

Topology/Protection Comment Resolution Summary

Jason Fan, Section Editor

Jim Kao, Technical Editor

Topology – Clause 10

- 38 comments
 - 32 technical
 - 6 editorial
- Adhoc group resolution (technicals + 2 editorials)
 - 4 accepted
 - 19 accepted/modified
 - 6 superceded
 - 2 rejected
 - 2 punted to Clause 0
 - 1 punted to WG
- Remaining editorials skipped

Summary of Resolutions

- 527
 - Clarified that topology messages are not wrapped
- 533, 554, 556
 - Figures and notation will follow Clause 3 conventions
- 535, 538
 - Topology to notify protection of identity of newly connected neighbor and whether it is different from previously connected neighbor
- 537
 - Editors to coordinate with OAM&P editors on specification of required contents of topology and status database

Summary of Resolutions cont.

- 541, 543, 557
 - Clarify that provisioned class A bandwidth reported in topology message changes on provisioning (not dynamically) and is accessible to fairness
- 544, 553
 - Isolated station (station that will clear topology database) is defined as station with FS or SF condition on one or more links on both sides of the station
- 546
 - Misconfiguration event to be triggered only in stations next to the detected misconfiguration to facilitate indication to the operator of the location of the misconfiguration

Summary of Resolutions cont.

- 559
 - Topology messaging to be sent periodically with configurable range 128 ms to 1024 ms, 128 ms default, and 128 ms resolution
- 563
 - Clarify initialization and modification of topology database

Summary of Actions

- Protection ad-hoc (PAH) to examine issues on topology issues slide
- 528, 547-549
 - Kshitij Kumar to generate topology state machine
- 529
 - Daniel Zhu and George Suwala to determine requirements, if any, for topology discovery prior to wrapping and unwrapping

Summary of Rejections/Punts

- 539: Punted to WG
 - Need WG to determine if the starting value of TTL is uniform across all frame types (data and control), e.g. should TTL always start at 255?
- 540: Punted to Clause 0
 - Usage of “next” link versus “downstream” link
- 542: Punted to Clause 0
 - Usage of “left/right” versus “east/west”

Summary of Rejections/Punts cont.

- 545: Rejected
 - Dynamic ringlet ID assignment capability is justified only if a proposal can be provided to achieve this that is not complicated and that does not have undesirable impacts on other protocols defined in the draft.
- 551: Rejected
 - Comment misinterpreted topology protocol, requesting action by the protocol that it already takes

Topology Issues List for PAH

- Clearly identify and itemize interface between topology, protection, and other modules within the MAC (560, 561)
- Clearly identify triggers for sending topology messages (559)
- What actions, if any, are taken upon failure to receive topology messages?
- Criteria and an algorithm are needed for consistency checking of topology image (538)
- What are the units and ranges of provisioned class A bandwidth information reported in topology messages? (558)

Protection – Clause 11

- 45 comments
 - 31 technical
 - 14 editorial
- Adhoc group resolution (technicals + 1 editorial)
 - 6 accepted
 - 17 accepted/modified
 - 1 superceded
 - 0 rejected
 - 7 deferred to protection ad-hoc (PAH)
 - 1 punted to Clause 0
- Remaining editorials skipped

Summary of Resolutions

- 565
 - Support both revertive and non-revertive operation, with revertive as default
- 572, 587
 - Figures and notation will follow Clause 3 conventions
- 567, 571, 574, 575, 580, 581, 608
 - Clarifications and addition of scenario descriptions to clause overview
- 576, 600, 603, 604, 606, 607
 - State diagram format modifications, clarifications, and corrections

Summary of Resolutions cont.

- 583
 - Holdoff timer range adjusted to 0 to 200 ms with 10 ms resolution and default of 0
 - Holdoff state to be removed in protection state diagrams; holdoff time simply to be applied to automatic protection triggers
- 584
 - Clarify that steering protection will select preferred direction for sending traffic to a destination based on protection hierarchy
- 586
 - Control TTL field to be deleted for consistency with MAC comment resolution

Summary of Resolutions cont.

- 588
 - Control version and control type fields to be leveraged from RPR Header for consistency with MAC comment resolution

Summary of Actions/Deferrals

- Protection ad-hoc (PAH) to examine issues on protection issues slides
- Deferred comments summarized on issues slides
- 567, 581
 - David James to help editors with scenario description generation

Summary of Punts

- 573: Punted to Clause 0
 - Usage of “inner/outer” for labeling ringlets

Protection Issues List for PAH

- Clearly identify and itemize interface between topology, protection, and other modules within the MAC
- Retransmission of messages (578, 579 – Def)
 - Exponential backoff or fixed; what are limits on message period?
- Insertion of steering station into an operating wrapping ring (576)
- Do multiple signal degrades result in a single wrap or no wraps? (601 - Def)
- Is the wrapping status bit required? (589 – Def)
- Can protection distinguish, using only protection messaging, whether a newly connected station is a new neighbor or the same as the previously connected neighbor? (582)

Protection Issues List continued

- How uniform should the behavior of wrapping and steering be in terms of reporting of link status throughout the ring? (595, 596 - Def
- How do non-revertive modes work for steering and wrapping? (Def – 594)
- How is variability of fairness advertisement interval handled as related to the loss of keep-alive trigger? (585)