

Project	IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group < http://ieee802.org/16 >	
Title	Maintenance Task Group Session #44 Minutes	
Date Submitted	2006-07-20	
Source(s)	Jonathan Labs Wavesat, Inc. 1375 Trans-Canada Hwy Dorval, Qc H9P 2W8 Canada	Voice: +1 514 684 0200 x325 Fax: +1 514 684 0211 mailto:jlabs@wavesat.com
Re:	Maintenance Task Group Session #44 Minutes	
Abstract	Maintenance Task Group Session #44 Minutes	
Purpose	Maintenance Task Group Session #44 Minutes	
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.	
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.	
Patent Policy and Procedures	The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures < http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html >, including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard." Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair < mailto:chair@wirelessman.org > as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site < http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices >.	

Maintenance Task Group Session #44 Minutes

*Jonathan Labs
Wavesat, Inc.*

Maintenance Task Group
Session #44, San Diego, California, USA

Interim editor: Itzik Kitroser

Tuesday July 18, 2006

Room Elizabeth E.

10:35: Opened meeting of the Maintenance Task Group

Presented the agenda in IEEE 802.16maint-06/19.

10:43: Motion to approve the agenda (IEEE 802.16maint-06/019): Moved by Dorin Viorel, seconded by Brian Johnson.
Approved by unanimous voice vote.

Presented the slides in IEEE 802.16maint-06/19.

10:46: Motion to approve minutes from Session 43 (IEEE 802.16maint-06/015): Moved by Asaf Matatyaou, seconded by Mark Cudak.
Accepted by unanimous voice vote.

Opened the discussion on starting a Cor2 Corrigendum project, as empowered by the 802.16 Working Group at the 802.16 WG opening plenary.

Discussion on the approved motion of Phil Barber at the opening plenary, stating:

“To empower the Maintenance Task Group to take necessary and reasonable action to initiate a new Corrigendum project, including completing and forwarding a PAR form to the 802 EC if necessary, no later than Wednesday, July 19 at noon, subject to WG review at the Closing Plenary of the decision to forward the PAR to the EC”

Question was raised regarding the scope of the proposed PAR and expected schedule of the work.

Suggestions:

Scope (in addition to inherited scope of a corrigendum project)
802.16-2004 / 802.16e-2005 with Cor1/802.16f

Discussion on Phil's proposal to the PAR scope in S80216-06_008:

Proposed scope statement for the PAR:

Scope of Proposed Project (proposal 2):

This corrigendum contains substantive corrections to IEEE Std 802.16. It corrects errors, inconsistencies, and ambiguities in that standard. It does not contain material that introduces enhancements or new features. The corrigendum only includes corrections submitted by September 23, 2006 prior to 802.16 Session #45.

12:26 Motion to break for lunch and resume at 13:30. Moved by: Wonil Roh, seconded by Herbert Ruck
Approved by unanimous voice vote.

12:27 Broke for lunch.

13:42 Resumed the Maintenance TG meeting in Manchester F.

Continued discussion on a Corrigendum PAR project. Discussed the wording for the major parts of a PAR:

Scope of Proposed Project:

This corrigendum contains substantive corrections to IEEE Std 802.16. It corrects errors, inconsistencies, and ambiguities in that standard. It does not contain material that introduces enhancements or new features. The corrigendum only includes corrections submitted to the IEEE 802.16 working group by September 23, 2006 prior to 802.16 Session #45.

Purpose of Proposed Project:

The purpose of this project is only to correct errors, inconsistencies, and ambiguities in IEEE Std 802.16-2004 as amended by 802.16e-2005 and 802.16f-2005.

Reason for the standardization project:

The reason for this project is to correct errors, inconsistencies, and ambiguities in IEEE Std 802.16 as soon as possible.

14:32: Motion to authorize the task group chair and the editor to draft the PAR application for a corrigendum 2 project according to text reviewed by the task group and post the application for review and approval for submission by the working group.

Moved by: Herbert Ruck, seconded by Ofer Kelman

In favor: 30, against: 0, abstain: 0

Motion passes.

Discussed dates needed for the PAR form.

The following dates were proposed by the TG for the Cor2 project by consensus:

- Initiation of a WG letter ballot on the task group approved comments according to the maintenance process: 2006-11
- Expected Date of Submission for Initial Sponsor Ballot: 2007-03
- Projected Completion Date for Submittal to RevCom: 2007-05

15:10: Broke for coffee

15:30 Resumed the meeting

Started reviewing change requests in 80216maint-06_012r2.USR. Started with all technical comments.

Stopped for the day with comment #40.

Generate and uploaded 80216maint-06_012r2_1.USR, which contains the reviews of the change requests as of Tuesday evening, to the Temp directory.

18:10 Broke for the evening.

18:10-18:30 As empowered by the TG, the TG chair and the interim editor drafted the PAR form, 80216Cor2PARdraft.doc, for a Cor2 Corrigendum project and submitted the form to the WG Chair for review.

Wednesday July 19, 2006

1:00 TG Chair uploads the draft PAR 80216Cor2PARdraft.doc to the Temp directory. An email is sent to the reflector opening a call for comments to the WG on the document until 10:00 AM Wednesday morning, July 19, 2006, as the form needs to be submitted to the 802 EC for consideration at the 802 EC meeting on Friday 48 hours prior to that meeting.

8:15 Resumed Maintenance TG meeting in Besty AB

Continued reviewing change requests in 80216maint-06_012r2_1.USR

10:00 Broke for coffee

10:20 Resumed meeting

Reviewed the comments on the Cor2 proposed PAR (see Appendix for the comments). Generated an updated PAR draft, IEEE 802.16maint-06/021r1, and uploaded it to Maintenance directory.

10:55 Motion: To forward the par document to 802.16 WG Chair for submission to the 802.16 WG and to 802 EC. Moved by Remi Chayer, seconded by Itzik Kitroser.

In favor: 28

Opposed: 0

Abstain: 0

Motion passes.

11:00 Resumed review of change requests in 80216maint-06_012r2_1.USR.

12:00 Broke for lunch

Generated and uploaded 80216maint-06_012r2_2.USR, which contains the reviews of the change requests as of Wednesday noon, to the Temp directory.

13:15 Resumed meeting in Betsy AB.

Resumed review of change requests in 80216maint-06_012r2_2.USR.

15:20 Broke for coffee

15:40 Resumed meeting.

Generated list of editorial comments, 80216maint-06_012r2_list_editorials.xls, for consideration as block for labeling as Ready-for-WG-Ballot by the TG. Uploaded 80216maint-06_012r2_list_editorials.xls to the Temp directory.

Resumed review of change requests in 80216maint-06_012r2_2.USR.

18:00 Broke for the evening

Generated and uploaded 80216maint-06_012r2_3.USR, which contains the reviews of the change requests as of Wednesday evening, to the Temp directory.

Thursday July 20, 2006

8:15: Resumed meeting in Manchester F.

Resumed review of change requests in 80216maint-06_012r2_3.USR

10:10: Broke for coffee.

10:45: Finished reviewing all technical change requests in 80216maint-06_012r2_3.USR.

11:00: Motion to accept the editorial change requests listed in 80216maint-06_022.xls as 'Ready for WG Ballot'. Moved by Wonil Roh, seconded by Joe Schumacher.

For: 23

Against: 0

Abstains: 0

Motion passes.

Start reviewing remaining editorial change requests in 80216maint-06_012r2_3.USR

12:00 Broke for lunch.

Generated and uploaded 80216maint-06_012r2_4.USR, which contains the reviews of the change requests as of Thursday noon, to the Temp directory.

13:15 Resumed after lunch in Elizabeth F.

Generated a list of change requests, 80216maint-06_023.pdf for consideration by the TG as errata.

13:20 Motion to accept the change requests listed in 80216maint-06_023.pdf as 'Errata', Itzik Kitroser, Joe Schumacher)

For: 16

Against: 0

Abstains: 0

Motion passes.

13:53 Received the following email from Eugene Crozer:

From: Crozier, Eugene [Eugene_Crozier@srtelecom.com]
Sent: July 20, 2006 1:53 PM

To: Jonathan Labs (E-mail)
Cc: Harrang, Jeffrey
Subject: IEEE comments

Jon

I wish to withdraw the comment 222 on OFDMA, BS receiver maximum input and 132 on image rejection.
I will resubmit both later.

Eugene

13:28 Completed review of Change Requests in 80216maint-06_012r2_4.USR for this session. Generated 80216maint-06_012r4, which contains the reviews of the change requests at the end of Session #44, and uploaded the database to the CR directory.

13:30 Broke for 20 minutes to allow the TG Chair to prepare the Maintenance TG closing.

13:55 Resumed meeting to start the Maintenance TG closing.

Reviewed the slides in IEEE 802.16maint-06_024.

Status of IEEE 802.16-06_12r4

- 370 Change Requests:
 - 284 Ready-for-WG-Ballot (pending approval from original commentator)
 - 5 No-Changes-Required
 - 28 Superseded
 - 15 Withdrawn
 - 23 Errata (no need to be balloted)
 - 4 Reviewed (problem recognized but requires further resolution)
 - 11 Deferred (needs further review)

Reviewed the PAR draft, IEEE 802.16maint-06/021r1, that was submitted to the 802 EC for consideration and approval at the EC meeting on Friday, July 20, 2006.

14:10: Motion to authorize the Maintenance TG Chair to make the following motion at Session #44 Closing Plenary: *“To request the WG to approve the forwarding of the PAR to the IEEE 802 EC.”* Moved by: Dov Andelman, seconded by: Jaehee Cho

In favor: 23

Against:0

Abstain:0

Motion Passes

14:33: Motion, pending approval by the WG to forward the Cor2 PAR to the EC, to authorize the TG Chair to make the following motion at Session #44 Closing Plenary:

“Pending PAR approval by the IEEE Standards Association and pending consideration and disposition of all Maintenance Change Requests at Session #45, to authorize the IEEE 802.16 Working Group at the Session #45 Closing Plenary to approve the initiation of an IEEE 802.16 WG Letter Ballot on each of the change requests that have been approved by the WG for balloting.”

Moved by: Itzik Kitroser

Seconded by: Asaf Matatyau

In favor: 17
 Against: 0
 Abstain: 0
 Motion Passes

Extensive discussion followed on a proposed schedule for the Cor2 project, pending approval of the PAR by the IEEE-SA. The following schedule was proposed:

- 22-Sept-06 Deadline for Change Request Submission to the Maintenance Data Base for consideration of CR for Cor2
- 28-Sept-06 Initiate WG Letter Ballots on the WG Approved Comment Data Base (30 day ballot)
- 1-Nov-06 Invitation to join Sponsor Ballot Pool for COR2 (WG Chair Action)
- 16-Nov-06 Initiate a 15-day WG Ballot Recirc, To get Conditional approval from the EC to go to Sponsor Ballot
- 7-Dec-06 Initiate Sponsor Ballot (document based on accepted WG Change Requests with >75% Approval)
- 15-Jan-07 Sponsor Ballot Comment resolution
- 25-Jan-07 Sponsor Ballot Recirc (15 days)
- 14-Feb-07 BRC meets to resolve comments
- 25-Feb-07 Sponsor Ballot Recirc (15 days)
- 18-Mar-07 Complete Sponsor Ballot
- 30-Mar-07 Cor2 approved by Standard Board

15:10: Motion to authorize the TG Chair to propose at the Session #44 Closing Plenary this schedule as the recommended schedule for the Cor2 project, pending PAR approval by the IEEE-SA. Moved by: Jim Carlo, seconded by: Itzik Kitroser

In favor: 22
 Against: 0
 Abstain: 1
 Motion Passes

15:17: Motion to authorize the TG Chair to make the following motion at Session #44 Closing Plenary: *"To approve 22 September, 2006 as the final date for submission of change requests to the IEEE 802.16 Maintenance Process for consideration for the COR2 Corrigendum project, pending successful approval of the COR2 Corrigendum PAR by the Standards Board on 16 September, 2006."* Moved by: Ed Agis, seconded by: John Humbert

In favor: 24
 Against: 0
 Abstain: 0
 Motion Passes

15:35 Motion to authorize the chair to make the following motion at the WG closing plenary: *"To open a Call for Reply comments on all Change Requests received by 22 September, 2006 and close the call by 24 September, 2006 (AOE)."* Moved by: Dov Andelman, seconded by: Itzik Kitroser

Discussion on the motion followed. Extensive discussion on the dates for the reply comments. The TG Chair reminded the group that the approved Maintenance Process requires approximately 2 weeks reply comment period prior to an 802.16 session, and this motion is needed to allow this next reply comment period to be changed to meet the requested schedule.

15:55 Question is called by Itzik Kitroser. In favor of calling the question: 18, opposed 0. The question is called.

Vote on the motion:

In favor: 23

Against: 0

Abstain: 0

Motion Passes

16:56 Motion to adjourn. Moved by Itzik Kitroser, seconded by Remi Chayer.
Motion passes by unanimous voice vote.

16:57 Adjourned Maintenance Task Group Meeting.

Appendix

Comments received in the Call for Comments to the proposed Cor2 PAR:

=====

From: Jim Carlo [j.carlo@ieee.org]

Sent: July 19, 2006 11:57 AM

To: 'Jonathan Labs'

Cc: 'Roger B. Marks'; pbarber@huawei.com; 'Yongjin (Norman) Zhu'; 'Lin Zhibin 04015'

Subject: RE: [STDS-802-16] Call for Comments on PAR draft for a Corrigendum (Cor2) Project

Three comments (editorial - for thinking about only):

1) On International, 7.2, should we mention ETSI?

2) On Scope, should we remove the last phrase, "prior to 802.16 Session #45." I think no one in NesCom will understand what Session #45 means, what the dates are. So, why not remove this phrase. It was in there so the WG can understand the significance of the date.

3) On 5.4, add the words IEEE in front of each of the 802 standards.

Jim Carlo (j.carlo@ieee.org) Phone:1-214-693-1776 Fax:1-214-853-5274

J.Carlo Consulting LLC (Focus on Telecom Strategy/Standards/Patents)

IEEE Fellow, Huawei Consultant

From: Jonathan Labs [mailto:jlabs@WAVESAT.COM]

Sent: Wednesday, July 19, 2006 3:16 AM

To: STDS-802-16@listserv.ieee.org

Subject: [STDS-802-16] Call for Comments on PAR draft for a Corrigendum (Cor2) Project

802.16 WG Members,

As empowered by the WG at the Opening Plenary here at Session #44, the Maintenance Task Group is taking necessary and reasonable action to initiate a new Corrigendum project, including a decision to draft a PAR form to be forwarded to the 802 EC by Wednesday, July 19, 2006 at noon, San Diego time.

A PAR form has been drafted and can be viewed at:

http://lan.wirelessman.org/CSUpload//upload/temp_db/80216Cor2PARdraft.doc

The Maintenance Task Group has authorized me to ask the WG for comments on the current draft before it is forwarded to the 802 EC. It is asked that any comments on this draft be submitted to me by Wednesday, 10 AM, San Diego time, in order that they can be reviewed by the TG, and that any necessary changes to the document be implemented before the noon deadline.

Jon Labs

Maintenance TG Chair

=====
===
From: Roger B. Marks [r.b.marks@ieee.org]
Sent: July 19, 2006 12:31 PM
To: Jonathan Labs
Cc: Carlo_Jim
Subject: Re: [STDS-802-16] Call for Comments on PAR draft for a
Corrigendum (Cor2) Project

Jon,

I suggest deletion of the sentence "The corrigendum only includes corrections submitted to the IEEE 802.16 working group by September 23, 2006 prior to 802.16 Session #45."

My reasons are:

*The Scope statement needs to be inserted verbatim into the standard.

This sentence is completely inappropriate for insertion into the standard.

*This issue may be perceived negatively as restricting openness.

*This issue can be addressed more effectively by means of a Working Group motion to specify the date of opening a WG letter ballot.

Regarding Jim's comments on 7.2 (international), I am opposed to listing ETSI, for various reasons. We have always listed ITU only on our PARs, and I believe we should continue that tradition.

Roger

On Jul 19, 2006, at 08:56 AM, Jim Carlo wrote:

> Three comments (editorial - for thinking about only):

>

> 1) On International, 7.2, should we mention ETSI?

>

> 2) On Scope, should we remove the last phrase, "prior to 802.16

> Session #45." I think no one in NesCom will understand what Session

> #45 means, what the dates are. So, why not remove this phrase. It was

> in there so the WG can understand the significance of the date.

>

> 3) On 5.4, add the words IEEE in front of each of the 802 standards.

>

> Jim Carlo (j.carlo@ieee.org) Phone:1-214-693-1776 Fax:1-214-853-5274

> J.Carlo Consulting LLC (Focus on Telecom Strategy/Standards/Patents)

> IEEE Fellow, Huawei Consultant

>

>
>
> From: Jonathan Labs [mailto:jlabs@WAVESAT.COM]
> Sent: Wednesday, July 19, 2006 3:16 AM
> To: STDS-802-16@listserv.ieee.org
> Subject: [STDS-802-16] Call for Comments on PAR draft for a
> Corrigendum (Cor2) Project
>
> 802.16 WG Members,
>
>
>
> As empowered by the WG at the Opening Plenary here at Session #44, the
> Maintenance Task Group is taking necessary and reasonable action to
> initiate a new Corrigendum project, including a decision to draft a
> PAR form to be forwarded to the 802 EC by Wednesday, July 19, 2006 at
> noon, San Diego time.
>
>
>
> A PAR form has been drafted and can be viewed at:
>
>
>
> [http://lan.wirelessman.org/CSUpload//upload/temp_db/](http://lan.wirelessman.org/CSUpload//upload/temp_db/80216Cor2PARdraft.doc)
> 80216Cor2PARdraft.doc
>
>
>
> The Maintenance Task Group has authorized me to ask the WG for
> comments on the current draft before it is forwarded to the 802 EC.
> It is asked that any comments on this draft be submitted to me by
> Wednesday, 10 AM, San Diego time, in order that they can be reviewed
> by the TG, and that any necessary changes to the document be

> implemented before the noon deadline.

>

>

>

> Jon Labs

>

> Maintenance TG Chair

>

>

=====
===

From: Jim Carlo [j.carlo@ieee.org]

Sent: July 19, 2006 12:34 PM

To: 'Roger B. Marks'; 'Jonathan Labs'

Subject: RE: [STDS-802-16] Call for Comments on PAR draft for a
Corrigendum (Cor2) Project

sounds good to me.

Jim Carlo (j.carlo@ieee.org) Phone:1-214-693-1776 Fax:1-214-853-5274 J.Carlo Consulting LLC (Focus on
Telecom Strategy/Standards/Patents) IEEE Fellow

-----Original Message-----

From: Roger B. Marks [mailto:r.b.marks@ieee.org]

Sent: Wednesday, July 19, 2006 11:31 AM

To: Jonathan Labs

Cc: Carlo_Jim

Subject: Re: [STDS-802-16] Call for Comments on PAR draft for a Corrigendum
(Cor2) Project

Jon,

I suggest deletion of the sentence "The corrigendum only includes

corrections submitted to the IEEE 802.16 working group by September 23, 2006 prior to 802.16 Session #45."

My reasons are:

*The Scope statement needs to be inserted verbatim into the standard.

This sentence is completely inappropriate for insertion into the standard.

*This issue may be perceived negatively as restricting openness.

*This issue can be addressed more effectively by means of a Working Group motion to specify the date of opening a WG letter ballot.

Regarding Jim's comments on 7.2 (international), I am opposed to listing ETSI, for various reasons. We have always listed ITU only on our PARs, and I believe we should continue that tradition.

Roger

On Jul 19, 2006, at 08:56 AM, Jim Carlo wrote:

> Three comments (editorial - for thinking about only):

>

> 1) On International, 7.2, should we mention ETSI?

>

> 2) On Scope, should we remove the last phrase, "prior to 802.16

> Session #45." I think no one in NesCom will understand what Session

> #45 means, what the dates are. So, why not remove this phrase. It was

> in there so the WG can understand the significance of the date.

>

> 3) On 5.4, add the words IEEE in front of each of the 802 standards.

>

> Jim Carlo (j.carlo@ieee.org) Phone:1-214-693-1776 Fax:1-214-853-5274
> J.Carlo Consulting LLC (Focus on Telecom Strategy/Standards/Patents)
> IEEE Fellow, Huawei Consultant
>
>
>
> From: Jonathan Labs [mailto:jlabs@WAVESAT.COM]
> Sent: Wednesday, July 19, 2006 3:16 AM
> To: STDS-802-16@listserv.ieee.org
> Subject: [STDS-802-16] Call for Comments on PAR draft for a
> Corrigendum (Cor2) Project
>
> 802.16 WG Members,
>
>
>
> As empowered by the WG at the Opening Plenary here at Session #44, the
> Maintenance Task Group is taking necessary and reasonable action to
> initiate a new Corrigendum project, including a decision to draft a
> PAR form to be forwarded to the 802 EC by Wednesday, July 19, 2006 at
> noon, San Diego time.
>
>
>
> A PAR form has been drafted and can be viewed at:
>
>
>
> [http://lan.wirelessman.org/CSUpload//upload/temp_db/](http://lan.wirelessman.org/CSUpload//upload/temp_db/80216Cor2PARdraft.doc)
> 80216Cor2PARdraft.doc
>
>
>
> The Maintenance Task Group has authorized me to ask the WG for

> comments on the current draft before it is forwarded to the 802 EC.
> It is asked that any comments on this draft be submitted to me by
> Wednesday, 10 AM, San Diego time, in order that they can be reviewed
> by the TG, and that any necessary changes to the document be
> implemented before the noon deadline.

>

>

>

> Jon Labs

>

> Maintenance TG Chair

>

>

=====
===

From: DGAL [ddrgal@yahoo.com]

Sent: July 19, 2006 12:56 PM

To: stds-802-16@ieee.org

Cc: Jonathan F Labs

Subject: 802.16 Standard Corrigenda 2 - Draft PAR, - comments on

Emailed: 09:50, Wed, July 19, 2006

Jonathan, Roger,

A few minor comments on the proposed PAR:

1. Global: "Corrigenda" is the plural form of "Corrigendum". Suggest to change where appropriate.
2. Section 5.2: Suggest to change "corrections" to "change requests".
3. Section 5.4: Shouldn't "Corrigenda 1" be mentioned? Obviously, it is implied that "Corrigenda 2" will be an addition to "Corrigenda 1".

Dan Gal,

Lucent Technologie

=====
=====
From: Remi Chayer [rchayer@wavesat.com]
Sent: July 19, 2006 12:56 PM
To: 'Jonathan Labs'
Subject: Coorigendum 2

Hi Jon,

I leave it to you to decide but I believe the deadline of September 23, 2006 to be quite short. I understand however that if we want to meet a quick finalization, we need to squeeze the people a little.

Concerning the contact at ITU, you may want to use Valery Timofeev, ITU Radiocommunication Bureau (BR) Director, However, it would be good to ask Jose for confirmation.

Regards,

Remi Chayer

Wavesat Inc.

Tel.: +1 (514) 684-0200 x378

Cell.: +1 (514) 892-4768

Fax: +1 (514)684-0288

mailto:rchayer@wavesat.com