

## **IEEE 802.1 Minutes, March 2008**

### **Opening Plenary, Monday, March 17, 2008**

Admin stuff – Tony Jeffree

Website – new upload area

Access at <http://ieee802.org/1/filenaming.html>

No login or passwords are required

Membership

Affiliation

Make sure you understand the definition and you must disclose your affiliation on the sign up sheet

Chair and Vice Chair elections

We will have elections at the closing Plenary. Both Tony and Paul will stand for re-election

Access to 802.XX websites/reflectors

802.1 WG and TG operation

How 802.1 works

Patent Policy

The call for patents was made by Tony

No responses were given

The five slides were shown and the IEEE patent policy was reviewed

The TG chairs must also call for patents

Techno Toys

Can not use AV recording devices in meeting unless all in the meeting agree

Call for any members of the press

None spoke up

Presentation materials

Remove copyright and privacy/confidentiality statements

Interim meetings

May 2008 12-15 Eilat, Israel

Sept 2008-15-18 ChengDu, China

Jan 2009 – Any ideas?

Exec Report

Meeting planning contract will be put out to competitive bid

No further extensions of existing contract beyond July

Bob Grow is chair of the Standards Board and will step down as chair of 802.3

Get802

Last 657K downloads last year

Program is in flux because it is being restructured

Back to 6 months lead time

AG will enter program on 17<sup>th</sup> of June

AK will go into the program now

Patent Pool

Companies that own IP put into pool

Companies license the pool

John Messenger objected to the discussion about the potential issues of interpretation of the patent pool

It was decided that this is not a discussion about a particular patent  
So the discussion can continue about the issues of an IEEE patent pool

Feedback should be given to the IEEE staff at the Wednesday 1 pm meeting

Attendance software

<https://murphy.events.ieee.org/imat/>

This will be live at the July meeting

Treasurer's report

1400 attendees

Should have reserve of 1 million before reducing fees

SC6 update

ISO agreement allows IEEE 802 standards to be referenced by ISO standards

P&P

More work on P&P

Create a P&P and an ops manual

AudCom will approve P&P

Non North American Venues

IEEE Standards Process Training

<http://ieee802.org/training.htm>

How 802 works

3 hours

802.1 PARS – 5 this week

.1BA AVB Systems

.1Qbb – Priority based flow control

.1Qav – amendment to existing PAR

.1aj – extension request

.1Q – Revision PAR

Liaisons

Several liaisons that we have to sort out

G.8032 Ring Protection – Marc Hollness

ITU-T Q9 SG15

The Internetworking TG will sort out if responses are needed

P802.1ak Corr-1

Passed with 100% so it is ready for sponsor ballot

Off line comment

Is there an issue with the lack of requirement for an implementation prior to standard approval?

Should there be a more rigorous proof required

Discussion

Probably not possible

If folks are not implementing then why are we doing the project

Validation is very welcome but it can not be required

The consensus was this should not be done

#### 802.1aj Table 8-3

What set of addresses should go into the table

Discussion

The original set of addresses chosen to not be forward by a bridge; this is a reason why it should be same

We should say what a TPMR will do with an address

We should illustrate some of the properties of each of the addresses

Currently, if a device hierarchy is created then we are in good shape because as you move up the hierarchy the set of addresses filtered always includes the sets filtered below

What should be in the next draft?

Need to specify what address go through, which is not possible today because it is a function of what is on the link

#### TG Agendas

Interworking – Steve

Security – Mick

.1X Rev and .1AR Comment Res

AVB – Michael

DCB – Pat

PAR Priority-based Flow Control does not tied to congestion notification

Discussion about the scope of the PAR and where it should be applied

T11 Liaison – Claudio DeSanti

ITU-T Optical Transport Network and Technologies Standardization Work Plan – Hiroshi Ohta

Several ways to proceed

As a group comment

Get volunteers to review and comment

Individually comment on the doc

Deadline for comment is end of October

Norm Finn volunteered to look at it and comment

#### Metro Ethernet Forum

Thanks for the aj draft and please send new draft when updated

MAC Addresses versus services

We should address the scope rather than simply an address list

May have a couple of responses for liaisons for Thursday

#### Fast Ring Recovery PAR – Norm Finn

Can we agree on a problem?

Can we afford this because the amount of work that we have?

Even if there are new folks and a new TG was created there is a problem that this is an amendment to .1Q

Do we have this extra work because there is demand for 802.1 standards?

## **Tuesday AM, March 18, 2008**

All the task groups, security, data center bridging, internetworking, and AV, met in parallel

### Security

- Call for patents

- Review of patent policy

- Ballot Comment Review of P802.1X-Rev – Mick Seaman

  - Discussion about supplicant should be informed of the result of the authorization process not just the authentication process

    - In authorize accept the NID can be specified, which results in a mapping to a particular set of network services

    - We would have to create a RADIUS attribute for this

    - Authenticator could figure this out but that is not a palatable solution

    - In general the solution is to return the authorization level by the AAA server

    - Discussion about the various solutions and ramifications of them

  - Bit of review of cached CAK

    - Discussion about KMD, its uses, and possible other methods to achieve the same thing

## **Tuesday PM, March 18, 2008**

- Ballot Comment Review of P802.1X-Rev – Mick Seaman

- Security Task Group and P802.21 meet in joint session to discuss the security and standardization issues regarding security within P802.21

  - Chair of 802.21

  - Yoshihiro Ohba – Editor

  - Agenda - Overview of the work being done and review sponsor ballot comments

  - Lots of discussion about the issues

    - The protocol is not sufficiently defined within the 802.21 standard to sort out how it can work on 802.3 and with 802.1X

## **Wednesday AM, March 19, 2008**

### Security Task Group

- Call for patents

- Review of patent policy

- Agenda for the day

  - .1X rev this morning

  - AR this afternoon

- Ballot Comment Review of P802.1X-Rev – Mick Seaman

  - Replace advertisement with announcement

  - Replace herald with announce

## **Wednesday PM, March 19, 2008**

### Security Task Group

- Ballot Comment Review of P802.1AR – Brian Weiss, subbing for Max

53 technical comments to review  
All ballots were reviewed

## **Thursday AM, March 20, 2008**

Security Task Group

## **Closing Plenary, Thursday, March 20, 2008**

Affiliation

Make sure you know the rules about affiliation

Patent Policy

The required slides were shown and the policy was reviewed

The call for patents was made

No one spoke up

AV devices

No recording without the consent of all in the room

Interim meetings

May 12 – 15 Eilat, Israel

Sept 15 – 18, ChengDu, China

Jan 2009 – Bangalore, India has been proposed. A formal proposal will be made in the next few weeks

Liaisons

None

CFI bit

802.5 is going away, therefore CFI bit is no longer relevant

Is it time to reassign the CFI bit?

Potential utility as drop precedence bit – there is a current need in AVB for this

There may be an issue with old equipment that use the CFI

Discussion

Qau is looking at using this bit

This is an initial discussion

Need to consider it properly and make sure all the interop issues are sorted out

Dial-in access to 802.1 meetings

This allow MIB experts to participate

This facilitates getting P802.1ap completed

What is the view of folks?

Hard to do because you can not limit who can dial in but the goal here is a few experts

Logistics is hard to do also

We won't do this generally but will evaluate on a case by case basis

Each case will need a motion to have dial-in

Task Group Reports

Internetworking – Steve

Security – Mick

AV – Michael

DCB – Pat

Sanity Check

Motions

802.1 requests the 802 Exec to confirm the appointment of Tony Jeffree as Chair of 802.1.

Proposed: Fuller

Second: Messenger

For: 52 Against: 0 Abstain: 0

802.1 requests the 802 Exec to confirm the appointment of Paul Congdon as Vice Chair of 802.1.

802.1 Proposed: Fuller

Second: Wright

For: 36 Against: 0 Abstain: 0

802.1 approves the November 2007 and January 2008 minutes.

Proposed: wright Seconded: nolish

For 30 Against 0 Abstain 4

802.1 resolves to authorize post-meeting(s) on the Friday morning of the July 2008 plenary session subject to confirmation and statement of agenda at the May interim meeting.

802.1 Proposed: Fuller

Second: wright

For: 29 Against: 0 Abstain:10

802.1 resolves to hold pre-meeting(s) on the Monday morning of the July 2008 plenary session.

802.1 Proposed: fuller

Second: wright

For: 33 Against: 0 Abstain: 1

The AVB TG will continue to have teleconferences weekly at 9AM (US Pacific) Wednesdays for AVB general topics and 10AM (US Pacific) Mondays for 802.1AS specific topics. Access information will be sent to the 802.1 reflector immediately after the plenary.

Proposed: teener

Second: pannell

For: 21

Against: 0

Abstain: 17

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1AS (Geoff Garner) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group balloting.

Proposed: teener Second: Garner

For: 23 Against: 0 Abstain: 14

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1aj (Tony Jeffree) to prepare a further draft based on the resolution of ballot comments at the January 08 Interim. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group recirc balloting.

Proposed: Haddock Second: messenger

For: 33 Against: 0 Abstain: 10

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1AB-REV (Tony Jeffree) to prepare a further draft . The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group recirc balloting.

Proposed: Haddock Second: wright

For: 32 Against: 0 Abstain: 8

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qat (Craig Gunther) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group balloting.

Proposed: teener Second: gunther

For: 34 Against: 0 Abstain: 11

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qav (Tony Jeffree) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group balloting.

Proposed: teener Second: fuller

For: 34 Against: 0 Abstain: 6

P802.1BA PAR/5C:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/new-avb-systems-ba-draft-par-0208-v5.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/new-avb-systems-ba-draft-5c-0208-v2.pdf>

802.1 requests EC approval to submit the draft PAR for P802.1BA Audio Video Bridging Systems to NesCom.

Proposed: teener Second: pannell

For: 31 Against: 0 Abstain: 18

P802.1Qav PAR amendment:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/av-p802-1qav-par-amendment-0308-v02.pdf>

802.1 requests EC approval to submit the draft PAR amendment for P802.1Qav to NesCom.

Proposed: teener Second: pannell

For: 33 Against: 0 Abstain: 19

The CN simulation ad hoc will continue to have teleconferences weekly at 9AM (US Pacific) Thursdays. Access information will be sent to the 802.1 reflector immediately after the plenary.

Proposed: thaler

Second: ghanwani

For: 30

Against: 0

Abstain: 21

Draft PAR/5C for P802.1Qbb :

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/new-dcb-thaler-pfc-draft-par-0308.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/new-dcb-thaler-draft-pfc-5c-0208-v3.pdf>

802.1 requests EC approval to forward the draft PAR for 802.1Qbb per-priority flow control to NesCom.

802.1: Proposed: Thaler Second:

Discussion on the issue of the tying of the per-priority pause to the control protocol, and Pat said that there would be a “shall” statement that per-priority pause would not be enabled unless the control protocol arranged that it should be. It was observed that this is an important limitation which will help in limiting the harm of per-priority pause.

For: 33 Against: 1 Abstain: 22

The editor of P802.1Qau (Norm Finn) is instructed to prepare a draft for task group ballot based on:

[au-nfynn-issues-0308-v2.ppt](#)

Proposed: Thaler Second: Finn

For: 43 Against: 0 Abstain: 8

802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC to forward P802.1ah to RevCom.

Proposed: haddock Second: bottorff

For: 45 Against: 0 Abstain: 7

802.1 grants permission for the Interworking task group to convene a conference call for 802.1ah comment resolution on the upcoming Sponsor recirculation ballot. 30 days notice via the email reflector will be given of the time & date.

Proposed: Haddock Second: Bottorff

For: 39 Against: 0 Abstain: 4

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1ap (Glenn Parsons) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group recirc balloting.

Proposed: Haddock Second: Parsons

For: 41 Against: 0 Abstain: 9

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1aq (Mick Seaman) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group balloting.

Proposed: Haddock Second: Seaman



March 2008

Orlando, FL

For: 40 Against: 0 Abstain: 7

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1aw (Linda Dunbar) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group balloting.

Proposed: Haddock Second: Dunbar

For: 31 Against: 0 Abstain: 11

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qay (Panos Saltsidis) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group and Working Group balloting.

Proposed: Haddock Second: Saltsidis

For: 41 Against: 0 Abstain: 4

802.1 requests approval of the EC to submit P802.1ak-Cor-1 for Sponsor ballot.

Proposed: Haddock Second: wright

For: 39 Against: 0 Abstain: 5

P802.1Q-REV:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/q-p802-1q-revision-par-0308-v2.pdf>

802.1 requests EC approval to forward the draft PAR for 802.1Q Revision to NesCom.

802.1: Proposed: Haddock Second: wright

For: 41 Against: 0 Abstain: 0

P802.1aj PAR extension:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2008/aj-p802-1aj-par-extension-0308.pdf>

802.1 requests EC approval to forward the draft PAR extension for 802.1aj to NesCom.

802.1: Proposed: haddock Second: wright

For: 37 Against: 0 Abstain: 4

The 802.1ap Ballot Resolution Group will have teleconferences weekly at 10AM (US Eastern) Wednesdays in April, Chaired by Glenn Parsons (Editor). Access information will be sent to the 802.1 reflector immediately after the plenary. Teleconference access will be provided for the BRG at the May interim.

Proposed: parsons

Second: haddock

For: 40

Against: 0

Abstain: 5

Straw Poll – Reserve time for ring & chains discussions at the May interim

For 7 Against 2 Abstain

802.1 resolves to hold an interim meeting of the Security TG 20th, 21st, 22nd May in Roseville, California.

802.1 Proposed: Seaman

Second: wright

For: 18 Against: 0 Abstain: 19

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1-X-REV (Mick Seaman) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group balloting.

Proposed: Seaman Second: Wright

For: 29 Against: 0 Abstain: 10

802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1AR (Max Pritikin) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group balloting.

Proposed: Weis Second: Seaman

For: 25 Against: 0 Abstain: 11

Teleconference access will be provided for the 802.1Qay ballot resolution MIB items at the May interim.

Proposed: martin

Second: saltsidis

For: 18

Against: 3

Abstain: 17

Adjourn

Proposed Wright

Unanimous

## ATTENDEES

<u>NAME</u>	<u>SURNAME</u>	<u>Affiliation</u>
Osama	About-Magd	Nortel Networks
Puneet	Agarwal	Broadcom
Zehavit	Alon	Nokia Siemens Networks
Caitlin	Bestler	Neterion
Jan	Bialkowski	Infinera, Inc
Bill	Bjorkman	
Rob	Boatright	Harman Pro
Jean-Michel	Bonnamy	France-Telecom
Paul	Bottorff	Nortel Inc
Rudolf	Brandner	Nokia Siemens Networks
Werner	Burkard	NOT CONFIRMED
Nancy	Cam-Winget	NOT CONFIRMED
Craig W.	Carlson	Qlogic
Weiyang	Cheng	Tellabs
Rao	Cherukuri	Juniper Networks
Taesik	Cheung	ETRI
George	Claseman	Micrel

Paul	Congdon	Hewlett Packard
Diego	Crupnicoff	Mellanox
Arjan	de Heer	Alcatel-Lucent
Claudio	Desanti	Cisco
Zhemin	Ding	Ericsson AB
Linda	Dunbar	Futurewei Technologies
Hesham	Elbakoury	Nortel
	Elie-Dit-	
David	Cosaque	Alcatel-Lucent
Janos	Farkas	Ericsson
Don	Fedyk	Nortel
Norm	Finn	Cisco Systems
Lionel	Florit	Cisco
Bob	Frazier	Ericsson
John	Fuller	Gibson Guitar
Geoffrey	Garner	Harman, Intel
Anoop	Ghanwani	Brocade
Avanindra	Godbole	Juniper Networks Inc
Franz	Goetz	Siemens
Ken	Grewal	Intel
Craig	Gunther	Harman Pro
Mitch	Gusat	IBM Research
Steve	Haddock	Self
Takashi	Hasegawa	Hitachi Cable
Brian	Hausauer	Net Effect, Inc
Asif	Hazarika	Fujitsu
Marc	Holness	Nortel
David	Huo	NOT CONFIRMED
Tony	Jeffree	Self, Cisco, Broadcom, Hewlett Packard, Adva
Michael	Johas Teener	Broadcom
Shinkyō	Kaku	NOT CONFIRMED
Abhay	Karandikar	Tejas Networks/IIT Bombay
Prakash	Kashyap	Extreme Networks
Yongbum	Kim	Broadcom
Takayuki	Kishimoto	NOT CONFIRMED
Philippe	Klein	Broadcom
Mike	Ko	IBM
Subi	Krishnamurthy	NOT CONFIRMED
Bruce	Kwan	Broadcom Corp
David	Law	3Com Europe Ltd
Yannick	Le Goff	France Telecom
Marcus	Leech	Nortel
John	Lemon	Adtran
Michael	Lerer	Soapstone Networks
Jonathan	Loewen	PMC-Sierra
Zhi-Hern	Loh	Fulcrum Microsystems
Jeff	Lynch	IBM
Gael	Mace	Thomson
Ben	Mack-Crane	Huawei
David	Martin	Nortel Networks
Riccardo	Martinotti	Ericsson
Marco	Mascitto	Telion Consulting Inc
Menucher	Menuchery	Marvell Semiconductors
John	Messenger	Adva Optical Networking Ltd
Pitri	Mikkila	Safinet Inc
Dinesh	Mohan	Nortel

Kevin	Nolish	Ericsson
Don	O'Connor	Fujitsu Network Communications
Hiroshi	Ohta	NTT
Stephen	Oliva	Sprint
David	Olsen	Harman Pro
Don	Pannell	Marvell
Glenn	Parsons	Nortel Networks
Alex	Pavlovsky	Finisar Corp
Mark	Pearson	Hewlett-Packard
Joe	Pelissier	Cisco
Hayim	Porat	Ethos Networks
Cari	Posthuma	NOT CONFIRMED
Ananda	Rajagopal	Foundry Networks
Refael	Ram	Corrigent Systems
Haricamanthan	Ramakrishnan	SMSC
Pasula	Reddy	Fujitsu
Daniel	Reynolds	UNH IOL
Guenter	Roeck	Teak Technologies
Josef	Roese	Deutsche Telecom
Derek	Rohde	Qlogic
Gregory	Roney	UNH IOL
Moran	Roth	Corrigent Systems
Jessy V	Rouyer	Alcatel-Lucent
Jonathan	Sadler	Tellabs
Ali	Sajassi	Cisco
Joseph	Salowey	Cisco
Panagiotis	Saltsidis	Ericsson
Satish	Sathe	Brocade
John	Sauer	Tellabs
Mick	Seaman	Mick Seaman
Koichiro	Seto	Hitachi Cable
John	Sisto	SMSC
Kevin B	Stanton	Intel
Bob	Sultan	Huawei Technologies
Muneyoshi	Suzuki	NTT
George	Swallow	Cisco Syatems
Attila	Takacs	Ericsson
Francois	Tallet	Cisco
Bert	Tanaka	Woven Systems
Pat	Thaler	Broadcom
Oliver	Thorp	Fujitsu
Gilles	Thouenon	FT R&D
Fred	Tuck	EchoStar
Manoj	Wadekar	Intel
Yan	Wang	Huawei
Brian	Weis	Cisco
Ludwig	Winkel	Siemens AG
David	Wong	NOT CONFIRMED
Michael D.	Wright	Panoptic Security
Chien-Hsien	Wu	Broadcom
Ken	Young	Gridpoint Systems
Li Lian	Yuan	China Mobile
Deng	Zhusheng	Huawei
Glen	Zorn	Aruba Networks

March 2008

Orlando, FL