802.1 Plenary - 11/2013 Dallas

Closing Agenda

802.1 officers etc

- Officers
  - Chair: Tony Jeffree
  - Vice Chair: Glenn Parsons
  - Recording Secretary: Eric Gray
  - Security TG Chair: Mick Seaman
  - Interworking TG Chair: Steve Haddock
  - AV Bridging TG Chair: Michael Johas Teener
  - Data Center Bridging TG Chair: Pat Thaler
  - Maintenance of website: John Messenger
  - Maintenance of Email exploder: Hal Keen
- Website
  - http://www.ieee802.org/1/
  - Username: p8021   Password: go_wildcats

Administrative stuff – Upload area

■ Website – New Upload area

– The new file upload facility can be accessed from the filenaming conventions page at:

http://ieee802.org/1/filenaming.html

The following are 802.1 voters:

Ao, Ting	GU, Yingjie	Pannell, Donald
Boehlke, Kenneth	Gunther, Craig	Parsons, Glenn
Boiger, Christian	Haddock, Stephen	Randall, Karen
Bottorff, Paul	Hayakawa, Hitoshi	Romascanu, Dan
Catlin, Jeffrey	Jakovljevic, Mirko	Rouyer, Jessy
Chang, Xin	Jeffree, Anthony	Saltsidis, Panagiotis
Cheng, Weiying	Jochim, Markus	Schell, Rick
Crupnicoff, Diego	Johas Teener, Michael	Seaman, Michael
Cummings, Rodney	Jones, Girault	Seto, Koichiro
DIARRA, Aboubacar Kader	Keen, Hal	Sexton, Daniel
Farkas, Janos	Kiessling, Marcel	Specht, Johannes
Fedyk, Donald	Klein, Philippe	Stanton, Kevin
Finn, Norman	Kleineberg, Oliver	Steiner, Wilfried
Fredette, Andre	Lynch, Jeff	Thaler, Patricia
Garner, Geoffrey	Mack-Crane, Ben	Touve, Jeremy
Ghanwani, Anoop	Messenger, John	Tretter, Albert
Goetz, Franz	Moldovansky, Anatoly	Vissers, Maarten
Gravel, Mark	Multanen, Eric	Weber, Karl
Gray, Eric	Muyshondt, Henry	Wei, Yuehua
Grow, Robert	Olsen, David	Xiao, Min

The following will become voting members when/if they show up here this week:

Hitt, Jeremy
Hussain, Rahil
McIntosh, James
Sabony, Mazda

The following could become voting members if they email me indicating their intention to do so and if they show up here this week:

Bragg, Nigel
Diamond, Patrick
Magee, Anthony
Stokes, Olen
Unbehagen, Paul
Walter, Todd

Instructions for the WG Chair

The IEEE-SA strongly recommends that at each WG meeting the chair or a designee:

– **Show slides #1 through #4 of this presentation**
– **Advise the WG attendees that:**
  - The IEEE's patent policy is described in Clause 6 of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws*;
  - Early identification of patent claims which may be essential for the use of standards under development is strongly encouraged;
  - There may be Essential Patent Claims of which the IEEE is not aware. Additionally, neither the IEEE, the WG, nor the WG chair can ensure the accuracy or completeness of any assurance or whether any such assurance is, in fact, of a Patent Claim that is essential for the use of the standard under development.

– **Instruct the WG Secretary to record in the minutes of the relevant WG meeting:**
  - That the foregoing information was provided and that slides 1 through 4 (and this slide 0, if applicable) were shown;
  - That the chair or designee provided an opportunity for participants to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) of which the participant is personally aware and that may be essential for the use of that standard
  - Any responses that were given, specifically the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that were identified (if any) and by whom.

– The WG Chair shall ensure that a request is made to any identified holders of potential essential patent claim(s) to complete and submit a Letter of Assurance.
– It is recommended that the WG chair review the guidance in *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual* 6.3.5 and in FAQs 12 and 12a on inclusion of potential Essential Patent Claims by incorporation or by reference.

   Note: **WG** includes Working Groups, Task Groups, and other standards-developing committees with a PAR approved by the IEEE-SA Standards Board.

(Optional to be shown) (Updated January 2012)

Participants, Patents, and Duty to Inform

All participants in this meeting have certain obligations under the IEEE-SA Patent Policy.

- **Participants [Note: Quoted text excerpted from IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws subclause 6.2]:**
  - **"Shall inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed)" of the identity of each "holder of any potential Essential Patent Claims of which they are personally aware" if the claims are owned or controlled by the participant or the entity the participant is from, employed by, or otherwise represents**
    - **"Personal awareness" means that the participant "is personally aware that the holder may have a potential Essential Patent Claim," even if the participant is not personally aware of the specific patents or patent claims**
  - **"Should inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed)" of the identity of "any other holders of such potential Essential Patent Claims" (that is, third parties that are not affiliated with the participant, with the participant's employer, or with anyone else that the participant is from or otherwise represents)**
- **The above does not apply if the patent claim is already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance that applies to the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group**
- **Early identification of holders of potential Essential Patent Claims is strongly encouraged**
- **No duty to perform a patent search**

Patent Related Links

All participants should be familiar with their obligations under the IEEE-SA Policies & Procedures for standards development.

Patent Policy is stated in these sources:

IEEE-SA Standards Boards Bylaws

http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/bylaws/sect6-7.html#6

IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual

http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/opman/sect6.html#6.3

Material about the patent policy is available at

http://standards.ieee.org/about/sasb/patcom/materials.html

If you have questions, contact the IEEE-SA Standards Board Patent Committee Administrator at patcom@ieee.org or visit http://standards.ieee.org/about/sasb/patcom/index.html

This slide set is available at https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/mob/slideset.ppt

Call for Potentially Essential Patents

- If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance:
    - Either speak up now or
    - Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible or
    - Cause an LOA to be submitted

Other Guidelines for IEEE WG Meetings

- **All IEEE-SA standards meetings shall be conducted in compliance with all applicable laws, including antitrust and competition laws.**

  - **Don't discuss the interpretation, validity, or essentiality of patents/patent claims.**

  - **Don't discuss specific license rates, terms, or conditions.**

    - Relative costs, including licensing costs of essential patent claims, of different technical approaches may be discussed in standards development meetings.

      - Technical considerations remain primary focus

  - **Don't discuss or engage in the fixing of product prices, allocation of customers, or division of sales markets.**

  - **Don't discuss the status or substance of ongoing or threatened litigation.**

  - **Don't be silent if inappropriate topics are discussed … do formally object.**

  See *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual*, clause 5.3.10 and "Promoting Competition and Innovation: What You Need to Know about the IEEE Standards Association's Antitrust and Competition Policy" for more details.

Task Group Patent policy announcements

- **TG Chairs please note:**
  - At the start of each TG meeting, TG Chair needs to perform the Call for Patents as per the previous slides.
  - During the rest of the week, please announce each morning that the meeting is subject to the Patents Policy as read and displayed at the opening of the TG meeting. If there are any responses to the call, minute it.
  - Point attendees at the PatCom website for details of the policy:

  http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/index.html

  and for the slide set:

  http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/pat-slideset.ppt

802.1 Chair/Vice-Chair elections

- These elections will take place during the closing 802.1 Plenary in March 2014
- Nominations are invited at any time from now until the start of the closing 802.1 Plenary in March 2014
- The existing Chair does not intend to stand for re-election.
- If there are multiple nominees for a post, then an election will take place in which only 802.1 voters participate and in which each voter casts a single vote for their preferred candidate. To win the election, a majority of voters present in the room is required. If a majority is not achieved, then the candidate with the least number of votes is eliminated and the vote re-taken.
- A motion to approve the winning candidate (in the case of an election) or the single nominee (in the event that there is only one candidate for the post) will then be made and voted upon by 802.1 voting members.

802 Chair and Officer elections

- These elections will take place during the closing EC meeting in March 2014

- Positions to be filled:
  - 802 Chair
  - 802 1st Vice-Chair
  - 802 2nd Vice Chair
  - 802 Recording Secretary
  - 802 Treasurer
  - 802 Executive Secretary

- If you have ambitions to be 802 Chair, talk to Paul Nikolich to find out what is involved.

- The 802 Officers are appointed by the 802 Chair, so if you have any ambitions in that direction, talk to the candidate(s) for 802 Chair position.

OmniRAN PAR

- The conclusions and responses to the received comments are captured in https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0091-02-ecsg-nov-2013-collected-comments-on-draft-par-proposal.xlsx

- The comment resolution led to a revised version of the PAR proposal:

- https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/13/omniran-13-0086-02-ecsg-proposed-par-and-5c.docx

Future interim meetings

- Jan 2014: Joint with 802.11 in LA 21st-24th
  - REGISTRATION (http://802world.org/apps/session/83/register) and HOTEL RESERVATIONS (https://resweb.passkey.com/Resweb.do?mode=welcome_ei_new&eventID=10736425)
- May 12-16 2014: John D'Ambrosia/Ethernet Alliance
  - http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2013/admin-ea-offer-to-host-may2014-15-0713.pdf
- September (8th – 11th) 2014: Ottawa, Glenn Parsons/Ericsson
  - Brookstreet Hotel $185 CDN with golf tournament
  - Meeting fee $300/$500 CDN
- January 2015
  - Joint with the wireless groups (Atlanta)?
- May 11-15 2015: John D'Ambrosia/Ethernet Alliance
  - http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2013/admin-ea-offer-to-host-may2014-15-0713.pdf

Proposed 5C/OM changes

- 5C:
  - https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/13/ec-13-0009-12-00EC-proposed-5c.pdf
  - Comments to James Gilb by 5pm Tuesday; James will respond by Wednesday 5pm.
- Other OM, WG P&P and CG changes:
  - https://mentor.ieee.org/802-ec/dcn/13/ec-13-0053-00-00EC-proposed-rule-change-for-november-2013.pdf

Plenary time pressure

- Plenary weeks are becoming problematic – increasing pressure on TG time

- Is it worth considering moving the closing Plenary to free up more time?
  - 5pm Thursday?
  - Friday morning?

Sanity check – current workload

Project	Subject	Stage	Draft#	Next action	PAR ends
802	O&A	Sponsor ballot	D1.7	Comment resolution	Dec '13
802.1Qbp	ECMP	Sponsor ballot	D1.7	RevCom	Dec '15
802.1AX-REV	Link Aggregation	WG ballot	D3.0	Comment-resolution	Dec '15
802.1ASbt	Time synch enhancements	Pre-draft	-		Dec '15
802.1Qbu	Frame preemption	Editor's draft	D0.0	Editor's draft #2	Dec '16
802.1Qbv	Scheduled traffic	Editor's draft #2	D0.1	Editor's draft #3	Dec '16
802.1Xbx	MKA extensions	WG Ballot	D1.2	Sponsor ballot	Dec '16
802.1Q-REV	Bridging revision	WG ballot	D1.3	Comment resolution	Dec '16
802.1Qbz	802.11 Bridging	TG ballot	D1.3	TG ballot	Dec '16
802.1Qca	SPB Path Control and Reservation	TG ballot	D0.4	Comment resolution	Dec '16
802.1CB	Frame Replication and Elimination	PAR approved	-	Initial Editor's draft	Dec '17
802.1AC-REV	MAC service	TG ballot	0.1	Comment resolution	Dec '17
802.1Qcc	SRP enhancements & performance improvements	PAR approved	-	Initial Editor's draft	Dec '17
802.1Qcd	Application VLAN TLV	TG ballot	D0.1	Comment resolution	Dec '17
802.1ARce	AR: SHA-384 and P-384 Elliptic Curve	PAR development	-	PAR precirculation	
802.1CF	Access network (OmniRAN)	PAR precirculated	-	PAR to NesCom	
802.1AB Cor-2	Tech and ed corrections	PAR precirculated	-	PAR to NesCom	
802.1AEcg	Ethernet data encryptors	PAR development		PAR precirculation	

802 O&A completion plan

- **Comment resolution on-line and at interim meeting (802.1 is colacated with wireless interim) – 24 Jan 2014**

- **Recirculate Feb 2014**

- **Comment resolution on-line, complete at March 2014 Plenary, conditional approval from EC**

- **Recirculate April 2014**

- **Comment resolution on-line, complete by end of May**

- **Recirculate June 2014**

- **Submit to RevCom July 2014**

ONF NBI Effort

Ben Mack-Crane

Huawei

11/14/13

NBI Leadership Roundtable

The ONF North Bound Interfaces (NBI) Work Group is inviting all organizations having interest in further collaboration, information sharing, and possible coordination around NBI technologies for SDN to an inaugural Leadership Roundtable on **Tuesday, November 19th**.

The purpose of this meeting is to identify stakeholders, communicate plans, and discover ways to more cohesively develop this important area of SDN. This meeting is a public meeting; ONF is soliciting leaders from respective organizations to present their plans in this area, and our hope is that greater coordination and further mutual activities may arise from this initial effort.

Is 802.1 interested in SDN NBI work?

802.1 specifies datapath functions that can be controlled by SDN
- Forwarding (unicast and multicast)
- Learning (including shared learning)
- Encapsulation (Q, Q-in-Q, MAC-in-MAC)
- Queuing/Scheduling (ETS, Credit-based Shaper, Scheduled Traffic)
- Control protocols may even be used…
  (e.g., LLDP for discovery, Hybrid operation)

Is there interest in 802.1 to be involved in determining how these features will appear or be controllable through an SDN NBI?
- Promote 802.1 standards as useful networking solutions
- Encourage open control of 802.1 datapath functions
- Prevent misinterpretation of standard behaviors

Discussion in Interworking:
- Some interest in reviewing NBI proposals/drafts from ONF, or OpenFlow itself
- Some interest in promoting 802.1 technologies to the industry

TG reports

- Interworking
- Security
- TSN
- DCB
- Maintenance
- O&A

Motions

MOTION

- 802.1 approves the July 2013 and September 2013 minutes:

http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/minutes/2013-07-minutes-v01.pdf

http://ieee802.org/1/files/public/minutes/2013-09-minutes-v01.pdf

Proposed: Gray Seconded: seaman

- Approved by acclamation

MOTION

- 802.1 resolves to hold pre-meeting(s) on the Monday morning of the March 2014 plenary session.

- Proposed: haddock

- Second: Gray

- Approved by acclamation

OmniRAN

- 802.1 directs its chair to vote AGAINST approval for forwarding the OmniRAN PAR to NesCom.

- Proposed: Seaman

- Second: Messenger

- For 4 against 18 abstain 14

OmniRAN inside 802.1?

- 802.1 wants the OmniRAN activity, if approved, to be part of the 802.1 Working Group.

- Prop: gray

- Sec: thaler

- F: 19 a: 0 ab: 17

OmniRAN Task Group straw poll

- If OmniRAN is to be an 802.1 activity, we would prefer it to be

- a separate Task Group 11

- part of Interworking 11

Motions - Maintenance

MOTION

- Authorize teleconference meeting of the Maintenance task group on March 4th at 11am ET.
- Proposed: Parsons
- Second: Gray
- Approved by acclamation

MOTION

- 802.1 requests EC approval for forwarding P802.1AB-Cor2 PAR to NesCom.
- Proposed: Parsons
- Second: Gray
- For: 30 Against: 0   Abstain: 1

- EC proposed: Jeffree   Second: Thaler
- For____Against___Abstain____

MOTION

- 802.1 requests EC approval for forwarding P802.1Q-rev PAR modification to NesCom.
- Proposed: Parsons
- Second: Gray
- For: 33 Against: 0   Abstain: 0

- EC proposed: Jeffree   Second: Thaler
- For_____Against____Abstain_____

MOTION

- 802.1 requests EC conditional approval for initiating sponsor ballot on P802.1Q-rev.
- Proposed: Parsons
- Second: Gray
- For: 34 Against: 0   Abstain: 0

- EC proposed: Jeffree   Second: Thaler
- For____Against___Abstain____

MOTION

- 802.1 requests EC approval to forward P802.1Q-REV D2.0 to ISO/IEC JTC1 SC6, for information under the PSDO agreement, when it is forwarded to Sponsor ballot.
- Proposed: Seaman Second: randall
- For__29__Against_0__Abstain_2___

- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:
- For____Against___Abstain____

Motions - Security

As required to request/ authorize:

- 802.0 approval to forward P802.1Xbx to Sponsor Ballot.
- 802.1 approval to develop a PAR for P802.1ARce – Secure Device Identity: SHA-384 and P-384 Elliptic Curve and to pre-circulate prior to, and for 802.1 and 802.0 approval at, the March 2014 802 Plenary.
- 802.1 approval to develop a PAR for P802.1AExx – MAC Security: Ethernet Data Encryptors and to pre-circulate prior to, and for 802.1 and 802.0 approval at, the March 2014 802 Plenary.
- 802.0 approval to forward IEEE 802.1AEbn and 802.1AEbw to ISO/IEC JTC1 SC6 for adoption under the PSDO agreement.
- 802.0 approval to forward P802.1Xbx to ISO/IEC JTC1 SC6, for information under the PSDO arrangement, prior to the opening of the upcoming Sponsor ballot on that document.

MOTION

- 802.1 requests EC approval to submit P802.1Xbx D1.2 to Sponsor Ballot.
- Proposed: Seaman Second: Randall
- For__23__Against_0__Abstain__11__

- EC proposed: Jeffree Second: Thaler
- For____Against___Abstain____

[P802.1Xbx D1.2 Port-Based Network Access Control: Amendment—MAC Security Key Agreement protocol (MKA) extensions, passed WG & WG recirc ballots: 60 voters, 37 responding (62% response), 10 approve (100%), 0 disapprove (no outstanding comments), 27 abstentions.]

MOTION

- 802.1 authorizes the Security Task Group to hold teleconferences (subject to notice of at least 21 days to the 802.1 email exploder) to consider the proposed PAR for P802.1ARce – Secure Device Identity – Amendment: SHA-384 and P-384 Elliptic Curve.

  The 802.1 Chair is authorized to pre-circulate the (possibly revised) PAR[1] for consideration at the March 2014 meeting.
- Proposed: Seaman Second: Randall
- For_27___Against_0__Abstain__6__

[1]Drafts previously circulated to the 802.1 email exploder, also at:
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2013/new-sec-arce-draft-par-5cs-0913-v01.txt

MOTION

- 802.1 authorizes the Security Task Group to hold teleconferences (subject to notice of at least 21 days to the 802.1 email exploder) to consider the proposed PAR for P802.1AEcg – MAC Security – Amendment: Ethernet Data Encryptors.

  The 802.1 Chair is authorized to pre-circulate the (possibly revised) PAR[1] for consideration at the July 2014 meeting.

- Proposed: Seaman Second: Randall
- For__26__Against_0__Abstain_5___

[1]PAR based on discussion and presentation at the York, September 2013 meeting.
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2013/ae-seaman-ede-0713-v02.pdf
http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2013/ae-seaman-ede-ppt-0913-v01.pdf

MOTION

- 802.1 requests EC approval to forward IEEE 802.1AEbn and IEEE 802.1AEbw to ISO/IEC JTC1 SC6, for adoption under the PSDO agreement.
- Proposed: Seaman Second: randall
- For__27__Against_0__Abstain__7__

- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:
- For____Against___Abstain____

MOTION

- 802.1 requests EC approval to forward P802.1Xbx D1.2 to ISO/IEC JTC1 SC6, for information under the PSDO agreement.
- Proposed: Seaman Second: randall
- For__29__Against_0__Abstain_5___

- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:
- For____Against___Abstain____

Motions - Interworking

MOTION

- Authorize 1-hour teleconferences for 802.1Qbz/802.11ak coordination on 11/25, 12/9, and 1/6, and subsequent dates to be announced with at least 21 days notice, at 17:00 Eastern US time. Teleconference access details to be announced on the 802.1 reflector.

- Proposed: Haddock
- Second: gray

- ABA

Motion

- 802.1 requests EC approval to forward 802.1Qbp to REVCOM.

- Proposed: Haddock
- Second: Mack-Crane
- For __25___Against__0___ Abstain _8____

- EC proposed: Jeffree   Second: Thaler
- For____Against___Abstain____

MOTION

- 802.1 authorizes the editor of P802.1AX-REV (Panos Saltsidis) to prepare a draft for Working Group recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock   Second: Saltsidis
- For__32__Against__0_Abstain_0___

MOTION

- 802.1 authorizes the editor of P802.1AC-REV (John Messenger) to prepare a draft for Task Group balloting. The ballot will also be issued to 802.16.
- Proposed: Haddock   Second: Messenger
- For__29__Against_0__Abstain__3__

MOTION

- 802.1 authorizes the editor of P802.1Qbz wired/wireless bridging (Norm Finn) to prepare a draft for Task Group balloting.
- Proposed: Haddock   Second: Finn
- For__32__Against__0_Abstain__2__

MOTION

- 802.1 authorizes the editor of P802.1Qca path control & reservation (Janos Farkas) to prepare a draft for Task Group balloting.

- Proposed: Haddock   Second: Farkas

- For__31__Against_0__Abstain__3__

Motions - TSN

MOTION

- Motion: The TSN TG will continue to have teleconferences weekly at 9AM (US Pacific) Wednesdays for TSN general topics. Access information will be sent to the 802.1 reflector immediately after the plenary.

- Proposed: Teener

- Second: Finn

- Approved by acclamation

MOTION

- 802.1 authorizes the editor of P802.1Qbv (Tony Jeffree) to prepare a draft for Task Group balloting.
- Proposed: Teener Second: Gray
- For__28__Against__0_Abstain__1__

Motions - DCB

MOTION

- Authorize DCB teleconferences. The calls will be used to discuss possible new work.
  - Monday, 6 January 2014, 8-10 AM Pacific
  - Up to 2 calls with proper notice between the January Interim and the March plenary at times and dates to be selected at the Interim
- Proposed: thaler
- Second: Gray
- ABA

Motion

- 802.1 authorizes the editor of P802.1Qcd (Eric Multanen) to prepare a draft for Working Group balloting.
- Proposed: Thaler
- Second: gray

For 26 Against 0 Abstain 2

Motions – O&A

- None

MOTION

- 802.1 requests EC approval for forwarding P802 PAR extension request to NesCom.

- Proposed: Gilb

- Second: Gray

- For: 23 Against: 0 Abstain: 2

- EC proposed: Jeffree   Second: Thaler

- For_____Against____Abstain_____

MOTION

- 802.1 grants approval to the Editor of P802, James Gilb, to conduct a conference call for comment resolution, Dec 4, 8:00 AM PST.
- Proposed: parsons
- Second: Gray
- ABA

Motions – Any others?