

Project	IEEE 802.20 Working Group on Mobile Broadband Wireless Access < http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/802/20/ >	
Title	IEEE 802.20 letter ballot – Technical issues	
Date Submitted	2006-03-06	
Source(s)	Anna Tee , Changhoi Koo 1301 E Lookout Dr., Richardson, TX 75082	Voice: (972) 761-7437 Fax: (972) 761-7909 Email: {atee,ckoo}@sta.samsung.com
	K. Sivanesan, CH Suh, DS Park Samsung Electronics, Suwon, S-Korea	Email: k.sivanesan@samsung.com
	Jose Puthenkulam, Hassan Yaghoobi	Email : Jose.p.Puthenkulam@intel.com Hassan.Yaghoobi@intel.com
Re:	IEEE 802.20 session #19, March 6-10, 2006	
Abstract	Some technical issues as identified in the IEEE 802.20 letter ballot are included for discussion.	
Purpose	For discussions	
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist the IEEE 802.20 Working Group. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.	
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.20.	
Patent Policy	The contributor is familiar with IEEE patent policy, as outlined in Section 6.3 of the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual < http://standards.ieee.org/guides/opman/sect6.html#6.3 > and in <i>Understanding Patent Issues During IEEE Standards Development</i> < http://standards.ieee.org/board/pat/guide.html >.	

Introduction

The 802.20 working group first letter ballot has been started since Jan 27, 2006. The deadline has been planned for March 8, 2006. This contribution is written to highlight some major issues concerning the current letter ballot. As the process of letter ballot comment resolution is still unclear as of this time, this document would serve as a basis for the working group to consider the identified problems with the current document that is being circulated as a standards draft for the first letter ballot.

Letter Ballot initiation

Initiation of this letter ballot has violated the IEEE 802.20 policies and procedures [1], because the standards draft has not been approved by the working group before submitting for letter ballot circulation.

Non-compliance with the 802.20 Five Criteria [2]

IEEE 802.20 5 Criteria stated that the standard will be in conformance with 802.1D and 802.1F, but there is no data or information on the conformance of this standard draft with the 802 architecture.

Violation of IEEE 802 Policies and Procedures [3]

Multiple sections of the standard draft are duplicates of the 3GPP2 standard: C.S0024-A, thus the IEEE 802 rules have been violated. From IEEE 802 P&P: "If, in the course of standards development, any Working Group utilizes a standard developed or under development by another organization within Project 802, by another IEEE group, or by an external organization, the Working Group shall reference that standard and not duplicate it. If a standard cannot be utilized as is and modifications or extensions to the standard are necessary, the Working Group should: a) Define the requirements for such changes, b) Make these requirements known to the other organization, and c) Solicit that organization for the necessary changes. Only if the required changes cannot be obtained from the other organization, can the Working Group, with the concurrence of the Executive Committee, develop these changes itself. Even in the latter case, the Working Group should seek the concurrence of the other organization by joint meetings, joint voting rights, or other mechanisms on the changes being made."

Examples of duplicated text:

- Section 9.2.2.2.1 Turbo Interleaving
- Section 2.2.5.10.1
- Section 2.2.5.11

References

1. 'IEEE 802.20 policies and procedures, V 1.0' IEEE 802.20-PD-05, Jan 2004.

2. 'Mobile Broadband Wireless Access: Five Criteria (Final)', IEEE 802.20-PD-03, Nov 13, 2002.
3. 'IEEE 802 policies and procedures' March 2005.