

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 48
Ganga, Ilango Intel

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

The references to 802.3 document is based on IEEE Std 802.3-2008. Should the document be aligned to the revised references as per the 802.3REV project that is already in sponsor ballot.

For example, see the following reference in 13.5 ifMauFECmode object, REFERENCE "IEEE Std 802.3. 30.5.1.1.14 aFECMode." However this reference has been changed to 30.5.1.1.16 in 802.3 Revision.

SuggestedRemedy

Align this document references to 802.3REV project that is already in sponsor ballot.

Response Response Status U

ACCEPT.
See details in response to comment # 23.

CI 00 SC 0 P L # 23
Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status A

Since the revision of 802.3.1 is to include changes due to the various amendments to 802.3, the references from 802.3.1 to 802.3 should align with the clause numbers in the revision of 802.3.
Consequently, references that do not align with 802.3 Revision D3.0 are proposed to be changed.

SuggestedRemedy

- Page 71, line 35, "30.3.61.14" should be "30.3.6.1.14"
- Page 71, line 53, "30.3.61.14" should be "30.3.6.1.14"
- Page 176, line 39, "30.5.1.1.12" should be "30.5.1.1.14"
- Page 176, line 41, "30.5.1.1.13" should be "30.5.1.1.15"
- Page 176, line 44, "30.5.1.1.14" should be "30.5.1.1.16"
- Page 176, line 46, "30.5.1.1.15" should be "30.5.1.1.17"
- Page 176, line 48, "30.5.1.1.16" should be "30.5.1.1.18"
- Page 197, line 12, "30.5.1.1.12" should be "30.5.1.1.14"
- Page 197, line 50, "30.5.1.1.13" should be "30.5.1.1.15"
- Page 198, line 38, "30.5.1.1.14" should be "30.5.1.1.16"
- Page 198, line 61, "30.5.1.1.15" should be "30.5.1.1.17"
- Page 199, line 18, "30.5.1.1.16" should be "30.5.1.1.18"
- Page 252, lines 38 and 55 "22.7a" should be "22.7"
- Page 252, lines 39 and 56 "35.4a" should be "35.4"
- Page 252, lines 39 and 56 "46.4a" should be "46.4"
- Page 253, lines 11 and 30 "22.7a" should be "22.7"
- Page 253, lines 11 and 30 "35.4a" should be "35.4"
- Page 253, lines 11 and 30 "46.4a" should be "46.4"
- Page 265, line 43, "45.2.3.20" should be "45.2.3.27"
- Page 265, line 48, "45.2.3.21" should be "45.2.3.28"
- Page 281, line 49, "45.2.3.18.3" should be "45.2.3.26.3"
- Page 286, line 38, "45.2.3.17.1" should be "45.2.3.25.1"
- Page 286, line 65, "45.2.3.17.2" should be "45.2.3.25.2"
- Page 289, line 62, "45.2.3.21" should be "45.2.3.29"
- Page 290, line 22, "45.2.3.22" should be "45.2.3.30"
- Page 290, line 47, "45.2.3.23" should be "45.2.3.31"
- Page 291, line 9, "45.2.3.25" should be "45.2.3.33"
- Page 291, line 35, "45.2.3.26" should be "45.2.3.34"
- Page 291, line 61, "45.2.3.27" should be "45.2.3.35"
- Page 292, line 21, "45.2.3.28" should be "45.2.3.36"
- Page 292, line 45, "45.2.3.24" should be "45.2.3.32"
- Page 295, line 63, "45.2.1.11.4" should be "45.2.1.14.4"
- Page 295, line 63, "45.2.1.11.7" should be "45.2.1.14.7"
- Page 297, line 50, "45.2.1.36" should be "45.2.1.23"
- Page 298, line 14, "45.2.1.36" should be "45.2.1.23"
- Page 300, line 25, "45.2.1.4.1" should be "45.2.1.4.7"
- Page 300, line 25, "45.2.1.4.2" should be "45.2.1.4.8"
- Page 300, line 25, "45.2.1.12.2" should be "45.2.1.15.2"

Page 300, line 26, "45.2.1.12.3" should be "45.2.1.15.3"
 Page 301, line 47, "45.2.1.12.4" should be "45.2.1.15.4"
 Page 302, line 49, "45.2.1.38" should be "45.2.1.41"
 Page 302, line 50, "45.2.1.39" should be "45.2.1.42"
 Page 302, line 50, "45.2.1.54" should be "45.2.1.57"
 Page 303, line 17, "45.2.1.11.4" should be "45.2.1.14.4"
 Page 303, line 17, "45.2.1.11.7" should be "45.2.1.14.7"
 Page 303, line 17, "45.2.1.12.4" should be "45.2.1.15.4"
 Page 303, line 63, "45.2.1.16" should be "45.2.1.19"
 Page 304, line 21, "45.2.1.17" should be "45.2.1.20"
 Page 304, line 39, "45.2.1.18" should be "45.2.1.21"
 Page 304, line 62, "45.2.1.19" should be "45.2.1.22"
 Page 305, line 22, "45.2.1.21" should be "45.2.1.29"
 Page 308, line 26, "45.2.1.42" should be "45.2.1.45"
 Page 309, line 23, "45.2.1.43" should be "45.2.1.46"
 Page 309, line 56, "45.2.1.43" should be "45.2.1.46"
 Page 310, line 12, "45.2.1.43" should be "45.2.1.46"
 Page 310, line 42, "45.2.1.43" should be "45.2.1.46"
 Page 321, line 65, "45.2.1.22" should be "45.2.1.25"
 Page 322, line 25, "45.2.1.23" should be "45.2.1.26"
 Page 369, line 34, "30.5.1.1.12" should be "30.5.1.1.14"
 Page 369, line 55, "30.5.1.1.13" should be "30.5.1.1.15"
 Page 370, lines 16 and 18, see separate comment
 Page 370, line 19, "30.5.1.1.14" should be "30.5.1.1.16"
 Page 370, line 41, "45.2.7.5" should be "45.2.8.5"
 Page 370, line 41, "45.2.1.86" should be "45.2.1.91"
 Page 370, line 42, "30.5.1.1.15" should be "30.5.1.1.17"
 Page 371, line 2, "45.2.7.6" should be "45.2.8.6"
 Page 371, line 3, "45.2.1.87" should be "45.2.1.92"
 Page 371, line 4, "30.5.1.1.16" should be "30.5.1.1.18"
 Page 371, line 19, "45.2.1.63" should be "45.2.1.65"
 Page 371, line 20, "30.5.1.1.17" should be "30.5.1.1.19"
 Page 371, line 34, "45.2.1.64" should be "45.2.1.66"
 Page 371, line 35, "30.5.1.1.18" should be "30.5.1.1.20"
 Page 371, line 50, "45.2.1.65" should be "45.2.1.67"
 Page 371, line 51, "30.5.1.1.19" should be "30.5.1.1.21"
 Page 371, line 65, "45.2.1.66" should be "45.2.1.68"
 Page 372, line 1, "30.5.1.1.20" should be "30.5.1.1.22"
 Page 372, line 12, "30.5.1.1.21" should be "30.5.1.1.23"
 Page 372, line 23, "45.2.1.76a.2" should be "45.2.1.78.2"
 Page 372, line 35, "45.2.1.76a.2" should be "45.2.1.78.1"
 Page 372, line 64, "30.5.1.1.XX" should be "30.5.1.1.11"
 Page 373, line 19, "30.5.1.1.XX" should be "30.5.1.1.12"
 Page 431, line 23, "30.5.1.1.11" should be "30.5.1.1.13"
 Page 431, line 38, "30.5.1.1.17" should be "30.5.1.1.19"
 Page 431, line 52, "30.5.1.1.18" should be "30.5.1.1.20"
 Page 432, line 3, "30.5.1.1.19" should be "30.5.1.1.21"
 Page 432, line 17, "30.5.1.1.20" should be "30.5.1.1.22"
 Page 432, line 32, "30.5.1.1.12" should be "30.5.1.1.14"
 Page 432, line 46, "30.5.1.1.13" should be "30.5.1.1.15"

Page 432, line 61, "30.5.1.1.14" should be "30.5.1.1.16"
 Page 433, line 13, "30.5.1.1.15" should be "30.5.1.1.17"
 Page 433, line 27, "30.5.1.1.16" should be "30.5.1.1.18"
 Page 448, line 28, "30.8.1.1.2" should be "30.9.1.1.2"
 Page 448, line 44, "30.8.1.1.3" should be "30.9.1.1.3"
 Page 448, line 59, "30.8.1.1.4" should be "30.9.1.1.4"
 Page 449, line 10, "30.8.1.1.11" should be "30.9.1.1.5"
 Page 449, line 38, "30.8.1.1.5" should be "30.9.1.1.7"

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Keep the cross references as text for now. Update to live cross references once 802.3-2012 has completed sponsor ballot.

Cl 00 SC 0 P64 L28 # 20
 Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Page 64 line 28 says "(reflected in the aOAMLocalFlagsField of 30.3.6.1.10)", but 30.3.6.1.10 is in IEEE Std 802.3 so the reference should be prefaced by this. Same issue on page 64, line 40 for 30.3.6.1.11 and for other references on subsequent pages.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "(reflected in the aOAMLocalFlagsField of IEEE Std 802.3 30.3.6.1.10)"

Make equivalent change on:

Page 64, line 40 for 30.3.6.1.11

Page 65, line 21 for 30.3.6.1.12

Page 69, line 32 for 30.3.6.1.7

Page 175, line 1 for 30.3.5

Page 176, line 1 for 30.3.7

Page 176, line 34 for 30.5.1

Page 305, line 41 for 45.2.6.12

Page 305, line 59 for 61.3.3.3 and Figure 61-19

Page 306, line 2 for 45.2.6.11

Page 370, line 4 for 65.2 and Clause 74

Page 371, line 19 for 45.2.1.63 (another comment corrects reference)

Page 371, line 34 for 45.2.1.64 (another comment corrects reference)

Page 371, line 50 for 45.2.1.65 (another comment corrects reference)

Page 371, line 65 for 45.2.1.66 (another comment corrects reference)

Page 372, line 58 (802.3 missing)

Page 400, line 9 for 30.3.1.1.31

Page 400, line 54 for 30.3.1.1.33

Page 401, line 3 for 30.3.1.1.34

Page 401, line 63 for 30.3.1.2.4

Page 403, line 42 for 30.3.2.1.2

Page 403, line 57 for 30.3.2.1.3

Page 404, line 22 for 30.3.2.1.5

Page 404, line 56 for 30.3.2.1.7

Page 408, line 49 for 30.3.5.1.1

Page 408, line 63 for 30.3.5.1.2

From Page 409, line 13 to Page 414 line 6 there are 23 instances of 'See "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" in' that should be followed by "IEEE Std 802.3"

Page 429, line 18 for 30.5.1.1.2

Page 429, line 49 for 30.5.1.1.4

Page 430, line 13 for 30.5.1.1.6

From Page 431, line 37 to Page 433 line 28 there are 9 instances of 'See "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" in' that should be followed by "IEEE Std 802.3"

From Page 440, line 18 to Page 474 line 18 there are 124 instances of 'See "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" in' that should be followed by "IEEE Std 802.3"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 02 SC 2 P21 L20 # 1
 Barrass, Hugh Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Nelacketworks

SuggestedRemedy

Networks

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 02 SC 2 P22 L36 # 2
 Barrass, Hugh Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Very high speed should be hyphenated, also fix capitals & add abbreviation

SuggestedRemedy

ITU-T Recommendation G.993.1, 2004—Very-high-speed Digital Subscriber Line (VDSL) transceivers.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

ITU-T Recommendation G.993.1, 2004—Very high speed digital subscriber line transceivers.

Cl 05 SC 5.4 P52 L24 # 22
 Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status A

This says "This object maps to the variable LocRxSystemValueEcho ...", but that is the same as for lldpV2Xdot3LocRxTwSysEcho earlier. Shouldn't this one be RemRxSystemValueEcho rather than LocRxSystemValueEcho?

SuggestedRemedy

Change LocRxSystemValueEcho to RemRxSystemValueEcho

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 07 **SC 7.3** **P102** **L 50** # **19**

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **A**

REFERENCE "IEEE 802.3 Mgt, 30.4.2.1.2, aGroupPortCapacity." should say "IEEE Std 802.3," rather than "IEEE 802.3 Mgt,"

SuggestedRemedy
Change "IEEE 802.3 Mgt," to "IEEE Std 802.3,"

Response **Response Status** **C**

ACCEPT.

CI 07 **SC 7.3** **P110** **L 61** # **24**

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **A**

This says "... less than or equal to maxFrameSize (See IEEE Std 802.3 4.4.2.1).", but 4.4.2.1 does not exist and 4.4.2 does not contain a maxFrameSize.
Same issue on page 111 lines 23 and 48

SuggestedRemedy
Correct this reference here and on page 111 lines 23 and 48.
Should this point to 4.4.2 as this contains maxBasicFrameSize and maxEnvelopeFrameSize or is there a better reference?

Response **Response Status** **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change:
less than or
equal to maxFrameSize (See IEEE Std 802.3 4.4.2.1).

To:
less than or
equal to maxFrameSizeLimit (See IEEE Std 802.3 4.2.7.1).

CI 08 **SC 8.5** **P148** **L 19** # **25**

Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **A**

This says "... greater than tlim max (see IEEE Std 802.3 Table 33-5).", but Table 33-5 doesn't have anything to do with times.

SuggestedRemedy
Correct the reference. Should this be Table 33-11?

Response **Response Status** **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change reference to Table 33-11.

CI 09 **SC 9.6** **P181** **L 1** # **31**

Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **A**

Object aMPCPAdminState (30.3.5.1.2) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3MpcpOperStatus in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy
Change "IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 64." to "IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 64 and Clause 77."

Response **Response Status** **C**

ACCEPT.

CI 09 **SC 9.6** **P181** **L 53** # **32**

Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **A**

Object aMPCPMode (30.3.5.1.3) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3MpcpMode in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy
Change "IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 64." to "IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 64 and Clause 77."

Response **Response Status** **C**

ACCEPT.

CI 09 **SC 9.6** **P182** **L 25** # **33**

Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type **T** **Comment Status** **A**

Object aMPCPLinkID (30.3.5.1.4) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3MpcpLinkID in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy
Change "as specified in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.2.2" to "as specified in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.2.2 or 76.2.6.1.3.2, as appropriate"

Response **Response Status** **C**

ACCEPT.

CI 09 SC 9.6 P191 L21 # 34
Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status A

Object aOMPemulationType (30.3.7.1.2) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationType in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "see IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1" to "see IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1 or 76.2, as appropriate"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 09 SC 9.6 P192 L33 # 35
Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status A

Object aSLDErrors (30.3.7.1.3) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationSLDErrors in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1" to "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 09 SC 9.6 P192 L52 # 36
Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status A

Object aCRC8Errors (30.3.7.1.4) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationCRC8Errors in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1" to "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate".
Change "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3" to "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate".

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 09 SC 9.6 P193 L33 # 37
Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status A

Object aGoodLLID (30.3.7.1.5) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationGoodLLID in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1" to "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate".
Change "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3" to "as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate".

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 09 SC 9.6 P193 L54 # 38
Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status A

Object aONUPONcastLLID (30.3.7.1.6) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationOnuPonCastLLID in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "A count of frames received that contain a valid SLD field, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1, pass the CRC-8 check, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3, and meet the rules of acceptance for an ONU defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.2." to "A count of frames received that: 1) contain a valid SLD field in an ONU, 2) meet the rules for frame acceptance, and 3) pass the CRC-8 check. The SLD is defined in 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate. The rules for LLID acceptance are defined in 65.1.3.3.2 or 76.2.6.1.3.2, as appropriate. The CRC-8 check is defined in 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 09 SC 9.6 P193 L9 # 40
Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status A

Object aBadLLID (30.3.7.1.8) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationBadLLID in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "A count of frames received that contain a valid SLD field, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1, and pass the CRC-8 check, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3, but are discarded due to the LLID check as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.2." to read "A count of frames received that contain a valid SLD field in an OLT, and pass the CRC-8 check, but are discarded due to the LLID check. The SLD is defined in 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate. The CRC-8 check is defined in 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate. The LLID check is defined in 65.1.3.3.2 or 76.2.6.1.3.2, as appropriate."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 09 SC 9.6 P194 L13 # 39
Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status A

Object aOLTPONcastLLID (30.3.7.1.7) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3OmpEmulationOltPonCastLLID in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "A count of frames received that contain a valid SLD field, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1, pass the CRC-8 check, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3, and meet the rules of acceptance for an OLT defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.2." to read "A count of frames received that contain a valid SLD field, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate, pass the CRC-8 check, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate. and meet the rules of acceptance for an OLT defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.2 or 76.2.6.1.3.2, as appropriate."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 09 SC 9.6 P198 L48 # 41
Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status A

Object aFECCorrectedBlocks (30.5.1.1.15) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3EponFecCorrectedBlocks in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "For 1000BASE-PX, 10GBASE-R, 10GBASE-PR or 10/1GBASE-PRX PHYs, it is a count of corrected FEC blocks" to read "For 10PASS-TS, 2BASE-TL, and 1000BASE-PX PHYs, it is a count of corrected FEC blocks"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "For 10PASS-TS, 2BASE-TL, and 1000BASE-PX PHYs, it is a count of corrected FEC blocks" to read: "For 1000BASE-PX, 10GBASE-PR or 10/1GBASE-PRX PHYs, it is a count of corrected FEC blocks"

CI 09 SC 9.6 P199 L6 # 42
Hajduczenia, Marek ZTE Corporation

Comment Type T Comment Status A

Object aFECUncorrectableBlocks (30.5.1.1.16) was modified by 802.3av, but changes in the text are not reflected in dot3EponFecUncorrectableBlocks in 802.3.1a

SuggestedRemedy

Change "For 1000BASE-PX, 10GBASE-R, 10GBASE-PR or 10/1GBASE-PRX PHYs, it is a count of corrected FEC blocks" to read "For 10PASS-TS, 2BASE-TL, and 1000BASE-PX PHYs, it is a count of corrected FEC blocks"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change: "For 10PASS-TS, 2BASE-TL, and 1000BASE-PX PHYs, it is a count of uncorrectable FEC blocks" to read: "For 1000BASE-PX, 10GBASE-PR or 10/1GBASE-PRX PHYs, it is a count of uncorrectable FEC blocks"

Cl 11 SC 11.5 P292 L12 # 26
Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status A

In the efmCuPAFInLostEnds OBJECT-TYPE the description says:
"If a Clause 45 MDIO Interface to the PCS is present, then this object maps to the 10P/2B PAF lost start of fragment register." but this should be the "PAF lost ends of fragments register"

SuggestedRemedy

Change:
"then this object maps to the 10P/2B PAF lost start of fragment register." to:
"then this object maps to the 10P/2B PAF lost ends of fragments register."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 11 SC 11.5 P297 L19 # 15
Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status A

This reference is ""IEEE Std 802.3, 61.2.2.8.4, 45.2.6.6-45.2.6.8"
However, in section 14.2 of the IEEE Standards Style Manual (2009) it says that for ranges:
"Dashes should never be used because they can be misconstrued for subtraction signs"

SuggestedRemedy

Change:
"45.2.6.6-45.2.6.8" to:
"45.2.6.6 to 45.2.6.8"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 11 SC 11.5 P306 L26 # 16
Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status A

This refers to 802.3ah which has been superceded by 802.3
Replace with a reference to 802.3.
Same issue on Page 315, line 12

SuggestedRemedy

Change "802.3ah" to "IEEE Std 802.3"
Page 315, line 12 change "802.3ah" to "IEEE Std 802.3"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 12A SC 12A P349 L10 # 17
Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status A

space missing in "specified in IEEE Std 802.345.2.2"

SuggestedRemedy

Insert the space to give "specified in IEEE Std 802.3 45.2.2"

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 13 SC 13.5 P239 L3 # 50
Ganga, Ilango Intel

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Update dot3StatsSymbolErrors object description as per changes specified in 30.3.2.1.5 aSymbolErrorDuringCarrier(see 802.3ba).

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add the following text:

For operation at 10 Gb/s, 40 Gb/s, and 100 Gb/s, it is a count of the number of times the receiving media is non-idle (the time between the Start of Packet Delimiter and the End of Packet Delimiter) for a period of time equal to or greater than minFrameSize, and during which there was at least one occurrence of an event that causes the PHY to indicate "Receive Error" on the XGMII, the XLGMII, or the CGMII.

Cl 13 SC 13.5 P370 L16 # 21
 Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type T Comment Status A

This says "this object will map to the FEC controlregister (see 45.2.7.3) for 1000BASE-PX or FEC enable bit in 10GBASE-R FEC control register (see 45.2.1.85)."

- 1) Space missing in "controlregister"
- 2) The references to Clause 45 should be prefaced by "IEEE Std 802.3"
- 3) The "FEC control register" for 1000BASE-PX is in 45.2.8.3 not 45.2.7.3
- 4) The "10GBASE-R FEC control register" has been re-named to "BASE-R FEC control register"
- 5) The "BASE-R FEC control register" is in 45.2.1.90 not 45.2.1.85

SuggestedRemedy

Change to:
 "this object will map to the FEC control register (see IEEE Std 802.3 45.2.8.3) for 1000BASE-PX or FEC enable bit in the BASE-R FEC control register (see IEEE Std 802.3 45.2.1.90)."

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 13 SC 13.5 P370 L18 # 47
 Ganga, Ilango Intel

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Update ifMauFECMode object description as per changes specified in 30.5.1.1.14 (see 802.3ba).

For example change "10GBASE-R FEC control register" to "BASE-R FEC control register"

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response Response Status W
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See response to comment # 21.

Cl 13 SC 13.5 P370 L23 # 49
 Ganga, Ilango Intel

Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Update ifMauFECCorrectedBlocks object description as per changes specified in 30.5.1.15 (see 802.3ba). This is an array of counters for 40 and 100 GbE.

Update ifMauFECUnCorrectableBlocks object description as per changes specified in 30.5.1.16 (see 802.3ba). This is an array of counters for 40 and 100 GbE.

SuggestedRemedy

As per comment

Response Response Status W
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Update ifMauFECCorrectedBlocks:
 Change object type to an array.
 Change reference to 30.5.1.17 (already addressed in comment #23)
 Change description to read:

For 1000BASE-PX, 10/40/100GBASE-R PHYs, an array of corrected FEC block counters. The counters will not increment for other PHY types. The indices of this array (0 to N-1) denote the PCS lane number where N is the number of PCS lanes in use. The number of PCS lanes in use is set to one for PHYs that do not use PCS lanes. Each element of this array contains a count of corrected FEC blocks for that PCS lane.

Update ifMauFECUnCorrectableBlocks:
 Change object type to an array.
 Change reference to 30.5.1.18 (already addressed in comment #23)
 Change description to read:

For 1000BASE-PX PHYs or 10/40/100GBASE-R PHYs, an array of uncorrectable FEC block counters. The counters will not increment for other PHY types. The indices of this array (0 to N-1) denote the PCS lane number where N is the number of PCS lanes in use. The number of PCS lanes in use is set to one for PHYs that do not use PCS lanes. Each element of this array contains a count of uncorrectable FEC blocks for that PCS lane.

Cl 99 SC **P5** L1 # **46**
 Ganga, Ilango Intel

Comment Type ER **Comment Status A**
 Update the introduction to include list of additions to 802.3.1-2011 covered by this revision.

SuggestedRemedy
 Update introduction to include list of additions covered by this revision as stated in the project objectives.

Response **Response Status W**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Add a paragraph that describes the amendments pulled in to this revision.

Cl 99 SC **Annex** P L # **44**
 Hamano, Hiroshi Fujitsu Labs. Ltd.

Comment Type E **Comment Status A**
 Annex number indications are preferable at PDF file Chapter markers.

SuggestedRemedy
 So as in 802.3.1-2011.

Response **Response Status C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl B SC **B.1.1** **P391** L46 # **27**
 Law, David HP Ltd

Comment Type T **Comment Status A**
 Since we no longer include the oAggregator object within the GDMO module shouldn't we get rid of this name binding.

SuggestedRemedy
 Delete name binding nbMAC-Aggregator.

Response **Response Status C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl B SC **B.16.1** **P457** L34 # **30**
 Law, David HP Ltd

Comment Type T **Comment Status A**
 Since we no longer include the oAggregator object within the GDMO module shouldn't we get rid of this name binding. This however brought to my attention there was no name binding for oOAM to be the top level object. I believe that this is an error as stated in IEEE std 802.3 subclause 30.2.2.1 'Text description of managed objects', ' Otherwise, if implemented, oOAM becomes the top-most managed object class of the DTE containment tree shown in Figure 30-3.'

SuggestedRemedy
 [1] Delete the name binding nbOAM-aggregator
 [2] Add the name binding nbOAMName as follows:

```
nbOAMName NAME BINDING
SUBORDINATE OBJECT CLASS oOAM;
NAMED BY SUPERIOR OBJECT CLASS
"ISO/IEC 10165-2":system AND SUBCLASSES;
WITH ATTRIBUTE aOAMID;
REGISTERED AS {iso(1) std(0) iso8802(8802) csma(3) csmacdmgt(30) nameBinding(6)
oAMName(?)};
```

Response **Response Status C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl B SC **B.16.2** **P461** L33 # **18**
 Anslow, Peter Ciena

Comment Type E **Comment Status A**
 Tab missing in front of "BEHAVIOUR"

SuggestedRemedy
 Replace space with a tab

Response **Response Status C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl B **SC B.3.1** **P405** **L 56** # **28**
Law, David HP Ltd

Comment Type T **Comment Status A**

Since we no longer include the oAggregator object within the GDMO module shouldn't we get rid of this name binding.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete name binding nbMACControl-Aggregator.

Response **Response Status C**

ACCEPT.

Cl B **SC B.4.1** **P410** **L 5** # **29**
Law, David HP Ltd

Comment Type E **Comment Status A**

There appears to be a missing space in the text bMPCPMACCtrlFramesTransmittedBEHAVIOUR. While this may be a formatting issue, there may be a space or a tab but it isn't displayed due to the length of the names, the lack of a space causes a compiler error.

The same issue also occurs on:

Page 410, line 19.

Page 427, line 58.

Page 434, line 35.

Page 434, line 36.

SuggestedRemedy

Add missing space.

Response **Response Status C**

ACCEPT.

Cl C **SC C.2** **P487** **L 18** # **45**
NoName

Comment Type E **Comment Status A**

From Geoff Thompson

The text: "802.9a (99) --see IEEE Std 802.3, IEEE Std 802.9" needs work. There are 2 issues.

Issue #1: The standard 802.9 has been withdrawn.

Issue #2: I don't believe that the text "see IEEE Std 802.3, IEEE Std 802.9" makes any sense.

(As closely as I can tell, 802.9a was never revised into the base standard.

It looks like all the pieces of 802.9 were withdrawn rather than merged.)

SuggestedRemedy

Revise the text to read:

"802.9a (99) --see IEEE Std 802.3, IEEE Std 802.9a Clause 12 (withdrawn)"

Response **Response Status C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Revise the text to read:

"802.9a (99) --see IEEE Std 802.3, IEEE Std 802.9a (withdrawn)"

Add IEEE Std 802.9a to the normative references in Clause 2.

Cl C **SC C.2** **P487** **L 18** # **43**
Hamano, Hiroshi Fujitsu Labs. Ltd.

Comment Type E **Comment Status A**

Newly added PMD names may be necessary.

SuggestedRemedy

Reflect PMD names which appear on page.3 in

http://www.ieee802.org/3/minutes/nov11/1111_1a_close_report.pdf

Response **Response Status C**

ACCEPT.