

September 30th, 2002

8:30AM – Presentation by Mike T

Logistics for connection
server address 192.168.0.3
192.168.0.3/index.htm

8:54 AM – Approval of agenda, F: Bob L, S: Tom A, approved by acclaim

| | | |
|--|-----------------|-----------------------|
| Motion: 2002-09-30-00 | | |
| Procedural | Mover: Bob Love | Second: Tom Alexander |
| Text: Move to approve the agenda for the 802.17 working group interim meeting in New Orleans | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: |
| Result: Passes, unanimous | | |

8:57 AM – ITU SG17/X.msr update by Mike T

- Glen P and Mike T visited Oslo
- X,msr is defining both MAC layer and service layer
- Significant overlap between 802.17 and X.msr
- US companies submitted proposal to T1X1.5 in Ottawa to deny permission to X.msr for lack of coordination
- 802.17 next steps: Liason to SG17

9:14 AM – SEC rules for membership

- Currently membership cannot be lost for 16 months
- Mike's proposal : 4 meeting proposal
- Straw poll gives slight advantage for 3 meeting

9:26 AM – PAR for 802.17a

9:31 AM – RPR : A view from the market – Lauren S (RPR alliance)

9:41 AM – Chief Editor's report

- CRDs will be posted on the file server under directory "latest_CRD"

10:02 AM - Break

10:27 AM – BAH report (Marc H)

- Focus on packet reorder, duplication, loss reqts

10:52 AM – PAH report (Jim K)

11:07 AM – FAH report (Necdet U)

11:15 AM – Finite state machine for 802.17 topology (Kshitij K)

11:27 AM – Simulation results for enhanced vs basic bridging (Fredrik D)

11:47 AM – Lunch break

1:15 PM – The rice packet ring simulator: An open-source ns-2 simulator of the RPR fairness algorithm (Ping Yuan)

1:30 PM – Bridging proposal (Peter J)

1:58 PM – Updated proposal for RPR rate synchronization (Rhett B)

2:13 PM – IETF Liason report of the RPR MIB (Glenn P)

- 802.17 preference to publish the MIB as IEEE only
- Motion will be proposed on Thursday to send RPR Mib and draft to IETF for sanity check

2:22 PM – ITU Liason report (Glenn P)

2:25 PM – MIBs (David J)

2:30 PM – CRCs (David J)

2:37 PM – Topology frame format – PAH (Leon B)

2:50 PM - Break

3:16 PM – OAM-AH report (Leon B)

3:31 PM – Time of day synchronization (David J)

3:47 PM – Improving 802.17 delays using global coordination (Harmen V)

4:15 PM – Details of the IKN-Fairness mechanism : CQMA

4:44 PM – Spatial Fairness shaping (David J)

5:05 PM – Bandwidth Allocation (David J)

5:30 PM – Avoiding frame duplication and misordering in 802.17 (Anoop G)

5:45 PM – Flooding with context containment (Marc H)

5:55 PM – Overview of BAH proposal T (Mike T)

6:10 PM – Support for selective ordering/duplication preservation on 802.17 ring (Bob C)

October 3rd, 2002

8:21 AM – Approval of agenda

8:25 AM – ITU-SG 17 liason

- T1X1 position is to deny consent to X.msr
- US state department position is similar

8:28 AM – PAR for 802.17a

- Standard stating amendments to 802.1D-1998
- Will be submitted in Nov, 2002
- Plan to finish in one year

8:34 AM – Motion for approval of PAR for 802.17a

| | | |
|--|----------------------|--------------------------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-01 | | |
| Technical | Mover: Mike Takefman | Seconder: Constantinos Bassias |
| Text: Move to forward the PAR for 802.17a as written in 802.17a_par.pdf to 802 SEC and other | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: |
| Result: Passes, unanimous | | |

8:42 AM – Undetected error analysis (Mike T on behalf of Nirmal S)

- HEC-16 vs HEC-32

9:00 AM – Editor's report (Tom A)

- Global section: 4 comments
- Intro section: 55 comments
- Clause 2,3,4 : 56 comments, 55 resolved
-
- D1.1 will be ready and posted on Oct 26
- Comment period runs from Oct 26-Nov 5

9:18 AM – Clause 0 report (Tom Alexander)

| | | | |
|---|----------------------|--------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-02 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Tom Alexander | Second: John Lemon | |
| Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on section 0 (global comments), as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including requests for contributions and requests to form ad-hoc groups as necessary. | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: Passes, unanimous | | | |

9:29AM – Clause 2,3,4 (Tom Alexander)

9:51 AM – Introduction D1.0 Clause #1 reports (David James)

| | | | |
|--|--------------------|-----------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-03 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: David James | Second: Tom Alexander | |
| Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on Intro section(clauses 1,2,3,4), as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including requests for contributions. | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: Passes, unanimous | | | |

10:04 AM Section 2 (MAC) CRG summary (John Lemon)

- All technical comments resolved (dealt with or deferred to WG)
- Discussion on comment #301

| | | | |
|---|-----------------|----------------------|----------------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-04 | | | |
| Procedural | Mover: Bob Love | Second: Harmen VanAs | |
| Text: Move to defer discussion on comment #301 until after the bridging discussions have concluded. | | | |
| For:3 | Against:21 | Abstain: | Result: fails |
| Result: Fails | | | |

- Discussion on comment #348

| | | | |
|---|-----------------|---------------------|----------------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-05 | | | |
| Procedural | Mover: Bob Love | Second: Khaled Amer | |
| Text: Move to amend the agenda to include a 30min discussion on “Frame formats necessary to accommodate future bridging enhancements” | | | |
| For: 7 | Against:17 | Abstain: | Result: fails |
| Result: Fails | | | |

12:05 PM – Lunch break

1:15 PM – Session resumes with the discussion of comments for clause 2 (John Lemon)

- Comment #360

| | | | |
|---|-------------------|-----------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-06 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: John Lemon | Second: Tom Alexander | |
| Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on MAC section(clauses 5,6,8 annexes G,H,I) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including requests for contributions. | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: Passes, unanimous | | | |

2:32 PM – PHY comment report (Annexes B,C,D and clause 7) (Rhett B)

| | | | |
|--|-----------------------|-----------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-07 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Rhett Brikovis | Second: Tom Alexander | |
| Text: Move that the Tfadopt the RPR rate synchronization function described in rb..... | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: Passes, unanimous | | | |

| | | | |
|---|-------------------------|---------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-08 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Rhett Brikovskis | Second: Peter Jones | |
| Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on PHY section(clauses 7 and annex B,C,D) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including requests for contributions. | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: Passes, unanimous | | | |

3:10 PM – Break

3:30 PM – Session resumes with clause 9

3:34 PM – Summary of the comment resolution ad-hoc for clause 9 – MAC fairness of P802.17/D.1 (Anoop Ghanwani)

| | | | |
|--|-----------------------|---------------------|--|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-09 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Anoop Ghanwani | Second: Necdet Uzun | |
| Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on the fairness section(clause 9) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including requests for contributions and requests to from ad-hocs as necessary, and to grant editorial license for all unresolved editorial comments if any. | | | |

| | | | |
|----------------------------------|----------|----------|----------------|
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: Passes, unanimous | | | |

3:52 PM – Topology and Protection ad-hoc report (Jason Fan)

4:40 PM – Revised topology and protection clauses (Jim Kao)

| | | | |
|--|------------------|-----------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-10 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Jason Fan | Second: Jim Kao | |
| Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on Topology/Protection section(clauses 10,11) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including requests for contributions and requests to form ad-hocs as necessary, and to grant editorial license for all unresolved editorial comments if any. | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: Passes, unanimous | | | |

4:54 PM – OAM D1.0 CRG report (Glenn Parsons)

| | | | |
|--|----------------------|---------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-11 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Glenn Parsons | Second: Peter Jones | |
| Text: Authorize 802.17 OAM editor to send the RPR MIB (text) and the RPR draft(as of 1 st WG ballot-PDF) to the IETF (OAM AD &IPoRPR WG) to review MIB after 802.17 authorizes first WG ballot. | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: Passes, unanimous | | | |

| | | | |
|---|----------------------|---------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-12 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Glenn Parsons | Second: Peter Jones | |
| Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on OAM section(clauses 12,13 and annex E) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc. | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: Passes, unanimous | | | |

5:30 PM – Bridging CRG report (Marc Holness)

| | | | |
|--|---------------------|--------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-13 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Marc Holness | Second: John Lemon | |
| Text: Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on Bridging section(annex F) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc and to grant editorial license for all unresolved editorial comments if any. | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |

| |
|----------------------------------|
| Result: Passes, unanimous |
|----------------------------------|

6:00 PM – Drafting D1.1

| | | | |
|--|----------------------|----------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-14 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Tom Alexander | Seconded: John Lemon | |
| Text: Move to authorize chief editor and editors to create 802.17/D1.1 based on P802.17/D1.0 and the instructions within those comment resolutions and motions that are formally approved at the September 2002 meetings in New Orleans. | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: Passes, unanimous | | | |

6:03 PM – Bridging proposal (Marc Holness)

| | | | |
|--|---------------------|-----------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-15 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Marc Holness | Seconded: Peter Jones | |
| Text: Move that the WG accept contribution draft text mh_flood_text_05.pdf. Editors of affected clauses (including clause 6,8,annex F etc) are instructed to review and use the draft contribution in mh_flood_text_05.pdf to update their clauses as appropriate. | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: Motion tabled | | | |

Subsidiary motion to move to table the motion 2002-10-3-15

| | | | |
|--|---------------------|-------------------------|----------------|
| Auxiliary Motion: 2002-10-3-15A | | | |
| Procedural | Mover: Marc Holness | Seconded: Tom Alexander | |
| Text: Move to table the motion 2002-10-3-15. | | | |
| For: 22 | Against: 3 | Abstain: 6 | Result: |
| Result: Passes | | | |

6:46 PM - Straw poll for bridging proposals

- In favor of H, For: 24, Against: 7
- In favor of Q, For: 7, Against: 23
- In favor of P, For: 6, Against: 23

6:50 PM - Subsidiary motion to move to untable the motion 2002-10-3-15

| | | |
|--|---------------------|-------------------------|
| Auxiliary Motion: 2002-10-3-15B | | |
| Procedural | Mover: Marc Holness | Seconded: Tom Alexander |

| | | | |
|--|------------|----------|----------------|
| Text: Move to untable the motion 2002-10-3-15. | | | |
| For: 27 | Against: 2 | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: Passes | | | |

6:52 PM – Discussion is back on motion 2002-10-3-15

| | | | |
|--|---------------------|-----------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-15 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Marc Holness | Secunder: Peter Jones | |
| Text: Move that the WG accept contribution draft text mh_flood_text_05.pdf. Editors of affected clauses (including clause 6,8,annex F etc) are instructed to review and use the draft contribution in mh_flood_text_05.pdf to update their clauses as appropriate. | | | |
| For: 26 | Against: 9 | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: Fails | | | |

6:57 PM – Roll call for the motion 2002-10-3-15 is requested by Necdet Uzun

- Mike T goes thru the roll call

The result for motion 2002-10-3-15 after the roll call is reflected below

| | | | |
|--|---------------------|-----------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-15 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Marc Holness | Secunder: Peter Jones | |
| Text: Move that the WG accept contribution draft text mh_flood_text_05.pdf. Editors of affected clauses (including clause 6,8,annex F etc) are instructed to review and use the draft contribution in mh_flood_text_05.pdf to update their clauses as appropriate. | | | |
| For: 26 | Against: 9 | Abstain: 1 | Result: |
| Result: Fails | | | |

7:06 PM – Further motion madness

| | | | |
|--|------------------|-------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-16 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Jason Fan | Secunder: Jim Kao | |
| Text: Move to create informative Annex J entitled “Topology and protection scenarios”, in D1.1, based on the contents of an_j_top_prot.pdf., with editorial license to incorporate the results of comment resolution against D1.0 at the New Orleans 2002 meeting. | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: passes, by unanimous acclaim | | | |

| | | | |
|-----------------------------|------------------|-------------------|--|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-17 | | | |
| Technical | Mover: Jason Fan | Secunder: Jim Kao | |

| | | | |
|--|----------|----------|----------------|
| Text: Move to adopt changes in clause 10 and clause 11 as delineated in cls10_topology_crg.pdf and cls11_protection_crg.pdf in D1.1, with editorial license to incorporate the results of comment resolution against D1.0 at the New Orleans 2002 meeting. | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: passes, by unanimous acclaim | | | |

7:19 PM – Motion to move to adjourn

| | | | |
|---|-----------------|-----------------------|----------------|
| Motion: 2002-10-3-18 | | | |
| Procedural | Mover: Yong Kim | Second: Mike Takefman | |
| Text: Move to adjourn | | | |
| For: | Against: | Abstain: | Result: |
| Result: passes, by unanimous acclaim | | | |

| | | ORGANIZATION | Motion | 15 of 10/3/2002 | |
|--------------|-------------|------------------------------------|---------------|------------------------|----------------|
| FIRST | LAST | ORGANIZATION | Yes | No | Abstain |
| Sanjay K. | Agrawal | Luminous Networks | | | |
| Saleh | Al-Araji | Scientific Atlanta | | | |
| Thomas | Alexander | PMC-Sierra Inc | 1 | | |
| Khaled | Amer | AmerNet | | 1 | |
| Siamack | Ayandeh | OneX Communications | | | |
| Gunes | Aybay | Riverstone Networks | | | |
| Vinay | Bannai | Luminous Networks | 1 | | |
| Charles | Barry | Luminous Networks | | | |
| Constantinos | Bassias | Lantern Communications | | 1 | |
| Med | Belhadj | Cortina Systems | 1 | | |
| Prasenjit | Biswas | Cortina Systems | 1 | | |
| Tom | Black | Cisco Systems | | | |
| Mark | Bordogna | Agere Systems | | | |
| Richard | Brand | Nortel Networks | | | |
| Rhett | Brikovskis | Lantern Communications | | 1 | |
| Andrew | Brown | Cisco Systems | | | |
| Leon | Bruckman | Corrigent Systems | | | |
| Collier | Buffington | Chip Engines | 1 | | |
| Italo | Busi | Alcatel | | | |
| Allen | Carriker | Cisco Systems | | | |
| Robert | Castellano | C-COR.NET | | | |
| James | Chan | Riverstone Networks | | | |
| Perminder | Chohan | Infineon Technologies | | | |
| Joseph | Cordero | Scientific Atlanta | | | |
| John | Coulter | Lantern Communications | | | |
| William | Dai | Broadcom Corp | | | |
| Fredrik | Davik | Ericsson / University of Oslo | | | 1 |
| Mike | Davis | Cisco Systems | | | |
| Spencer | Dawkins | Fujitsu Network Communications | | | |
| Jeanne | De Jaegher | Alcatel | | | |
| Lewis | Eatherton | Excite @Home | | | |
| Vince | Eberhard | Mindspeed Technologies | | | |
| Hesham | Elbakoury | Nortel Networks | | | |
| Igor | Erceg | Luminous Networks | | | |
| Jim | Ervin | Cisco Systems | | | |
| Joshua | Etkin | Mindspeed Technologies | | | |
| Angela Tozzi | Faber | Telcordia Technologies | | | |
| Jason | Fan | Luminous Networks | 1 | | |
| Amin M. | Farvez | Scientific Atlanta | | | |
| Jingsong | Fu | CIENA Corporation | | | |
| Chris | Garner | Consultant | | | |
| Denton | Gentry | Dominet Systems | | | |
| Anoop | Ghanwani | Lantern Communications | | 1 | |
| Stein | Gjessing | University of Oslo,Dpt Informatics | | | |
| Omer | Goldfisher | Corrigent Systems | | | |
| Martin | Green | Cisco Systems | 1 | | |
| Stephen | Haddock | Extreme Networks | | | |
| Samuel | Hall | Luminous Networks | | | |
| Richard | Harvey | Mindspeed Technologies | | | |

| | | ORGANIZATION | Motion | 15 of 10/3/2002 | |
|--------------|-------------|-------------------------------|---------------|------------------------|----------------|
| FIRST | LAST | ORGANIZATION | Yes | No | Abstain |
| John | Hawkins | Nortel Networks | 1 | | |
| Carl | Hayssen | Nortel Networks | | | |
| Asif | Hazarika | Luminous Networks | 1 | | |
| Albert | Herrera | Lantern Communications | | | |
| Tricia | Hill | Luminous Networks | | | |
| Marc | Holness | Nortel Networks | 1 | | |
| Russ | Homer | Infineon Technologies | 1 | | |
| Bob | Hott | Naval Surface Warfare Center | | | |
| Chang | Huang | Carleton University | | | |
| Wai-Chau | Hui | Nortel Networks | 1 | | |
| Hiwshi | Iwamitsu | Hakuto America | | | |
| David | James | | | 1 | |
| Pankaj | Jha | Cypress Semi | | | |
| Bruce B | Johnson | Excite @Home | | | |
| Peter | Jones | Luminous Networks | 1 | | |
| Fumikazu | Kanehara | NEC Networks | | | |
| Jim | Kao | Cisco Systems | 1 | | |
| Harsh | Kapoor | Appian Communications | | | |
| Vasan | Karighattam | Intel Corporation | | | |
| Yongbum | Kim | Broadcom Corp | 1 | | |
| Paritosh | Kulkarni | Chip Engines | | | |
| Kenneth | Lancaster | | | | |
| Byoung-Joon | Lee | Tropic Networks | | | |
| Chuck | Lee | Appian Communications | | | |
| John | Lemon | Luminous Networks | 1 | | |
| Heng | Liao | PMC-Sierra Inc | | | |
| Jeremy | Lin | Luminous Networks | | | |
| Rodney | Lindemeier | Looking Glass Networks | | | |
| Lai-Chin | Lo | Luminous Networks | 1 | | |
| Robert D. | Love | LAN Connect Consultants | | 1 | |
| James | Markevitch | Cisco Systems | 1 | | |
| Vittorio | Mascolo | Alcatel | | | |
| Derek | Mayweather | Luminous Networks | | | |
| Adisak | Mekkittikul | Lantern Communications | | | |
| Sherri | Menefee | Lantern Communications | | | |
| Dave | Meyer | Mindspeed Technologies | | | |
| Jim | Mollenauer | Technical Strategy Associates | | | |
| David | Moore | Scientific Atlanta | | | |
| Gal | Mor | Corrigent Systems | | | |
| Ashwin R | Moranganti | Appian Communications | | | |
| Ajit | Ninan | Luminous Networks | 1 | | |
| Mannix | O'Connor | Lantern Communications | | | |
| Fredrik | Olsson | Agilent Technologies | | | |
| Robin | Olsson | Vitesse Semiconductors | | | |
| Gary | O'Neal | Iris Broadband, Inc. | | | |
| Fredrik | Orava | Dynarc Inc | | | |
| Joerg | Ottensmeyer | Siemens | | | |
| Glenn | Parsons | Nortel Networks | 1 | | |
| Chip | Paryzek | Scientific Atlanta | | | |

| | | ORGANIZATION | Motion | 15 of 10/3/2002 | |
|--------------|--------------|---------------------------------|---------------|------------------------|----------------|
| FIRST | LAST | ORGANIZATION | Yes | No | Abstain |
| Harry | Peng | Nortel Networks | 1 | | |
| Allan | Pepper | Nortel Networks | | | |
| Stevan | Plote | Looking Glass Networks | | | |
| Tim | Plunkett | NSWC-DD | | | |
| Paul | Quesenberry | Scientific Atlanta | | | |
| Vish | Ramamurti | SBC Communications | | | |
| Lars | Ramfelt | Dynarc Inc | | | |
| Komal | Rathi | Lantern Communications | | 1 | |
| Dan | Romascanu | Avaya Communications | | | |
| Gady | Rosenfeld | Corrigent Systems | | | |
| Luis | Rovira | Scientific Atlanta | | | |
| Nirmal | Saxena | Chip Engines | | | |
| Lauren | Schlicht | Mindspeed Technologies | | | |
| Armin | Schulz | AMCC | | | |
| Jon | Schuringa | IKN- | | 1 | |
| Raj | Sharma | Luminous Networks | | | |
| Jae Cheol | Son | Luminous Networks | | | |
| Donald | Sorenson | Scientific Atlanta | | | |
| Bob | Sultan | DataNet Associates | | | |
| Jun | Takagi | Hakuto America | | | |
| Michael | Takefman | Cisco Systems | 1 | | |
| Frederic | Thepot | Dynarc Inc | | | |
| Ali | Tohidi | Broadcom | | | |
| Gary | Turner | Lucent Technologies | | | |
| Necdet | Uzun | Cisco Systems | 1 | | |
| Harmen R | Van As | Vienna University of Technology | | 1 | |
| Kanaiya | Vasani | Lantern Communications | | | |
| Nader | Vasseghi | Cisco Systems | | | |
| Link | Verstegen | | | | |
| Nader | Vijeh | Lantern Communications | | | |
| Stephan | Vogt | Scientific Atlanta | | | |
| Peter | Wolff | C-COR.NET | | | |
| Steven | Wood | Cisco Systems | 1 | | |
| Donghui | Xie | Cisco Systems | | | |
| Yiming | Yao | Luminous Networks | | | |
| Mete | Yilmaz | Cisco Systems | 1 | | |
| Pinar | Yilmaz | Cisco Systems | 1 | | |
| George | Young | SBC Technology Resources Inc | | | |
| Jin | Yu | Scientific Atlanta | | | |
| David | Zelig | Corrigent Systems | | | |
| Yongdong | Zhao | IDT Inc | | | |
| Igor | Zhovnirovsky | OneX Communications | | | |
| | | | 26 | 9 | 1 |
| | | | Yes % | 74.29% | |
| | | | Voters | 36 | |