

Minutes of the 802.1 Interim meeting held in New Orleans, 12-15 January 2009

Attendees

<u>Last Name</u>	<u>First Name</u>	<u>Affiliation</u>	<u>Sign-ins</u>
Alon	Zehavit	Nokia Siemens Networks	4
Ayandeh	Siamack	3Com Corporation	6
Bialkowski	Jan	Infinera Corporation	7
Boatright	Robert	HARMAN INTERNATIONAL INDUSTRIES, INCORPORATED	2
BONNAMY	Jean-Michel	France Telecom	6
Bottorff	Paul	Nortel Networks	7
Carlson	Craig	QLogic Corporation	6
Cheng	Weiying	Tellabs	5
Cherukuri	Rao	Juniper Networks, Inc.	6
Congdon	Paul	Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.	4
Connor	Donald	FUJITSU	2
Crisp	Stefan	Agilent Technologies, Inc.	1
Crupnicoff	Diego	Mellanox Technologies	7
De Heer	Arjan	ALCATEL-LUCENT	5
DeSanti	Claudio	Cisco Systems, Inc.	7
Ding	Zhemín	Ericsson	7
Dunbar	Linda	Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd.	7
Elie-Dit-Cosaque	David	ALCATEL-LUCENT	7
Farkas	Janos	Ericsson	6
Fedyk	Donald	Nortel Networks	7
Finn	Norman	Cisco Systems, Inc.	4
Fuller	John	John Nels Fuller	5
Garner	Geoffrey	Samsung Electronics	3
Ghanwani	Anoop	Brocade	5
Goetz	Franz	Siemens	7
Gravel	Mark	Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.	7
Grewal	Karanvir	Intel Corporation	6
Gunther	Craig	HARMAN INTERNATIONAL INDUSTRIES, INCORPORATED	7
Gusat	Mitch	IBM	5
Haddock	Stephen	self	4
Hagen	Mikkel	University of New Hampshire InterOperability Laboratory	7
Hudson	Charles	Hewlett-Packard Development Company, L.P.	6
insler	romain	France Telecom	6
Jeffree	Anthony	Cisco, Broadcom, HP, Adva	7
Kami	Nobuharu	NEC Corporation	1
Kashyap	Prakash	Extreme Networks	7
Klein	Philippe	Broadcom Corporation	5

Ko	Michael	IBM	6
Kumar	Vinod	Tejas Networks Ltd	7
Kwan	Bruce	Broadcom Corporation	7
Lemon	John	ADTRAN Inc.	4
Lipshteyn	Marina	Voltaire	7
MACE	Gael	Thomson R&D France	7
Mack-Crane	Thomas	Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd.	7
Martin	David	Nortel Networks	6
McIntosh	James	Vitesse Semiconductor Corporation	4
Messenger	John	ADVA Optical Networking Ltd.	3
Mora	Matthew	Apple Computer, Inc.	5
Multanen	Eric	Intel Corporation	6
Nolish	Kevin	Ericsson	7
Noseworthy	Bob	University of New Hampshire InterOperability Laboratory HARMAN INTERNATIONAL INDUSTRIES, INCORPORATED	4
Olsen	David	Marvell	7
Pannell	Donald	Nortel Networks	7
Parsons	Glenn	Cisco Systems, Inc.	7
Pelissier	Joseph	Ethos Networks	4
Porat	Hayim	NSA/IAD	5
Randall	Karen	Deutsche Telekom AG	7
Roese	Josef	ALCATEL-LUCENT	7
Rouyer	Jessy	Cisco Systems, Inc.	6
Salowey	Joseph	Ericsson	7
Saltsidis	Panagiotis	AMCC	7
Sathe	Satish	Tellabs	4
Sauer	John	Mick Seaman	6
Seaman	Michael	Nokia Siemens Networks	3
Sprecher	Nurit	Intel Corporation	4
Stanton	Kevin	Huawei Technologies Co., Ltd.	2
Sultan	Robert	Broadcom Corporation	6
Teener	Michael	Broadcom Corporation	4
Thaler	Patricia	Apple Computer, Inc.	7
Warren	Niel	ZTE Corporation	3
Wei	Yuehua	Cisco Systems, Inc.	7
Weis	Brian	Siemens	6
Winkel	Ludwig CHIEN-		7
WU	HSIEN	Broadcom Corporation	7
Young	Ken	GridPoint, Inc.	5

AVB TG Minutes

Minutes of AVB TG, 1/12/2009-1/15/2009

802.1 Audio Video Bridging Task Group Agenda Presenter Length
- Magic decoder ring

Presenter: AKB/Alan Bartky, AB/Alexei Beliaev, BG/Bob Grow, CG/Craig Gunther, CH/Chuck Harrison, DB/David Bagby, DE/Darwin Engwer, DO/David Olsen, DP/Don Pannell, FF/Felix Feng, GC/George Claseman, GG/Geoff Garner, GT/Geoff Thompson, GV/Ganesh Venkatesan, HB/Hal Baht, JNF/John Fuller, KS/Kevin Stanton, MH/Myron Hattig, MJT/Michael Johas Teener, OAM/Osama Aboul-Magd, NF/Norm Finn, PJ/Paul Jeong, PK/Philippe Klein, PT/Pat Thaler, RB/Robert Boatright, SF/Serge Fourcand, SO/Shlomo Ovadia, SS/Suman Sharma, SSSJ/Seong-Soon Joo, TJ/Tony Jeffree, ZW/Zong Wu, ??/everyone

Length: minutes, where the main headings are the totals for that heading, with AM usually 180 minutes (9am-noon), and PM usually 240 minutes (1PM-5PM)

- Mon PM 13:00-17:00 802.1 - 802.3 joint meeting 240
- 802.3/802.1AS interaction 120
 - to include a presentation by MJT on minimizing the effort to JUST the abstract interface MJT 30
 - discussion/other stuff 90
 - Link Peer detection 120
 - to include a presentation by MJT on the needs in AVB, and a possible solution for "base-T" PHYs MJT 30
 - discussion/other stuff 90
- Tue AM 09:00-12:00 180
 - administrivia MJT 50

Michael Johas Teener opened the meeting by presenting the IEEE-SA patent slides and calling for patents. There was no response.

- 802.1AS GG, etc 130

Geoff Garner led a discussion of Draft 4.2 of the 802.1AS document.

- Tue PM 13:00-17:00 240

- 802.1AS (cont) GG 120

Geoff Garner continued to lead the discussion of Draft 4.2 of the 802.1AS document.

- Power management & AVB PK 120

The Power Management presentation was postponed until Wednesday.

- Tue evening (time ??) 120

- 802.3 time measurement ad hoc ?? 120

- Wed AM 09:00-12:00 180

- 802.1Qat CG 180

Craig Gunther led a discussion of Draft 2.0 of 802.1Qat.

- Wed PM 13:00-17:00		240
- 802.1Qat (cont)	CG	60

Philippe Klein presented avb-phkl-pwr-mgmt-0109.pdf about power management.

- 802.1Qav	TJ	180
------------	----	-----

Tony Jeffree led a discussion of Draft 3.2 of 802.1Qav.

- Thu AM 09:00-12:00		180
- 802.1BA	MJT, etc	180

Don Pannell led a discussion of the assumptions document, working toward a list of items to be included into 802.1BA.

- Thu PM 13:00-17:00		240
- 802.1BA (cont)	MJT, DP, etc.	240

Don Pannell continued to lead the discussion of the assumptions document and 802.1BA.

Meeting was adjourned.

Interworking TG Minutes

January 13, 2009 Interworking Task Group IEEE Interim, New Orleans

Meeting called to order at 9:00am.

Presented patent policy slides. No response to the call for patents.

Linda Dunbar led comment resolution on the 802.1Qaw-d4.0 DDCFM Working Group Recirculation Ballot.

A comment disposition document will be posted, and the draft will be forwarded to Sponsor Ballot.

Panos Saltsidis led comment resolution on the 802.1Qay-d4.6 PBB-TE Working Group Recirculation Ballot.

A comment disposition document will be posted, and the draft will be forwarded to Sponsor Ballot.

Recess at 11:10am.

Resume at 1:20pm.

Tony Jeffree led comment resolution on the 802.1AB-REV-d4.1 LLDP Working Group Recirculation Ballot.

A comment disposition document will be posted, and a new draft will be issued for another recirculation ballot.

Tony Jeffree gave a brief status update on the 802.1AC-Rev MAC Service Definition document. Expect that a draft will be issued for Task Group Ballot prior to the March meeting.

Heard and discussed presentations on PBB-TE Segment Protection Switching:

David Martin: <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-martin-PBB-TE-segment-prot-0109-v00.pdf>

Wei Yuehua: <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-weiyh-segment-protection-0109-v00.pdf>

Bob Sultan: <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-sultan-segment-protection-requirements-0109-v01.pdf>

Adjourn at 5:40pm

January 14, 2009 Interworking Task Group IEEE Interim, New Orleans

Meeting called to order at 9:00am.

Presented patent policy slides. No response to the call for patents.

Don Fedyk presented an overview and status of the Shortest Path Bridging project, and led comment resolution on the 802.1aq-d1.5 Task Group Ballot.

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/aq-fedyk-SPB-recap_0109_v1.ppt

Kevin Nolish presented an update on the 802.1H-Rev project.

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/H-nolish-draftintro-0109-v01.ppt>

Heard and discussed further presentations on PBB-TE Segment Protection Switching:

Vinod Kumar: <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-vinod-SPS-modeling-0109-v1.ppt>

Bob Sultan: <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-sultan-segment-protection-technical-proposal-0109-v01.pdf>

January 15, 2009 Interworking Task Group IEEE Interim, New Orleans

Meeting called to order at 9:00.

Presented patent policy slides. No response to the call for patents.

Don Fedyk presented continued comment resolution on the 802.1aq-d1.5 Task Group Ballot. A comment disposition document will be posted.

Don Fedyk led a discussion in response to the liaison request from the IETF to comment on the TRILL document from the point of view of “its effect on the Ethernet Service Model.” Discussion centered on comparing the some architectural choices made by the IETF TRILL project versus 802.1 projects (e.g. congruency of forward/reverse paths and unicast/multicast paths). No conclusions yet on how to respond to the IETF.

Concluded with a discussion of the various segment protection proposals and began structuring a comparison table to help whittle down the number of approaches.

Adjourn at 12:10.

Security TG Minutes

<Not provided>

DCB TG Minutes

Meeting notes for 1/13:

Pat Thaler set up an agenda for the week and went through the IEEE patent slides. Call was given for patent submission and none was raised.

Balaji Prabhakar presented "Stability of QCN: The Averaging Principle".

Nobuharu Kami presented "Implementing QCN".

In the afternoon Norm Finn went over Qau comment resolution. Updated comment resolution was uploaded as v02 in au-draft area. Folks were asked that if issues not covered during the meeting should be discussed, then Norm will go over them on Thursday morning.

Meeting notes for 1/14:

Pat reminded people of the IEEE patent slides and call for patents.

Claudio DeSanti went over Qbb comment resolution.

In the afternoon Craig Carlson presented 802.1Qaz Draft 0.2 Status.

Joe Pelissier presented a new version of "Thoughts on DCBX".

Mike Ko presented "DCB Configuration Needs From The Server Perspective".

Craig Carlson presented "DCBX NEXT STEPS".

Norm presented "LLDP TLVs required for P802.1au", followed by the state machines that would be needed to configure CN.

Eric Multanen presented "Baseline DCBX Goals and Functions". Norm questioned whether the state machines that he proposed earlier for Qau could be made to work with the state machines as currently defined in the DCBX spec. Norm suggested that he and Eric should sit down and work out the details to see if it is doable.

This was followed by a discussion on the future of DCBX. Joe was in favor of throwing out both the state machines in the current DCBX spec and replaced them with state machines per feature as needed. Mike suggested that the group should wait for the comeback from Norm and Eric to see if the current state machines in DCBX are really broken. There were other opinions that the state machines should not be used if simpler ones or operation without state machines above LLDP can do the job. Pat wanted a quick resolution to the problem. The group will continue the discussion on Thursday.

Meeting notes for 1/15:

Norm Finn went through some more comment resolution for Qau as requested by Bruce Kwan.

Claudio DeSanti went through some more comment resolution for Qbb as requested by Mark Gravel.

Norm Finn presented an updated version of "LLDP TLVs required for P802.1au". He showed how the currently defined DCBX protocol can be made to work with CN. However, it took more exchanges for both nodes to get to the point when they can send data compared with the scheme using just LLDP. The group was asked whether DCBX should be discarded and replacement LLDP exchanges be used instead. Mike Ko suggested that since we have not gone through a similar examination of the configuration scenario for ETS and PFC, we could use LLDP exchanges for CN, but postpone the decision for discarding DCBX with replacement LLDP exchanges for ETS and PFC until we have gone through similar exercises. The group accepted this position.

Due to the added material and time constraints to get the next draft ready, we will have a 15 day task group ballot on Qau before the plenary rather than starting a Working Group ballot that would be open during the plenary.

A task group ballot will also be held on Qbb.

For Qaz, we do not yet have consensus on DCBX. Eric and others in favor of maintaining the state machines proposed in [az-wadkar-dcbx-capability-exchange-discovery-protocol-1108-v1.01.pdf](#) will see what simplifications can be made and bring an updated proposal to the March meeting. We intend to decide this issue in March.

There will not be a ballot on Qaz before the March meeting due to the lack of consensus on DCBX.

In the afternoon, we had a joint meeting with Interworking on Virtual Bridging.