

Summary of the Comment Resolution Ad-hoc for Clause 9—MAC Fairness of P802.17/D0.3

Anoop Ghanwani, Section Editor
(anoop@lanterncom.com)

Necdet Uzun, Technical Editor
(nuzun@cisco.com)

	Technical, Binding	Technical, Non-binding	Editorial	Total
Accepted	2	3	0	5
Accepted-Modified	14	6	0	20
Accepted-Duplicate	1	1	0	2
Accepted-Clarified	2	1	0	3
Defer to WG	4	0	0	4
Deferred to Other CRG	1	1	0	2
Received from Other CRG	1	0	0	1
Editor to resolve	0	0	12	12
Total	25	12	12	49

Summary of Accepted Comments

- 19 technical comments were addressed by the Clause 9 rewrite which the ad-hoc has accepted
 - State machines (to be reconciled)
 - Moving text around and removing redundant text
 - Better definition of variables
 - Treatment of fairness messages during wrapping
 - Clarification of how the algorithm works
- Stability as a goal of MAC fairness
- DVJ contribution for Type B fairness messages to be added to Annex I
 - Further work in the RAH/FAH
- Analysis of the convergence time
 - Contributions to be invited (informational)

Summary of Accepted Comments (2)

- Justification of the access delay timer values

Access delay timer should be based on the acceptable MAC end to end delay for class B/C traffic. The default value should be set to 5ms for class C and to 1 ms for class B. The range is 1 ms to 100 mS in 1 ms increments. This needs to be incorporated into the text.

- Relationship to other clauses and signals
 - Addressed by Clause 9 rewrite
 - Signals to be addressed by the RAH/FAH
- Provide an externally observable behavior (as required by the PICS)
 - To be addressed by the RAH/FAH
- Justification for the PTQ sizing
 - Add an editors note stating that the justification needs to be provided

Summary of Comments Exchanged with Other Clauses

- Received from other groups
 - #38: Proposed text to better explain sending of fairness control messages (Received from Clause 1—Overview)
 - Comment accepted; figure and text explaining how FCMs are generated on the ring will be added (editor's recommendation)
- Sent to other groups
 - #484: About cut-through and store-and-forward modes (Sent to Clause 6—MAC Data Path)
 - #2457: Adding fairness scenarios (Sent to Annex I—Implementation Guidelines)

Comments Deferred for Resolution by WG

- #2163, #500
 - Flexibility in the fair rate calculation
- #501
 - Make Type B messages optional
- #524
 - Architectural issues with the fairness frame format

Comments to be Resolved by Editor

- Editor requested license to resolve 12 editorial comments
- License was granted by the fairness section comment resolution ad-hoc