

# 802.1 Plenary - 03/2009

Closing Agenda

# Decorum



- Press (i.e., anyone reporting publicly on this meeting) are to announce their presence (2008 SASB Op Manual 5.3.3.5)
- Photography or recording by permission only (2008 SASB Op Manual 5.3.3.4)
- Cell phone ringers off please

# The following are 802.1 voters:

Aboul-Magd, Osama  
Alon, Zehavit  
Bestler, Caitlin  
Bialkowski, Jan  
Boatright, Rob  
Bonnamy, Jean-Michel  
Bottorff, Paul  
Brandner, Rudolf  
Carlson, Craig  
Cheng, Weiyang  
Cherukuri, Rao  
Cheung, Taesik  
Congdon, Paul  
Crupnicoff, Diego  
Desanti, Claudio  
Ding, Zhemin  
Dunbar, Linda  
Elbakoury, Hesham  
Elie-Dit-Cosaque, David  
Farkas, Janos  
Fedyk, Donald  
Feng, Felix Feifei  
Finn, Norman  
Frazier, Robert  
Fuller, John  
Garner, Geoffrey  
Ghanwani, Anoop

Goetz, Franz  
GOFF, YANNICK  
Gray, Eric  
Grewal, Karanvir  
Gunther, Craig  
Gusat, Mitch  
Haddock, Stephen  
Hausauer, Brian  
Hazarika, Asif  
Insler, Romain  
Jeffree, Anthony  
Karandikar, Abhay  
Kashyap, Prakash  
Keen, Hal  
Kilcrease, Keti  
Kim, Yongbum  
Klein, Philippe  
Ko, Mike  
Kondapalli, Raghu  
Kumar, Vinod  
Kwan, Bruce  
Laihonen, Kari  
Lerer, Michael  
Mace, Gael  
Mack-Crane, Ben  
Martin, David  
Martinotti, Riccardo

Mascitto, Marco  
McGuire, Alan  
McIntosh, James  
Menuchery, Menucher  
Messenger, John  
Mohan, Dinesh  
Mora, Matthew  
Multanen, Eric  
Nolish, Kevin  
Ohta, Hiroshi  
Olsen, David  
Pannell, Donald  
Parsons, Glenn  
Patton, Ken  
Pelissier, Joseph  
Peterson, David  
Porat, Hayim  
Pritikin, Max  
Rajagopal, Ananda  
Randall, Karen  
Roden, Robert  
Roeck, Guenter  
Roese, Josef  
Rohde, Derek  
Romascanu, Dan  
Roth, Moran  
Rouyer, Jessy

Sadler, Jonathan  
Sajassi, Ali  
Salowey, Joseph  
Saltsidis, Panagiotis  
Sathe, Satish  
Sauer, John  
Seaman, Michael  
Seto, Koichiro  
Shah, Himanshu  
Sprecher, Nurit  
Stanton, Kevin  
Sultan, Robert  
Suzuki, Muneyoshi  
Swallow, George  
Takacs, Attila  
Teener, Michael  
Terry, John  
Thaler, Patricia  
Thorp, Oliver  
Tuck, Fred  
Wadekar, Manoj  
Wang, Yan  
Weis, Brian  
Wijnen, Bert  
Winkel, Ludwig  
Wright, Michael D.  
Wu, Chien-Hsien  
Young, Ken  
Zorn, Glen

The following have become voting members if they are here this week:

Bjorkman, Bill

Lipshteyn, Marina

Sharma, Suman

# Instructions for the WG Chair

The IEEE-SA strongly recommends that at each WG meeting the chair or a designee:

- Show slides #1 through #4 of this presentation
- Advise the WG attendees that:
  - The IEEE's patent policy is consistent with the ANSI patent policy and is described in Clause 6 of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws*;
  - Early identification of patent claims which may be essential for the use of standards under development is strongly encouraged;
  - There may be Essential Patent Claims of which the IEEE is not aware. Additionally, neither the IEEE, the WG, nor the WG chair can ensure the accuracy or completeness of any assurance or whether any such assurance is, in fact, of a Patent Claim that is essential for the use of the standard under development.
- Instruct the WG Secretary to record in the minutes of the relevant WG meeting:
  - That the foregoing information was provided and that slides 1 through 4 (and this slide 0, if applicable) were shown;
  - That the chair or designee provided an opportunity for participants to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) of which the participant is personally aware and that may be essential for the use of that standard
  - Any responses that were given, specifically the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that were identified (if any) and by whom.
- The WG Chair shall ensure that a request is made to any identified holders of potential essential patent claim(s) to complete and submit a Letter of Assurance.
- It is recommended that the WG chair review the guidance in *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual* 6.3.5 and in FAQs 12 and 12a on inclusion of potential Essential Patent Claims by incorporation or by reference.

Note: **WG** includes Working Groups, Task Groups, and other standards-developing committees with a PAR approved by the IEEE-SA Standards Board.

(Optional to be shown)

# Participants, Patents, and Duty to Inform

All participants in this meeting have certain obligations under the IEEE-SA Patent Policy. Participants:

- “Shall inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed)” of the identity of each “holder of any potential Essential Patent Claims of which they are personally aware” if the claims are owned or controlled by the participant or the entity the participant is from, employed by, or otherwise represents
  - “Personal awareness” means that the participant “is personally aware that the holder may have a potential Essential Patent Claim,” even if the participant is not personally aware of the specific patents or patent claims
- “Should inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed)” of the identity of “any other holders of such potential Essential Patent Claims” (that is, third parties that are not affiliated with the participant, with the participant’s employer, or with anyone else that the participant is from or otherwise represents)
- The above does not apply if the patent claim is already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance that applies to the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group

Quoted text excerpted from IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws subclause 6.2

- Early identification of holders of potential Essential Patent Claims is strongly encouraged
- No duty to perform a patent search

# Patent Related Links

All participants should be familiar with their obligations under the IEEE-SA Policies & Procedures for standards development.

Patent Policy is stated in these sources:

IEEE-SA Standards Boards Bylaws

*<http://standards.ieee.org/guides/bylaws/sect6-7.html#6>*

IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual

*<http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3>*

Material about the patent policy is available at

*<http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-material.html>*

If you have questions, contact the IEEE-SA Standards Board Patent Committee Administrator at [patcom@ieee.org](mailto:patcom@ieee.org) or visit <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/index.html>

This slide set is available at <http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt>

# Call for Potentially Essential Patents

- If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance:
  - Either speak up now or
  - Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible or
  - Cause an LOA to be submitted



# Other Guidelines for IEEE WG

## Meetings

- **All IEEE-SA standards meetings shall be conducted in compliance with all applicable laws, including antitrust and competition laws.**
  - **Don't discuss the interpretation, validity, or essentiality of patents/patent claims.**
  - **Don't discuss specific license rates, terms, or conditions.**
    - Relative costs, including licensing costs of essential patent claims, of different technical approaches may be discussed in standards development meetings.
      - Technical considerations remain primary focus
  - **Don't discuss or engage in the fixing of product prices, allocation of customers, or division of sales markets.**
  - **Don't discuss the status or substance of ongoing or threatened litigation.**
  - **Don't be silent if inappropriate topics are discussed ... do formally object.**

-----  
See *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual*, clause 5.3.10 and “Promoting Competition and Innovation: What You Need to Know about the IEEE Standards Association's Antitrust and Competition Policy” for more details.

# Future interim meetings

- May 2009 (firm):
  - Pittsburgh Pen 18<sup>th</sup>-21<sup>st</sup>
- September 2009 (offer):
  - Offer from Claudio DeSanti/Cisco to host a meeting in Tuscany 7<sup>th</sup> through 10<sup>th</sup>.
- January 2010 (offer):
  - Jan 2009 New Orleans meeting – sponsors incurred hotel penalties
  - Hotel has offered a deal on the penalties if we hold a repeat meeting in 2010
  - Needs to be late in the month to be useful given holiday season

# Liaisons

- Joint meetings with 802.11
  - Thurs 8-10 with AVB TG
- 802.3 – will be working on a PAR to support 802.1AS.
- Any others?

# Email lists

- Is 1 enough?
- Do we need an additional list(s) to handle ballot traffic?
- Other solutions (e.g., 802.11's web based system)?

# TG reports

- Interworking
- Security
- AV
- DCB

# (IN)Sanity check – current workload

1. 802 O&A – TG ballot. PAR to Dec '11
2. 802.1H revision – TG ballot. PAR to Dec '10
3. 802.1Q-REV – PAR approved. PAR to Dec '12
4. 802.1X-REV (Key agreement): to Sponsor ballot. PAR to Dec '12
5. 802.1AB (LLDP) revision: to Sponsor ballot. PAR to Dec '11
6. 802.1AC (MAC Service): TG ballot. PAR to Dec '10

# Motions

# MOTION

- 802.1 approves the November 2008 and January 2009 minutes.
- Proposed: messenger Seconded: Finn
- For 38 Against 0 Abstain 0



# MOTION

- 802.1 resolves to hold pre-meeting(s) on the Monday morning of the July 2009 plenary session.
- 802.1 Proposed:Teener
- Second:Nolish
  - For: 34 Against: 0 Abstain: 1

# MOTION

- 802.1 resolves to hold its September interim meeting in Tuscany, 8<sup>th</sup> through 11<sup>th</sup> September 2009.
- Proposed: DeSanti
- Second: Finn
  - For: 33 Against: 0 Abstain: 13

# Motions - AVB

# MOTION

- Motion: The AVB TG will continue to have teleconferences weekly at 9AM (US Pacific) Wednesdays for AVB general topics and 10AM (US Pacific) Mondays for 802.1AS specific topics. Access information will be sent to the 802.1 reflector immediately after the plenary.
- Proposed: Johas Teener
- Second: Gunther
  - For: 18
  - Against: 0
  - Abstain: 23

# MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qav (Tony Jeffree) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Johas Teener    Second: Gunther
- For: 34    Against: 0    Abstain: 8

# MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1Qav to Sponsor ballot following completion of recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Johas Teener  
Second: Gunther
- For: 37    Against: 0    Abstain: 7
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

# Motion

- 802.1 authorizes the 802.1 Chair to take the necessary steps to initiate generation of an IEEE-SA press release announcing the transition of 802.1Qav to Sponsor ballot.
- Proposed: Johas Teener Second:Young
- For: 32 Against: 1 Abstain: 11

# MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qat (Craig Gunther) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group balloting.
- Proposed: Johas Teener      Second: Gunther
- For: 36    Against: 0    Abstain: 8



# Motions - DCB

# MOTION

- Motion: Authorize DCBX ad hoc teleconferences weekly 10AM (US Pacific) Thursdays. Access information will be sent to the 802.1 reflector immediately after the plenary.
- Proposed: thaler
- Second: DeSanti
  - For:22
  - Against:0
  - Abstain:17

# MOTION

- The editor of P802.1Qau (Norm Finn) is instructed to prepare a draft for working group ballot based on comment resolution at the March plenary.
- The Chair is authorized to submit the draft for working group balloting.
- Proposed: Thaler Second: Finn
- For: 38 Against: 0 Abstain: 6

# MOTION

- The editor of P802.1Qaz (Craig Carlson) is instructed to prepare a draft for task group ballot based on consensus at the May 09 interim meeting.
- The Chair is authorized to submit the draft for task group balloting.
- Proposed: Thaler Second:DeSanti
- For: 30 Against: 0 Abstain: 10

# MOTION

- The editor of P802.1Qbb (Claudio DeSanti) is instructed to prepare a draft for task group ballot based on comment resolution at the March and May 09 meetings
- The Chair is authorized to submit the draft for task group balloting.
- Proposed: Thaler Second:DeSanti
- For: 34 Against: 0 Abstain: 7

# Motion

- Forward draft PAR for 802.3bd  
Amendment: MAC Control Frame for  
Priority-based Flow Control to the EC  
for approval to forward to NesCom.
- Proposed: Thaler Second:DeSanti
- For: 32 Against: 1 Abstain:9
- EC: Proposed: Jeffree Second: Thaler

# Motions - Security

# MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1X-REV (Mick Seaman) to prepare a further draft for WG recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Seaman Second:Fuller
- For: 34 Against: 0 Abstain: 3



# MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1X-REV to Sponsor ballot following completion of recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Seaman Second:Fuller
- For: 33 Against: 0 Abstain: 2
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

# MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1AR (Max Pritikin) to prepare a further draft for WG recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Seaman Second:Salowey
- For: 29    Against: 0    Abstain: 3

# MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1AR to Sponsor ballot following completion of recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Seaman Second:Salowey
- For: 32 Against: 0 Abstain: 3
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

# Motions - Interworking

# MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qay (Panos Saltsidis) to prepare a further draft for Sponsor recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Saltsidis
- For: 41    Against: 0    Abstain: 0

# MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1Qay to RevCom following completion of recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Saltsidis
- For: 39 Against: 0 Abstain: 0
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:
-

# Motion

- 802.1 authorizes the 802.1 Chair to take the necessary steps to initiate generation of an IEEE-SA press release announcing the forwarding of 802.1Qay to RevCom.
- Proposed: Young    Second:Saltsidis
- For: 40    Against: 0    Abstain: 0

# MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1Qaw (Linda Dunbar) to prepare a further draft for Sponsor recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Dunbar
- For: 31 Against: 0 Abstain: 3



# MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1Qaw to RevCom following completion of recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Dunbar
- For: 35     Against: 0     Abstain: 2
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:
-

# MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1AB-REV (Tony Jeffree) to prepare a further draft . The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Working Group recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Nolish
- For: 43 Against: 0 Abstain: 0

# MOTION

- 802.1 requests approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1AB-REV to Sponsor Ballot.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Nolish
- For: 39 Against: 0 Abstain: 0
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:
-

# MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802-REV (Tony Jeffree) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Nolish
- For: 32 Against: 0 Abstain:1

# MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editor of P802.1AC (Tony Jeffree) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Nolish
- For: 35 Against: 0 Abstain: 1

# MOTION

- 802.1 instructs the editors of P802.1H-REV (Nolish, Wright) to prepare a further draft. The Chair is authorized to submit the project for Task Group balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Nolish
- For: 35    Against: 0    Abstain: 0

# MOTION

- 802.1 approves the liaison letter to the IETF regarding TRILL:
- <see text as presented>.
- Proposed: Haddock    Second: Fedyk
- For: 25    Against: 0    Abstain: 4

# Motion

- Authorize the May interim to generate a PAR and 5C's for pre-circulation to the EC for an 802.1Q Amendment: PBB-TE segment protection switching
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Mack-Crane
- For: 26      Against: 0      Abstain: 4



# Motion

- Authorize the May interim to generate a PAR and 5C's for pre-circulation to the EC for 802.1Q Amendment: Support for a non-access point station Bridge
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Finn
- For: 26      Against: 0      Abstain: 1

# Motion

- Authorize the May interim to generate a PAR 5C's for pre-circulation to the EC for an 802.1Q Amendment: Multiple I-SID Registration Protocol (MIRP)
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Finn
- For: 32      Against: 0      Abstain: 0

# Motion

- Authorize the May interim to generate a PAR and 5C's for pre-circulation to the EC for 802.1Q Amendment: E-NNI hairpin switching
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Finn
- For: 25      Against: 0      Abstain: 1

# Motion

- Authorize the May interim to generate a PAR and 5C's for pre-circulation to the EC for Edge Virtual Bridging
- Proposed: Hudson Second: Mack-Crane
- For: 20 Against: 6 Abstain: 8