

# IEEE 802.1 Interim Meeting

San Jose, CA, USA, September 2015

## 802.1 Meeting Minutes – 8-11 September, 2015

### Attendees

<i>Last Name</i>	<i>First Name</i>	<i>Middle Name</i>	<i>Affiliation</i>
Boiger	Christian		b-plus GmbH
Butterworth	Ashley		Apple, Inc.
Chen	David		NSN, Inc.
Chen	Feng		Siemens AG
Cummings	Rodney		National Instruments Corporation
Farkas	Janos		Ericsson
Finn	Norman		Cisco Systems, Inc.
Garner	Geoffrey		Broadcom Corporation
Gray	Eric W		Ericsson AB
Gunther	Craig		Harman International Industries, Incorporated
Hantel	Mark		Rockwell Automation
Holness	Marc		Ciena Corporation
Jeffree	Anthony		Broadcom, HP
Johas Teener	Michael		Broadcom Corporation
Kiessling	Marcel		Siemens AG
Korhonen	Jouni		Broadcom Corporation
Mangin	Christophe		Mitsubishi Electric R&D Centre Europe (MERCCE)
McBeath	Tom		Spirent Communications
Messenger	John		ADVA Optical Networking Ltd.
Pannell	Donald R		Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.
Parsons	Glenn		Ericsson AB
Randall	Karen		NSA/IAD
Romascanu	Dan		Avaya Inc.
Rouyer	Jessy		Alcatel-Lucent
Samii	Soheil		General Motors Company
Seaman	Michael		Individual
Specht	Johannes		University of Duisburg-Essen and General Motors Company
Stanton	Kevin		Intel Corporation
Steiner	Wilfried		TTTech Computertechnik AG
Thaler	Patricia		Broadcom Corporation
Thompson	Geoffrey		GraCaSI S.A.
Thornburg	David		Cisco Systems, Inc.
Touve	Jeremy		Alcatel-Lucent

Walter  
Weber  
Weis  
Winkel  
Woods

Todd  
Karl  
Brian  
Ludwig  
Jordon

National Instruments Corporation  
Beckhoff, ZHAW  
Cisco Systems, Inc.  
Siemens AG  
Innovasic, Inc.

# Task Group Minutes

## TSN (& Interworking) minutes

*Tuesday, 8 September*

**0900-1700**

Michael Johas Teener presented Administration, Patent Policy, and Agenda. There was no response to the call for patents.

Michael Johas Teener presented the agenda.

Geoff Garner presented **802.1AS-Rev/D1.0 comment resolution**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/as-rev-drafts/d1/802-1AS-rev-d1-0.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/as-rev-drafts/d1/802-1AS-Rev-d1-0-pdis-v1.pdf>

Norm Finn presented **Port MIB changes for 802.1AS-Rev**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/asrev-finn-port-MIB-changes-0915-v1.pdf>

Rodney Cummings presented **Update on 1588 Rev**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/as-cummings-1588-update-0915-v2.pdf>

*Wednesday, 9 September*

**1000-1800**

Michael Johas Teener reviewed Patent Policy. There was no response to the call for patents.

Mick Seaman presented Reserved addresses for **802.1Aecg**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/ae-seaman-edc-reserved-addresses-090915v1.pdf>

Michael Johas Teener presented **AS-revision one step details**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/asrev-mjt-one-step-details-0407-v07.pdf>

Feng Chen presented **Sync redundancy in 1588 and .1AS-Rev**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/as-chen-goetz-sync-redundancy-0915-v01.pdf>

Rodney Cummings presented **802.1AS: Constrained Systems**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/as-cummings-constrained-problem-0715-v2.pdf>

Michael Johas Teener presented **clock quality reporting for 802.1AS-revision**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/asrev-mjt-timing-fidelity-0915-v2.pdf>

Marc Holness presented **YANG Overview**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/new-mholness-yang-overview-0915-v03.pdf>

Marc Holness presented **802.1X and 802.1Q YANG**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/new-mholness-8021Q-update-0915-v03.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/new-mholness-8021X-Update-0815-v02.pdf>

Glenn Parsons presented **New URN for YANG**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/new-parsons-URN-namespace-considerations-0815.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/new-parsons-URN-namespace-PAR-0915.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/new-parsons-URN-namespace-CSD-0915.pdf>

John Messenger presented **P802.1AC-Rev comment resolution**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/acrev-messenger-editor-report-0915-v01.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ac-rev-drafts/d2/802-1ac-rev-d2-2.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ac-rev-drafts/d2/802-1ac-rev-d2-2-pdis-v1.pdf>

## ***Thursday, 10 September***

### **0900-1700**

Michael Johas Teener reviewed Patent Policy. There was no response to the call for patents.

Norm Finn presented **P802.1CB comment resolution**, including discussion of creating a YANG module for P802.1CB

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/cb-drafts/d1/802-1CB-d1-1.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/cb-nfinn-arranging-layers-0915-v01.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/cb-drafts/d1/802-1CB-d1-1-pdis-v1.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/cb-drafts/d1/802-1CB-d1-1-dis.pdf>

Norm Finn presented **802.1CB sequence recovery proposal**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/cb-nfynn-sequence-recovery-0715-v01.pdf>

Johannes Specht presented **802.1CB reset proposal**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/new-tsn-specht-cb-reset-challenge-0915-v01.pdf>

Rodney Cummings presented **802.1Qcc D0.5 progress**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/cc-cummings-d05-progress-0915-v1.pdf>

János Farkas presented **P802.1CM**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/cm-drafts/d0/802-1CM-d0-0.pdf>

## ***Friday, 11 September***

### **0900-1700, TSN**

Michael Johas Teener reviewed Patent Policy. There was no response to the call for patents.

Tony Jeffree presented **Ballot resolution - P802.1AB-REV**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ab-rev-drafts/d1/802-1ab-rev-d1-0.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ab-rev-drafts/d1/802-1AB-REV-d1-0-pdis-v2.pdf>

Tony Jeffree presented **Ballot resolution - P802.1Qbu**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bu-drafts/d3/802-1Qbu-d3-0.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bu-drafts/d3/802-1Qbu-3-0-pdis-v1.pdf>

Tony Jeffree presented **Ballot resolution - P802.1Qbv**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bv-drafts/d3/802-1Qbv-d3-0.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/bv-drafts/d3/802-1Qbv-D3-0-pdis-v1.pdf>

Tony Jeffree presented **802.1Qch/802.1Qci discussion**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ci-drafts/d0/802-1Qci-d0-1.pdf>

Christian Boiger presented **802.1CB and 802.1Qci layering**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/cb-boiger-layering-0915-v01.pdf>

Marcel Kießling presented **MRP++**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/new-tsn-kiessling-MRPpp-0915-v01.pdf>

Johannes Specht presented **UBS Discussion**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/new-tsn-specht-ubs-comparison-and-steps-0915-v01.pdf>

Pat Thaler presented **LAAP (Local Address Assignment Protocol) project**

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/dcb-thaler-1CQ-par-local-address-prot-0915-v0.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/dcb-thaler-1CQ-csd-local-address-prot-0915-v0.pdf>

Pat Thaler presented **Possible joint work with IETF BIER**

<https://datatracker.ietf.org/wg/bier/charter/>

## ***Security Minutes***

### **Attendees:**

- Mick Seaman (802.1 Security Task Group Chair, minutes of this meeting)
- Brian Weis
- Karen Randall
- Rakesh Chopra
- Marc Holness (part)
- Jessy Rouyer (part)
- Glenn Parsons (part)
- Mahesh Jathanandani (part)

### **Agenda**

As refined in discussion from items previously circulated:

- Patent Policy
- P802.1AEcg – D0.5 task group ballot resolution continued
- Maintenance items

- P802.1ARce
- P802.1X (YANG model for 802.1X)
- P802.15.9 ongoing participation and liaison
- Privacy related issues
- A.O.B
- Future meetings

### **Meeting details**

The Security TG met Tuesday September 8th through 10th, with task group members also participating in the Interworking/TSN sessions.

The chair showed the Patent Policy slides (as revised by the IEEE for 2015) and issued a call for patents at the beginning of each day's session. There were no responses to these patent calls.

### **P802.1AEcg:**

Resolution of the first task group ballot of draft 0.5 continued. The outstanding comments with revised proposed dispositions were posted prior to the meeting in:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/cg-drafts/d0/802-1AEcg-d0-5-pdis3-open.pdf>

The complete set of comments including those believed to have been previously resolved were posted in:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/cg-drafts/d0/802-1AEcg-d0-5-pdis3.pdf>

Discussion in the meeting focused on the interim draft with the proposed comment resolutions:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/cg-drafts/d0/802-1AEcg-d0-6.pdf>

Steve Haddock had agreed (via email) that the changes in this draft satisfied his ballot comments/concerns re: the use of PEB terminology for EDEs [see prior minutes and ballot comments/dispositions for background]. Jessy Rouyer also said that his comments had been resolved.

The issue of providing interoperability/use case clarifications for Karen Randall's comments still need to be addressed and was not closed at this meeting.

P802.1AEcg will require the assignment of at least one of the Reserved Addresses specified by 802.1Q for EDE use. This is an unusual address assignment case in that

there are very few of these addresses and the properties of the candidate address(es) need to be discussed in drafts.

Not being explicit about the likely candidate(s) would invite pre-standard implementations to pick one at random, thus polluting the entire space. Mick presented a discussion of the need/considerations to the whole of the 802.1 group. Updated documents recording/taking into account presentation feedback and follow up discussion and analysis are now at:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/ae-seaman-edc-reserved-addresses-1115-v03.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/ae-seaman-edc-address-scopes-1115-v02.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/ae-seaman-edc-interop-1115-v05.pdf>

Both Clause 11 and Clause 15 will need to be updated to reflect the extended address use.

Rakesh pointed out that an octet count in SecyRxStatsEntry in the MIB was redundant and it was agreed that it was worthwhile considering the deprecating this object and adding another without the octet count. In addition there were further counters in the MIB that might be usefully removed. The counters and controls in 802.1AE were specified prior to the development of MKA and there was a desire to provide extensive diagnostics capability in an environment where "roll your own" key agreement protocols might not always function as desired. At present the counter requirements are a significant factor in limiting the number of SAs, and 802.1AEcg is introducing separate SAs for different traffic classes. We need to determine what changes, beyond the octet count removal need to be included in this amendment.

[An updated P802.1AEcg draft incorporating agreed resolutions is now available, though this is not yet complete and the ramifications of changes have not yet been carried out through the document.]

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/cg-drafts/d0/802-1AEcg-d0-7.pdf>

### **Maintenance items:**

Mick had circulated a draft response (email 8/16/2015 8.59 pm) to #0165 on 1X state machines. This was discussed and agreed. Summary - reject.

The long outstanding issue on Confidentiality Offset for the initial 802.1AE Cipher Suites was discussed. Resolution will be handled in 802.1AEcg. A formal maintenance request needs to be filed to record the issue and its resolution (**Action: Mick**).

P802.1AEcg has also handled minor maintenance items (such as reference updating). Formal maintenance requests should also be filed to cover these. Similarly the initial draft of P802.1Xck has incorporated similar minor maintenance items for 802.1X (as per the PAR), and formal requests need to be filed to cover these (**Action: Mick**).



## **P802.1ARce:**

No work at this meeting.

## **P802.1Xck (YANG model for 802.1X)**

The PAR had been forwarded to RevCom at the July plenary meeting and approval was expected shortly.

Marc gave a presentation on how to learn and use YANG:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2015/new-mholness-yang-overview-0915-v03.pdf>

A 'starter draft' for the project, largely to incorporate all the pending maintenance items including updating references had been posted:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/ck-drafts/d0/802-1Xck-d0-1.pdf>

Progress since the July meeting included:

- Updates to the YANG model
- YANG module structural definitions adhering to the 802.1X-2010+.1Xbx-2014 UML management information model
- YANG modules compiling and following IETF YANG module guidelines

There was further discussion on several outstanding items, including namespace definition, YANG module definition formatting rules, GitHub structure, and YANG model "default" settings.

## **P802.15.9**

P802.15.9 was currently or shortly to be in Sponsor Ballot. No discussion at this meeting.

## **Privacy related issues**

Mick initiated a short discussion on the recommendations/criteria for EAP methods in 802.1X and 802.1AR. Some EAP methods disclose the identity of the Supplicant and

Authenticator, particularly to an active attacker. It would appear that at least one of the participant's identities would have to be disclosed in the presence of an active attacker. In most cases it would be preferable if the disclosed identity would be that of the Authenticator/Authentication Server rather than the Supplicant, because personal identity is more likely to be tied to a Supplicant. Some tunneled authentication methods may have the right properties.

## **A.O.B**

No items recorded.

## **Future meetings**

Future teleconference dates were discussed, and tentatively agreed. The next teleconference was already scheduled, future dates/times are naturally subject to the 30-day announcement rules.

[Announcement of dates/times was made to the exploder after the meeting, scheduling through January].

## ***Maintenance***

The minutes for the Interim meeting are incorporated in these minutes by reference and are available at:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/maint/2015-09-maintenance-meeting-v2.pdf>

Maintenance meeting minutes for all prior meetings are available via:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/maint.html>

## ***OmniRAN Minutes***

OmniRAN held their Interim meeting jointly with IEEE 802 wireless in Bangkok, Thailand, September 14-17.

The minutes for that Interim meeting are incorporated in these minutes by reference and are available at:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/15/omniran-15-0047-00-00TG-sept-2015-f2f-meeting-minutes.docx>

Amended meeting slides for that Interim meeting are available at:

<https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/dcn/15/omniran-15-0040-03-00TG-sept-2014-f2f-meeting-slides.pptx>

Current status of OmniRAN activities – including future meeting announcements, past

meeting and conference call minutes – is available via a wiki located at:  
<https://mentor.ieee.org/omniran/bp/StartPage>

## ***DCB Minutes***

No separate minutes received.

DCB met jointly with Security and with TSN/Interworking during the Interim meeting.