

**TELECOMMUNICATION  
STANDARDIZATION SECTOR**

STUDY PERIOD 2005-2008

**English only****Original: English**

---

**Question(s):** 5/13, 9/15, 12/15      **Meeting, date:** Kobe, Japan, 22-26 April 2006  
**Study Group:** 15    **Working Party:** 3/15  
**Source:** Rapporteurs – Q9/15, Q12/15  
**Title:** Ethernet Ring Protection

---

**LIAISON STATEMENT**

**To:** Mike Takefman, chair IEEE 802.17, [tak@cisco.com](mailto:tak@cisco.com)  
Tony Jeffree, chair IEEE 802.1, [tony@JEFFFREE.CO.UK](mailto:tony@JEFFFREE.CO.UK)  
**Copy:** Paul Nikolich, IEEE 802 Chair, [p.nikolich@ieee.org](mailto:p.nikolich@ieee.org)  
**Approval:** Agreed to at joint Q.9 & 12/15 and 5/13 meeting  
**For:** Comment  
**Deadline:** 1 October 2006

---

**Contact:** Ghani Abbas      Tel: +44 115 906 4036  
Marconi Communications Plc.      Fax: +44 115 906 4346  
UK      Email: [Ghani.Abbas@marconi.com](mailto:Ghani.Abbas@marconi.com)

---

**Contact:** Malcolm Betts      Tel: +1 613 763 7860  
Nortel Networks      Fax: +1 613 763 4371  
Canada      Email: [betts01@nortel.com](mailto:betts01@nortel.com)

---

Thank you for your liaison informing us of the potential issues with defining Ethernet ring protection and of the applicability of RPR. We would like to offer some clarity on our work, and further have some additional questions.

Selective protection of VLANs is important requirement of ITU-T G.8031 because in a transport Ethernet network VLANs are used to identify customer service instances. This is particularly an issue when the service is provided over multiple physical links. The service provider can offer differentiation with the value-added service of per VLAN protection.

In the ITU-T context, we treat VLANs as distinct service instances, thus this semantic is in the spirit of the IEEE 802.1Q semantics and will not affect the interoperability of equipment based on IEEE 802.1Q standards.

We are studying multipoint-to-multipoint Ethernet protection for inclusion in the next version of G.8031. Further, we are studying using Ethernet rings to facilitate protection. However, we have not yet agreed on the architecture or mechanism of an ‘Ethernet ring’. We would be interested in understanding if there are any ongoing or planned work items in IEEE that may relate to Ethernet rings.

In transport Ethernet networks, network management is often used to setup and manage VLANs, as a result the spanning tree protocol is not used. We have been made aware that Spanning tree (RSTP, MSTP) is being enhanced or replaced by 802.1aq – Shortest Path Bridging. We would appreciate an update on this protocol including an indication if this would be a useful candidate for either Ethernet rings or multipoint-to-multipoint protection.

RPR is now included on the G.8031 living list as a candidate for Ethernet ring protection in addition to the proposal we indicated in the previous liaison. We would welcome your assistance when we decide to proceed with a Recommendation on this topic. Please keep us informed of any evolution of the IEEE 802.17 standard.

We wish to thank IEEE 802 for your response to our previous liaison and look forward to the continuation of the exchange of information on topics of common interest to our organizations.

---