IEEE 802.17 (interim) meeting minutes Las Vegas

Sep 23-25,2003

Notes

- The official 802.17 WG website is at http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/17
- All the presentation materials for the meeting are located at the following URL http://www.ieee802.org/17/documents/presentations/sep2003/index.htm
- The format for this plenary was slightly modified from the previous to give more time to the CRG to resolve comments. Please see the agenda for more details.
- Robert's rules apply
- Chicago voting rules
- Some acronyms used
 - o CRG
 - o WG

Meeting minutes 09/23/2003

8:10 AM – Introduction & Welcome (Mike Takefman)

- 74 members
- 2 members lost their voting rights

8:15 AM – Motion 2003-09-23-1, M: Peter Jones, S: John Lemon, approval of agenda, by consent

8:38 AM – P802.17/D2.5 Draft and Ballot Status

- 27 ballots received
- Approvals: 57, Disapprovals: 10, Absentions: 3
- 524 comments, 218 technical non-binding, 90 technical binding
- 16 commenters
- John Lemon wins the cheap wine aware with 167 comments
- Draft is now 744 pages
- Try to get 90% approval before going to SEC for sponser ballot

9:05 AM – Glenn Parsons X.msr report (Glenn Parsons)

- Update on his Switzerland vacation
- 9:12 AM Steering & wrapping interoperability (David James)

9:43 AM – Fairness ad-hoc considerations (traffic management) – David James

10:12 AM – break

The working group reconvened in three tracks to resolve comments.

Meeting minutes 09/24/2003

3:48 PM – WG reconvenes

3:49 PM – Motion 2003-09-24-2, M: Vinay Bannai, S: Peter Jones, approval of agenda, by consent

3:51 PM – Chief Editor's report (Tom Alexander)

- 7 days to created D2.6
- 1 day to clean up, review and assemble D2.6
- Post D2.6 by 10/4
- Recirc ballot period runs from 10/5 thru 10/20
- Post comment database for review by 10/21
- Virtual interim meeting from 10/22 thru 10/23

4:28 PM – Motion 2003-09-24-3, M: Tom Alexander, S: Harry Peng, Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on Clause 0/2/3/4 as ..., approved by consent

4:25 PM – Clause 0 editor's report (David James)

4:28 PM – Motion 2003-09-24-4, M: David James, S: Tom Alexander, Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on Clause 1 as ..., approved by consent

4:31 PM – OAM section editor's report (Glenn Parsons)

4:57 PM – Motion 2003-09-24-5, M: Glenn Parsons, S: David James, Move to authorize the chairman to correspond with the IEEE RAC as per the letter captured in file rac_liaison_v1.pdf, approved by consent

5:28 PM – Motion 2003-09-24-6, M: Glenn Parsons, S: Peter Jones, Move to adopt all resolutions to OAM section, approved by consent

5:32 PM – Bridging editor's report (Bob Castellaneo)

6:03 PM – Motion 2003-09-24-7, M: Robert Castellano, S: Marc Holness, Move to adopt all resolutions to Bridging section, approved by consent

6:05 PM – PHY editor's report (Harry Peng)

6:03 PM – Motion 2003-09-24-8, M: Harry Peng, S: Peter Jones, Move to adopt all resolutions to PHY section, approved by consent

6:16 PM – Fairness Section (Bob Sultan)

6:03 PM – Motion 2003-09-24-9, M: Bob Sultan, S: Necdet Uzun, Move to adopt all resolutions to Fairness section, approved by consent

6:48 PM – Recess for the day

Meeting minutes 09/25/2003

9:15 AM – WG reconvenes

9:17 AM – Topology editor's report (Jason Fan)

9:24 PM – Motion 2003-09-24-10, M: Jason Fan, S: Jim Kao, Move to adopt all resolutions to Toplogy section, approved by consent

9:25 PM – Motion 2003-09-24-11, M: John Lemon, S: Peter Jones, Move to grant OAM editors permission to update MIB and table D.2 ..., approved by consent

9:26 PM – MAC editor's report (John Lemon)

- Comment 91
 - o WG1: Y: 1, N: 5, A:11, rejected
 - o WG2: Y: 9, N: 0; A: 8, accept-modify
- Comment 127
 - o WG1: Y: 2, N: 2, A:13, rejected
 - o WG2: Y: 5, N: 1; A: 10, accept-modify

10:45 PM – Motion 2003-09-24-12, M: John Lemon, S: Steve Wood, Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on the MAC section,, approved by consent

10:47 PM – Bridging editor's report (Bob Castelleno)

11:00 PM – Motion 2003-09-24-13, M: Tom Alexander, S: Peter Jones, Move to authorize the chief editor to create P802.17/D2.6 ..., approved by consent

11:01 PM – Chair remarks

- October interim will be in San Jose (Cisco office) and Ottawa (Cisco office)
- Tele-conference will be available for WG members to dial-in
- No internet access

11:09 PM - recess

11:24 PM – Chair's comments on 802.17b

• Khaled Amer: Start work on 802.17b right away, we are already late

- John Lemon: We can brain storm right now
- Raj Sharma: We need to get new blood
- Peter Jones: Companies might balk at sending the same people for the next standard
- Vinay Bannai: That's companies problem, not IEEE standards
- Peter Jones: May not have time to work on 802.17b if the sponsor ballot comes back with comments

12:00 PM – Call to adjourn

12:01 PM – Motion 2003-09-24-14, M: John Lemon, S: Khaled Amer, Move to adjourn, approved by consent

Date / Ti	me: 8/28/03 9:29 AM	(mm/dd/yy hh:mm AM/PM)	Motion #:	3
Move	d By: Tom Alexander	Seconded By: Ne	cdet Uzun	
Motion:				
Move	to adopt all resolutions to	comments on	Clause 0/2/3/4 as	
	ed by comment resolutio			
	butions as necessary, and	·	<u> </u>	
	olved editorial comments			
		ii aiiy.		
	Type (Technical or Administrative):	Technical	75% needed to pa	ass
Voting:	999 Against: 0 Abstain (or 0	Other type):	100.0% in favor	
For:	999 Against: 0 Abstain (or 0 (Passed or failed): PASSED	Other type):[0]]	100.0% 11 1800	
rtcoun	TAGGED]		
	Subsidiary Motions:]		
	Subsidiary Motions:			

Date / Time:	8/28/03 9:56 AM	(mm/dd/yy hh:mm AM/PM)	Motion #:	4
Moved By:	Glenn Parsons	Seconded By: Leon Br	ruckman	
Motion:				
as resolv	adopt all resolutions to red by comment resolutions as necessary, an ed editorial comments	ution ad-hoc, included to grant editorial	ding requests	for
Ту	pe (Technical or Administrative)	: Technical	75% needed to p	pass
Voting: For: 999 Result (Pa	Against: 0 Abstain (or ssed or failed): PASSED	Other type): 0	100.0% in favor	
Su	bsidiary Motions:			

Date / Time:	8/28/03 9:57 AM	(mm/dd/yy hh:mm AM/PM)	Motion #: 5
Moved By	: Glenn Parsons	Seconded By: Peter J	lones
Motion:			
Move to	grant editorial license	to OAM editors to	update the MIB
	e D.2 to attempt to ma		•
	uses in D2.5.		The state of the s
Ulilei Cla	uscs III DZ.J.		
т.,	no (Toohnical or Administrative)	Toohnical	75% pooded to peec
ıy	pe (Technical or Administrative)	: Technical	75% needed to pass
Voting:			
For: 999	Against: 0 Abstain (or 0	Other type): 0	100.0% in favor
Result (Pa	assed or failed): PASSED]	
	<u></u>	_	
Su	bsidiary Motions:		
		_	
		4	
		J	

Date / Ti	me: 8/28/03 10 By: David James	:02 AM	(mm/dd/yy hh:mm AM/PM) Seconded By: To	om Alexa	Motion #:	6
Motion:						
Move	to adopt all reso	olutions to	comments or	n the I	ntro Sectio	n
(Claus	e 1), as resolve	d by com	ment resolutio	n ad-l	noc, includi	ng
reques	sts for contribut	ions as no	ecessary, and	to gra	ant editorial	
licens	e for all unresol	ved editoi	rial comments	if any	/ .	
				•		
	Type (Technical or Ad	dministrative):	Technical		75% needed to	pass
Voting: For: Result	999 Against: 0 (Passed or failed):	Abstain (or C	Other type): 0	100	0.0% in favor	
	Subsidiary Motions:					

Date / T Move Motion:	ime: 8/28/03 10:22 AM d By: Marc Holness	(mm/dd/yy hh:mm AM/PM) Seconded By: M	Motion #: 7 ike Takefman
Secti reque	to adopt all resolutions ton, as resolved by comments for contributions as reserved edited	ent resolution a necessary, and	ad-hoc, including to grant editorial
	Type (Technical or Administrative): Technical	75% needed to pass
Voting: For:[Resu	999 Against: 0 Abstain (or the first of the	Other type): 0	100.0% in favor
	Subsidiary Motions:		

Date / T Move Motion:	me: 8/28/03 10:47 d By: Bob Sultan		oldd/yy hh:mm AM/PN Seconded By:		Motion #:	8
Section include	to adopt all resolution (Clause 9), as reling requests for corial license for all u	solved by ontributio	comment	: resolu essary,	tion ad-hoo and to grai	•
	Type (Technical or Admir	nistrative):	Technical		<u>75%</u> needed to	pass
Voting: For: Resul		stain (or Othe	er type): 0	100	0.0% in favor	
	Subsidiary Motions:					

Date / Ti	me: 8/28/03 10):55 AM	(mm/dd/yy hh:mm AM/PM)		Motion #:	9
	By: Harry Peng		Seconded By: F	eter Jor	nes	
Motion:						
Move	to adopt all res	olutions to	comments o	n the	PHY Section	า
(Claus	ses 7, B, C), as r	esolved b	v comment re	solut	ion ad-hoc.	
1 '	ing requests fo				·	nt
	ial license for a				·	
Cartor			ca caltorial c	OIIIIII	ciito ii aiiy.	
	Type (Technical or A	dministrative):	Technical		75% needed to	pass
Voting:						
For:	999 Against: 0	Abstain (or C	Other type): 0	10	00.0% in favor	
Result	(Passed or failed):	PASSED]			
			1			
	Subsidiary Motions:					
	-					
	+					
	<u> </u>		J			

Date / Time:	8/28/03 12:03 PM	(mm/dd/yy hh:mm AM/PM)	Motion #: 10
Moved By:	Jason Fan	Seconded By: Jii	n Kao
Motion:			
Move to a	adopt all resolutions	s to comments or	 າ the
	/Protection Section		
		•	sts for contributions
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	•	
	sary, and to grant e	ditorial license ic	ir all utilesolved
editorial	comments if any.		
Тур	pe (Technical or Administrat	ive): Technical	75% needed to pass
Voting:			
For: 999	Against: 0 Abstain	(or Other type): 0	100.0% in favor
Result (Pa	ssed or failed): PASSE		
Sul	bsidiary Motions:		

Date / Time:	0.20.00 2.22	(mm/dd/yy hh:mm AM/PM)	Motion #: 11
•	: John Lemon	Seconded By: Mike "	Woody" Takefman
Motion:			
Move to	adopt all resolutions to	o comments on th	ne MAC Section,
as resolv	red by comment resolu	ıtion ad-hoc, inclı	uding requests for
	tions as necessary, an	•	•
	ed editorial comments	•	
uniesoiv	eu euitoriai comments	ii aiiy.	
Ту	pe (Technical or Administrative):	Technical	75% needed to pass
Voting:			
For: 993	Against: 0 Abstain (or 0	Other type): 0	100.0% in favor
Result (Pa	assed or failed): PASSED		
		_	
Su	bsidiary Motions:		
]	

Date / Tim		(mm/dd/yy hh:mm AM/PM)	Motion #: 12
Motion:	By: John Lemon	Seconded By: David	James
Move to	o replace " " with "-" in	Equation 6.1 (pag	ge 89, line 29).
	Type (Technical or Administrative	e): Technical	75% needed to pass
<u> </u>	999 Against: 0 Abstain (or Passed or failed): PASSED	Other type): 0	100.0% in favor
	Subsidiary Motions:		

Date / Time	e: 8/28/03 2:26 PM	(mm/dd/yy hh:mm AM/PM)	Motion #: 13
Moved B	y: John Lemon	Seconded By: David	James
Motion:			
Move to	replace "Q_TX_PHY" v	vith "Q TX COUN	IT" on Table-Row
	page 172, line 40).		
	(page 112, 1116 16).		
Т	ype (Technical or Administrative)	: Technical	75% needed to pass
Voting:			
	9 Against: 0 Abstain (or 0	Other type): 0	100.0% in favor
Result (P	assed or failed): PASSED		
_		-	
S	ubsidiary Motions:	_	
		4	
		-	
		╛	

Date / Time:	8/28/03 2:27 PM	(mm/dd/yy hh:mm AM/PM)	Motion #:	14
Moved By:	Tom Alexander	Seconded By: John Le	emon	
Motion:				
Move to a	uthorize the Chief Editor	r and the editorial te	am to create	
	2.5 based on P802.17/D2			ł
	se comment resolutions			
	at the August 2003 sess			_
• •	comment period and WG			. 101
a 13-day c				
Тур	pe (Technical or Administrative):	Technical	75% needed to	pass
Voting:				
For: 999	Against: 0 Abstain (or 0	Other type): 0	100.0% in favor	
	ssed or failed): PASSED			
Sul	osidiary Motions:]		

Date / Tin	ne: 8/28/03 2:43 PM	(mm/dd/yy hh:mm AM/PM)	Motion #:	15
Moved By: Bob "Love" Sultan		Seconded By: George Suwala		
Motion:				
Move to	adjourn.			
	Type (Technical or Administrative)	: Procedural	50% needed to	nass
	Type (Teorimout of Authiniotrative)	. Troccata		puoo
Voting:	<u></u>			
<u> </u>		Other type): 0	100.0% in favor	
Result	(Passed or failed): PASSED			
	Subsidiary Motions:	7		
	Oubsidiary Motions.	-		
		†		
		1		