

IEEE 802.1 Minutes, March 2003, Dallas, TX

Link Security, Monday AM, March 10, 2003

Joint meeting with the Link Security Study Group. The minutes are kept by the Link Security Study Group

Presentation Introduction to 802.17 – Bob Love

This presentation is on the website.

Frame Format – 802.17

Like Ethernet with some extra header stuff

Control Frame – topology discovery, etc

Data and Control are extended Ethernet frames

Idle – keep clock sync....

Fairness Frame – for congestion control

Presentation 802.17 Bridging - Marcus Holness

This presentation is on the website.

Presentation PAN security issues – Rene Struik

This presentation is on the website.

Opening Plenary, Monday, March 10, 2003

Agenda – Tony Jeffree

Administrative stuff – Tony Jeffree

Voting Membership rules

Officers – Tony Jeffree

Tony Jeffree, Chairman, Neil Jarvis, Vice Chair, Mick Seaman, Task Group Chair, Michael Wright, Recording Secretary, Hal Keen email administrator

Website – Tony Jeffree

Web site <http://www.ieee802.org/1>

Username p8021

Password go_wildcats

Voting membership – Tony Jeffree

Membership rules are Seriously broken

Terminology issue, operating rules talk about session, which is defined as complete set of meetings such as a working plenary

A meeting is a subset of a session

The only valid rule is “the chair can appoint voting member”

There are consistent rules in each group, which we will use

Gain membership attend 3 qualifying sessions, two of which must be

plenaries and inform the Chair of your intention to become a voter

Qualifying attendance is 75% of meetings during the session in order to count

Must respond to 2 out of the last 3 WG ballots

801.1 WG and TG operations – Tony Jeffree

Consensus process!!

No votes during TG meetings

WG plenary meeting are used to take any “formal” votes

Most technical issues are resolved through TG ballots

Voting membership is NOT a pre-requisite to participate in TG or WG ballots

Focus on technical issues not RR

Lots of offline discussion

IEEE 802 Patent Policy – Tony Jeffree

Reviewed the IEEE 802 patent policy. Tony showed the IEEE required two slides and made sure everyone in the room understood the policy. Slide titled IEEE-SA

Standards Board Bylaws on Patents in Standards, Slide #1 and slide titled

Inappropriate Topics for IEEE WG Meetings

Interim meetings – Tony Jeffree

Week of June 2 in Ottawa, co-located with Link Security, Nortel is the host, entire week because of co-location

Open question for September, Italy is being discussed in .3.

Executive committee meeting review – Tony Jeffree

802.6 and 802.7 letter ballot to disband

May need to re-visit withdrawal of B and F as 802.3 relies on them

Report on Link-Sec

Placing in .1 will be discussed again this Friday at the closing exec meeting

Get 802 update

Financial position looking okay so far for 2003 (20% of budget for 18% of the year elapsed)

Conformance claims to drafts

Standards office has agreed to write to offenders when a complaint is lodged. But there is not much else that can be done.

SA Position Statements – policy

Changes to address 802 concerns. For example licensing issue with wireless spectrum.

SA BoG funding model

Increase membership dues (\$10 for 6 years)

Project initiation fee

Corporate membership dues

Rules for recirculation ballots

IEEE standards edition policy

Not clear what happens when an edition has been reaffirmed

802.3 Interpretations

Need to update/improve the process

802 handoff CFI

How to do roaming across technologies? Some views that this should happen in 802.1

Network services

Have a couple folks who we are paying money to get the network working

Chair meeting schedule

802.1s awards – Tony Jeffree

Plaques were presented to Norm Finn, Mick Seaman, and Tony Jeffree

Task Group agenda – Mick Seaman

Ordered by the PAR

.1D/D1 revision, ballot resolution

.1aa revision to .1x

 need discussion with state machines, Paul's comment

 joint meeting with 11i

.1ab Connectivity Discovery

.1ac – MAC Service definition, no work this meeting but there is a document on website but need to review

.1ad – provider bridges, will probably do a TG ballot, just to get the discussion started and make sure we have captured what everyone has agreed too.

MEF liaison

OA&M

.1B and .1F are used by .3 so we can not withdraw or need to fix. Need to discuss this issue this week.

NWI/FYI

 MAC in MAC continued

 RSTP/OSFP testing

 MEF Intro

 Higher Layer protocols

 May need new inlayer protocols that have Ethertypes in them such as management protocols

Agenda

Tuesday 9 – 12:30 .1D ballot, 1ab ballot resolution

2.00 – 5.30 .1ad provider bridges

Wednesday .1aa EAP and Link Sec

Thursday 9.00-12.30 Provider Bridges

 2.00-3.00 .1ab ballot resolution cont. NWI/FYI

 3.00-5.00 Closing plenary

IETF Bridge MIB – Les Bell

Using 4095 as a wildcard value to identify any VLAN-Id.

Discussion

 Yep, should be able to use it. Because that is how we meant the value to be used.

 How to handle the form of this ballot? Can this be an interpretation of the standard? Then ballot the interpretation.

 Still will need a subtype so it can be an escape that allows multiple mappings. Les will need to check this out.

 Could use 32767.

 Mick will put out a draft interpretation letter and get discussion to see if there is consensus

Joint meeting with Link Security

Tuesday AM March 11, 2003

Review of 802.1D/D1 ballot comments – Tony Jeffree

The official ballot resolutions are in the ballot resolution document, which is on the website.

Review of how the PICS will be completed.

There will be a vote in closing to do re-circulation and then seek permission to go to sponsor ballot. This should now be mechanical task.

There will be a re-circulation of D1 before

Review of 802.1ab/D3 ballot comments- Tony Jeffree

The official ballot resolutions are in the ballot resolution document, which is on the website.

Tuesday PM March 11, 2003

Review of 802.1ab/D3 ballot comments – Tony Jeffree

The official ballot resolutions are in the ballot resolution document, which is on the website.

Wednesday AM March 12, 2003

Joint meeting with Link Security Study Group

The minutes are kept by Link-Security Study Group.

Wednesday PM March 12, 2003

Joint meeting with 802.11i to discuss current state of 802.1aa

Review quickly where we are on 802.1aa/D5

Presentation from Paul Congdon on .1aa state machines

Review of .1aa/D5 – Tony Jeffree

Interim draft, which covers the outstanding ballot comments except for Paul's comments.

Presentation 802.1X and 802.11 Issues – Jesse Walker (Intel), Nancy Cam-Winget(Cisco), and Paul Congdon(HP)

This presentation will be on the 802.1 website

.11i document is 203r0 document on IEEE 802.11 website

New .1X protocol to provision a pair wise key between STA and AP

Pre-authentication Issues

Have implications for the 802.1x state machines

Does this work belong in .11i or .1x

How to resolve state machine interactions

Ideas to address pre-authentication issues

Define how 802.1x machines can run on wired shared media

Encapsulate pre-authentication EAPOL frames differently

Have 802.11i re-define authenticator state machines to support pre-auth using combinations of above

Others?

802.1X & EAP & Jetubg State Machines and Interfaces – Jim Burns, Paul Congdon, Nick Petroni, John Vollbrecht

This presentation is on the website.

Number of issues resolved in RFC 2284bis
Interface between .1X and EAP is very well defined
Resulting Issues to Discuss 802.11 & 802.1X
 How best to incorporate 802.11 into the 802.1X/EAP interface diagrams?
Proposed 802.1aa/D5 changes
 Specification of interface between EAP/802.1X
 No more EAP packet processing in 802.1x
 Addition of controlled port in Supplicant
 Initial Authenticator request comes from EAP
 Ability for EAP to silently discard frames
 Proposed inclusion of EAP machines in 802.1X Annex
 EAPOL – Key exchange sequenced before EAP – Success
 Propose to include generic key machine interface within 802.1X
EAP / 802.1X Interface (excluding key exchange)
How to change the state machines to support both .11i and .1x
Review of the proposed changes to the state machine

Discussion

Mick as Task Group chair believes this work needs to be added to .1aa with the exception of the pre-authentication stuff. Pre-authentication is not included because it has not had enough time.

Many thanks to Paul and company for the work they did to get the state machines fixed. This will be taken up in the closing plenary to include in the draft. The draft will have to go to working group ballot not re-circulation because of the extent of the changes.

Interpretation Request – Tony Jeffree

Request came into 802.3 Link Aggregation. The request was to clarify if an implementation that allows manual configuration but does not support LACP is conformant. We agree with the 802.3 folks - LACP is required to be conformant. An Interpretation request was received from Naveen Chandra of Inkra Networks Corp. Mick sent a response. This interpretation request was a response to an interpretation request last November. Tony will fix up Mick's response, ballot, and send as a response.

Presentation Layer 2 Protocols and Provider Bridges – Norm Finn

This presentation is on the website

Thursday AM March 13, 2003

Presentation Selective Customer TCN Snooping across a Provider Domain - Girish Chiruvolu and Jean-Francois Cartier

Presentation is on the website

Provider/Customer domain interaction

Case for Unlearning

 Don't want to do frequent learning and unlearning because of broadcast storms

Goals

 Reduce unnecessary flushing of MAC addresses

A few definitions

Single homed Segment

Dual-Homed C-VLAN Segment I

Dual-Homed C-VLAN segment II

Which TCN to snoop?

Single homing – no need

Dual homing – need to snoop and trigger unlearning

A solution for reduction in unlearning for dual-homed segments

Solution Realization

Advantages of the Snoop bit approach

Summary

There was lots of discussion about some of the assumptions in the presentation.

Presentation End to End OAM – Norm Finn

This is a review of what OAM is doing in 802.3ah Draft 1.3

What we want.

Do I have connectivity? Ping and Traceroute type functions.

Types of End to End OAM PDUs

Presentation Ethernet in the Metro (MEF) – Paul Bottorf

MEF would like a tutorial on 802.1ad

www.metroethernetforum.org/_root/members/drafts.htm

user id is mef and password is 3030

There are 17 drafts

Discussion of relationship and what is the next step for both MEF and 802.1

Thursday PM March 13, 2003

Presentation RSTP-OSPF Convergence – Gerard Goubert UNH InterOperability Lab

This presentation is on the website

This is test result of RSTP and OSPF convergence under some failure conditions.

Presentation MAC in MAC – Dirceu Cavendish, et.al.

This presentation is on the website

Closing Plenary – Tony

Voting membership – Tony Jeffree

3 qualify sessions, 2 out 3 must be plenary

2 out of last 4, one is a plenary

2 out 3 working group ballots

75% of meetings during the week, 6 meetings this time

Patent Policy – Tony Jeffree

The patent policy was discussed and the two slides were shown

Interim meetings – Tony Jeffree

Ottawa, open question for September, week 15th September in Italy

Agenda for interim 8am Monday to noon Friday

802.1B and 802.1F – Tony Jeffree

Both standards are still being used by 802.3 so these standards will need to be reaffirmed

Motions

802.1 resolves to hold an interim session in Ottawa, Mon through Fri of the week of 2nd June 2003 (2nd through 6th June), co-located with Link Sec
Proposed:Seaman
Second:Wright
–For:15 –Against:0 –Abstain:0

802.1 approves the Nov ‘2002 and Jan ‘2003 meeting minutes.
802.1 Proposed: wright
Second:bell
–For: 14 Against: 0 Abstain: 1

802.1 resolves to hold a pre-meeting on the Monday morning of the July 2003 plenary session.
802.1 Proposed: thorsen
Second:wright
–For: 15 Against: 0 Abstain: 0

802.1 instructs the Editors for P802.1d to revise the document in line with the comment dispositions agreed during this meeting and issue the next draft for WG confirmation ballot.
802.1 Proposed:bell
Second:goubert
–For: 13 Against: 0 Abstain: 1

802.1 requests conditional approval from the SEC to forward P802.1d to Sponsor ballot following completion of its upcoming recirculation ballot
802.1 Proposed: bell Second: wright
–For: 14 Against: 0 Abstain: 1

802.1 requests conditional approval from the SEC to forward P802a to RevCom following completion of its Sponsor recirculation ballot
802.1 Proposed: bell Second: wright
–For: 14 Against: 0 Abstain: 0

802.1 instructs the Editors for P802.1ab to revise the document in line with the comment dispositions agreed during this meeting and issue the next draft for Task Group ballot.
802.1 Proposed: lane
Second: romascanu
–For: 15 Against: 0 Abstain: 0

802.1 instructs the Editor for P802.1aa to revise the document in line with the comment dispositions agreed during this meeting and issue the next draft for a second WG ballot.
802.1 Proposed: bell
Second: wright
–For: 14 Against: 0 Abstain: 1

802.1 instructs the Editor for P802b to issue the current draft for a first WG ballot.

802.1 Proposed: wright

Second: seaman

–For: 15 Against: 0 Abstain: 0

802.1 instructs the Chair to circulate the text of the proposed response to Naveen Chandra's interpretation request to the 802.1 exploder for comment. If no comments or disagreements are received within 30 days, the text will be forwarded as the official 802.1 interpretation.

802.1 Proposed: wright

Second: bell

–For: 16 Against: 0 Abstain: 0

Discussion about provider bridge draft – Mick Seaman

Should have draft in a month

Discussion about EFM/802.3 relationship to 802.1 – Mick Seaman

Need some individual comments because of the current timing

Motion to adjourn

Move wright

Second lane

For Unanimous.

Against 0

Abstain 0

List of attendees with qualify attendance

Allyn Romanow

Arjan De Heer

Atsushi Iwata

Bill Lane

Bob Moskowitz

Chen-Yin Lee

Craig Easley

Dan Romascanu

David Elie-Dit-Cosaque

David Frattura

Dennis Volpano

Dinesh Mohan

Dirceu Cavendish

Dolors Sala

Don O'Connor

Egbert-Jan Sol

Frank Reichstein

Geoffry Waters

Gerard Goubert

Girish Chiruvolu

Glenn Parsons

Hesham ElBakoury

Jessy V Rouyer

Jim Burns

John Roese

Jonathan Thatcher

Karl Weber

Kazuo Takagi

Ken Patton

Kenneth Alonge

Les Bell
Ludwig Winkel
Manu Kaycee
Marco Carugi
Michael Wright
Michel Thorsen
Mick Seaman
Neil Jarvis
Norm Finn
Paul Bottorff

Paul Congdon
Roger Lapuh
Satoshi Obara
Satoshi Zino
Steve Haddock
Ted Chang
Tommy Long
Tony Jeffree
Youghum Kim

This is a list of attendees who attended at least one meeting

Ajay Gummalla
Alan Weissberger
Alex Feldman
Allyn Romanow
Antti Pietilainen
Arjan De Heer
Atsushi Iwata
Bill Lane
Bill McIntosh
Bob Moskowitz
Brian MacLeod
Burak Baysal
Chen-Yin Lee
Craig Easley
Dan Romascanu
David B Nelson
David Elie-Dit-Cosaque
David Frattura
David Halasz
David James
David Johnston
David Mitton
Dennis Volpano
Dinesh Mohan
Dirceu Cavendish
Dolors Sala
Don O'Connor
Donald Eastlake
Egbert-Jan Sol
Floyd Simpson
Frank Ciotti
Frank Reichstein
Geoff Thompson

Geoffry Waters
Gerard Goubert
Girish Chiruvolu
Glenn Parsons
Hesham ElBakoury
Hoon Lee
Jaeyeon Song
James Pigg
Jayant Cmandt
Jesse Walker
Jessy V Rouyer
Jim Burns
John Roese
John Vollbrecht
Jonathan Thatcher
Karen O'Donoghue
Karl Weber
Kazuo Takagi
Ken Alonge
Ken Patton
Kenneth Alonge
Koichiro Seto
Kue Wong
Les Bell
Ludwig Winkel
Manu Kaycee
Marc Holness
Marco Carugi
Marcus Leech
Masahiro Takagi
Mats Naslund
Matt Squire
Michael Wright

Michel Thorsen
Mick Seaman
Ming Sheu
Nancy Cam-Winget
Nastou Tanagiotis
Neil Jarvis
Nora Dabbous
Norm Finn
Paul Bottorff
Paul Congdon
Peter Jones
Ray Wang
Rene Struck
Robert Barrett
Robert Wu
Roger Lapuh
Rudolf Brandner
Russell Housley

Sandra Turner
Satoshi Obara
Satoshi Zino
Sheila Frankel
Stefan Rommer
Steve Haddock
Tamera Shelton
Ted Chang
Ted Kuo
Thomas Maufer
Tommy Long
Tony Jeffree
Tyan-Shu Jou
Vergnaud
Wai-Chau Hui
Youghum Kim
Youngkyoo Jang
Yukihiro Fujimoto