802.1 Plenary - 03/2009

Closing Agenda
Decorum

- Press (i.e., anyone reporting publicly on this meeting) are to announce their presence (2008 SASB Op Manual 5.3.3.5)
- Photography or recording by permission only (2008 SASB Op Manual 5.3.3.4)
- Cell phone ringers off please
The following are 802.1 voters:

Aboul-Magd, Osama
Alon, Zehavit
Bestler, Caitlin
Bialkowski, Jan
Boatright, Rob
Bonnamy, Jean-Michel
Bottorff, Paul
Brandner, Rudolf
Carlson, Craig
Cheng, Weiying
Cherukuri, Rao
Cheung, Taesik
Congdon, Paul
Crupnicoff, Diego
Desanti, Claudio
Ding, Zhemin
Dunbar, Linda
Elbakoury, Hesham
Elie-Dit-Cosaque, David
Farkas, Janos
Fedyk, Donald
Feng, Felix Feifei
Finn, Norman
Frazier, Robert
Fuller, John
Garner, Geoffrey
Ghanwani, Anoop
Goetz, Franz
GOFF, YANNICK
Gray, Eric
Grewal, Karanvir
Gunther, Craig
Gusat, Mitch
Haddock, Stephen
Hausauer, Brian
Hazarika, Asif
Insler, Romain
Jeffree, Anthony
Karandikar, Abhay
Kashyap, Prakash
Keen, Hal
Kilcrease, Keti
Kim, Yongbum
Klein, Philippe
Ko, Mike
Kondapalli, Raghu
Kumar, Vinod
Kwan, Bruce
Laihonen, Kari
Lerer, Michael
Mace, Gael
Mack-Crane, Ben
Martin, David
Martinotti, Riccardo
Mascitto, Marco
McGuire, Alan
McIntosh, James
Menuchery, Menucher
Messenger, John
Mohan, Dinesh
Mora, Matthew
Multanen, Eric
Nolish, Kevin
Ohta, Hiroshi
Olsen, David
Pannell, Donald
Parsons, Glenn
Patton, Ken
Pelissier, Joseph
Peterson, David
Porat, Hayim
Pritikin, Max
Rajagopal, Ananda
Randall, Karen
Roden, Robert
Roeck, Guenter
Roehe, Josef
Rohde, Derek
Romascanu, Dan
Roth, Moran
Rouyer, Jessy
Sadler, Jonathan
Sajassi, Ali
Salowey, Joseph
Saltsidis, Panagiotis
Sathe, Satish
Sauer, John
Seaman, Michael
Seto, Koichiro
Shah, Himanshu
Sprecher, Nurit
Stanton, Kevin
Sultan, Robert
Suzuki, Muneyoshi
Swallow, George
Takacs, Attila
Teener, Michael
Terry, John
Thaler, Patricia
Thor, Oliver
Tuck, Fred
Wadekar, Manoj
Wang, Yan
Weis, Brian
Wijnen, Bert
Winkel, Ludwig
Wright, Michael D.
Wu, Chien-Hsien
Young, Ken
Zorn, Glen
The following have become voting members if they are here this week:

Bjorkman, Bill
Lipshteyn, Marina
Sharma, Suman
Instructions for the WG Chair

The IEEE-SA strongly recommends that at each WG meeting the chair or a designee:

- Show slides #1 through #4 of this presentation
- Advise the WG attendees that:
  - The IEEE’s patent policy is consistent with the ANSI patent policy and is described in Clause 6 of the IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws;
  - Early identification of patent claims which may be essential for the use of standards under development is strongly encouraged;
  - There may be Essential Patent Claims of which the IEEE is not aware. Additionally, neither the IEEE, the WG, nor the WG chair can ensure the accuracy or completeness of any assurance or whether any such assurance is, in fact, of a Patent Claim that is essential for the use of the standard under development.
- Instruct the WG Secretary to record in the minutes of the relevant WG meeting:
  - That the foregoing information was provided and that slides 1 through 4 (and this slide 0, if applicable) were shown;
  - That the chair or designee provided an opportunity for participants to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) of which the participant is personally aware and that may be essential for the use of that standard
  - Any responses that were given, specifically the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that were identified (if any) and by whom.
- The WG Chair shall ensure that a request is made to any identified holders of potential essential patent claim(s) to complete and submit a Letter of Assurance.
- It is recommended that the WG chair review the guidance in IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual 6.3.5 and in FAQs 12 and 12a on inclusion of potential Essential Patent Claims by incorporation or by reference.

Note: **WG** includes Working Groups, Task Groups, and other standards-developing committees with a PAR approved by the IEEE-SA Standards Board.

(Optional to be shown)
Participants, Patents, and Duty to Inform

All participants in this meeting have certain obligations under the IEEE-SA Patent Policy. Participants:

- “Shall inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed)” of the identity of each “holder of any potential Essential Patent Claims of which they are personally aware” if the claims are owned or controlled by the participant or the entity the participant is from, employed by, or otherwise represents.
  - “Personal awareness” means that the participant “is personally aware that the holder may have a potential Essential Patent Claim,” even if the participant is not personally aware of the specific patents or patent claims.
- “Should inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed)” of the identity of “any other holders of such potential Essential Patent Claims” (that is, third parties that are not affiliated with the participant, with the participant’s employer, or with anyone else that the participant is from or otherwise represents).
- The above does not apply if the patent claim is already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance that applies to the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group.

Quoted text excerpted from IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws subclause 6.2

- Early identification of holders of potential Essential Patent Claims is strongly encouraged
- No duty to perform a patent search
All participants should be familiar with their obligations under the IEEE-SA Policies & Procedures for standards development.

Patent Policy is stated in these sources:

- IEEE-SA Standards Boards Bylaws
  
  http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws/sect6-7.html#6

  

Material about the patent policy is available at

http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-material.html

If you have questions, contact the IEEE-SA Standards Board Patent Committee Administrator at patcom@ieee.org or visit http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/index.html

This slide set is available at http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt
Call for Potentially Essential Patents

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance:

- Either speak up now or
- Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible or
- Cause an LOA to be submitted
Other Guidelines for IEEE WG Meetings

- All IEEE-SA standards meetings shall be conducted in compliance with all applicable laws, including antitrust and competition laws.
  - Don’t discuss the interpretation, validity, or essentiality of patents/patent claims.
  - Don’t discuss specific license rates, terms, or conditions.
    - Relative costs, including licensing costs of essential patent claims, of different technical approaches may be discussed in standards development meetings.
      - Technical considerations remain primary focus
  - Don’t discuss or engage in the fixing of product prices, allocation of customers, or division of sales markets.
  - Don’t discuss the status or substance of ongoing or threatened litigation.
  - Don’t be silent if inappropriate topics are discussed … do formally object.

See IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual, clause 5.3.10 and “Promoting Competition and Innovation: What You Need to Know about the IEEE Standards Association’s Antitrust and Competition Policy” for more details.
Future interim meetings

- **May 2009 (firm):**
  - Pittsburgh Pen 18\textsuperscript{th}-21\textsuperscript{st}

- **September 2009 (offer):**
  - Offer from Claudio DeSanti/Cisco to host a meeting in Tuscany 7\textsuperscript{th} through 10\textsuperscript{th}.

- **January 2010 (offer):**
  - Jan 2009 New Orleans meeting – sponsors incurred hotel penalties
  - Hotel has offered a deal on the penalties if we hold a repeat meeting in 2010
  - Needs to be late in the month to be useful given holiday season
Liaisons

- Joint meetings with 802.11
  – Thurs 8-10 with AVB TG
- 802.3 – will be working on a PAR to support 802.1AS.
- Any others?
Email lists

- Is 1 enough?
- Do we need an additional list(s) to handle ballot traffic?
- Other solutions (e.g., 802.11’s web based system)?
TG reports

- Interworking
- Security
- AV
- DCB
(IN)Sanity check – current workload

1. 802 O&A – TG ballot. PAR to Dec ‘11
2. 802.1H revision – TG ballot. PAR to Dec ‘10
3. 802.1Q-REV – PAR approved. PAR to Dec ‘12
4. 802.1X-REV (Key agreement): to Sponsor ballot. PAR to Dec ’12
5. 802.1AB (LLDP) revision: to Sponsor ballot. PAR to Dec ‘11
6. 802.1AC (MAC Service): TG ballot. PAR to Dec ‘10
Motions
MOTION

- 802.1 approves the November 2008 and January 2009 minutes.
- Proposed: messenger  Seconded: Finn
- For 38  Against  0  Abstain  0
MOTION

- 802.1 resolves to hold pre-meeting(s) on the Monday morning of the July 2009 plenary session.
- 802.1 Proposed: Teener
- Second: Nolish
  - For: 34  Against: 0  Abstain: 1
MOTION

802.1 resolves to hold its September interim meeting in Tuscany, 8\textsuperscript{th} through 11\textsuperscript{th} September 2009.

Proposed: DeSanti

Second: Finn

– For: 33    Against: 0    Abstain: 13
Motions - AVB
MOTION

- Motion: The AVB TG will continue to have teleconferences weekly at 9AM (US Pacific) Wednesdays for AVB general topics and 10AM (US Pacific) Mondays for 802.1AS specific topics. Access information will be sent to the 802.1 reflector immediately after the plenary.

- Proposed: Johas Teener

- Second: Gunther
  - For: 18
  - Against: 0
  - Abstain: 23
MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qav (Tony Jeffree) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Johas Teener    Second: Gunther
- For: 34   Against: 0   Abstain: 8
MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1Qav to Sponsor ballot following completion of recirculation balloting.

- Proposed: Johas Teener
  Second: Gunther

- For: 37   Against: 0   Abstain: 7

- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:
Motion

- 802.1 authorizes the 802.1 Chair to take the necessary steps to initiate generation of an IEEE-SA press release announcing the transition of 802.1Qav to Sponsor ballot.

- Proposed: Johas Teener Second: Young

- For: 32 Against: 1 Abstain: 11
MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qat (Craig Gunther) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group balloting.
- Proposed: Johas Teener    Second: Gunther
- For: 36  Against: 0   Abstain: 8
Motions - DCB
MOTION

- Motion: Authorize DCBX ad hoc teleconferences weekly 10AM (US Pacific) Thursdays. Access information will be sent to the 802.1 reflector immediately after the plenary.
- Proposed: thaler
- Second: DeSanti
  - For: 22
  - Against: 0
  - Abstain: 17
MOTION

- The editor of P802.1Qau (Norm Finn) is instructed to prepare a draft for working group ballot based on comment resolution at the March plenary.
- The Chair is authorized to submit the draft for working group balloting.

- Proposed: Thaler Second: Finn
- For: 38 Against: 0 Abstain: 6
MOTION

- The editor of P802.1Qaz (Craig Carlson) is instructed to prepare a draft for task group ballot based on consensus at the May 09 interim meeting.
- The Chair is authorized to submit the draft for task group balloting.

- Proposed: Thaler Second: DeSanti
- For: 30  Against: 0  Abstain: 10
MOTION

- The editor of P802.1Qbb (Claudio DeSanti) is instructed to prepare a draft for task group ballot based on comment resolution at the March and May 09 meetings.
- The Chair is authorized to submit the draft for task group balloting.

- Proposed: Thaler Second: DeSanti
- For: 34 Against: 0 Abstain: 7
Motion

- Forward draft PAR for 802.3bd Amendment: MAC Control Frame for Priority-based Flow Control to the EC for approval to forward to NesCom.

- Proposed: Thaler Second: DeSanti
- For: 32  Against: 1  Abstain: 9
- EC: Proposed: Jeffree Second: Thaler
Motions - Security
MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1X-REV (Mick Seaman) to prepare a further draft for WG recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Seaman  Second: Fuller
- For: 34  Against: 0  Abstain: 3
MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1X-REV to Sponsor ballot following completion of recirculation balloting.

- Proposed: Seaman Second: Fuller

- For: 33    Against: 0    Abstain: 2

- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:
MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1AR (Max Pritikin) to prepare a further draft for WG recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Seaman  Second: Salowey
- For: 29  Against: 0  Abstain: 3
MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1AR to Sponsor ballot following completion of recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Seaman Second: Salowey
- For: 32  Against: 0  Abstain: 3
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:
Motions - Interworking
MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qay (Panos Saltsidis) to prepare a further draft for Sponsor recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Saltsidis
- For: 41 Against: 0 Abstain: 0
MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1Qay to RevCom following completion of recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Saltsidis
- For: 39 Against: 0 Abstain: 0
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:
Motion

- 802.1 authorizes the 802.1 Chair to take the necessary steps to initiate generation of an IEEE-SA press release announcing the forwarding of 802.1Qay to RevCom.
- Proposed: Young    Second: Saltsidis
- For: 40    Against: 0    Abstain: 0
MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qaw (Linda Dunbar) to prepare a further draft for Sponsor recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Dunbar
- For: 31 Against: 0 Abstain: 3
MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1Qaw to RevCom following completion of recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Dunbar
- For: 35  Against: 0  Abstain: 2
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:
MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1AB-REV (Tony Jeffree) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Nolish
- For: 43 Against: 0 Abstain: 0
MOTION

- 802.1 requests approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1AB-REV to Sponsor Ballot.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Nolish
- For: 39 Against: 0 Abstain: 0
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:
MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802-REV (Tony Jeffree) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Nolish
- For: 32  Against: 0  Abstain: 1
MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1AC (Tony Jeffree) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Nolish
- For: 35 Against: 0 Abstain: 1
MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editors of P802.1H-REV (Nolish, Wright) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Nolish
- For: 35 Against: 0 Abstain: 0
MOTION

- 802.1 approves the liaison letter to the IETF regarding TRILL:
- <see text as presented>.
- Proposed: Haddock    Second: Fedyk
- For: 25    Against: 0    Abstain: 4
Motion

- Authorize the May interim to generate a PAR and 5C’s for pre-circulation to the EC for an 802.1Q Amendment: PBB-TE segment protection switching
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Mack-Crane
- For: 26 Against: 0 Abstain: 4
Motion

- Authorize the May interim to generate a PAR and 5C’s for pre-circulation to the EC for 802.1Q Amendment: Support for a non-access point station Bridge
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Finn
- For: 26 Against: 0 Abstain: 1
Motion

- Authorize the May interim to generate a PAR 5C’s for pre-circulation to the EC for an 802.1Q Amendment: Multiple I-SID Registration Protocol (MIRP)
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Finn
- For: 32  Against: 0  Abstain: 0
Motion

- Authorize the May interim to generate a PAR and 5C’s for pre-circulation to the EC for 802.1Q Amendment: E-NNI hairpin switching
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Finn
- For: 25 Against: 0 Abstain: 1
Motion

- Authorize the May interim to generate a PAR and 5C’s for pre-circulation to the EC for Edge Virtual Bridging
- Proposed: Hudson Second: Mack-Crane
- For: 20 Against: 6 Abstain: 8