IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

				-				
C/ 00 SC 0	P35	L 3	# 128	C/ 00	SC 0	P 50	L 26	# 131
Jones, Peter	Cisco			Jones, P	eter	Cisco		
comment Type E	Comment Status X			Commen	t Type E	Comment Status X		
0.1 W" text from the IldpV2Xdot3LocPD	ttributes add a 'UNITS "0.1 Watts e description. RequestedPowerValue, lldpV2X RequestedPowerValueB, lldpV2	dot3LocPDRequ	estedPowerValueA,	seco IldpV	nds" to "time in 2Xdot3LocPow	tributes add a 'UNITS "Seconds" n the description. verDownTime	' clause and cha	nge the "number of
	EAllocatedPowerValueA, IldpV2			00	edRemedy			
SuggestedRemedy						P-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file		
See attached LLDF	P-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file			Proposed	d Response	Response Status O		
Proposed Response	Response Status O							
				C/ 00	SC 0	P187	L 52	# 104
C/00 SC 0	P 47	L23	# 129	Jones, P	eter	Cisco		
ones, Peter	Cisco	225	# 125	Commen	t Type TR	Comment Status X		
comment Type E	Comment Status X			fix de	scription and c	clause 30 reference for pethPseF	PortMPSAbsentC	Counter.
For a PSE, this attr 802.3, 30.9.1.1.4). SuggestedRemedy	ing text from IIdpV2Xdot3LocPov ribute contains the value of the a			See	edRemedy attached POW d Response	ER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file Response Status 0		
See attached LLDF	P-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file			01.00			1.10	"
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			C/ 00	SC O	P188	L16	# 105
				Jones, P		Cisco		
C/00 SC 0	P 49	L11	# 130	Commen	51	Comment Status X		. fix description on a
lones, Peter	Cisco				misssing class se 30 pointer.	enums (5-8) to pethPsePortPow	erClassifications	s, fix description and
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Suaaeste	edRemedy			
	tributes change "local PD syster	m" to "local PD"		00		ER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file		
IldpV2Xdot3LocPD	4PID, IldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAutoc EAutoclassCompleted, IldpV2Xd	classSupport,	classRequest,	Proposed	d Response	Response Status O		
SuggestedRemedy								
See attached LLDF	P-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file							
Pronosad Response	Baapanaa Statua							

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 00 SC 0 Page 1 of 8 5/4/2024 9:23:10 AM

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/00 SC 0	P188	L 41	# 108	C/ 00 SC 0	P 193	L15	# 110
lones, Peter	Cisco			Jones, Peter	Cisco		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
	or Clause 30 pointers for the fo	ollowing		remove obsolete pet	hPsePortShortCounter from pe	thPsePortGroup	
pethPsePortInvalidS pethPsePortPowerD				SuggestedRemedy			
, pethPsePortActualPo	ower			remove obsolete pet	hPsePortShortCounter from pe	thPsePortGroup	
pethPsePortPowerA pethPsePortCumulat				Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
SuggestedRemedy							
See attached POWE	R-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file			CI 00 SC 0	P 193	L 53	# 109
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			Jones, Peter	Cisco		
				Comment Type T	Comment Status X		
00 SC 0	P189	L16	# 106	Relocate pethPsePc	rtShortCounter back into pethP	sePortEntry at it	s correct locaiton.
ones, Peter	Cisco			SuggestedRemedy			
Comment Type ER	Comment Status X			See attached POWE	R-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file		
Add UNITS clause to	pethPsePortActualPower, pet iveEnergy and rewrite descript		Accuracy and	Proposed Response	Response Status O		
SuggestedRemedy				C/00 SC 0	P285	L 2	# 112
See attached POWE	R-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file			Jones, Peter	Cisco	L -	# 112
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			Comment Type ER	Comment Status X		
					er MAC user)" or "LLC" to " M	AC client" in dot	3 StatsAlignmentError
X 00 SC 0	P189	L16	# 107		rrors as well as any other attribu		
ones, Peter	Cisco			SuggestedRemedy			
Comment Type ER	Comment Status X			See attached EtherL	ike-MIB.mib file		
	pethMainPsePower and peth	MainPseConsum	nptionPower and	Proposed Response	Response Status O		
SuggestedRemedy							
aggeoteantenneay							
,	R-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file						

C/ 00 SC 0

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 00 SC 0	P 285	L 2	# 120	C/ 00 SC 0	P 299	L16	# 119
Jones, Peter	Cisco			Jones, Peter	Cisco		
Comment Type ER	Comment Status X			Comment Type	E Comment Status X		
Change "LLC (or ot and dot3StatsFCSE	ther MAC user)" or "LLC" to " N	IAC client" in dot	3StatsAlignmentErrors	Delete empty li	ne.		
	EITOIS			SuggestedRemedy			
SuggestedRemedy See attached Ether	d ika MID mih fila			See attached E	therLike-MIB.mib file		
				Proposed Respons	e Response Status O		
Proposed Response	Response Status O						
	Daam	1.05	" [10	C/ 00 SC 0	P 300	L 48	# 118
C/00 SC 0	P 287	L 65	# 113	Jones, Peter	Cisco		
lones, Peter	Cisco			Comment Type	E Comment Status X		
Comment Type ER	Comment Status X				nt of " to "A 64 bit count" for dot3	HCInPauseFrames	&
REFERENCE.	and "dot3StatsSQETestErrors" f	rom dot3StatsSC	2E I esterrors	dot3HCOutPau			
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Suggesteurkennedy See attached Ether	Like-MIB.mib file				therLike-MIB.mib file		
	Like-MIB.mib file Response Status O			See attached E Proposed Respons			
See attached Ether					e Response Status O	L38	# 122
See attached Ether		L7	# [114	Proposed Respons	e Response Status O P 302	L38	# [122
See attached Ether Proposed Response	Response Status O	L7	# [114	Proposed Respons CI 00 SC 0 Jones, Peter	e Response Status 0 P 302 Cisco	L38	# 122
See attached Ether Proposed Response	Response Status 0 P 294	L7	# [114	Proposed Respons Cl 00 SC 0 Jones, Peter Comment Type	e Response Status O P302 Cisco E Comment Status X		
See attached Ether Proposed Response Cl 00 SC 0 Jones, Peter Comment Type TR	Response Status 0 P 294 Cisco			Proposed Respons Cl 00 SC 0 Jones, Peter Comment Type	e Response Status 0 P 302 Cisco		
See attached Ether Proposed Response Cl 00 SC 0 Iones, Peter Comment Type TR Change dot3StatsF	Response Status O P294 Cisco Comment Status X			Proposed Respons Cl 00 SC 0 Jones, Peter Comment Type For the followin count".	e Response Status O P302 Cisco E Comment Status X ag attributes change "A count" or	"the count" to "A 64	
See attached Ether Proposed Response 2/ 00 SC 0 Iones, Peter Comment Type TR Change dot3StatsF	Response Status O P294 Cisco Comment Status X RateControlStatus to "read-write"			Proposed Respons Cl 00 SC 0 Jones, Peter Comment Type For the followin count". dot3HCStatsAl	e Response Status O P302 Cisco E Comment Status X	"the count" to "A 64 Errors,	bit count" or "the 64 b
See attached Ether Proposed Response Cl 00 SC 0 Iones, Peter Comment Type TR Change dot3StatsR SuggestedRemedy See attached Ether	Response Status O P294 Cisco Comment Status X RateControlStatus to "read-write"			Cl 00 SC 0 Jones, Peter Comment Type For the followin count". dot3HCStatsAl dot3HCStatsIn	e Response Status O P302 Cisco E Comment Status X ag attributes change "A count" or ignmentErrors, dot3HCStatsFCS	"the count" to "A 64 Errors, CStatsFrameTooLon	bit count" or "the 64 b
See attached Ether Proposed Response Cl 00 SC 0 Jones, Peter Comment Type TR Change dot3StatsR SuggestedRemedy See attached Ether	Response Status O P294 Cisco Comment Status X RateControlStatus to "read-write"			Cl 00 SC 0 Jones, Peter Comment Type For the followin count". dot3HCStatsAl dot3HCStatsIn	e Response Status O P302 Cisco E Comment Status X ag attributes change "A count" or ignmentErrors, dot3HCStatsFCS ternalMacTransmitErrors, dot3HC ternalMacReceiveErrors, dot3HC	"the count" to "A 64 Errors, CStatsFrameTooLon	bit count" or "the 64 b
See attached Ether Proposed Response Cl 00 SC 0 Jones, Peter Comment Type TR Change dot3StatsF SuggestedRemedy	Response Status O P294 Cisco Comment Status X RateControlStatus to "read-write"			Proposed Respons Cl 00 SC 0 Jones, Peter Comment Type For the followin count". dot3HCStatsAl dot3HCStatsInt dot3HCStatsInt SuggestedRemedy	e Response Status O P302 Cisco E Comment Status X ag attributes change "A count" or ignmentErrors, dot3HCStatsFCS ternalMacTransmitErrors, dot3HC ternalMacReceiveErrors, dot3HC	"the count" to "A 64 Errors, CStatsFrameTooLon	bit count" or "the 64 b

Pa 5/4

C/ **00**

SC 0

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/00 SC 0	P 305	L 52	# 121	C/ 00 SC 0	P 309	L 34	# 125
lones, Peter	Cisco			Jones, Peter	Cisco		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
Delete empty line. SuggestedRemedy See attached EtherLi	ke-MIB.mib file			object (30.3.8.3.) is Deprecate dot3Exte	CtrlStatus is incorrectly defined to read-write. ensionMacCtrlStatus and define ange in etherExtensionMacCtrlC	new dot3Extensio	
Proposed Response	Response Status O			SuggestedRemedy	-		
				See attached Ether	Like-MIB.mib file		
C/00 SC 0	P306	L 55	# 123	Proposed Response	Response Status O		
lones, Peter	Cisco						
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			C/00 SC 0	P 309	L 47	# 126
For the following attril 000 -> thousand	outes change			Jones, Peter	Cisco		
000 -> million				Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
See attached EtherLi Proposed Response	ke-MIB.mib file Response Status O			ifCounterDiscontinu SuggestedRemedy See attached Ether			
C/00 SC 0	P308	L 37	# 124	Proposed Response	Response Status O		
Iones, Peter	Cisco						
Comment Type E	Comment Status X						
attributes to dot3Paus Text shown below. For interfaces operati less than 5 minutes if are advised to use the Discontinuities in the	ing at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit fr f they are incrementing at their e 'HC'/64 bit versions of these of values of counters in this table , and at other times as indicate	rame based cou r maximum rate. counters. e can occur at re	nters can roll over in Management stations -initialization of the				
management system ifCounterDiscontinuity							
ifCounterDiscontinuity							

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI 00 SC 0

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

C/ 1	SC 1.3	P18	L 27	# 94	C/ 5	SC	5.4.2	P 50	L 20	# 97
Hajducze	jduczenia, Marek Charter Communication		Jones, P	eter		Cisco				
Commen	nt Type ER		Commen	t Type	т	Comment Status X				
shall	be either 1.3 afte	A Word usage subclause sha er 1.2 Purpose; or, if the draft rpose subclause, as 1.2 after		se 1 of the draft. It	lldpV	2Xdot3L	_ocPower	erpret the IldpV2Xdot3LocPow DownRequest clause 30 object		st attribute or the
	edRemedy				Suggeste		•			
Inser	-		head of the exist	ing subclause 1.3 and	Proposed			eprecate object. Response Status O		
to the	e standard and fro	es mandatory requirements so om which no deviation is perm	nitted (shall equa	Ils is required to).1,2	CI 5	SC	5.4.2	P 74	L 2	# 98
		ates that among several poss ithout mentioning or excluding			Jones, P	eter		Cisco		
actio	on is preferred but	not necessarily required (sho	uld equals is rec	commended that).	Commen	t Type	т	Comment Status X		
stand	dard (may equals				I don't know how to interpret the IldpV2Xdot3RemPowerDownRequest attribute or the aLldpXdot3RemPowerDownRequest clause 30 object it points to.					
		for statements of possibility a an equals is able to).	nd capability, wh	nether material,	Suggeste	dReme	dv	. ,		
		must is deprecated and canno	ot be used when	stating mandatory	00			eprecate object.		
requi 2The	irements, must is	used only to describe unavoid precated and cannot be used with the second seco	dable situations.		Proposed			Response Status O		
Proposed	d Response	Response Status O			C/ 8	SC	8	P180	L1	# 133
					Jones, P	eter		Cisco		
CI 5	SC 5.4.2	P 43	L 44	# 127	Commen	t Type	Е	Comment Status X		
Jones, P		Cisco			Change "Ethernet data terminal equipment (DTE) power via medium dependent interface (MDI)" to "Power over Ethernet" to match 802.3-2022					
Commen	51	Comment Status X			Suggeste	dReme	, dv			
	te the following te a PSE_this attribute	ext for clarity.	om the		00			R-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file		
aPSI	EPowerPairs attri	bute (see IEEE Std 802.3, 30. s of this attribute are undefine	.9.1.1.4).		Proposed		-	Response Status O		
Suggeste	edRemedy									
00		XT-V2-MIB.mib file								
Dronoco	d Posnonso	Baananaa Statua								

Proposed Response Response Status **O**

CI 8 SC 8

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 8	SC 8.5.2	P 43	L35	# 134	CI 8	SC	8.5.2	P186	L 51	# 102
Jones, Po	eter	Cisco			Jones, P	eter		Cisco		
Comment	t Type E	Comment Status X			Commen	t Type	TR	Comment Status X		
		text from IIdpV2Xdot3LocPow		on.	Add "	both" to	pethPse	PortPowerPairs.		
		ute contains a value derived fr ibute (see IEEE Std 802.3, 30			Suggeste	dRemed	'v			
For a	a PD, the content	ts of this attribute are undefine	.9.1.1.4). d.		00			R-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file		
	dRemedy				Proposed	l Respon	se	Response Status O		
See a	attached POWEF	R-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file						,		
Proposed	l Response	Response Status O			CI 8	SC	8.5.2	P187	L 27	# 103
					Jones, P	eter		Cisco		
C/ 8	SC 8.5.2	P185	L 31	# 99	Commen	t Type	Е	Comment Status X		
Jones, Po	nes, Peter Cisco			Move "A value of searching(2)- indicates the PSE State diagram is in a state other than						
Comment	t Type T	Comment Status X			those	listed al	oove." so	o it's in numerical order.		
		PortEntry is wrong. It should be	using Interface	ndex for PortIndex	SuggestedRemedy See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file					
	entPhysicalIndex	for Group Index					-			
	dRemedy				Proposed	l Respon	se	Response Status 0		
May ı	not be worth add	ing them to clause 30.								
Proposed	l Response	Response Status O			CI 8	SC	8.5.2	P187	L35	# 100
					Jones, P	eter		Cisco		
C/ 8	SC 8.5.2	P186	L18	# 101	Commen	t Type	т	Comment Status X		
Jones, Po	eter	Cisco						ot defined in 802.3. There are r	nany other obje	ects like this in the Pol
Comment	t Type TR	Comment Status X				0.		ype, pethMainPseTable		
The c	current definition	of pethPsePortAdminEnable is	s wrong.		SuggestedRemedy					
		two states, status(pethPsePor			Not s	ure what	to do al	pout this class of objects in the	PoE MIB.	
acPS aPSI	ol(pethPsePortAd EAdminControl r EAdminState. lify descriptions.	dminEnable). pethPsePortAdm not	ninenable is cor	ttrol and should point to	Proposed	l Respon	se	Response Status O		
Suggeste	dRemedy									
See a	attached POWEF	R-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file								
Proposed	l Response	Response Status 0								
		•								

C/ 8 SC 8.5.2

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 9	SC 9.1.1.3	P 196	L55	# 96	C/ 10	SC	10.4.2	P 284	L 21	# 115
Hajducz	enia, Marek	Charter Comm	nunication		Jones, Pe	eter		Cisco		
Commei	nt Type ER	Comment Status X			Comment	Туре	ER	Comment Status X		
Sen	sitive language use	d in the draft: master and slav	ve					arding counter rollover and D		om Dot3CollEntry
Suggest	edRemedy							ble definition. Text shown be at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit fi		nters can roll over in
NOT "slav	E-IEEE Std 802.	of 9.1.1.3 with the following t 3, Annex K defines optional al <i>Response Status</i> O		ology for "master" and	less th are ac Discol manag	nan 5 mi Ivised to ntinuitie: gement	inutes if the use the s in the va	ney are incrementing at their HC'/64 bit versions of these alues of counters in this table and at other times as indicate	maximum rate. counters. can occur at re	Management stations
					Suggestee	dRemed	ly			
C/ 10	SC 10.4.2	P 284	L 21	# 111	See a	ttached	EtherLike	-MIB.mib file		
Jones, F	Peter	Cisco			Proposed	Respon	ise	Response Status O		
Commei	nt Type TR	Comment Status X								
Move common text rea attributes to dot3Stats For interfaces operatin less than 5 minutes if are advised to use the Discontinuities in the v	butes to dot3StatsT interfaces operating than 5 minutes if th advised to use the continuities in the va agement system, a unterDiscontinuityT edRemedy attached EtherLike	egarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3StatsEntry tsTable definition. Text shown below. ing at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in f they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters. values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the the and at other times as indicated by the value of tyTime.				eter <i>Type</i> commo ites to d terfaces han 5 mi dvised to ntinuities gement	ot3Contro operating inutes if the use the s in the va	P 295 Cisco Comment Status X arding counter rollover and D DTable definition. Text showr g at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit fi ney are incrementing at their HC'/64 bit versions of these alues of counters in this table and at other times as indicate ime.	a below. rame based cou maximum rate. counters. can occur at re	nters can roll over in Management stations -initialization of the
					Suggestee		•			
					See a	ttached	EtherLike	e-MIB.mib file		
					Proposed	_		Response Status O		

C/ 10 SC 10.4.2

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

					0	•			
C/ 10	SC 10.4.2	P 297	L 37	# 117	C/ 21	SC 21	P 2	L 8	# 95
Jones, P	eter	Cisco			Hajducze	nia, Marek	Charter Con	nmunication	
Commen	t Type E	Comment Status X			Commen	tType ER	Comment Status X		
		garding counter rollover and D		om Dot3PauseEntry	pre N	IEC, IETF RFC	2856, IETF RFC 3411 are not	t cited normativel	y in text
		eTable definition. Text shown ng at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit f		nters can roll over in	Suggeste	dRemedy			
less t	han 5 minutes if	they are incrementing at their	r maximum rate.		Rem	ove these two er	ntries from Clause 2		
Disco mana	ontinuities in the	HC'/64 bit versions of these values of counters in this table and at other times as indicate /Time.	e can occur at re		Proposed	l Response	Response Status O		
Suggeste	dRemedy								
See a	attached EtherLil	ke-MIB.mib file							
Proposed	l Response	Response Status 0							
C/ 13	SC 13.5.2	P 446	L 31	# 132					
Jones, P	eter	Cisco							
Commen	t Type TR	Comment Status X							
Rem ifMau	ove the following	deprecated objects from mau locks, ifMauFECUnCorrectable	lfGrpFEC. eBlocks						
Suggeste	edRemedy								
See a	attached MAU-M	IB.mib file							
Proposed	l Response	Response Status 0							
C/ 15	SC 15	P189	L	# 135					
Jones, P	eter	Cisco							
Commen	t Type E	Comment Status X							
add o	larity	outes add a 'UNITS "Milliwatts' wer, pethPsePortPowerAccura							
Suggeste	edRemedy								
	-								

Proposed Response Response Status **0**

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 21 SC 21