**Document under Review:** **P802.16/D4**          **Ballot Number:** **0000166**                    **Comment Date**

**Comment #** **150**          **Comment submitted by:** Stanley          Wang                    Member

**Comment**     **Type** Editorial                    **Starting Page #** 35          **Starting Line #** 46          **Section** 3
Typo.


**Suggested Remedy**
Change "a upink" to "an uplink"

Make the same change for Page 78 Line 64 and Page 133 Line 3.


**Proposed Resolution**     **Recommendation:**                    **Recommendation by**


**Reason for Recommendation**


**Resolution of Group**          **Decision of Group:**



**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**


**Group's Notes**
**Group's Action Items**


**Editor's Notes**                    **Editor's Actions**

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**


**Editor's Action Items**

**Document under Review:** **P802.16/D4**          **Ballot Number:** **0000166**                    **Comment Date**

**Comment #** **151**          **Comment submitted by:** Stanley          Wang                              Member

**Comment**    **Type** Editorial                    **Starting Page #** 36          **Starting Line #** 56          **Section** 4

Typo.

**Suggested Remedy**

Remove ")" from the abbreviation.

**Proposed Resolution**    **Recommendation:**                    **Recommendation by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**          **Decision of Group:**

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**          **Editor's Actions**

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**

**Document  under  Review:**  **P802.16/D4**                    **Ballot  Number:**  **0000166**                                      **Comment  Date**

**Comment #**  **152**              **Comment  submitted  by:**    Stanley              Wang                                    Member

**Comment       Type**  Editorial                      **Starting  Page #**  70        **Starting  Line #**  32        **Section**  6.2.2.2.1

Clarity

**Suggested  Remedy**

Page 70, line 32, Change the title of Table 7 to read "Fragmentation Sub-header Format"

Page 72, line 3229, Change the title of Table 11 to read "Packing Sub-header Format"

**Proposed  Resolution      Recommendation:**                        **Recommendation  by**

**Reason  for  Recommendation**

**Resolution  of  Group**              **Decision  of  Group:**

**Reason  for  Group's  Decision/Resolution**

**Group's  Notes**
**Group's  Action  Items**

**Editor's  Notes**              **Editor's  Actions**
**Editor's  Questions  and  Concerns**

**Editor's  Action  Items**

**Document under Review:** **P802.16/D4**           **Ballot Number:** **0000166**                    **Comment Date**

**Comment #** **153**          **Comment submitted by:**   Stanley            Wang                       Member

**Comment**     **Type** Technical                 **Starting Page #** 152          **Starting Line #** 35        **Section** 6.2.13.1

SFID is a system-wide identifier and should not be assigned by the BS.

**Suggested Remedy**

Delete the sentence "Service Flows have a 32-bit Service Flow Identifier (SFID)."

Change the next sentence to read "All Service Flows have a 32-bit Service Flow Identifier (SFID);"

Also on page 152, line 50, delete "by the BS"

Also on page 154, line 52, delete "assigned by the BS"

**Proposed Resolution**      **Recommendation:**                        **Recommendation by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**             **Decision of Group:**

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**              **Editor's Actions**

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**

**Document under Review:** **P802.16/D4**          **Ballot Number:** **0000166**                    **Comment Date**

**Comment #** **154**          **Comment submitted by:** Stanley          Wang                    Member

**Comment**     **Type** Editorial               **Starting Page #** 203      **Starting Line #** 37      **Section** 7.2.4

All transitions must be labeled with event/action.

**Suggested Remedy**

Line 37, change "Timeout" to "Timeout /"

Line 41, change "Auth Reject" to "Auth Reject /"

Lines 42 & 43, change "Perm Auth Reject" to "Perm Auth Reject /"

**Proposed Resolution**     **Recommendation:**               **Recommendation by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**          **Decision of Group:**

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**
**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**               **Editor's Actions**

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**

**Document under Review:** **P802.16/D4**                    **Ballot Number:** **0000166**                                **Comment Date**

**Comment #** **155**                **Comment submitted by:** Stanley                Wang                                                Member

**Comment**          **Type** Editorial                          **Starting Page #** 207          **Starting Line #** 19          **Section** 7.2.4.5

Clarity.

**Suggested Remedy**

Change "<event/rcvd message> - <state>" to "<event> (<rcvd message>) --> <state>"

Make sure the same chage is also made on page 207, line 19.

**Proposed Resolution**        **Recommendation:**                              **Recommendation by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**                **Decision of Group:**

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**
**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**                **Editor's Actions**

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**

**Document under Review:** **P802.16/D4**          **Ballot Number:** **0000166**                          **Comment Date**

**Comment #** **156**          **Comment submitted by:** Stanley          Wang                          Member

**Comment**          **Type** Editorial          **Starting Page #** 208          **Starting Line #** 31          **Section** 7.2.4.5

Typo.

**Suggested Remedy**

Underline "5-E"

**Proposed Resolution**          **Recommendation:**          **Recommendation by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**          **Decision of Group:**

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**          **Editor's Actions**

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**

**Document under Review:** **P802.16/D4**                **Ballot Number:** **0000166**                              **Comment Date**

**Comment #** **157**              **Comment submitted by:** Stanley              Wang                                    Member

**Comment**        **Type** Editorial                        **Starting Page #** ?              **Starting Line #** 19              **Section** 7.2.5.5

Clarity.

**Suggested Remedy**

Make a copy of page 207 line 19 and copy it to page 213 line 19.

**Proposed Resolution**        **Recommendation:**                        **Recommendation by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**                **Decision of Group:**

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**                **Editor's Actions**

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**

**Document  under  Review:**  **P802.16/D4**                 **Ballot  Number:**  **0000166**                              **Comment  Date**

**Comment  #**  **158**            **Comment  submitted  by:**   Stanley         Wang                                    Member

**Comment          Type**  Editorial                 **Starting  Page  #**  213        **Starting  Line  #**  39         **Section**  7.2.5.5

Typo.

**Suggested  Remedy**
Add space before "(Stop)"

Make the same change on line 47.

**Proposed  Resolution**      **Recommendation:**                **Recommendation  by**

**Reason  for  Recommendation**

**Resolution  of  Group**          **Decision  of  Group:**

**Reason  for  Group's  Decision/Resolution**

**Group's  Notes**
**Group's  Action  Items**

**Editor's  Notes**                **Editor's  Actions**

**Editor's  Questions  and  Concerns**

**Editor's  Action  Items**

**Document under Review:** **P802.16/D4**          **Ballot Number:** **0000166**                    **Comment Date**

**Comment #** **159**          **Comment submitted by:** Stanley          Wang                    Member

**Comment**     **Type** Editorial                    **Starting Page #** 214          **Starting Line #** 57          **Section** 7.2.5.5

All key exchange messages are authenticated by HMAC.  Adding a specific note to this particular transition misleads the reader and makes the reader belive that it is the only trasition that HMAC is validated.


**Suggested Remedy**

Page 214, line 57, delete the entire note.

Page 215, line 3, delete the entire note.

Page 215, line 14, delete the entire note.


**Proposed Resolution**     **Recommendation:**                    **Recommendation by**


**Reason for Recommendation**


**Resolution of Group**          **Decision of Group:**


**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**


**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**


**Editor's Notes**               **Editor's Actions**

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**


**Editor's Action Items**

**Document under Review:** **P802.16/D4**                    **Ballot Number:** **0000166**                                        **Comment Date**

**Comment #** **160**             **Comment submitted by:**    Stanley            Wang                                        Member

**Comment**        **Type** Editorial                    **Starting Page #** 215            **Starting Line #** 25         **Section** 7.2.5.5

Typo.

**Suggested Remedy**

Change "remove CID" to "remove SAID"

**Proposed Resolution**        **Recommendation:**                        **Recommendation by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**                **Decision of Group:**

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**                **Editor's Actions**

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**

**Document under Review:** **P802.16/D4**          **Ballot Number:** **0000166**                    **Comment Date**

**Comment #** **161**          **Comment submitted by:** Stanley          Wang                              Member

**Comment**     **Type** Technical          **Starting Page #** 293          **Starting Line #** 53          **Section** 9.1.1

Per Clause 9.13 of RFC 2132, "DHCP Options and BBOTP Vendor Extensions", option #60 is "Vendor Class Identifier".

**Suggested Remedy**

Change "(Vendor Specific Option)" to "(Vendor Class Identifier)"

**Proposed Resolution**     **Recommendation:**                    **Recommendation by**

**Reason for Recommendation**

**Resolution of Group**          **Decision of Group:**

**Reason for Group's Decision/Resolution**

**Group's Notes**

**Group's Action Items**

**Editor's Notes**          **Editor's Actions**

**Editor's Questions and Concerns**

**Editor's Action Items**

**Document under Review:** **P802.16/D4**          **Ballot Number:** **0000166**             **Comment Date**

**Comment #** **162**       **Comment submitted by:** Stanley       Wang                  Member

**Comment**    **Type** Technical           **Starting Page #** 302       **Starting Line #** 34       **Section** 11

Current definition of the length field of a TLV encoding limits the length of the value field. For example, for a 1-byte length field, the maximum length for the value field is 255 bytes. In addition, TLVs for PKM messages use 2-byte length field while others use 1-byte length field.

This can causes some troubles such as the value field is longer than the maximum length allowed by the length field.

There is a standard way of handling the encoding rules, re: ITU-T X690.

**Suggested Remedy**

[ITU-T X690] ITU-T Recommendation X.690, "Information Technology -- ASN.1 Encoding Rules: Specification of Basic Encoding Rules (BER), Canonical Encoding Rules (CER), and Distinguished Encoding Rules (DER)," December 1997."

Page 302, line 34, add the following paragraph:

The format of the length field shall be per the "definite form" of [ITU-T X690]. Specifically, if the actual length of the value field is less than or equal to 127 bytes:

 . the length of the length field shall be one byte,
 . the msb of the length field shall be set to 0, and
 . the other 7 bits of the length field shall be used to indicate the actual length of the value field in bytes.

If the length of the value field is more than 127 bytes:

 . the length of the length field shall be one byte more than what is actually used to indicate the length of the value field in byte,
 . the msb of the first byte of the length field shall be set to 1,
 . the other 7 bits of the first byte of the length field shall be used to indicate the number of additional bytes of the length field (i.e., excluding the first byte), and
 . the remaining bytes (i.e., excluding the first byte) of the length field shall be used to indicate the actual length of the value field."

Page 303, line 11, remove "(1 byte}" from the "Length" field title. Make the same change for all TLV tables (e.g., page 304 line 11, page 305 line 9, etc)

Page 309, line 31, change "2 byte" to "variable"

Page 309, line 44, delete "is 2 bytes, and"

Page 313, line 26, change "33" to "variable"

Page 315, line 43, change ">=9" to "variable"

Page 317, line 26, change "6*n" to "5*n"

Page 318, line 35, change "14" to "variable"

**Proposed  Resolution        Recommendation:                        Recommendation  by**

**Reason  for  Recommendation**

**Resolution  of  Group                    Decision  of  Group:**

**Reason  for  Group's  Decision/Resolution**

**Group's  Notes**
**Group's  Action  Items**

**Editor's  Notes                    Editor's  Actions**
**Editor's  Questions  and  Concerns**

**Editor's  Action  Items**

**Document under Review:** **P802.16/D4**                **Ballot Number:** **0000166**                    Comment Date

**Comment #** **163**                **Comment submitted by:**  Stanley            Wang                                    Member

**Comment        Type** Technical                        **Starting Page #** 309        **Starting Line #** 48        **Section** 11.2

The statement on line 48 applies only to PKM messages.  There is no similar statement that applies to other messages.

**Suggested  Remedy**

Page 309, line 48, delete the entire line.

Page 302, line 36, add to the end of the paragraph "MAC management messages that do not contain all required encodings or contain encoding(s) with invalid length(s) shall be silently discarded."

**Proposed  Resolution        Recommendation:**                    **Recommendation  by**

**Reason  for  Recommendation**

**Resolution  of  Group**                **Decision  of  Group:**

**Reason  for  Group's  Decision/Resolution**

**Group's  Notes**

**Group's  Action  Items**

**Editor's  Notes**                **Editor's  Actions**

**Editor's  Questions  and  Concerns**

**Editor's  Action  Items**