

November 2002
Clause 9 Comment Resolution
Bob Sultan
Necdet Uzun
Anoop Ghanwani
Gal Mor
Komal Rathi

Clause 9 Statistics

	acpt	dup	mod	withdr	total
Technical binding	7	2	9	0	18
Tech. non-binding	9	5	18	1	33
Technical total	16	7	27	1	51
Editorial					62
Total comments					113

Clause 9 Resolutions

151	Avoid reference to rates greater than 10Gbps in rate coefficient table by providing formula.
152	Weights are learned from TLVs in the extended topology message, not from the stationCapabilities bytes
200	The range of the advertisementInterval is [1MTU, agingInterval].
227, 229	Set sendC to 255 when addRateCongested reaches maxAllow (and explain why in text).

Clause 9 Resolutions

133, 134, 143, 144, 148	Editors to modify definitions of addRate, addRateCongested, fwRate, fwRateCongested, and nrXmitRate, to insure that they accurately reflect the normative pseudo-code descriptions without repeating all details.
196	Statement regarding setting of lowThreshold was incorrectly associated with high threshold.
197	Add to existing informative note that higher value of lowThreshold can prevent sending fairness messages that have no effect because they reflect short bursts.

Clause 9 Resolutions

135, 147	Remove text implying that AGEcoef can assume values other than {1, 2, 4, 8, 16} and LPCOEF can assume values other than {16, 32, 64, 128, 256, 512}.
140	Correct definition of congestionPoint to reflect that this is not the most congested station on the ringlet, but in the congestion domain of the local station.
168, 206, 185	Describe rules handling RI in SC-FCM at wrapped station. Editors granted license to appropriately modify current text.

Clause 9 Resolutions

225, 228, 184, 191	Move computations of addRateOK, addRateCongestedOK, and sendC to section describing per-byte operations but state that new values have an effect only at packet boundaries. State tables will be provided to describe per-byte operations.
-----------------------------	--

Clause 9 Resolutions

168, 178, 219, 230	Calculation of hopsToCongestion when wrapped is hopsToWrapPoint when congestion is on the opposite ringlet, and fwdRateCongested should revert to fwdRate.
212	C-code not to be moved to annex H until completely replaced by appropriate normative state tables and associated normative pseudo-code.
174	Description of multi-choke will be moved to a distinct subclause in order to clarify the clause 9 text. No functional change is implied.

Clause 9 Resolutions

179, 187, 183, 182	<p>The ‘condition’ in the row of a state table will contain a pseudo-code function returning a boolean value. The ‘action’ in a row of a state table will contain one (or a small number of) pseudo-code procedure call. The functions and procedures will be named descriptively. The body of the functions and procedures will appear below the state tables. States will be named with a prefix identify the associated state machine. Tables to be moved to appropriate subclauses.</p>
-----------------------------	---

Clause 9 Resolutions

175	Note describing implications of threshold settings will be labeled ‘informative’.
167, 194	Editor granted license to explain aggressive and conservative modes in text. Also will be stated that choice of aggressive or conservative mode is orthogonal to choice of single or dual transit buffer.
137	Ring can contain mix of stations using conservative or aggressive modes.
177	MC-FCM distribution is mandatory.

Clause 9 Resolutions

120

aggressive: Mode of operation of the fairness algorithm in which the fairRate is computed based on the congested station's add rate. This allows relatively high utilization of capacity at the expense of wider fluctuation in fairRate values.

conservative: Mode of operation of the fairness algorithm in which the fairRate is computed based on the last fairRate and effect of last fairRate advertised on the congestion state. This allows relatively narrow fluctuation in fairRate values at the expense of capacity utilization.

Clause 9 Resolutions

195,
218,
145

Clarification of rules for declaring congestion (with distinct threshold names):

dual transit buffer:

1) conservative mode: use both STQ depth and rate thresholds (when one is exceeded, station is congested).

2) aggressive mode: use STQ depth threshold.

single transit buffer:

rate thresholds and HoL timers always used.

Clause 9 Resolutions

217	A local station should be counted as active when congested determining the number of active stations.
119	Clause 9 and 6 editors will clarify the interface between their functions.

188, 189, 207, 186, 215, 216, 181, 132	Various errors and omissions in text, tables, or code on which there was little or no discussion
--	--