C/ 00 SC 0 P35 L3 # 128

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

For the following attributes add a 'UNITS "0.1 Watts" clause and remove the "in units of 0.1 W" text from the description.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

C/ 00 SC 0 P47 L23 # 129

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Remove the following text from IldpV2Xdot3LocPowerPairsExt description. For a PSE, this attribute contains the value of the aPSEPowerPairs attribute (see IEEE Std

802.3, 30.9.1.1.4).

See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

SuggestedRemedy

C/ 00 SC 0 P49 L11 # [130

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

For the following attributes change "local PD system" to "local PD" lldpV2Xdot3LocPD4PID, lldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAutoclassSupport, lldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAutoclassCompleted, lldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAutoclassRequest,

IIdp V2X dot 3 Loc Power Down Request,

SuggestedRemedy

See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file

Response Status C

SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P50 L26 # 131

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

For the following attributes add a 'UNITS "Seconds"' clause and change the "number of seconds" to "time in the description.

IldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownTime

SuggestedRemedy

See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change description from:

"This attribute indicates the number of seconds the PD requests to stay powered off. A value of zero indicates an indefinite amount of time."

to:

"This attribute indicates the time the PD requests to stay powered off. A value of zero indicates an indefinite amount of time."

Cl 00 SC 0 P187 L52 # 104

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

fix description and clause 30 reference for pethPsePortMPSAbsentCounter.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change 30.9.1.1.11 to 30.9.1.1.20

Cl 00 SC 0 P188 L16 # 105

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Add misssing class enums (5-8) to pethPsePortPowerClassifications, fix description and clause 30 pointer.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change SYNTAX to:

"INTEGER { class0(1), class1(2), class2(3), class3(4), class4(5), class5(6), class6(7), class7(8), class8(9) }"

Change Description to:

"Classification is a way to tag different terminals on the Power over LAN network according to their power consumption.

Devices such as IP telephones, WLAN access points and others, will be classified according to their power requirements.

The meaning of the classification labels is defined in the IEEE specification.

This variable is valid only while a PD is being powered, that is, while the attribute pethPsePortDetectionStatus is reporting the enumeration deliveringPower."

Change reference from 30.9.1.1.6 to 30.9.1.1.8

CI 00 SC 0 P188 L41 # 108

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Fix descriptions and/or Clause 30 pointers for the following pethPsePortInvalidSignatureCounter

pethPsePortPowerDeniedCounter pethPsePortActualPower

pethPsePortPowerAccuracy pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Make the requested changes and

Add editors note at the beginning of the standard to indicate that the MIB information should be verified against the errata against IEEE Std 802.3-2022 and subsequent approved amendments

Cl 00 SC 0 P189 L16 # 106

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

Add UNITS clause to pethPsePortActualPower, pethPsePortPowerAccuracy and pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy and rewrite description

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P189 L16 # 107

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

Add UNITS clause to pethMainPsePower and pethMainPseConsumptionPower and rewrite description

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

C/ 00 SC 0 P193 L15 # 110 Jones, Peter Cisco Comment Type TR Comment Status A remove obsolete pethPsePortShortCounter from pethPsePortGroup SuggestedRemedy remove obsolete pethPsePortShortCounter from pethPsePortGroup Response Response Status C ACCEPT. C/ 00 SC 0 P193 L 53 # 109 Cisco Jones, Peter Comment Type T Comment Status A Relocate pethPsePortShortCounter back into pethPsePortEntry at it's correct locaiton. SuggestedRemedy See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file Response Response Status C ACCEPT. SC 0 C/ 00 P 285 L2 # 112 Jones. Peter Cisco Comment Type ER Comment Status A Change "LLC (or other MAC user)" or "LLC" to " MAC client" in dot3StatsAlignmentErrors and dot3StatsFCSErrors as well as any other attributes in MIB. SuggestedRemedy See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file Response Response Status C ACCEPT.

C/ 00 SC 0 P 285 L2 # 120 Jones, Peter Cisco Comment Type Comment Status A ER Change "LLC (or other MAC user)" or "LLC" to " MAC client" in dot3StatsAlignmentErrors and dot3StatsFCSErrors SuggestedRemedy See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Resolved with Comment 112 Proposed resolution for comment 112 is "Proposed Accept" CI 00 SC 0 P 287 L65 # 113 Jones. Peter Cisco Comment Type ER Comment Status A Remove " 7.2.4.6" and "dot3StatsSQETestErrors" from dot3StatsSQETestErrors REFERENCE. SuggestedRemedy See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file Response Response Status C ACCEPT. C/ 00 SC 0 P 294 L7 # 114 Jones, Peter Cisco Comment Type TR Comment Status A Change dot3StatsRateControlStatus to "read-write" to match clause 30 SuggestedRemedy See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file Response Response Status C ACCEPT.

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Response Status C

Response

ACCEPT.

C/ 00 SC 0 P 299 L16 # 119 Jones, Peter Cisco Comment Type Comment Status A Ε Delete empty line. SuggestedRemedy See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file Response Response Status C ACCEPT. C/ 00 SC 0 L 48 # 118 P300 Jones, Peter Cisco Comment Type Ε Comment Status A Change "A count of " to "A 64 bit count" for dot3HCInPauseFrames & dot3HCOutPauseFrames SuggestedRemedy See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file Response Response Status C ACCEPT. C/ 00 SC 0 P302 L38 # 122 Jones. Peter Cisco Comment Type E Comment Status A For the following attributes change "A count" or "the count" to "A 64 bit count" or "the 64 bit count". dot3HCStatsAlignmentErrors. dot3HCStatsFCSErrors. dot3HCStatsInternalMacTransmitErrors, dot3HCStatsFrameTooLongs, dot3HCStatsInternalMacReceiveErrors, dot3HCStatsSymbolErrors SuggestedRemedy

C/ 00 SC 0 P305 L 52 Jones, Peter Cisco Comment Type E Comment Status A Delete empty line. SuggestedRemedy See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file Response Response Status C ACCEPT. C/ 00 SC 0 P306 L 55 Cisco Jones, Peter Comment Type E Comment Status A For the following attributes change 000 -> thousand 000 000 -> million dot3HCStatsTransmitLPIMicroseconds, dot3HCStatsTransmitLPITransitions. dot3HCStatsReceiveLPITransitions. SuggestedRemedy See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file Response Response Status C ACCEPT. SC 0 C/ 00 P308 L37

Cl **00** SC **0** P **308** L **37** # 124

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3ExtensionEntry attributes to dot3PauseTable .

Text shown below.

For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.

Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

121

123

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 00 SC 0 P309 L34 # [125

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

dot3ExtensionMacCtrlStatus is incorrectly defined to be read-only. The matching clause 30 object (30.3.8.3.) is read-write.

Deprecate dot3ExtensionMacCtrlStatus and define new dot3ExtensionMacCtrlAdmin object. Make equivalent change in etherExtensionMacCtrlGroup.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P309 L47 # 126

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

"Move common text regarding Discontinuities from Dot3PFCEntry attributes to dot3PFCTable.

Text shown below.

Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime."

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

C/ 1 SC 1.3

P18

L 27

94

Hajduczenia, Marek

Charter Communication

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

per completed MEC, "A Word usage subclause shall appear in Clause 1 of the draft. It shall be either 1.3 after 1.2 Purpose; or, if the draft

does not contain a Purpose subclause, as 1.2 after 1.1 Scope."

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a new subclause 1.3 entitled "Word usage" ahead of the existing subclause 1.3 and renumber all following subclauses.

The content is as follows:

The word shall indicates mandatory requirements strictly to be followed in order to conform to the standard and from which no deviation is permitted (shall equals is required to).1,2 The word should indicates that among several possibilities one is recommended as particularly suitable, without mentioning or excluding others; or that a certain course of action is preferred but not necessarily required (should equals is recommended that). The word may is used to indicate a course of action permissible within the limits of the standard (may equals is permitted to).

The word can is used for statements of possibility and capability, whether material, physical, or causal (can equals is able to).

1The use of the word must is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, must is used only to describe unavoidable situations.

2The use of will is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, will is only used in statements of fact

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.4.2

P43

L **44**

127

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Delete the following text for clarity.

For a PSE, this attribute contains a value derived from the

aPSEPowerPairs attribute (see IEEE Std 802.3, 30.9.1.1.4).

For a PD, the contents of this attribute are undefined.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file

Response Status C

ACCEPT

CI 5 SC 5.4.2 P50 L20 # 97

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type T Comment Status R

I don't know how to interpret the lldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownRequest attribute or the lldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownRequest clause 30 object it points too.

SuggestedRemedy

clarify description or deprecate object.

Response Status C

REJECT.

The commentor fails to provide a specific change to the text.

CI 5 SC 5.4.2 P74 L2 # 98

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type T Comment Status R

I don't know how to interpret the lldpV2Xdot3RemPowerDownRequest attribute or the aLldpXdot3RemPowerDownRequest clause 30 object it points to.

SuggestedRemedy

clarify description or deprecate object.

Response Status C

REJECT.

The commentor fails to provide a specific change to the text.

C/ 8 SC 8 P180 L1 # 133

Jones, Peter Cisco

Ε

Change "Ethernet data terminal equipment (DTE) power via medium dependent interface (MDI)" to "Power over Ethernet" to match 802.3-2022

Comment Status A

SuggestedRemedy

Comment Type

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 8 SC 8.5.2 P43 L35 # 134

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Remove the following text from IldpV2Xdot3LocPowerPairs description.

For a PSE, this attribute contains a value derived from the aPSEPowerPairs attribute (see IEEE Std 802.3, 30.9.1.1.4).

For a PD, the contents of this attribute are undefined.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P185 L31 # 99

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type T Comment Status R

Indexing for pethPsePortEntry is wrong. It should be using InterfaceIndex for PortIndex and entPhysicalIndex for Group Index

SuggestedRemedy

May not be worth adding them to clause 30.

Response Status C

REJECT.

The commentor fails to provide a specific change to the text.

Add:

CI8 SC 8.5.2 P186 L18 # 101 CI 8 SC 8.5.2 P187 L 27 # 103 Jones, Peter Cisco Jones, Peter Cisco Comment Type Comment Status A Comment Status A TR Comment Type The current definition of pethPsePortAdminEnable is wrong. Move "A value of searching(2)- indicates the PSE State diagram is in a state other than The table needs two two states, status(pethPsePortAdminState) and those listed above." so it's in numerical order. control(pethPsePortAdminEnable). pethPsePortAdminEnable is control and should point SuggestedRemedy to acPSEAdminControl not See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file aPSEAdminState. Simplify descriptions. Response Response Status C SuggestedRemedy ACCEPT. See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file CI 8 SC 8.5.2 P187 L 35 # 100 Response Response Status C Jones, Peter Cisco ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Comment Type T Comment Status R Add: PortPowerPriority is not defined in 802.3. There are many other objects like this in the PoE "pethPsePortAdminState OBJECT-TYPE MI, e.g. pethPsePortType, pethMainPseTable SYNTAX TruthValue SuggestedRemedy MAX-ACCESS read-only STATUS current Not sure what to do about this class of objects in the PoE MIB. **DESCRIPTION** Response Response Status C "true (1) PSE functions are enabled. false(2) PSE functions are disabled." REJECT. REFERENCE "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.9.1.1.2" The commentor fails to provide specific changes to the text. ::= { pethPsePortEntry 18 }" CI 9 SC 9.1.1.3 P196 L 55 # 96 after pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy **Charter Communication** Haiduczenia. Marek Add "ethPsePortAdminState | TruthValue" to the end of PethPsePortEntry Comment Type ER Comment Status A Change reference from 30.9.1.1.2 to 30.9.1.2.1 Sensitive language used in the draft: master and slave SuggestedRemedy CI8 SC 8.5.2 P186 L 51 # 102 Insert a note at the end of 9.1.1.3 with the following text Jones. Peter Cisco NOTE—IEEE Std 802.3, Annex K defines optional alternative terminology for "master" and Comment Type TR Comment Status A "slave". Add "both" to pethPsePortPowerPairs. Response Response Status C SuggestedRemedy ACCEPT. See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

" A value of both(3) means that both signal and spare pairs are in use" "

to the end of the description in pethPsePortPowerPairs

C/ 9 SC 9.1.1.3 Page 7 of 9 5/14/2024 8:09:02 AM

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 10 SC 10.4.2 P 284 L 21 # 111 Jones. Peter Cisco

Comment Type Comment Status A TR

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3StatsEntry attributes to dot3StatsTable definition. Text shown below.

For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.

Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C ACCEPT.

SC 10.4.2 C/ 10 P 284 L 21 # 115

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3CollEntry attributes to dot3CollTable definition. Text shown below.

For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.

Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuitvTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C ACCEPT.

C/ 10 SC 10.4.2

ER

P 295

L 55

116

Jones, Peter Comment Type

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3ControlEntry attributes to dot3ControlTable definition. Text shown below.

Cisco

Comment Status A

For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.

Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

C/ 10 SC 10.4.2 P 297 L37 # 117

Jones, Peter

Comment Type Comment Status A

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3PauseEntry attributes to dot3PauseTable definition. Text shown below.

Cisco

For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.

Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuitvTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

C/ 13 SC 13.5.2 P446 L31 # 132 Jones, Peter Cisco Comment Type Comment Status A TR Remove the following deprecated objects from maulfGrpFEC. ifMauFECCorrectedBlocks, ifMauFECUnCorrectableBlocks SuggestedRemedy See attached MAU-MIB.mib file Response Response Status C ACCEPT. C/ 15 SC 15 P189 # 135 Jones, Peter Cisco Comment Type Comment Status A For the following attributes add a 'UNITS "Milliwatts" clause and change the description to add clarity pethPsePortActualPower, pethPsePortPowerAccuracy, pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy SuggestedRemedy Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add "UNITS | "Milliwatts" as indicated in the comment. Change description of pethPsePortActualPower to: ""The power being supplied by the PSE to the PD measured at the MDI."" Change description of pethPsePortPowerAccuracy to: ""The accuracy of the power measurement at MDI."" Change description of pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy to: ""The cumulative energy supplied by the PSE ."" C/ 21 SC 21 P 2 L8 # 95 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication Comment Type ER Comment Status A pre MEC, IETF RFC 2856, IETF RFC 3411 are not cited normatively in text SuggestedRemedy Remove these two entries from Clause 2 Response Response Status C ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ **21** SC **21** Page 9 of 9 5/14/2024 8:09:02 AM