A confirmation ballot and then a sponsor ballot has to be completed.
Agenda for the Week – Mick Seaman

Tuesday AM
.1Q Ballot Resolution and Multiple Spanning Trees
11AM - .3 Priority based flow

Tuesday PM
Meet with .3 for Link Aggregation

Wednesday AM
8:30 AM Technical Plenary
10:30 AM meet with .3 for Link Aggregation

Wednesday PM
Meet with .3 for Link Aggregation

Thursday AM
.1Q Ballots
Multiple Spanning Tree
Protocol Sensitive VLANs

Working Group Session, Tuesday AM, July 7, 1998

Technical Plenary Meeting – Bill Lidinsky
Based on the response about last nights tutorials Bill wants a motion to cancel the Technical Plenary.

Resolution: That the Technical Plenary be canceled.

Move: Norm Finn
Second: Mick Seaman

YES: 16 NO: 1 ABSTAIN: 4

Resolution: To adjourn the meeting

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Alan Chambers

YES: Unanimous NO: ABSTAIN:

.1Q Sponsor Ballot Resolution – Tony Jeffree

Pat Thaler – Comment 1 – Make the change
Rich Seifert – Comment 2 – Do it
Comment 3 – Do it
Comment 4 – Do it
Comment 5 – Modify section 8.6 to reflect the comment.
Comment 6 – Do it
Comment 7 – Discussion of what to do with VLAN Id 0xffff. What is default? The discussion ended with the position that 0xffff should not be transmitted. A note will be added to 8.6 with a reference to table 9-2.
Comment 8 – Do it
Comment 9 – Do it
Comment 10 – Remove figure 8.2
Comment 11 – Do it – Make sure E-ISS and ISS references are consistent
Comment 12 – Do it
Comment 13 – Add forward reference to 8.14.7
Comment 14 – Do it
Comment 15 – Add reference
Comment 16 – Do it
Comment 17 – Do it
Comment 18 – Convert to a note
Comment 19 – Do it
Comment 20 – Reject, leave table 8-9 in the document
Comment 22 – Rejected
Comment 23 – Do it
Comment 24 – Do it
Comment 25 – BPDUs shall be transmitted untagged.
  "Discussion"
  Add a bullet in 8.14.7, Page 74 that a received tagged BPDU and GVRP frame are not forwarded or recognized.

Comment 26 – Make a third bullet item.

John Messenger – All comments were editorial
Geoff Thompson – Comment 44 – Some discussion. Changed to “Mac Service Entities”
Alijeza Ghazizahedi – Comment 47 – Rejected
Comment 48 – Rejected

Multiple Spanning Trees – Norm Finn
  Do we have a consensus on goals and terminology?

Working Group Session, Tuesday PM, July 7, 1998
  1 meet with .3 for Link Aggregation, therefore no minutes for Tuesday afternoon.

Working Group Session, Wednesday AM, July 8, 1998

Congestion Control – Fouad Tobagi
  Professor Tobagi and two of his students presented they findings about Congestion Control. The presentation is in the docs98 directory on the ftp server. Filename: http://p8021.hep.net/go_wildcats/docs98/079802.pdf

Follow up on Monday night’s tutorial – Khaled Amer
  There was a discussion about flow control and its uses and effectiveness.
  To get on the flow control reflector contact Khaled Amer at Khaladamer@usa.net or phone 714-424-0147

Working Group Session, Wednesday PM, July 8, 1998
  1 meet with .3 for Link Aggregation, therefore no minutes for Wednesday afternoon.

Working Group Session, Thursday AM, July 9, 1998

Review of .1Q Ballot Disposition – Tony Jeffree
  Pat Thaler accepted resolution to her comments.
  Rich Seifert wants to see the changes before he agrees. Tony will work with Rich to make sure the document is ready and there will be no “no votes” before it is sent our for recirculation ballot.

Presentation to Mick Seaman – Jim Carlo
  IEEE Medallion Award was presented to Mick for his work on 802 standards.

Multiple Spanning Trees – Norm Finn and Michael Smith
  GMRP – GVRP effects.
  Filename: http://p8021.hep.net/go_wildcats/docs98/079801.pdf
Next step is to draft a PAR and five criteria. These documents must be circulated by forty days before the next executive meeting.

**Closing Working Group Plenary, July 9, 1998**

**Approve Minutes – Bill Lidinsky**

Resolution: That the minutes from the March 802.1 Plenary be approved

Move: Tony Jeffree  
Second: Norm Finn

YES: 17  
NO: 0  
ABSTAIN: 1

**Poll for meeting over a July 4th – Bill Lidinsky**

A plenary is schedule for over July 4th. Is this a problem? Consensus was it is a problem. Bill will pass this information on to the executive.

**Voters List – Alan Chambers**

**IPF Funding – Bill Lidinsky**

IEEE Standards have a 250K budget short fall.  
What does it do for us? Consensus – Nothing.  
We would have to do our own sponsor ballots if we did not use the IPF. The consensus was that it would probably be better if we did our own.  
Bill will vote in the executive committee for cutting the IPF funding.

**Naming Conventions – Bill Lidinsky**

No more upper or lower cases in document titles.

**Current PARs – Bill Lidinsky**

The current PARs are r – GPRP, s – Multiple Spanning Tree, t - .1D Maintenance, u - .1Q maintenance. They will be approved at this evening’s executive meeting.

**Resolutions**

Resolution: 802.1 instructs the editor for P802.1Q to revise the document in accordance with the resolution of sponsor ballot comments, as agreed at this meeting. The resultant text, P8021Q/D11, to be recirculated to the sponsor ballot pool for confirmation.

Move: Tony Jeffree  
Second: Michael Wright

YES: Unanimous  
NO:  
ABSTAIN:

Resolution: 802.1 requests approval from the executive committee of 802 to forward P802.1Q to REVCOM, conditional upon P802.1Q passing its recirculation ballot with no new negative votes. (Currently one outstanding negative from Rich Seifert; he has indicated that he expects to be able to change the vote to affirmative, but wishes to see the final text before making that decision.)
Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Michael Wright

YES: 21          NO: 0          ABSTAIN: 0

Resolution: 802.1 instructs David Delany to develop a proposed PAR and five criteria for protocol sensitive VLAN classification in P802.1Q. The draft PAR and five criteria will be circulated on the exploder for comment and amendments prior to Bill Lidinsky circulating them to the 802.0 for approval at the November executive committee meeting.

Move: David Delany
Second: Andrew Smith

YES: Unanimous      NO:             ABSTAIN:

Resolution: 802.1 requests that the 802 Executive take the necessary procedural steps to allow sponsor ballots to be conducted by Project 802, rather than by the IEEE balloting service, if it so desires.

Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Michael Wright

YES: 20            NO: 0            ABSTAIN: 1

Resolution: P802.1 instructs the editor for P802, Overview and Architecture, to prepare a revised version of the draft in accordance with the 3/98 ballot resolution and to circulate it for 802.1 confirmation ballot.

Move: Alan Chambers
Second: Tony Jeffree

YES: Unanimous     NO:             ABSTAIN:

Resolution: P802.1 requests approval from the 802 SEC to forward P802, Overview and Architecture, for sponsor ballot, conditional upon passing its working group recirculation ballot with no negative votes.

Move: Alan Chambers
Second: Tony Jeffree

YES: 19            NO:             ABSTAIN:

Resolution: 802.1 instructs Alan Chambers, the editor for P802.1s, to incorporate his view of the consensus, justifications, and open issues with regard to multiple spanning trees in 802.1Q, as expressed at the July 1998 802.1 meeting, into a draft 802.1s document.

Move: Norm Finn
Second: Steve Adams

YES: Unanimous     NO:             ABSTAIN:

Resolution: 802.1 resolves to hold an interim meeting on Monday August 31, 1998 (afternoon only), co-located with the 802.3 interim meeting.

802.1 also resolves to hold a pre-meeting on the Monday morning of the November Plenary.
Move: Tony Jeffree
Second: Norm Finn

YES: 18 NO: ABSTAIN: 1

Global Local Area Networks – Bill Lidinsky
The Global LAN (G-LAN) stuff got moved off to .1. It is fuzzy and Bill doesn’t know what to do with it.
Discussion of “Does 802 need to work on flow control and where should such work reside in 802?”
Does someone want to make a motion to sponsor this work? Answer: No

ISO documentation of Ethertypes – Tony Jeffree
The issue of documenting the Ethertypes has been raised in ISO. They do not have the text, therefore Tony has become the editor to create the text.

Motion to Adjourn – Bill Lidinsky

Resolution: That the meeting be adjourned.

Move: Michael Wright
Second: David Delany

YES: Unanimous NO: ABSTAIN: