

IEEE 802.17 Meeting Minutes
March 2006 Plenary
San Diego, CA

Monday: 3/6/06

13:45 Call to Order – Bill Reysen volunteered to scribe

13:50 Introduction and Patent Policy – Mike Takefman

Future Schedule

- April/May/June Teleconferences
- July 802 Plenary

Goals for this week

- Comment resolution on D1.3
- ITU Liaison Letter
- When to kick off maintenance (802.17c)
- Is there a 802.17d?

Currently have 12 active members across 11 organizations. Discussed getting more members from equipment manufacturers interested in RPR.

14:00 Reviewed and Revised the Agenda

14:10 Motion 1:

Move to approve agenda – John Lemon / Marc Holness (administrative)
Approved without objection

14:10 Review of Current 802.17b Schedule – Mike Takefman

14:20 Editor's Update of 802.17b – Marc Holness

Review of results of Multicast Ballot resolved in February

14:30 Comment Resolution of 802.17b D1.3

- Numbers 1 – 21
- Consult comment database for results

16:45 ITU-T SC15 Liaison - Glenn Parsons

- Presentation to 802.3 and 802.1 already made
- OTNT Standardization work plan
- Definitions of metro-ethernet and ethernet over transport
- Looking for overlaps

- New Ethernet over Transports Recs (G.8012/Y.1308 Am. 1 includes ethernet over RPR and MPLS)
- G8010 – Describes RPR in ITU terminology
- G8031 – Ethernet Protection Switching (sponsor ballot) – connection protection schemes for sub-nets constructed from point to point Ethernet VLANs. Copying frames above the MAC layer. Concern raised about spanning tree.

Discussion on Ethernet Protected Rings

- G8031 – Expand to cover multipoint connections. Several ring options discussed (RPR, RPR enhancement for specific VLANs, Spanning tree?)
- 802.1 is asking 802.17 to investigate multipoint protection.
- One question is does this discussion belong at the MAC level or above?
- RPR already allows a client to protect specific VLANs.
- Another option is to define a new “light MAC” to do ethernet rings.
- No goals or objectives stated for quality (time) of protection.
- Comments from 802.1 meeting (Mick)
 - (Mick) Utility of protecting VLANs is not clear if the entire link fails
 - (Mick) May change the semantic of VLANs in future specs. Caution when treating VLANs as circuits
 - (Mick) Protection needs to be fast. 50ms not fast enough. Should be faster than 802.1 lag CC message round trip time (around 11ms).
 - (Mick) Want to avoid flapping. Lower layers repair slower than upper layer.
 - (Norm) STP does not converge over RPR because it is a shared medium. – 802.17 group does not agree with this statement.
 - (Nurit) Preference to use Ethernet MAC rather than RPR MAC. Another contribution is planned.

Discussion to be continued Tuesday

6pm – recess

3/07/06

9:10 Call to Order

9:15 Review of Draft Liaison Letter to ITU-T SG15
Drafted by Takefman, Parsons and Lemon Monday night.

After completing review, a straw poll indicated unanimous consent to send this letter to dot1 for review. If dot 1 wants a joint review with us, we can accommodate them. Otherwise, we will review any changes they make.

9:41 802.17b D1.3 Comment Resolution – Marc Holness
See CRD for results

11:55 Break for Lunch

13:15 802.17 Maintenance – John Lemon

See Maintenance webpage for disposition of Maintenance Requests

16:00 802.17b D1.3 Comment Resolution – Marc Holness

17:18 Recess for the day – restart time tomorrow 8:30

3/08/06

8:40 802.17b D1.3 Comment Resolution – Marc Holness

11:55 Lunch Break

1:15 802.17 Maintenance – John Lemon

3/09/06

8:45 Call to Order

8:46 Chair / Vice Chair Elections – Mike Takefman

John Lemon unopposed for Vice Chair

Mike Takefman unopposed for chair

8:47 Motion 2: Move to confirm John Lemon as Vice Chair of 802.17
Michael Kelsen / Gary Turner (administrative) 9/0/0

8:49 Motion 3: Move to confirm Michael Takefman as Chair of 802.17
John Lemon / Leon Bruckman (administrative) 9/0/0

9:00 Request to modify the agenda to adjust timing of items and add
Discussion on 802.17c and 802.17d

9:02 Motion 4: Move to approve the Thursday agenda as modified
Michael Kelsen / Leon Bruckman (administrative) unanimous

9:05 Discussion on 802.17b D1.4/1.5/1.6 Schedule – Mike Takefman

D1.4 Draft to be created by 3/31/2006, recirc to start immediately

D1.4 Ballot to run April 1st to April 16th 2006

D1.4 CRG on April 19th and 20th

D1.5 Draft to be created by May 25th 2006

D1.5 Ballot to run May 26th to June 10th

D1.5 CRG on June 14th/15th

D1.6 Draft to be created by June 30th

D1.6 Ballot to run July 1st to July 16th 2006

Straw poll on this plan of record: no objection to this being the plan of record with the chair given authority to move dates around slightly based on the document arriving early (or late).

9:32 Mini Motion Madness

9:35 Motion 5: Move to approve the minutes from the following sessions / teleconferences:
November 2005, January 2006.

Gary Turner / Marc Holness (technical) unanimous

- 9:40 Motion 6: Move to hold 802.17b Comment Resolution Teleconferences on or about (allowing for variation in delivery of the draft) April 19/20, 2006 and to authorize the group to progress the 802.17b project.
John Lemon / Gary Turner (administrative) unanimous
- 9:41 Motion 7: Move to hold an 802.17b Interim Session (and teleconference) on June 14/15, 2006 at Cortina Systems in Sunnyvale CA, and to authorize the group to progress the 802.17b project.
John Lemon / Gary Turner (administrative) unanimous
- 9:43 Motion 8: To authorize the editor to create P802.17b/D1.4 based on P802.17b/D1.3 and the comment resolutions and motions from this session.
Leon Bruckman / Michael Kelsen (technical) unanimous
- 9:45 Motion 9: Direct the WG chair to begin a 15 day WG recirculation ballot on P802.17b/D1.4 on April 1st, 2006
Mike Takefman / Gary Turner (technical) unanimous
- 9:47 Discussion on 802.17c – Mike Takefman

It appears that there are enough MRs and a few important MRs that need to be fixed.
A maintenance PAR can be opened under the 48 hour rule.
It seems that people agree that a revision might be the best course.
Discussion on MIB changes / demotion from required to optional, proposals to be made at the July Plenary session or at the June Interim.

10:10 Break for 15 minutes

10:25 Discussion on 802.17d
Ring Aggregation:
Is it .17 or .1 scope?
The ring distribution algorithm is key.

11:00 Mick Seaman and Glenn Parsons arrive to edit the ITU-T letter.
Plenty of changes made

11:51 Motion 10: Move to approve the ITU-T SG15 Liaison letter as edited and authorize the Chair and the 802.1 Liaison (Glenn Parsons) to complete editing as required at the 802.1 closing plenary.
Marc Holness / Gary Turner (technical) unanimous

11:55 Motion 11: Move to Adjourn
Marc Holness / Michael Kelsen (administrative) unanimous

Attendees:

Mike Takefman

John Lemon

Marc Holness

Bob Sultan

Glenn Parsons

Leon Bruckman

Gary Turner

Michael Kelsen

Bill Reysen

Nitan Gogate