Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　　*P* **35**　　*L* **3**　　　# 128

Jones, Peter　　　　　　　　　　Cisco

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**D**

For the following attributes add a 'UNITS "0.1 Watts"' clause and remove the "in units of 0.1 W" text from the description.
lldpV2Xdot3LocPDRequestedPowerValue, lldpV2Xdot3LocPDRequestedPowerValueA, lldpV2Xdot3LocPDRequestedPowerValueB, lldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAllocatedPowerValue, lldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAllocatedPowerValueA, lldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAllocatedPowerValueB,

SuggestedRemedy

See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　　*P* **47**　　*L* **23**　　　# 129

Jones, Peter　　　　　　　　　　Cisco

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**D**

Remove the following text from lldpV2Xdot3LocPowerPairsExt description.
For a PSE, this attribute contains the value of the aPSEPowerPairs attribute (see IEEE Std 802.3, 30.9.1.1.4).

SuggestedRemedy

See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　　*P* **49**　　*L* **11**　　　# 130

Jones, Peter　　　　　　　　　　Cisco

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**D**

For the following attributes change "local PD system" to "local PD"
lldpV2Xdot3LocPD4PID, lldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAutoclassSupport, lldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAutoclassCompleted, lldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAutoclassRequest, lldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownRequest,

SuggestedRemedy

See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　　　*P* **50**　　*L* **26**　　　# 131

Jones, Peter　　　　　　　　　　Cisco

Comment Type　**E**　　*Comment Status*　**D**

For the following attributes add a 'UNITS "Seconds"' clause and change the "number of seconds" to "time in the description.
lldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownTime

SuggestedRemedy

See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

Change description from:
"This attribute indicates the number of seconds the PD requests to stay powered off. A value of zero indicates an indefinite amount of time."
to:
"This attribute indicates the time the PD requests to stay powered off. A value of zero indicates an indefinite amount of time."

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **00**
SC **0**

Page 1 of 11
5/4/2024 9:34:51 AM

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **187**   *L* **52**   # 104

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**

   fix description and clause 30 reference for pethPsePortMPSAbsentCounter.

SuggestedRemedy

   See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

   Referenced MIB files are posted at:
   https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

   Change 30.9.1.1.11 to
   30.9.1.1.20

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **188**   *L* **16**   # 105

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**

   Add misssing class enums (5-8) to pethPsePortPowerClassifications, fix description and
   clause 30 pointer.

SuggestedRemedy

   See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

   PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

   Referenced MIB files are posted at:
   https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

   Change SYNTAX to:
   "INTEGER { class0(1), class1(2), class2(3), class3(4), class4(5), class5(6), class6(7),
   class7(8), class8(9) }"

   Change Description to:
   "Classification is a way to tag different terminals on the Power over LAN network according
   to their power consumption.
      Devices such as IP telephones, WLAN access points and others, will be classified
   according to their power requirements.

      The meaning of the classification labels is defined in the IEEE specification.

      This variable is valid only while a PD is being powered, that is, while the attribute
   pethPsePortDetectionStatus is reporting the enumeration deliveringPower."

   Change reference from 30.9.1.1.6 to 30.9.1.1.8

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **00**
SC **0**

Page 2 of 11
5/4/2024 9:34:51 AM

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **188**   *L* **41**   # 108

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

Fix descriptions and/or Clause 30 pointers for the following
pethPsePortInvalidSignatureCounter
pethPsePortPowerDeniedCounter
pethPsePortActualPower
pethPsePortPowerAccuracy
pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **189**   *L* **16**   # 106

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Add UNITS clause to pethPsePortActualPower, pethPsePortPowerAccuracy and
pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy and rewrite description

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **189**   *L* **16**   # 107

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Add UNITS clause to pethMainPsePower and pethMainPseConsumptionPower and
rewrite description

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **193**   *L* **15**   # 110

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **D**

remove obsolete pethPsePortShortCounter from pethPsePortGroup

SuggestedRemedy

remove obsolete pethPsePortShortCounter from pethPsePortGroup

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

TFTD - Can this be removed without causing backwards compatibility issues?

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **193**   *L* **53**   # 109

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **D**

Relocate pethPsePortShortCounter back into pethPsePortEntry at it's correct locaiton.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **285**   *L* **2**   # 112

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **D**

Change "LLC (or other MAC user)" or "LLC" to " MAC client" in dot3StatsAlignmentErrors
and dot3StatsFCSErrors as well as any other attributes in MIB.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **00**   Page 3 of 11
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *SC* **0**   5/4/2024 9:34:51 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **285**   *L* **2**   # 120

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**

Change "LLC (or other MAC user)" or "LLC" to " MAC client" in dot3StatsAlignmentErrors and dot3StatsFCSErrors

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

Resolved with Comment 112
Proposed resolution for comment 112 is
"Proposed Accept"

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **287**   *L* **65**   # 113

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**

Remove " 7.2.4.6" and "dot3StatsSQETestErrors" from dot3StatsSQETestErrors REFERENCE.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **294**   *L* **7**   # 114

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**

Change dot3StatsRateControlStatus to "read-write" to match clause 30

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **299**   *L* **16**   # 119

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Delete empty line.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **300**   *L* **48**   # 118

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Change "A count of " to "A 64 bit count" for dot3HCInPauseFrames & dot3HCOutPauseFrames

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **00**   Page 4 of 11
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *SC* **0**   5/4/2024 9:34:51 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **302**   *L* **38**   # 122

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

For the following attributes change "A count" or "the count" to "A 64 bit count" or "the 64 bit count".

dot3HCStatsAlignmentErrors, dot3HCStatsFCSErrors,
dot3HCStatsInternalMacTransmitErrors, dot3HCStatsFrameTooLongs,
dot3HCStatsInternalMacReceiveErrors, dot3HCStatsSymbolErrors

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **306**   *L* **55**   # 123

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

For the following attributes change
000 -> thousand
000 000 -> million

dot3HCStatsTransmitLPIMicroseconds, dot3HCStatsTransmitLPITransitions,
dot3HCStatsReceiveLPITransitions,

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **305**   *L* **52**   # 121

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Delete empty line.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **308**   *L* **37**   # 124

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3ExtensionEntry attributes to dot3PauseTable .
Text shown below.
For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.
Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **00**
SC **0**

Page 5 of 11
5/4/2024 9:34:51 AM

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **309**   *L* **34**   # 125

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

dot3ExtensionMacCtrlStatus is incorrectly defined to be read-only. The matching clause 30 object (30.3.8.3.) is read-write.
Deprecate dot3ExtensionMacCtrlStatus and define new dot3ExtensionMacCtrlAdmin object.
Make equivalent change in etherExtensionMacCtrlGroup.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P* **309**   *L* **47**   # 126

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

"Move common text regarding Discontinuities from Dot3PFCEntry attributes to dot3PFCTable.
Text shown below.
Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime."

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **1**   *SC* **1.3**   *P* **18**   *L* **27**   # 94

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communication

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status*   **D**

per completed MEC, "A Word usage subclause shall appear in Clause 1 of the draft. It shall be either 1.3 after 1.2 Purpose; or, if the draft
does not contain a Purpose subclause, as 1.2 after 1.1 Scope."

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a new subclause 1.3 entitled "Word usage" ahead of the existing subclause 1.3 and renumber all following subclauses.
The content is as follows:
The word shall indicates mandatory requirements strictly to be followed in order to conform to the standard and from which no deviation is permitted (shall equals is required to).1,2
The word should indicates that among several possibilities one is recommended as particularly suitable, without mentioning or excluding others; or that a certain course of action is preferred but not necessarily required (should equals is recommended that).
The word may is used to indicate a course of action permissible within the limits of the standard (may equals is permitted to).
The word can is used for statements of possibility and capability, whether material, physical, or causal (can equals is able to).
1The use of the word must is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, must is used only to describe unavoidable situations.
2The use of will is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, will is only used in statements of fact

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **5**   *SC* **5.4.2**   *P* **43**   *L* **44**   # 127

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

Delete the following text for clarity.
For a PSE, this attribute contains a value derived from the aPSEPowerPairs attribute (see IEEE Std 802.3, 30.9.1.1.4).
For a PD, the contents of this attribute are undefined.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

TYPE: TR/technical required   ER/editorial required   GR/general required   T/technical   E/editorial   G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched   A/accepted   R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written   C/closed   U/unsatisfied   Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **5**   *SC* **5.4.2**   Page 6 of 11   5/4/2024   9:34:51 AM

Cl **5**   *SC* **5.4.2**   *P* **50**   *L* **20**   # 97

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

I don't know how to interpret the lldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownRequest attribute or the lldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownRequest clause 30 object it points too.

SuggestedRemedy

clarify description or deprecate object.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.

The commentor fails to provide a specific change to the text.

TFTD

Cl **5**   *SC* **5.4.2**   *P* **74**   *L* **2**   # 98

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

I don't know how to interpret the lldpV2Xdot3RemPowerDownRequest attribute or the aLldpXdot3RemPowerDownRequest clause 30 object it points to.

SuggestedRemedy

clarify description or deprecate object.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.

The commentor fails to provide a specific change to the text.

TFTD

Cl **8**   *SC* **8**   *P* **180**   *L* **1**   # 133

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Change "Ethernet data terminal equipment (DTE) power via medium dependent interface (MDI)" to "Power over Ethernet" to match 802.3-2022

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **8**   *SC* **8.5.2**   *P* **43**   *L* **35**   # 134

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Remove the following text from lldpV2Xdot3LocPowerPairs description.
 For a PSE, this attribute contains a value derived from the aPSEPowerPairs attribute (see IEEE Std 802.3, 30.9.1.1.4).
 For a PD, the contents of this attribute are undefined.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **8**   *SC* **8.5.2**   *P* **185**   *L* **31**   # 99

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

Indexing for pethPsePortEntry is wrong. It should be using InterfaceIndex for PortIndex and entPhysicalIndex for Group Index

SuggestedRemedy

May not be worth adding them to clause 30.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.

The commentor fails to provide a specific change to the text.

TFTD

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **8**   Page 7 of 11
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *SC* **8.5.2**   5/4/2024 9:34:51 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **8**   *SC* **8.5.2**   *P* **186**   *L* **18**   # 101

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**

The current definition of pethPsePortAdminEnable is wrong.
The table needs two two states, status(pethPsePortAdminState) and
control(pethPsePortAdminEnable). pethPsePortAdminEnable is control and should point to acPSEAdminControl not
 aPSEAdminState.
Simplify descriptions.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

Add:
"pethPsePortAdminState OBJECT-TYPE
  SYNTAX   TruthValue
  MAX-ACCESS read-only
  STATUS   current
  DESCRIPTION
    "true (1) PSE functions are enabled.
     False(2) PSE functions are disabled."
  REFERENCE
    "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.9.1.1.2"
  ::= { pethPsePortEntry 18 }"
after pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy

Add "ethPsePortAdminState | TruthValue" to the end of PethPsePortEntry

Change reference from 30.9.1.1.2 to 30.9.1.2.1

Cl **8**   *SC* **8.5.2**   *P* **186**   *L* **51**   # 102

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**

Add "both" to pethPsePortPowerPairs.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

Add:
" A value of both(3) means that both signal and spare pairs are in use" "
to the end of the description in pethPsePortPowerPairs

Cl **8**   *SC* **8.5.2**   *P* **187**   *L* **27**   # 103

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Move "A value of searching(2)- indicates the PSE State diagram is in a state other than those listed above." so it's in numerical order.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **8**   Page 8 of 11
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *SC* **8.5.2**   5/4/2024 9:34:51 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **187** *L* **35** # 100

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **D**

PortPowerPriority is not defined in 802.3. There are many other objects like this in the PoE MI, e.g. pethPsePortType, pethMainPseTable

SuggestedRemedy

Not sure what to do about this class of objects in the PoE MIB.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.

The commentor fails to provide specific changes to the text.

TFTD

Cl **9** *SC* **9.1.1.3** *P* **196** *L* **55** # 96

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communication

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

Sensitive language used in the draft: master and slave

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a note at the end of 9.1.1.3 with the following text
NOTE—IEEE Std 802.3, Annex K defines optional alternative terminology for "master" and "slave".

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **10** *SC* **10.4.2** *P* **284** *L* **21** # 111

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3StatsEntry attributes to dot3StatsTable definition. Text shown below.
For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.
Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **10** *SC* **10.4.2** *P* **284** *L* **21** # 115

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3CollEntry attributes to dot3CollTable definition. Text shown below.
For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.
Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general *Cl* **10** Page 9 of 11
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn *SC* **10.4.2** 5/4/2024 9:34:51 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **10**   *SC* **10.4.2**   *P* **295**   *L* **55**   # 116

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3ControlEntry attributes to dot3ControlTable definition. Text shown below.
For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.
Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **10**   *SC* **10.4.2**   *P* **297**   *L* **37**   # 117

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3PauseEntry attributes to dot3PauseTable definition. Text shown below.
For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.
Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

---

Cl **13**   *SC* **13.5.2**   *P* **446**   *L* **31**   # 132

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**

Remove the following deprecated objects from mauIfGrpFEC.
ifMauFECCorrectedBlocks, ifMauFECUnCorrectableBlocks

SuggestedRemedy

See attached MAU-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Referenced MIB files are posted at:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/1/b/comments/D1.2/D1.2.MIB.TREE.zip

TFTD - Is this possible without breaking backwards compatibility?

Cl **15**   *SC* **15**   *P* **189**   *L*   # 135

Jones, Peter   Cisco

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

For the following attributes add a 'UNITS "Milliwatts"' clause and change the description to add clarity
pethPsePortActualPower, pethPsePortPowerAccuracy, pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add "UNITS | "Milliwatts" as indicated in the comment.

Change description of pethPsePortActualPower to:
""The power being supplied by the PSE to the PD measured at the MDI.""

Change description of pethPsePortPowerAccuracy to:
""The accuracy of the power measurement at MDI.""

Change description of pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy to:
""The cumulative energy supplied by the PSE .""

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **15**
SC **15**

Page 10 of 11
5/4/2024 9:34:51 AM

Cl **21**   *SC* **21**   *P* **2**   *L* **8**   # 95

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communication

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**

   pre MEC, IETF RFC 2856, IETF RFC 3411 are not cited normatively in text

SuggestedRemedy

   Remove these two entries from Clause 2

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **21**   Page 11 of 11
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *SC* **21**   5/4/2024 9:34:51 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line