

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
--------	----------------	---------------	----------------------------	-----------------------	------------------------	-----------	----------------------

Section 10 comments from Ballot on Draft Standard D2 (Vic Hayes, Chair, AT&T WCND)

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
	10	DW	T		How are parameters like SIFS and Slot time specified, who do depend on both MAC and PHY parameters. It could be a PHY specification, which should include fixed MAC_processing_time values.		
	10	BTh	E	N	add... aDwell_Offset	Used in section 8.1.5; I can't find its definition	
	10	DW	T	Y	A parameter is needed that specifies the total PHY overhead of PLCP preamble and Header. So anything that determines the total duration occupied on the medium. Also needed is a factor with which the MPDU duration can be calculated by the MAC.	The MAC needs this to calculate the Duration fields in Control and Dataframes. This does specifically apply to the Fhopper, who apparently adds one bit for every 32 bits.	
	10.1	DM	e		Change numbering to remove single subsections. There should always be more than 1 subsection.	If there is only one subsection then the subsection should become a section of the next higher level. The purpose of a subsection is to break a section down into more parts. If there is only one part then it doesn't warrant a subsection.	
	10.1	WR	e		Combine all MIB information into a single clause.	There is overlap between 8.4 and 10.1. All MIB information should be in its own clause	
	10.1.2	KD	E		Replace aMPDU_Max_Lngth_1M and aMPDU_Max_Lngth_2M with MPDU_Max_Lngth and Pref_MPDU_Max_Frgmnt_Lngth. Both new parameters are GET parameters only.	The _1M and _2M parameters were voted down by the previous letter ballot.	
	10.1.2	KD	E		Add aCurrent_Pwr_State as a Get-Replace parameter.	The acceptance of the new layer management primitives eliminated the PLME_POWER primitive which turned the FH PHY on/off. This function must now be controlled for power management by a PHY MIB parameter.	
	10.1.2	DW	T		-aTxRx_Turnaround_time spec is required.	I would expect that	

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comment type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
					Tx and Rx delay figures are needed to allow a MAC to assess proper SIFS timing.	aTxRx_Turnaround_time is intended here. The MAC needs to know the difference between the actual and standard specified numbers, to assure proper SIFS timing.	
	10.1.3.1	HC	e		aSlot_Time, aCCA_Asmnt_Time, aRxTx_Turnaround_Time, aTx_PLCP_Delay, aRxTx_Switch_Time, aTxRamp_On_Time,	spelling	
	10.1.4	KJ	E		All final level numbers should be renumbered since many have been deleted and others added with duplicate levels		
	10.1.4.10 10.1.4.12 10.1.4.13 10.1.4.15	FMi	t	N	The time units for each of these attributes should be microseconds, based on the adoption of the time unit unification decision at the July, 1995 meeting. If there is a reason for some of the delays to be in units smaller than one microsecond, a binary divisor should be used, such as units of 1/16 microsecond or 1/128 microsecond.	The intervals calculated using these delays are all in microseconds. The units of the values summed to calculate the intervals should be in microseconds, or in units which can be scaled to microseconds by shifting.	
	10.1.4.14	FMi	T	N	The behavior should be defined as: "The nominal time in microseconds <u>between the time the MAC entity receives a PHY_RXEND.indicate primitive at the end of a successful MPDU reception and the time the MAC entity issues the PHY_TXSTART.request primitive to send an acknowledgement to process a frame and prepare a response to the frame</u> ";	This attribute is either improperly described or misplaced. A MAC processing time does not belong in the PHY MIB. Since this attribute is used in the SIFS calculation, probably the behaviour is described improperly, and a definition of the relevant MAC behavior is provided in this comment.	
	10.1.4.4	HC	T	N	aSlot_Time is dependent on Air_Propagation_Time, which this section says is equal to 1 usec. WHY?	Why is this a fixed value and where does it come from? I don't know what it should be, just wonder why it is what it is.	

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comment type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
--------	----------------	---------------	-------------------------	-----------------	------------------------	-----------	----------------------

	10.1.4.6	HC	T	N	" The maximum time in nanoseconds the PHY requires to change from receive to transmitting the start of the first symbol out on the air. The following equation is used to derive the RxTx_Turnaround_Time: aTx_PLCP_Delay + aRxTx_Switch_Time + aTxRamp_On_Time + aTx_RF_Delay. ";	Units mismatch - aTx_RF_Delay (10.1.4.10) is defined in units of nonoseconds.	
--	----------	----	---	---	--	---	--

	10.3.2.3	DM	t		Need a means to disable the whitener on a per frame basis.	Japan call sign id requirements specify that the call sign id be transmitted in the clear with no scrambling or whitening. This means the 802.11 standard needs to define a mechanism which allows the data to be sent in this format.	
--	----------	----	---	--	--	--	--

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comment type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
--------	----------------	---------------	-------------------------	-----------------	------------------------	-----------	----------------------

11

10

10