

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 00 SC 0 P35 L3 # 128
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 For the following attributes add a 'UNITS "0.1 Watts"' clause and remove the "in units of 0.1 W" text from the description.
 IldpV2Xdot3LocPDRRequestedPowerValue, IldpV2Xdot3LocPDRRequestedPowerValueA, IldpV2Xdot3LocPDRRequestedPowerValueB, IldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAllocatedPowerValue, IldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAllocatedPowerValueA, IldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAllocatedPowerValueB,
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P47 L23 # 129
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 Remove the following text from IldpV2Xdot3LocPowerPairsExt description.
 For a PSE, this attribute contains the value of the aPSEPowerPairs attribute (see IEEE Std 802.3, 30.9.1.1.4).
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P49 L11 # 130
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 For the following attributes change "local PD system" to "local PD"
 IldpV2Xdot3LocPD4PID, IldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAutoclassSupport, IldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAutoclassCompleted, IldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAutoclassRequest, IldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownRequest,
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P50 L26 # 131
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 For the following attributes add a 'UNITS "Seconds"' clause and change the "number of seconds" to "time in the description."
 IldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownTime
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change description from:
 "This attribute indicates the number of seconds the PD requests to stay powered off. A value of zero indicates an indefinite amount of time."
 to:
 "This attribute indicates the time the PD requests to stay powered off. A value of zero indicates an indefinite amount of time."

CI 00 SC 0 P187 L52 # 104
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 fix description and clause 30 reference for pethPsePortMPSAbsentCounter.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change 30.9.1.1.11 to 30.9.1.1.20

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 00 SC 0 P188 L16 # 105

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Add missing class enums (5-8) to pethPsePortPowerClassifications, fix description and clause 30 pointer.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change SYNTAX to: "INTEGER { class0(1), class1(2), class2(3), class3(4), class4(5), class5(6), class6(7), class7(8), class8(9) }"

Change Description to: "Classification is a way to tag different terminals on the Power over LAN network according to their power consumption.

Devices such as IP telephones, WLAN access points and others, will be classified according to their power requirements.

The meaning of the classification labels is defined in the IEEE specification.

This variable is valid only while a PD is being powered, that is, while the attribute pethPsePortDetectionStatus is reporting the enumeration deliveringPower."

Change reference from 30.9.1.1.6 to 30.9.1.1.8

CI 00 SC 0 P188 L41 # 108

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Fix descriptions and/or Clause 30 pointers for the following pethPsePortInvalidSignatureCounter pethPsePortPowerDeniedCounter pethPsePortActualPower pethPsePortPowerAccuracy pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Make the requested changes and

Add editors note at the beginning of the standard to indicate that the MIB information should be verified against the errata against IEEE Std 802.3-2022 and subsequent approved amendments

CI 00 SC 0 P189 L16 # 106

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

Add UNITS clause to pethPsePortActualPower, pethPsePortPowerAccuracy and pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy and rewrite description

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P189 L16 # 107

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

Add UNITS clause to pethMainPsePower and pethMainPseConsumptionPower and rewrite description

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 00 SC 0 P193 L15 # 110
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 remove obsolete pethPsePortShortCounter from pethPsePortGroup
 SuggestedRemedy
 remove obsolete pethPsePortShortCounter from pethPsePortGroup
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P193 L53 # 109
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type T Comment Status A
 Relocate pethPsePortShortCounter back into pethPsePortEntry at it's correct locaiton.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P285 L2 # 112
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Change "LLC (or other MAC user)" or "LLC" to "MAC client" in dot3StatsAlignmentErrors and dot3StatsFCSErrors as well as any other attributes in MIB.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P285 L2 # 120
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Change "LLC (or other MAC user)" or "LLC" to "MAC client" in dot3StatsAlignmentErrors and dot3StatsFCSErrors
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolved with Comment 112
 Proposed resolution for comment 112 is
 "Proposed Accept"

CI 00 SC 0 P287 L65 # 113
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Remove "7.2.4.6" and "dot3StatsSQETestErrors" from dot3StatsSQETestErrors REFERENCE.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 00 SC 0 P294 L7 # 114
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 Change dot3StatsRateControlStatus to "read-write" to match clause 30
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 00 SC 0 P299 L16 # 119
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 Delete empty line.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P305 L52 # 121
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 Delete empty line.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P300 L48 # 118
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 Change "A count of " to "A 64 bit count" for dot3HCInPauseFrames & dot3HCOutPauseFrames
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P306 L55 # 123
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 For the following attributes change
 000 -> thousand
 000 000 -> million
 dot3HCStatsTransmitLPIMicroseconds, dot3HCStatsTransmitLPITransitions,
 dot3HCStatsReceiveLPITransitions,
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P302 L38 # 122
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 For the following attributes change "A count" or "the count" to "A 64 bit count" or "the 64 bit count".
 dot3HCStatsAlignmentErrors, dot3HCStatsFCSErrors,
 dot3HCStatsInternalMacTransmitErrors, dot3HCStatsFrameTooLongs,
 dot3HCStatsInternalMacReceiveErrors, dot3HCStatsSymbolErrors
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 00 SC 0 P308 L37 # 124
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3ExtensionEntry attributes to dot3PauseTable .
 Text shown below.
 For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.
 Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.
 SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 5 **SC 5.4.2** **P50** **L20** # **97**

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **R**

I don't know how to interpret the IldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownRequest attribute or the IldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownRequest clause 30 object it points too.

SuggestedRemedy
clarify description or deprecate object.

Response **Response Status** **C**

REJECT.

The commentor fails to provide a specific change to the text.

Cl 5 **SC 5.4.2** **P74** **L2** # **98**

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **R**

I don't know how to interpret the IldpV2Xdot3RemPowerDownRequest attribute or the aLldpXdot3RemPowerDownRequest clause 30 object it points to.

SuggestedRemedy
clarify description or deprecate object.

Response **Response Status** **C**

REJECT.

The commentor fails to provide a specific change to the text.

Cl 8 **SC 8** **P180** **L1** # **133**

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **A**

Change "Ethernet data terminal equipment (DTE) power via medium dependent interface (MDI)" to "Power over Ethernet" to match 802.3-2022

SuggestedRemedy
See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response **Response Status** **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl 8 **SC 8.5.2** **P43** **L35** # **134**

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **A**

Remove the following text from IldpV2Xdot3LocPowerPairs description.
For a PSE, this attribute contains a value derived from the aPSEPowerPairs attribute (see IEEE Std 802.3, 30.9.1.1.4).
For a PD, the contents of this attribute are undefined.

SuggestedRemedy
See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response **Response Status** **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl 8 **SC 8.5.2** **P185** **L31** # **99**

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **R**

Indexing for pethPsePortEntry is wrong. It should be using InterfaceIndex for PortIndex and entPhysicalIndex for Group Index

SuggestedRemedy
May not be worth adding them to clause 30.

Response **Response Status** **C**

REJECT.

The commentor fails to provide a specific change to the text.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 8 SC 8.5.2 P186 L18 # 101

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

The current definition of pethPsePortAdminEnable is wrong. The table needs two states, status(pethPsePortAdminState) and control(pethPsePortAdminEnable). pethPsePortAdminEnable is control and should point to acPSEAdminControl not aPSEAdminState. Simplify descriptions.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add:

"pethPsePortAdminState OBJECT-TYPE

SYNTAX TruthValue

MAX-ACCESS read-only

STATUS current

DESCRIPTION

"true (1) PSE functions are enabled.

false(2) PSE functions are disabled."

REFERENCE

"IEEE Std 802.3, 30.9.1.1.2"

::= { pethPsePortEntry 18 }

after pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy

Add "ethPsePortAdminState | TruthValue" to the end of PethPsePortEntry

Change reference from 30.9.1.1.2 to 30.9.1.2.1

CI 8 SC 8.5.2 P186 L51 # 102

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Add "both" to pethPsePortPowerPairs.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add:

" A value of both(3) means that both signal and spare pairs are in use " to the end of the description in pethPsePortPowerPairs

CI 8 SC 8.5.2 P187 L27 # 103

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Move "A value of searching(2)- indicates the PSE State diagram is in a state other than those listed above." so it's in numerical order.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 8 SC 8.5.2 P187 L35 # 100

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type T Comment Status R

PortPowerPriority is not defined in 802.3. There are many other objects like this in the PoE MI, e.g. pethPsePortType, pethMainPseTable

SuggestedRemedy

Not sure what to do about this class of objects in the PoE MIB.

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

The commentor fails to provide specific changes to the text.

CI 9 SC 9.1.1.3 P196 L55 # 96

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

Sensitive language used in the draft: master and slave

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a note at the end of 9.1.1.3 with the following text

NOTE—IEEE Std 802.3, Annex K defines optional alternative terminology for "master" and "slave".

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 10 SC 10.4.2 P284 L21 # 111

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3StatsEntry attributes to dot3StatsTable definition. Text shown below.
 For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.
 Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 10 SC 10.4.2 P284 L21 # 115

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A**

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3CollEntry attributes to dot3CollTable definition. Text shown below.
 For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.
 Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 10 SC 10.4.2 P295 L55 # 116

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A**

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3ControlEntry attributes to dot3ControlTable definition. Text shown below.
 For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.
 Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 10 SC 10.4.2 P297 L37 # 117

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A**

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3PauseEntry attributes to dot3PauseTable definition. Text shown below.
 For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.
 Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 13 SC 13.5.2 P446 L31 # 132

Jones, Peter

Cisco

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**

Remove the following deprecated objects from maulfGrpFEC.
ifMauFECCorrectedBlocks, ifMauFECUnCorrectableBlocks

SuggestedRemedy

See attached MAU-MIB.mib file

Response Response Status **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl 15 SC 15 P189 L # 135

Jones, Peter

Cisco

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A**

For the following attributes add a 'UNITS "Milliwatts"' clause and change the description to add clarity
pethPsePortActualPower, pethPsePortPowerAccuracy, pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy

SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add "UNITS | "Milliwatts" as indicated in the comment.

Change description of pethPsePortActualPower to:
""The power being supplied by the PSE to the PD measured at the MDI.""

Change description of pethPsePortPowerAccuracy to:
""The accuracy of the power measurement at MDI.""

Change description of pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy to:
""The cumulative energy supplied by the PSE .""

Cl 21 SC 21 P2 L8 # 95

Hajduczenia, Marek

Charter Communication

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A**

pre MEC, IETF RFC 2856, IETF RFC 3411 are not cited normatively in text

SuggestedRemedy

Remove these two entries from Clause 2

Response Response Status **C**

ACCEPT.