

**IEEE P802.11  
Wireless LANs**

**Comments received on the WG recirculation ballot on 802.11rev**

Legend for Voter-Ids

as = Anil Sanwalka,

ca = Carl Andren,hmo = Henri Moelard,

bo = Bob O’Hara,

jzw = Johnny Zweig,

kam = Keith Amundsen, vh = Vic Hayes

1	1	as	T	y	<p><b>The proposed replacement for appendix D has all the MIB attribute names changed to be preceded by “dot11”.</b></p> <p><b>I have seen no justification given for this. I thought we were supposed to be fixing errors not changing things to be the way we think they should have been originally.</b></p> <p><b>The effect of making this change to all the MIB attribute names referred to in the current 802.11 standard is that the entire standard document has to be edited by the IEEE editor not for formatting but for content.</b></p> <p><b>I personally cannot vote yes on a change of this magnitude without seeing the modified text and verifying that the changes have been made in the appropriate places.</b></p> <p><b>I would be more than happy to withdraw this comment if someone can give me a good reason why I should.</b></p>	<p><b>Modify the new text for appendix D to coincide with the attribute names as defined in clause 11 of the current standard.</b></p>	<p>This is not a technical comment. The text to which the commenter refers was not changed in the draft for this ballot and can not be used as the basis of a NO vote. To address the comment made, the names of the attributes were changed to conform to the SNMPv2 SMI style of management rather than the ISO GDMO style, since the vast majority of network management in use is of the SNMPv2 SMI type.</p>
2	2	as	t	y	<p>If the change in clause one has been applied, no reference to aListenInterval exists in 7.3.1.6</p>	<p>replace aListenInterval with dot11ListenInterval</p>	<p>This is not a technical comment. Instruction number 1 will be augmented with a list of the attribute names to be changed.</p>
3	10	as	t	y	<p>If the change in clause one has been applied, no reference to aSlotTime exists in 9.2.4</p>	<p>replace with <b>1. Clause 9.2.4, fifth paragraph, change: “dot11SlotTime = The</b></p>	<p>This is not a technical comment. Instruction number 1 will be augmented with a list of the attribute names to be changed.</p>

						value of the correspondingly named MIB attribute.” into: “aSlotTime = The value of the correspondingly named PHY characteristic.”.	
4	12	as	t	y	If the change in clause one has been applied, no reference to aSIFSTime or aSlotTime exist in 9.2.10	replace with <b>2. Clause 9.2.10, first paragraph below Figure 58, change the following sentence:</b> “dot11SIFSTime and dot11SlotTime are defined in the MIB, and are fixed per PHY”. <b>so that it reads:</b> “aSIFSTime and aSlotTime are fixed per PHY.”	This is not a technical comment. Instruction number 1 will be augmented with a list of the attribute names to be changed.
5	13	as	t	y	If the change in clause one has been applied, no reference to aMACPrcDelay exists in 9.2.10	replace with <b>3. Clause 9.2.10, second paragraph below Figure 58, in the equation for aSIFSTime, change “dot11MACPrcDelay” into “dot11MACProcessingDelay.”</b>	This is not a technical comment. Instruction number 1 will be augmented with a list of the attribute names to be changed.
6	18	as	T	y	This seems to me to be another case of how we think we should have done the standard in the first place, and is not intended to fix errors in the current standard.	Leave the PHY “characteristics” as MIB attributes unless something is broken.	The proposed change is a direct result of an interpretation request received by the IEEE. This change addresses that interpretation request. This is not a technical comment on the proposed

							change.
7	2	as	t	y	If the change in clause one has been applied, no reference to aListenInterval exists in 11.2.1.1 or 11.2.1.9	replace aListenInterval with dot11ListenInterval	This is not a technical comment. Instruction number 1 will be augmented with a list of the attribute names to be changed.
8	18	as	T	y	This seems to me to be another case of how we think we should have done the standard in the first place, and is not intended to fix errors in the current standard.	Leave the PHY “characteristics” as MIB attributes unless something is broken.	The proposed change is a direct result of an interpretation request received by the IEEE. This change addresses that interpretation request. This is not a technical comment on the proposed change.
1	10.4.3.2	ca	E	n.a.	Typo in section on aTxRampOffTime. (in C) should be (in $\mu$ s)	fix typo	Accepted.
1	73 p40-41	hmo	t	N	A counter for the number of received MSDUs is missing. It is needed, to serve as input for the generic MAC counter "framesReceived", analogous to how dot11TransmittedFrameCount serves as input for "framesSent". Both serve as base reference for error statistics.	Add a new counter dot11ReceivedFrameCount. "This counter shall increment for each successfully received MSDU".	Withdrawn by the commenter.
2	73 p52	hmo	e	N	Wrong syntax for dot11CurrentCCAMode: "Integer329+".	Replace "Integer329+" by "Integer32".	Accepted.
1	101	bo	E		correct spelling of two occurrences of dot11AuthenticationAlgorithm	change “dot11AathenticationAlgorithm” to “dot11AuthenticationAlgorithm”	Accepted.
2	Title page	bo	E		title must conform to IEEE requirements	add “March 1998” to the document title in two places	Accepted.
3	all	bo	E		remove every occurrence of the word “clause” except when it refers to a first level clause. If “clause” is used as the first word of a sentence and does not refer to a first level clause, replace it with “subclause”.		Accepted.
4	18	bo	E		Correct the table entry in the new subclause 10.4.3.2	In the entry for aTxRampOffTime, replace “(in C)” with “(in $\mu$ S)”	Accepted.

5	25	bo	E		correct spelling/font	In the aSIFSTime entry of Table 50, replace “speciPed” with “specified”	Accepted.
6	30	bo	E		clarify instructions	replace “delete all text in this clause, delete all of it subclauses” with “delete all the text and subclauses”	Accepted.
7	31	bo	E		clarify instructions	replace “delete all text in this clause, delete all of it subclauses” with “delete all the text and subclauses”	Accepted.
8	101	bo	E		correct incorrect hyphenation	replace “Cur- rently” with “Currently”	Accepted.
9	101	bo	E		correct incorrect hyphenation	replace “dot11DiversitySelec- tionRx” with “dot11DiversitySelectionRx”	Accepted.
10	101	bo	E		correct attribute name	replace “aDi- versitySelectionRx” with “aDiversitySelectionRx”	Accepted.
11	101	bo	E		correct units	replace “Kms” with “TU”	Accepted.
12	101	bo	E		make consistent with rest of document	replace “hop sequence” with “hopping sequence”	Accepted.
13	101	bo	e		correct hyphenation	replace “de- fined” with “defined”	Accepted.
14	101	bo	e		correct notation	in four places, replace “00h-7fh” with “X’00-X’ff”	Accepted.
15	101	bo	E		correct typo	replace “Integer329+” with “Integer32”	Accepted.
1	1	jzw	E		Change 1 is unclear as to whether it requires that parameters to service primitives be renamed (and it is evident from other changes that it does not).	Clarify that changing “a” to “dot11” only applies to MIB attributes, not parameters of primitives.	Accepted. A list of names to be changed will be added to the instruction.
2	18	jzw	e		The phrase “and on” in change 18 is sloppy.	Change “renumber current clauses 10.4.2 and on” to “renumber current clause 10.4.2 and subsequent clauses”	Accepted.

3	18	jzw	T		The revision to 10.4.2.4 in change 18 should create a requirement for generating a particular primitive, not just (sloppily) say “provide its operational characteristics”.	Change “provide its operational characteristics” to “generate a PLME-CHARACTERISTICS. confirm primitive that conveys its operational characteristics.”	Accepted. This is not a technical change, but a clarification of the original text.
4	18	jzw	e		In the table in change 18, the “aTxRampOffTime” description says “in C” rather than “in microseconds”	Change “(in C)” to “(in $\mu$ s)”.	Accepted.
5	18	jzw	t		In the table in change 18, the “aMPDUDurationFactor” text is sloppy. There should be parentheses around the items multiplied and divided together, and the definition of N should be clarified (it counts the number of octets in the PPDU, but does not count the number of octets in the preamble, SFD or PLCP header).	Clarify “N” and add parentheses around “aMPDUDurationFactor x 8 x PSDU length (octets) / data rate” and change “x” to “ $\times$ ” and “/” to “ $\div$ ”.	This is editorial, not technical. Accepted.
6	30, 31	jzw	E		The word “properly” is superfluous in changes 30 and 31.	Delete “properly” from both changes.	Accepted.
7	25, 35, 38	jzw	T	Y	The text for the PHY Characteristics of the 3 PHYs is not consistent. The DSSS and IR PHYs appear to have a radically different understanding of what these numbers mean, and what they are for than the FHSS PHY. Personally, I think FHSS has it right, but I am not religious on the point. I do not think that “implementation dependent” is a reasonable value for a number that is used in various calculations, nor is giving a range of possible values (as change 35 does). It should be made clear that these values are defined per implementation, not changeable, nor modifiable.	Harmonize these three descriptions of PHY Characteristics, at least enough to make it look like they are all three based on the same definitions.	This is an editorial change. Accepted. Clarifying text is added where required to explain constraints currently existing in other parts of the standard.
8	101	jzw	T		The use of the word “rename” in the description of dot11StationID is confusing. The intent of the attribute is to be able to redefine the MAC address of the station, and this has nothing to do with any kind of “name”.	Change “rename” to “modify the individual MAC address of”.	This is not correct. The dot11StationID is simply a handle that the external manager may choose to change. It has absolutely nothing to do with the station’s MAC address, other than sharing the same format. The definition was clarified to help eliminate this ambiguity.

9	101	jzw	t		The range of possible values for dot11OperationalRateSet is not internally self-consistent. Also, IEEE 802 is not allowed to standardize anything slower than 1 Mbit/second, so a value of 1 (0.5 Mbps) for a rate is nonsensical.	Change “withint the range from 1 to 127” to “within the range from 2 to 127”.	Accepted. This is not a technical change, but a clarification of constraints elsewhere in the standard.
10	101	jzw	E		Typo	Change “dot11AthenticationAlgorithm” to “dot11AuthenticationAlgorithm” throughout.	Accepted.
1		kam	e		The Annex D ASN.1 MIB contains aCurrentDwell, Set, Pattern & Index of the FH Parameter set but Clause 13 does not contain aCurrentDwell.	Should this be added to Clause 13, or Clause 11? (I would not support removing it.)	The definition of this item has been moved to Annex D. dot11CurrentDwell is used in the FH Parameter Set of the Beacon and Probe Response frames (defined in clause 7).
1	1	vh	E		The text of the MIB is part of the standard and therefore part of the IEEE Copyright. Because it is our intention to make the file available in the standard, and because we intent to offer the content to the IETF, we need to have a release for it.	Discuss with the staff of the IEEE whether we can add a piece of text in the beginning of annex D that the copyright is extended to users for their product generation and for the IETF to support the MIB in their standards process.	Accepted.