

To: 802.1aj Study Group
From: 802.17 WG

Subject: Concerns with the PAR for P802.1aj

The 802.17 WG has reviewed your PAR and 5 Criteria documents and would like to provide the following feedback on your proposed project.

In section **14. PURPOSE:** The wide and growing deployment of Ethernet Provider Services has created a demand for simple two-port demarcation devices that connect two 802 media or 802 media emulations. The lack of standards for such devices, and particularly for link-loss signaling and remote diagnosis, is impeding the growth of this industry. This standard will greatly improve this situation.

14a. Reason: Public networks represent a new and very broad application space for IEEE 802 technologies and specifically for Provider Bridges (P802.1ad) and Ethernet in the First Mile (802.3ah). Numerous vendors and potential users (the Service Providers) have expressed the need to integrate Ethernet link technologies with their existing infrastructure at a low cost, while providing the manageability and remote diagnostic capabilities traditionally offered by circuit switched technologies.

In the Compatibility section of the 5 Criteria, the only MAC that is called out as a requirement for compatibility is 802.3.

We believe that the PAR and 5 Criteria as currently written is overly focused on a single 802 MAC technology. As such is a sub-optimal use of scarce 802 volunteer resources and limits the market for devices built to this standard.

For example, a device similar to a SONET/SDH regenerator would be of great use in Metropolitan and Regional Area Networks for both 802.3 and 802.17 MAC layers. 802.17 is of the opinion that the specification of this kind of device is in line with the proposed project.

802.17 requests that the PAR and 5 Criteria be changed to be more inclusive of other 802 MAC technologies.

Respectfully,

IEEE 802.17 Resilient Packet Ring Working Group