IEEE P802.3.1b D1.1 MIB Rev Task Force 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 00 SC 0 P0 L0	# 81	CI 00 SC	C 0	P	0	LO	# 82
Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication		Hajduczenia, M	arek	Cha	rter Comm	unication	
Comment Type ER Comment Status D		Comment Type	ER	Comment Status	s D		
Multiple locations in the draft MIBs There are several locations where incorrect quotation marks are using issues	g, causing compliance		few location start of desc		ere double	quotation mark	ks happens, i.e., "" is
		SuggestedRem	-				
SuggestedRemedy Replace all """ symbols with "" symbol		Replace all	"" with a sin	igle " mark			
Replace all """ symbols with "" symbol Replace all "" symbols with "" symbol Replace all "" symbols with "" symbol		Proposed Resp PROPOSEI		Response Status	5 <b>W</b>		
Proposed Response Response Status W		CI 00 SC	C 0	P	0	LO	# 86
PROPOSED ACCEPT.		Jones, Peter		Cisc	0		
		Comment Type	TR	Comment Status	s D		
C/00 SC 0 P0 L0	# 78	minor chang	ges compari	ing my "compiling" f	files vs Mai	rek's. Diffs atta	ched
Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication		SuggestedRem	edy				
Comment Type ER Comment Status D		Please mak	re the chang	es shown in the mi	b-diffs ren	amed compile	s.txt file
		T lease mak	te the chang			amoa_oompilo	
Multiple locations in the draft MIBs "LAST-UPDATED "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" statement uses i.e., a single "-", whereby "" should be used The same applies to "REVISION "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023"		Proposed Resp PROPOSEI	onse D ACCEPT I	Response Status	5 W		
Multiple locations in the draft MIBs "LAST-UPDATED "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" statement uses i.e., a single "-", whereby "" should be used The same applies to "REVISION "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" This issue was introduced by copying text from pdf / Access directly		Proposed Resp PROPOSEI	onse D ACCEPT I	Response Status	5 W		nPowerDownRequest"
Multiple locations in the draft MIBs "LAST-UPDATED "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" statement uses i.e., a single "-", whereby "" should be used The same applies to "REVISION "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" This issue was introduced by copying text from pdf / Access directly	" statement	Proposed Resp PROPOSEI Apply chang attributes.	onse D ACCEPT I	Response Status IN PRINCIPLE. pXdot3LocPowerCla	5 W		nPowerDownRequest"
Multiple locations in the draft MIBs "LAST-UPDATED "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" statement uses i.e., a single "-", whereby "" should be used The same applies to "REVISION "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" This issue was introduced by copying text from pdf / Access directly SuggestedRemedy Change "-" symbol with "" symbols (make sure the proper symbol is	" statement	Proposed Resp PROPOSEI Apply chang attributes. Replace "ar Replace "'''	onse D ACCEPT ges to "aLldp nd and" with to "'" (doubl	Response Status IN PRINCIPLE. pXdot3LocPowerCla "and" le quotation with a s	s W assExt", "Ile single quote	dpV2Xdot3Ren	
Multiple locations in the draft MIBs "LAST-UPDATED "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" statement uses i.e., a single "-", whereby "" should be used The same applies to "REVISION "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" This issue was introduced by copying text from pdf / Access directly SuggestedRemedy Change "-" symbol with "" symbols (make sure the proper symbol is Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.	" statement	Proposed Resp PROPOSEI Apply chang attributes. Replace "ar Replace "'''' C/ 00 SC	onse D ACCEPT I ges to "aLldp nd and" with	Response Status IN PRINCIPLE. pXdot3LocPowerCla "and" le quotation with a s	assExt", "Ile single quota	dpV2Xdot3Ren	nPowerDownRequest" # <u>87</u>
Multiple locations in the draft MIBs         "LAST-UPDATED "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" statement uses         i.e., a single "-", whereby "" should be used         The same applies to "REVISION "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023"         This issue was introduced by copying text from pdf / Access directly         SuggestedRemedy         Change "-" symbol with "" symbols (make sure the proper symbol is         Proposed Response       Response Status         PROPOSED ACCEPT.         C/ 00       SC 0	" statement being replaced)	Proposed Resp PROPOSEI Apply chang attributes. Replace "ar Replace "'''' C/ 00 SO Jones, Peter	onse D ACCEPT ges to "aLldp nd and" with to "'" (doubl C <b>0</b>	Response Status IN PRINCIPLE. pXdot3LocPowerCla "and" le quotation with a s P( Cisc	s W assExt", "Ile single quota 0	dpV2Xdot3Ren	
Multiple locations in the draft MIBs         "LAST-UPDATED "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" statement uses         i.e., a single "-", whereby "" should be used         The same applies to "REVISION "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023"         This issue was introduced by copying text from pdf / Access directly         SuggestedRemedy         Change "" symbol with "" symbols (make sure the proper symbol is         Proposed Response       Response Status         PROPOSED ACCEPT.         C/ 00       SC 0       P0         Hajduczenia, Marek       Charter Communication	" statement being replaced)	Proposed Resp PROPOSEI Apply chang attributes. Replace "ar Replace "'''' C/ 00 SO Jones, Peter Comment Type	onse D ACCEPT   ges to "aLldp nd and" with to "'" (doubl C 0 TR	Response Status IN PRINCIPLE. pXdot3LocPowerCla "and" le quotation with a s Pi Cisc Comment Status	assExt", "Ild single quota 0 co s D	dpV2Xdot3Ren	
Multiple locations in the draft MIBs         "LAST-UPDATED "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" statement uses         i.e., a single "-", whereby "" should be used         The same applies to "REVISION "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023"         This issue was introduced by copying text from pdf / Access directly         SuggestedRemedy         Change "" symbol with "" symbols (make sure the proper symbol is         Proposed Response       Response Status         PROPOSED ACCEPT.         C/ 00       SC 0         Pajduczenia, Marek       Charter Communication	" statement being replaced)	Proposed Resp PROPOSEI Apply chang attributes. Replace "ar Replace "'''' C/ 00 SO Jones, Peter Comment Type	onse D ACCEPT ges to "aLldp nd and" with to "'" (doubl C 0 TR nilint errors	Response Status IN PRINCIPLE. pXdot3LocPowerCla "and" le quotation with a s Pi Cisc Comment Status on the "clean" MIB	assExt", "Ild single quota 0 co s D	dpV2Xdot3Ren	
Multiple locations in the draft MIBs         "LAST-UPDATED "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" statement uses i.e., a single "-", whereby "" should be used         The same applies to "REVISION "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023"         This issue was introduced by copying text from pdf / Access directly         SuggestedRemedy         Change "-" symbol with "" symbols (make sure the proper symbol is         Proposed Response       Response Status         PROPOSED ACCEPT.         C/ 00       SC 0         Pajduczenia, Marek       Charter Communication         Comment Type       ER         Comment Type       ER         Multiple locations in the draft MIBs         There are several locations where comment markup was transferred,	" statement being replaced) # <u>80</u>	Proposed Resp PROPOSEI Apply chang attributes. Replace "ar Replace "'''' C/ 00 SC Jones, Peter Comment Type We have sr I have not y	onse D ACCEPT ges to "aLldp nd and" with to """ (doubl C 0 TR milint errors of ret resolved i	Response Status IN PRINCIPLE. pXdot3LocPowerCla "and" le quotation with a s Pi Cisc Comment Status on the "clean" MIB	assExt", "Ild single quota 0 co s D	dpV2Xdot3Ren	
Multiple locations in the draft MIBs         "LAST-UPDATED "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" statement uses         i.e., a single "-", whereby "" should be used         The same applies to "REVISION "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023"         This issue was introduced by copying text from pdf / Access directly         SuggestedRemedy         Change "-" symbol with "" symbols (make sure the proper symbol is         Proposed Response       Response Status         PROPOSED ACCEPT.         C/ 00       SC 0         Pajduczenia, Marek       Charter Communication         Comment Type       ER         Comment markup was transferred, markup.	" statement being replaced) # <u>80</u>	Proposed Resp PROPOSEI Apply chang attributes. Replace "ar Replace """ C/ 00 SC Jones, Peter Comment Type We have sp I have not y SuggestedRem	onse D ACCEPT ges to "aLldp nd and" with to "" (doubl C 0 TR nilint errors of ret resolved edy	Response Status IN PRINCIPLE. pXdot3LocPowerCla "and" le quotation with a s <i>P</i> ( Cisc <i>Comment Status</i> on the "clean" MIB these.	s W assExt", "Ile single quota 0 co s D text.	dpV2Xdot3Ren ation mark) <i>L</i> <b>0</b>	# <u>87</u>
Multiple locations in the draft MIBs         "LAST-UPDATED "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" statement uses         i.e., a single "-", whereby "" should be used         The same applies to "REVISION "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023"         This issue was introduced by copying text from pdf / Access directly         SuggestedRemedy         Change "-" symbol with "" symbols (make sure the proper symbol is         Proposed Response       Response Status         PROPOSED ACCEPT.         C/ 00       SC 0         Pajduczenia, Marek       Charter Communication         Comment Type       ER         Multiple locations in the draft MIBs       There are several locations where comment markup was transferred, markup.         SuggestedRemedy       SuggestedRemedy	" statement being replaced) # <u>80</u> using the [MHxxx]	Proposed Resp PROPOSEI Apply chang attributes. Replace "ar Replace """ C/ 00 SC Jones, Peter Comment Type We have sr I have not y SuggestedRem Review the	onse D ACCEPT ges to "aLldp nd and" with to "'" (doubl C 0 TR nilint errors of ret resolved edy warnings or	Response Status IN PRINCIPLE. pXdot3LocPowerCla "and" le quotation with a s <i>P</i> ( Cisc <i>Comment Status</i> on the "clean" MIB these.	assExt", "Ild single quota 0 s D text. changes_c	dpV2Xdot3Ren ation mark) <i>L</i> <b>0</b>	
Multiple locations in the draft MIBs         "LAST-UPDATED "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023" statement uses         i.e., a single "-", whereby "" should be used         The same applies to "REVISION "202307310000Z" – July 31, 2023"         This issue was introduced by copying text from pdf / Access directly         SuggestedRemedy         Change "-" symbol with "" symbols (make sure the proper symbol is         Proposed Response       Response Status         PROPOSED ACCEPT.         C/ 00       SC 0         Pajduczenia, Marek       Charter Communication         Comment Type       ER         Comment Status       D         Multiple locations in the draft MIBs         There are several locations where comment markup was transferred,	" statement being replaced) # <u>80</u> using the [MHxxx]	Proposed Resp PROPOSEI Apply chang attributes. Replace "ar Replace """ Cl 00 SC Jones, Peter Comment Type We have sr I have not y SuggestedRem Review the Proposed Resp	onse D ACCEPT ges to "aLldp nd and" with to "'" (doubl C 0 TR nilint errors et resolved edy warnings or onse	Response Status IN PRINCIPLE. pXdot3LocPowerCla "and" le quotation with a s <i>P</i> ( Cisc <i>Comment Status</i> on the "clean" MIB these.	assExt", "Ild single quota 0 s D text. changes_c	dpV2Xdot3Ren ation mark) <i>L</i> <b>0</b>	# <u>87</u>

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/gener	al required T/technical E/editorial G/general	CI <b>00</b>	Page 1 of 7
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected	RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn	SC O	3/5/2024 1:16:35 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line			

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.1 MIB Rev Task Force 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ <b>00</b>	SC 0	P <b>0</b>	LO	# 79	C/ 1	SC	1.6	P18	L <b>22</b>	# 83
Hajduczen	nia, Marek	Charter Comr	nunication		Hajducze	enia, Mai	rek	Charter Com	nunication	
Comment	Type ER	Comment Status D			Comment	t Type	ER	Comment Status D		
In Figu		e draft MIBs ices in multiple locations, the	re is "–" used in	stead of "-" and causes				tains a very important stateme ement is missing in IEEE Std		module syntax
	iance issues				Suggeste	dRemed	dy			
Suggested					Add a	a new su	lbclause	1.6 as follows		
Global	lly replace "–" wit	th "-" in all MIB files								
•	Response OSED ACCEPT.	Response Status W			All SI and p	MIv2 mo bass auto	omated c	lation Iluded in this standard are SM thecks using tools available at the versions of SMIv2 validatio	the time of publ	
00 /	SC 0	P <b>0</b>	LO	# 88				an/1/smilint), as well as other 3		tools listed at
Jones, Pet	ter	Cisco						up/ops/mib-review-tools. Whe elength-32' configuration optic		tool, 'smilint: level 8'
Comment	Type <b>TR</b>	Comment Status D			Proposed	l Respor	nse	Response Status W		
l have	drafted a proced	np utility to produce a commo dure document that I intend to			•	,		IN PRINCIPLE.		
	0 0	before and after MIB Text			Add a	a new su	bclause	1.6 as follows		
uggested										
Use pr	roposed tools to p	programatically format the MI	B files for cons	stency				lation and formatting luded in this standard are SM		EC 2578) compliant
roposed	Response	Response Status W						hecks using tools available at		
PROP	OSED ACCEPT	IN PRINCIPLE.						ee versions of SMIv2 validatio		tools listed at
See co	omment #83 for t	he new subclause on SMIv2	syntax validatio	n and formatting	https: and 's	://wiki.ie smilint: ł	tf.org/gro	up/ops/mib-review-tools. Whe elength-32' configuration optic a common structure/format for	n using 'smilint' ons were used. T	tool, 'smilint: level 6' 'he 'smidump' utility

standard.

C/ 1 SC 1.6

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.1 MIB Rev Task Force 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 5 SC 5.2 P 25 L 40 $\#$ 89	CI 5 SC 5.3 P28 L14 # 91
Ran, Adee Cisco	Ran, Adee Cisco
Comment Type T Comment Status D	Comment Type E Comment Status D
"Version 1 of the IEEE 802.3 LLDP extension MIB module is deprecated" It is not clear what "Version 1" refers to. The content of this clause does not have a version number.	"may be considered to be sensitive or vulnerable in some network environments" is awkward language.
SuggestedRemedy	Also, "may" has a special meaning in standard language, and is arguably not the right here; anything _may_ be considered vulnerable somewhere. The sentence seems to
Provide a detailed reference to the deprecated content, or clarify in some other way.	suggest that these objects _are_ considered sensitive in some environments.
Proposed Response Response Status W	
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.	Several similar statements appear in multiple places in the document (I counted 10 instances of "may be considered sensitive").
Change "Version 1 of the IEEE 802.3 LLDP extension MIB module is deprecated." to	SuggestedRemedy
"Version 1 of the IEEE 802.3 LLDP extension MIB module is deprecated. LLDP-V2-MIB and LLDP-V2-TC-MIB are used instead."	Change to "are considered sensitive or vulnerable in some network environments".
	Change other instances similarly.
CI 5 SC 5.3 P28 L10 # 90	Proposed Response Response Status W
Ran, Adee Cisco	PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Comment Type E Comment Status D	
"Setting the object, IldpXdot3PortConfigTLVsTxEnable, to incorrect values"	C/ 5 SC 5.4 P40 L26 # 74
The parenthetical commas seem unnecessary.	Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
SuggestedRemedy	Comment Type TR Comment Status D
Change to "Setting the object IldpXdot3PortConfigTLVsTxEnable to incorrect values".	Validation error for entries: 4PdualsigPD, 4PsinglesigPD, 2P - unexpected NUMBER,
Proposed Response Response Status W	expecting LOWERCASE_IDENTIFIER
PROPOSED ACCEPT.	SuggestedRemedy
	Replace globally as follows:
	4PdualsigPD > fourPairDualSigPD
	4PsinglesigPD > fourPairSingleSigPD 2P > twoPair
	2PdualsigPD > twoPairDualSigPD
	For consistency
	singlesigPD > singleSigPD (change in Sig captialization)
	Proposed Response Response Status W

C/ 5 SC 5.4 Page 3 of 7 3/5/2024 1:16:35 PM

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.1 MIB Rev Task Force 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 5 SC 5.4	P 44	L <b>2</b>	# 76	CI 5	SC 5.4	P 56	L14	# 67
Hajduczenia, Marek	Charter Com	nmunication		Hajducze	nia, Marek	Charter Com	nmunication	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status D			Comment	t Type TR	Comment Status D		
use Integer32 instea SuggestedRemedy	ad of INTEGER in SMIv2				of `IldpV2Xdot3F gned32 vs INTE	RemPowerClass' in sequence GER	and object type of	definition do not match:
Change "SYNTAX	INTEGER" to "SYNTAX	nteger32" in		Suggeste	dRemedy			
IldpV2Xdot3LocPov		niegersz m		Chan	ge type in Lldp\	2Xdot3RemPowerEntry defin	ition to INTEGER	R
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE	Response Status W			,	l Response POSED ACCEP	Response Status W		
C/ 5 SC 5.4	P <b>44</b>	L3	# 75	CI 5	SC 5.4	P 56	L15	# 68
lajduczenia, Marek	Charter Com	nmunication		Hajducze	nia, Marek	Charter Corr	nmunication	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status D			Comment	t Type TR	Comment Status D		
	is no longer allowed in SMIv2 in MAX-ACCESS write-only to rea		s in the MIB definition.		of `lldpV2Xdot3F GER vs BITS	RemPowerType' in sequence a	and object type d	efinition do not match:
e.m. onungou inc		au-write.			GER VS DITS			
U		ad-whie.			dRemedy			
SuggestedRemedy Change all instance	es (6 in total) of "MAX-ACCESS		AX-ACCESS read-	Suggeste	dRemedy	/2Xdot3RemPowerEntry defin	ition to BITS	
SuggestedRemedy Change all instance write"	es (6 in total) of "MAX-ACCESS		AX-ACCESS read-	Suggeste Chan	dRemedy	2Xdot3RemPowerEntry defin Response Status W	ition to BITS	
SuggestedRemedy Change all instance write" Proposed Response	es (6 in total) of "MAX-ACCESS Response Status W		AX-ACCESS read-	Suggeste Chan Proposed	dRemedy ge type in Lldp∖	Response Status W	ition to BITS	
SuggestedRemedy Change all instance write"	es (6 in total) of "MAX-ACCESS Response Status W		AX-ACCESS read-	Suggeste Chan Proposed PROF	dRemedy ge type in Lldp\ I Response POSED ACCEP	Response Status W T.		# 74
SuggestedRemedy Change all instance write" Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE	es (6 in total) of "MAX-ACCESS Response Status W		AX-ACCESS read-	Suggeste Chan Proposed PROF	dRemedy ge type in Lldp\ I Response POSED ACCEP SC <b>5.4</b>	Response Status W T. P <b>56</b>	L 20	# 71
SuggestedRemedy Change all instance write" Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE	es (6 in total) of "MAX-ACCESS <i>Response Status</i> <b>W</b> EPT.	write-only" to "M		Suggeste Chan Proposed PROF CI 5 Hajducze	dRemedy ge type in Lldp\ I Response POSED ACCEP SC <b>5.4</b> mia, Marek	Response Status W T. P <b>56</b> Charter Com	L 20	# [71
Change all instance write" Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE	es (6 in total) of "MAX-ACCESS <i>Response Status</i> <b>W</b> EPT. <i>P</i> <b>56</b>	write-only" to "M		Suggeste Chan Proposed PROF C/ 5 Hajducze Comment	dRemedy ge type in Lldp\ I Response POSED ACCEP SC <b>5.4</b> mia, Marek t Type <b>TR</b>	Response Status W T. P <b>56</b> Charter Com Comment Status D	L 20 nmunication	
<ul> <li>buggestedRemedy</li> <li>Change all instance</li> <li>write"</li> <li>proposed Response</li> <li>PROPOSED ACCE</li> <li>F 5 SC 5.4</li> <li>dajduczenia, Marek</li> <li>comment Type TR</li> <li>type of `lldpV2Xdot3</li> </ul>	es (6 in total) of "MAX-ACCESS <i>Response Status</i> <b>W</b> EPT. <i>P</i> 56 Charter Com <i>Comment Status</i> <b>D</b> 3RemPowerPairs' in sequence a	write-only" to "M	# 77	Suggeste Chan Proposed PROF Cl 5 Hajducze Comment IldpV2	dRemedy ge type in Lldp\ <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEP SC <b>5.4</b> mia, Marek t Type <b>TR</b> 2Xdot3RemPSE	Response Status W T. P <b>56</b> Charter Com	L 20 nmunication	
Change all instance write" Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE 5/ 5 SC 5.4 Hajduczenia, Marek Comment Type TR	es (6 in total) of "MAX-ACCESS <i>Response Status</i> <b>W</b> EPT. <i>P</i> 56 Charter Com <i>Comment Status</i> <b>D</b> 3RemPowerPairs' in sequence a	write-only" to "M	# 77	Suggeste Chan Proposed PROF CI 5 Hajducze Comment IldpV2 Suggeste	dRemedy ge type in Lldp\ <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEP SC <b>5.4</b> nia, Marek t <i>Type</i> <b>TR</b> 2Xdot3RemPSE dRemedy	Response Status W T. P56 Charter Com Comment Status D AllocatedPowerValue is repea	L 20 nmunication ated twice in the I	list in lines 20 and 23.
uggestedRemedy Change all instance write" roposed Response PROPOSED ACCE / 5 SC 5.4 lajduczenia, Marek omment Type TR type of `lldpV2Xdot3 Unsigned32 vs BIT3 uggestedRemedy	es (6 in total) of "MAX-ACCESS <i>Response Status</i> <b>W</b> EPT. <i>P</i> 56 Charter Com <i>Comment Status</i> <b>D</b> 3RemPowerPairs' in sequence and	write-only" to "M L 13 amunication and object type de	# 77	Suggeste Chan Proposed PROF Cl 5 Hajducze Comment IldpV2 Suggeste Remo	dRemedy ge type in Lldp\ <i>Response</i> POSED ACCEP SC <b>5.4</b> nia, Marek t <i>Type</i> <b>TR</b> 2Xdot3RemPSE dRemedy	Response Status W T. P56 Charter Com Comment Status D AllocatedPowerValue is repea	L 20 nmunication ated twice in the I	list in lines 20 and 23.
CuggestedRemedy Change all instance write" Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE 5/ 5 SC 5.4 Hajduczenia, Marek Comment Type TR type of `lldpV2Xdot3 Unsigned32 vs BITS SuggestedRemedy	es (6 in total) of "MAX-ACCESS <i>Response Status</i> <b>W</b> EPT. <i>P</i> 56 Charter Com <i>Comment Status</i> <b>D</b> 3RemPowerPairs' in sequence a	write-only" to "M L 13 amunication and object type de	# 77	Suggeste Chan Proposed PROF CI 5 Hajducze Comment IldpV2 Suggeste Remo	dRemedy ge type in Lldp\ Response POSED ACCEP SC 5.4 Inia, Marek t Type TR 2Xdot3RemPSE dRemedy ove the lldpV2Xo	Response Status W T. P56 Charter Com Comment Status D AllocatedPowerValue is repea	L 20 nmunication ated twice in the I	list in lines 20 and 23.
SuggestedRemedy Change all instance write" Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCE Cl 5 SC 5.4 Hajduczenia, Marek Comment Type TR type of `lldpV2Xdot3 Unsigned32 vs BITS SuggestedRemedy	es (6 in total) of "MAX-ACCESS <i>Response Status</i> <b>W</b> EPT. <i>P</i> 56 Charter Com <i>Comment Status</i> <b>D</b> 3RemPowerPairs' in sequence and S pV2Xdot3RemPowerEntry defin <i>Response Status</i> <b>W</b>	write-only" to "M L 13 amunication and object type de	# 77	Suggeste Chan Proposed PROF C/ 5 Hajducze Comment IldpV/2 Suggeste Remo Iooks Proposed	dRemedy ge type in LldpV I Response POSED ACCEP SC 5.4 mia, Marek t Type TR 2Xdot3RemPSE dRemedy ove the lldpV2Xo like a copy pas	Response Status W T. P56 Charter Com Comment Status D AllocatedPowerValue is repeated dot3RemPSEAllocatedPowerValue Response Status W	L 20 nmunication ated twice in the I	list in lines 20 and 23.

CI 5 SC 5.4

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.1 MIB Rev Task Force 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/5 SC 5.4	P 56	L <b>41</b>	# 69	C/ 5	SC 5.4		P <b>75</b>	L12	# 84
Hajduczenia, Marek	Charter Con	nmunication		Hajduczei	nia, Marek		Charter Cor	nmunication	
Comment Type TR	Comment Status D			Comment	Туре Т	R	Comment Status D		
type of `lldpV2Xdot3 match: TruthValue \	3RemPowerDownRequest' in se /s INTEGER	equence and obje	ct type definition do not				vere added to LldpV2Xdot3 up, affecting the complianc		
SuggestedRemedy				Suggestee	dRemedy				
Change type in Lldp	V2Xdot3RemPowerEntry defin	ition to INTEGER		Add th	ne following	objects	s into IldpV2Xdot3LocSys0	Group definition (c	order is not importa
Proposed Response	Response Status W			here)					
PROPOSED ACCE				lldp\//	Vdot2LooD	DBogu	lestedPowerValueA		
				lldpV2	2Xdot3LocP	DRequ	lestedPowerValueB		
C/5 SC 5.4	P 56	L <b>42</b>	# 70	lldpV2	2Xdot3LocP	SEAllo	catedPowerValueA		
Hajduczenia, Marek	Charter Con	nmunication					catedPowerValueB		
Comment Type <b>TR</b>	Comment Status D				2Xdot3LocP 2Xdot3LocP		veringStatus		
	RemPowerDownTime' in sequ	ience and object t	ne definition do not		2Xdot3LocP				
match: TruthValue v				IldpV2	2Xdot3LocP	owerCl	lassExtA		
SuggestedRemedy					2Xdot3LocP				
•••		itian ta lata a 200			2Xdot3LocP				
Change type in Lidp	V2Xdot3RemPowerEntry defin	intion to integer32			2Xdot3LocP 2Xdot3LocP				
Proposed Response	Response Status W				Xdot3LocP				
PROPOSED ACCE	PT.						AvailPower		
							oclassSupport		
							oclassCompleted		
							oclassRequest ownRequest		
					2Xdot3LocP				
				IldpV2	2Xdot3LocN	leasVo	ItageSupport		
				lldpV2	2Xdot3LocN	leasCu	rrentSupport		
							werSupport		
							ergySupport ementSource		
							ItageRequest		
				lldpV2	2Xdot3LocN	leasCu	rrentRequest		
							werRequest		
					2Xdot3LocN 2Xdot3LocN		ergyRequest		
					2Xdot3Lock				
					2Xdot3LocN				
				lldpV2	2Xdot3LocN	leasEn	ergyValid		
							ItageUncertainty		
							rrentUncertainty		
							werUncertainty ergyUncertainty		
							Veasurement		
							leasurement		
				•					

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 5 SC 5.4 Page 5 of 7 3/5/2024 1:16:35 PM

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.1 MIB Rev Task Force 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

IIdpV2Xdot3LocPowe IIdpV2Xdot3LocEnerg				C/ 5	SC	5.4		P <b>75</b>	L <b>52</b>	# 85
IIdpV2Xdot3LocPSEF				Hajducz	enia, Ma	arek		Charter Com	munication	
lldpV2Xdot3LocTxFw lldpV2Xdot3LocTxFw				Commer	nt Type	TR	Comment	Status D		
IIdpV2Xdot3LocRxFw IIdpV2Xdot3LocRxFw IIdpV2Xdot3LocRxFw	,								RemPowerEntry I ce for the MIB mo	out not added to the dule
IIdpV2Xdot3LocPreen IIdpV2Xdot3LocPreen				Suggest	edReme	edy				
IIdpV2Xdot3LocPreen IIdpV2Xdot3LocPreen IIdpV2Xdot3LocAddF	nptActive			Add here		owing obje	cts into IIdpV22	(dot3RemSys)	Group definition (	order is not important
Proposed Response PROPOSED ACCEP	Response Status W						equestedPowe			
	1.						AllocatedPower			
C/ 5 SC 5.4	P <b>75</b>	L <b>34</b>	# 72	Ildp\	/2Xdot3	RemPSEA	AllocatedPower	ValueB		
Hajduczenia, Marek	Charter Comm	nunication					PoweringStatus oweredStatus	i		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status D					RemPowe				
	cedOperationPowerValue' is inc	cluded in Ilde\/2Xd	at21 acSvcGroup				rClassExtA			
but not defined anywh			locoysoloup,	lldp\	/2Xdot3	RemPowe	rClassExtB			
,							rClassExt			
SuggestedRemedy						RemPowe				
Remove from the list	of objects					RemPDLo RemPD4F				
Proposed Response	Response Status W						/laxAvailPower			
PROPOSED ACCEP	'						AutoclassSupp			
	1.						AutoclassComp			
							, AutoclassRequ			
				lldp\	/2Xdot3	RemPowe	rDownReques	t		
							rDownTime			
							VoltageSuppo			
							CurrentSuppor			
							PowerSupport			
							EnergySuppor			
							urementSourc VoltageReque			
							CurrentReque			
							PowerReques			
							EnergyReques			
				lldp\	/2Xdot3	RemMeas	VoltageValid			
							CurrentValid			
							PowerValid			
							EnergyValid			
							VoltageUncert			
							CurrentUncert			
							PowerUncerta EnergyUncerta			
							geMeasureme			
							entMeasureme			
				hap	_/\u010	Conound		n.		
TYPE: TR/technical requi	red ER/editorial required GR/c	eneral required T/	technical E/editorial	G/general				CI 5		Page 6 of 7

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line C/ 5 SC 5.4 Page 6 of 7 3/5/2024 1:16:35 PM

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.1 MIB Rev Task Force 1st Working Group recirculation ballot comments

IldpV2Xdot3RemPowerMeasurement IldpV2Xdot3RemEnergyMeasurement IldpV2Xdot3RemPSEPowerPriceIndex IldpV2Xdot3RemTxFw IldpV2Xdot3RemTxFwEcho IldpV2Xdot3RemRxFw IldpV2Xdot3RemRxFwEcho IldpV2Xdot3RemPreemptSupported IldpV2Xdot3RemPreemptEnabled IldpV2Xdot3RemPreemptActive IldpV2Xdot3RemAreasuremetActive
Proposed Response Response Status

Proposed Response Response Status W PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI 6	SC 6	P <b>77</b>	L <b>7</b>	# 92
Ran, Adee		Cisco		

Comment Type T Comment Status D

Clause 6 relates to OAM as if it is a specific feature of EFM. The text in 6.1 refers to EGM, and 6.2 refers to Clause 57.

Since the previous revision, other flavors of Ethernet that include OAM have been added. In 802.3-2022, OAM is mentioned in clauses 97, 115, and 149. It appears as if these clauses are also relevant here.

If clause 6 is specific to the OAM in clause 57 of 802.3 and not to other usages of this term, then some clarification that other instances are not addressed by this clause is required.

If all flavors of OAM are relevant then the other ones should be listed too.

#### SuggestedRemedy

Per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

No specific changes were proposed.

CI 8	SC 8.5	P1	67	L 38	# 73
Hajduczenia, Marek		Char	ter Comr	nunication	
Commen	t Type T	Comment Status	D		
		tCounter' is not a child no under PethPsePortEntry	de undei	r `pethPsePortE	ntry' - it is listed but no
Suggeste	edRemedy				
depre	ecated;	aintain the element index	es, creat	e a stub definitio	on and mark it as
Proposed	d Response	Response Status	w		
		EPT IN PRINCIPLE.			
	ove it from n	ethPsePortGroup and peth	nPsePort	Entry but do no	t renumber entries in
Rem the li				2	
		P1	77	L7	# 93

Comment Type **T** Comment Status **D** 

"1G-EPON and 10G-EPON (collectively referred to as EPON)"

There is also Nx25G-EPON in Clause 141. If it is relevant, it should be added to the list (and corresponding changes should be made to the clause text). Otherwise, it should be explicitly excluded.

#### SuggestedRemedy

Per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

Since Nx25G-EPON is not referenced, it is not covered. We do not want to list what is NOT included (the list would be very long for each module) and rather just list what is included, as covered by Clause 9.

CI 9 SC 9.1