

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI **FM** SC **FM** P**0** L**27** # **40**
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** **EZ**
 Something happened with the formatting in FM, where blocks of text are adjusted to both left and right side, for example page 1, lines 27-30.
SuggestedRemedy
 Please re-apply proper formatting in FM text to left adjust the text
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

CI **FM** SC **FM** P**9** L**17** # **39**
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A**
 Missing list of participants
SuggestedRemedy
 Fill in the list of participants of the WG ballot
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

CI **00** SC **0** P L # **179**
 Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type **T** Comment Status **A**
 There appears to be a problem with the ieee802-ethernet-link-oam.yang module in the ZIP file not being aligned with the text of the PDF. As a specific example, the typedef vendor-oui (which appears on page 202 of the PDF) is identified as a string in the PDF, but in the module in the zip is a hex-string. As another example, the leaf "out-information" in the PDF (page 205) is named "information-tx" in the module in the zip. The modification date on most of the files in the zip is 2018-03-14, so perhaps these are all old versions of modules, predating even the 2019 version of 802.3.2a?
SuggestedRemedy
 Figure out what happened to cause divergence between the text of the PDF 802.3.2a_D1.0 and the YANG modules in the ZIP file, and create an updated/corrected version of the ZIP file. For the modules to be useful, they need to align with the normative text in the PDF.
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Align existing YANG modules with modules published in the official GIT repository (URL here) with necessary changes per previous draft versions. Update ZIP file once completed

CI **00** SC **0** P**0** L**0** # **44**
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** **EZ**
 Document name is shown currently as "IEEE Draft P802.3.xx"
SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "IEEE Draft P802.3.2a"
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

CI **2** SC **2** P**15** L**21** # **41**
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** **EZ 2018**
 Outdated reference to 802.3 standard
SuggestedRemedy
 Replace 2018 with 2022
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

CI **2** SC **2** P**15** L**21** # **180**
 Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** **EZ 2018**
 The reference to 802.3 should be to the 2022 version
SuggestedRemedy
 Change 2018 to 2022.
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

CI **2** SC **2** P**15** L**23** # **181**
 Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A** **EZ**
 The reference to 802.3.1 should be updated to the 2023 version (802.3.1b) that is being developed.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change 2013 to 2023.
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add editorial note to update to correct date once project is completed

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 2 SC 2 P17 L21 # 42
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Potentially outdated reference to 802.3.1 standard
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial note to update reference to 802.3.1 from 2013 to 2024 when the work on that project is finished and the new standard is published.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 4 SC 4 P18 L22 # 102
 Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "PoE" is mentioned in the abbreviations, however "PoDL" isn't. Both appears on page 114 Line 15 in close proximity to each other
 SuggestedRemedy
 Include PoDL in abbreviations
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 4 SC 4 P18 L # 103
 Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Abbreviations in general seems to be very short, compared to the "Ethernet SMIv2 Data Model" specification. Compared to this document, abbreviations like "ONU" (Page 131), "OLT" (Page 131), "TDM" (Page 131), "LLID" (Page 131), "TDMA" (Page 131), "MPCP" (Page 131), "WDM" (Page 131) should be included
 SuggestedRemedy
 Include missing abbreviations for readers convenience
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add missing abbreviations to Chapter 4

CI 5 SC 5.1 P19 L4 # 57
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A
 Yang Module structure missing Mac Merge description
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add MAC Merge description
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Add the missing Yang modules and description to 5.1, change a structured list for Yang modules and their descriptions

CI 4 SC 4 P18 L11 # 101
 Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Search for EFM indicates, that it is only mentioned in the abbreviations.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove EFM from abbreviations
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 5 SC 5.2 P19 L19 # 58
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Missing reference to table 5-2,5-3
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add reference to table 5-2 and 5-3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add missing yang and their respective Tables

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.2 P20 L1 # 43
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 No page numbers on horizontal pages. No lines either
 SuggestedRemedy
 Please make sure that pages and line numbers are shown on horizontal pages
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 5 SC 5.2 P25 L1 # 45
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Text formatting in Table 5-6 uses green color
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to default color for normal text
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 5 SC 5.2.3.4 P79 L12 # 133
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A revision
 Most, if not all, of the "revision" clauses are out of date. These should be updated as we issue drafts.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add new revision clause for each module for each draft, we can remove them when we publish the standard, e.g.,
 This should have been
 revision 2019-11-28 {
 description "802.3 TF review D1.0";
 }
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Make sure each YANG module has the following revision statement
 revision 2024-xx-xx {
 description
 "Updates under IEEE Std 802.3.2-202x, Draft X.X";
 reference
 "IEEE Std 802.3.2-202x, unless dated explicitly";
 }
 Prepend with an editorial note indicated that the revision date is to be updated at publication date and also publication year for the standard.

CI 5 SC 5.2.3.4 P79 L17 # 134
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A 2018
 802.3.2a reference is incorrect
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 802.3-2018 to 802.3-2022
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change 802.3.2a to 802.3-2022

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.2.3.4 P79 L37 # 135
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 remove "-2022" from following referencs to 802.3, it's included in the revision clause, if my previous comment is accepted.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022" to "IEEE Std 802.3" in remainder of this YANG module
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 For LLDP Yang module will add reference
 "IEEE Std 802.3-2022, unless dated explicitly";
 and remove explicit dated from all leaf description

Cl 5 SC 5.2.3.4 P85 L11 # 136
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Formatting issues on many of the leaf descriptions in this augments clause
 SuggestedRemedy
 fix formatting
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Adopt best practice from Yangsters to resolve formating issues

Cl 5 SC 5.2.3.4 P92 L13 # 137
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 Some of the leafs use "A SET attribute"/"A GET attribute", and some use "read-only". Be consistent.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "A SET ..." to "A read-write ..." and change "A GET ..." to "A read-only ..." throughout the clause/module
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3 P25 L # 59
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Green colour for text in table 5-6
 SuggestedRemedy
 Correct colour of font to black for Table 5-6
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3 P37 L1 # 46
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Given the size of the some of the YANG trees, and how text breaks across lines, please consider changing page orientation for all YANG tree sections into horizontal
 SuggestedRemedy
 Per comment, applicable to all YANG tree sections
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P49 L1 # 104
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type T Comment Status A
 Need to pull some missing content from oPHYEntity, at least aPhyType and aPhyTypeList. In 802.3.1 these come in as IANAifMauTypeListBits and ifMauType(AutonomousType) from IANA-MAU-MIB.
 we need the equivalent definitions and attributes for the YANG model.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Define new tables/leaves/types etc.
 This will need some work, and presentations to the group.
 Add editor's note calling for contrubutiouons in the mean time?
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add Editorial note with request for contributions on additions needed

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.3.2 P49 L10 # 47
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 URL <https://github.com/YangModels/yang/tree/master/standard/ieee/published/802.3> leads to 404 location and needs to be updated
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change all the URLs to YANG modules from <https://github.com/YangModels/yang/tree/master/standard/ieee/published/802.3> to <https://github.com/YangModels/yang/tree/main/standard/ieee/published/802.3>, which resolves correctly. Multiple locations in the draft
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 5 SC 5.3.2 P49 L10 # 48
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 All URLs should be prefaced with editorial note to indicate that the URL contains the 2019 version of the modules right now and new versions will be published once the standard has been approved
 SuggestedRemedy
 Per comment, applicable to all YANG sections
 We also need to push the existing "published" modules into 2019 version for bookkeeping and update the readme file on the github page to make sure people are aware where what is.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 5 SC 5.3.2 P50 L3 # 60
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A 2018
 Reference to IEEE Std 802.3-2018
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update to reference IEEE Std 802.3-2022 and IEEE Std 802.3.1-2013
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolved by #134

CI 5 SC 5.3.2 P53 L29 # 61
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 IEEE 802.3,
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update to reference IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 5 SC 5.3.2 P67 L26 # 62
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ 2018
 "IEEE Std 802.3-2018, unless dated explicitly";
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update to "IEEE Std 802.3-2022, unless dated explicitly";
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 5 SC 5.3.2 P73 L53 # 63
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ 2018
 Unless otherwise indicated, the references in this model module are to IEEE Std 802.3-2018.";
 SuggestedRemedy
 "Update "the references in this model module are to IEEE Std 802.3-2018, unless dated explicitly";
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P73 L 61 # 64
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ 2018
 "IEEE Std 802.3-2018";
 SuggestedRemedy
 "IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P75 L 34 # 68
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.14.1.7"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P74 L 74 # 65
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 30.14.1.3"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P75 L 65 # 69
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 30.14.1.1"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P75 L 19 # 66
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.14.1.6";
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P76 L 12 # 70
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 The Verify State diagram (Figure 99?)
 SuggestedRemedy
 The Verify State diagram Figure 99-8 in IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P75 L 31 # 67
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 (see Figure 99?)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3 figure 99-5
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P76 L 50 # 71
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.14.1.2";
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P77 L17 # 72
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.14.1.5"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P78 L29 # 76
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.14.1.12";
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P77 L35 # 73
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.14.1.8"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P78 L40 # 77
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 30.14.1.13";
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P78 L2 # 74
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.14.1.10";
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P79 L16 # 78
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A 2018
 IEEE Std 802.3.2a, unless dated explicitly"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with IEEE Std 802.3-2022
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P78 L15 # 75
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 30.14.1.11";
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Resolved by #133

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P79 L37 # 79
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.12.2.1.5 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022"
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.5
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.5"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P81 L7 # 82
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.12.3.1.26 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.3.1.26
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.3.1.26"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P79 L58 # 80
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.12.2.1.9 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.9
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.9"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P82 L1 # 83
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.12.3.1.28 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022"
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.3.1.28
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.3.1.28"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P80 L31 # 81
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 30.12.2.1.10 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.10
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.10"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P82 L43 # 84
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 30.12.2.1.29 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.29
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.29"

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P83 L9 # 85
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 30.12.2.1.16 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.16
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.16"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P84 L48 # 88
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.12.2.1.24 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.24
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.24"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P83 L63 # 86
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 30.12.2.1.15 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.15
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.15"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L9 # 89
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 30.12.2.1.25 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.25
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.25"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P84 L23 # 87
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 30.12.2.1.23 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022"
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.23
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.23"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L13 # 90
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 802.3
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L 20 # 91
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L 36 # 94
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L 25 # 92
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L 42 # 95
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L 31 # 93
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L 47 # 96
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L 52 # 97
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L 60 # 98
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P49 L 15 # 49
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 It seems all existing YANG modules included in the draft do not match the approved YANG modules published at
<https://github.com/YangModels/yang/tree/main/standard/ieee/published/802.3>. Not sure when the change happened but the baseline module versions must be aligned with what was previously published

SuggestedRemedy
 Roll in all existing YANG modules from
<https://github.com/YangModels/yang/tree/main/standard/ieee/published/802.3> and apply any maintenance request changes (there are 4-5 locations where changes are needed). Then apply on top any changes per comments from this ballot. Make sure that the modules are pulled into FM files from a local txt file and keep the text files updated as needed. Publish updated text files in a zip file as well to facilitate testing
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. A new ZIP containing correct baseline with addition added in up until D1.0 with testing facilitated. Frame maker is not able to correctly Diff current frame maker text Yang and Yang import from the yang files

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P49 L 24 # 105
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A revision
 Most, if not all, of the "revision" clauses are out of date. These should be updated as we issue drafts.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add new revision clause for each module for each draft, we can remove them when we publish the standard, e.g.,
 This should have been
 revision 2019-11-28 {
 description "802.3 TF review D1.0";
 }
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #133

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P49 L45 # 106
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A 2018
 iana-if-type reference is out of date
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change iana-if-type@2018-07-03.yang to iana-if-type@2023-01-26.yang
 Check and change for all modules
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P50 L0 # 51
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A revision
 Insert a new revision statement to cover the alignment with 802.3-2022 and any published amendments
 SuggestedRemedy
 Per comment, applicable to all YANG
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #133

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P50 L3 # 50
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A 2018
 Update all references for 802.3 from 2018 to 2022.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Applicable to all YANG modules
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolved by #133

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P50 L3 # 107
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A 2018
 802.3 reference is out of date
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 802.3-2018 to 802.3-2022
 Check and change for all modules
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolved by #134

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P54 L20 # 108
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
 Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
 repeated "Discontinuities ..." text in the leaves.
 Move "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
 See "container frame { " as example.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add
 "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
 Remove
 "Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it differs from the container level behaviour.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P55 L24 # 109

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A

These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
 Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
 Move "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
 See "container frame { " as example.

SuggestedRemedy

Add
 "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343).";
 Remove
 "Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it differs from the container level behaviour.

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P55 L46 # 110

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Should not be defining 802.3.2 objects by reference to 802.3.1.
 PFC functionality is in defined in 802.1Q clause 36.
 PFC uses the M_CONTROL primitives defined in 802.1AC-2016 11.4.
 802.1AC-2016 13.1 Ethernet convergence function says that the parameters are passed directly to the corresponding 802.3 MA_CONTROL primitives .
 802.3 defines control frame handling in Clause 31, and "Opcode-independent MAC Control sublayer operation" in 31.5
 Opcodes are defined in Annex 31A, and PFC handling in Annex 31D. The state machines in 31D.4.4 and 31D.6.3 do not count the PFC messages

SuggestedRemedy

Remove in-frames-pfc & out-frames-pfc
 or add new clause 30 objects

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add note to description regarding "Deprechated in-frames-pfc & out-frames-pfc as not defined in base standard"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P57 L43 # 111

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A

These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
 Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove "Also see the 'description' statement..." text from objects unless they do not conform to this standard.

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P57 L50 # 112

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status A EZ
 Typo

SuggestedRemedy

Change "once ..." to "once."

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P57 L54 # 113

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A

Should only refer to the MAC Client

SuggestedRemedy

Change "LLC (or other MAC user)" to "MAC Client"

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P57 L 59 # 114
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Should only refer to the MAC Client
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "the LLC " to "the MAC Client"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P60 L 17 # 115
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 Poorly worded
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace
 "This count effectively comprises aFrameCheckSequenceErrors and aAlignmentErrors added together."
 with
 "This counter is calculated by summing the following IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30 counters: aFrameCheckSequenceErrors + aAlignmentErrors"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 "This counter is calculated by summing the following counters: aFrameCheckSequenceErrors + aAlignmentErrors"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P60 L 52 # 116
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 We should not not be defining objects that are not specified in 802.3.
 RFC 2819 defines this as
 "The total number of packets received that were less than 64 octets long (excluding framing bits, but including FCS octets) and were otherwise well formed."
 What is the equivalent in 802.3? If there isn't one, this should be removed
 SuggestedRemedy
 Reference to existing or new clause 30 object(s), or remove this.
 Response Response Status U
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Add note to description regarding "Function is Deprechated "

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P63 L 11 # 117
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
 Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
 Move "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
 See "container frame { " as example.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add
 "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343).";
 Remove
 "Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it differs from the container level behaviour.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P65 L18 # 118

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A

These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
 Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
 Move "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
 See "container frame { " as example.

SuggestedRemedy

Add
 "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343).";
 Remove
 "Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it differs from the container level behaviour.

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.2 P66 L46 # 119

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A revision

Most, if not all, of the "revision" clauses are out of date. These should be updated as we issue drafts.

SuggestedRemedy

Add new revision clause for each module for each draft, we can remove them when we publish the standard, e.g.,
 This should have been
 revision 2019-11-28 {
 description "802.3 TF review D1.0";
 }

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #133

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.2 P67 L1 # 120

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A 2018

iana-if-type reference is out of date

SuggestedRemedy

Change iana-if-type@2018-07-03.yang to iana-if-type@2023-01-26.yang
 Check and change for all modules

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.2 P67 L26 # 121

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A 2018

802.3 reference is out of date

SuggestedRemedy

Change 802.3-2018 to 802.3-2022
 Check and change for all modules

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolved by #133

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.2 P67 L37 # 122

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A

Fix formatting

SuggestedRemedy

Change
 "Only valid for Ethernet interfaces operating at speeds (data rates)
 above 1000 Mb/s.";
 to
 "Only valid for Ethernet interfaces operating at speeds
 (data rates) above 1000 Mb/s.";

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.2 P68 L 22 # 123
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Formatting issues on many of the leaf descriptions in this augment clause
 SuggestedRemedy
 Fix formatting
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolve with alignment to Yangsters best practice, pretty printing with Pyang.
 Add editorial note egarding use of pretty printer adding whitespace

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.2 P69 L 29 # 124
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
 Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
 Move "This counter ..." and "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
 See "container frame { " as example.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "These behaviors apply to all objects in this container."
 add "These counters do not increment when the Ethernet interface is operating in full-
 duplex mode."
 Add "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization
 of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the
 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
 Remove "This counter does not increment when the Ethernet interface is operating in full-
 duplex mode ..." text from objects
 Remove "Also see the 'description' statement..." text from objects unless they do not
 conform to this standard.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.2 P72 L 29 # 125
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
 Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
 Move "This counter ..." and "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
 See "container frame { " as example.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "These behaviors apply to all objects in this container."
 add "These counters do not increment when the Ethernet interface is operating in full-
 duplex mode."
 Add "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization
 of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the
 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
 Remove "This counter does not increment when the Ethernet interface is operating in full-
 duplex mode ..." text from objects
 Remove "Also see the 'description' statement..." text from objects unless they do not
 conform to this standard.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P73 L 49 # 126
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Formatting issue.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Fix formatting
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Resolve with alignment to Yangsters best practice, pretty printing
 with Pyang.
 Add editorial note egarding use of pretty printer adding whitespace

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P73 L57 # 127
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A revision
 Most, if not all, of the "revision" clauses are out of date. These should be updated as we issue drafts.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add new revision clause for each module for each draft, we can remove them when we publish the standard, e.g.,
 This should have been
 revision 2019-11-28 {
 description "802.3 TF review D1.0";
 }
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #133

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P73 L60 # 128
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A 2018
 802.3 reference is out of date
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 802.3-2018 to 802.3-2022
 Check and change for all modules
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolved by #133

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P73 L61 # 52
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type T Comment Status A EZ 2018
 The current IEEE802.3 Std is 2022, why is this reference to 2018?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 2018 to 2022
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P74 L11 # 129
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A
 Formatting issues on many of the leaf descriptions in this container clause
 SuggestedRemedy
 Fix formatting
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Resolve with alignment to Yangsters best practice, pretty printing with Pyang.
 Add editorial note egarding use of pretty printer adding whitespace

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P74 L11 # 130
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
 Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
 Move "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
 See "container frame { " as example.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add
 "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
 Remove
 "Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it differs from the container level behaviour.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P74 L38 # 54
 Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 The references on each of the leaf nodes on pages 74-78 only include a clause number.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add "IEEE Std 802.3, " prior to each of the Clause 30.x.x.x text in the "reference" fields
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Harmonize with reference to 802.3 in all Yang modules

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P77 L27 # 132

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A

These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
 Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
 Move "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
 See "container frame { " as example.

SuggestedRemedy

Add
 "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343).";
 Remove
 "Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it differs from the container level behaviour.

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P77 L27 # 131

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A

Formatting issues on many of the leaf descriptions in this container clause

SuggestedRemedy

Fix formatting

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolve with alignment to Yangsters best practice, pretty printing with Pyang.

Add editorial note egarding use of pretty printer adding whitespace

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.4 P79 L10 # 56

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A

Other modules contain a blanket use this version of the standard unless called out. Add that for LLDP

SuggestedRemedy

Add this sentence to the description for the organization member "Unless otherwise indicated, the references in this model module are to IEEE Std 802.3-2022."

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Resolve by comment #133

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.4 P79 L37 # 53

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A

IEEE Std IEEE Std is appearing in the text

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the redundant IEEE Std from all occurances in the document (pages 79-112, 152 times)

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change text of the references to use the form "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.x" on pages 79-112 where x is the existing sub-clause for that item

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.4 P79 L37 # 55

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A

The other modules list the reference as "Std, Clause" while PSE is doing it "Clause of Std". Be consistent.

SuggestedRemedy

Change text of the references to use the form "IEE Std 802.3, 30.x" on pages 79-112 where x is the existing sub-clause for that item

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change text of the references to use the form "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.x" on pages 79-112 where x is the existing sub-clause for that item

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P118 L18 # 138
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A revision
 Most, if not all, of the "revision" clauses are out of date. These should be updated as we issue drafts.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add new revision clause for each module for each draft, we can remove them when we publish the standard, e.g.,
 This should have been
 revision 2019-11-28 {
 description "802.3 TF review D1.0";
 }
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #133

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P118 L57 # 139
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A 2018
 802.3.2a reference is incorrect
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 802.3-2018 to 802.3-2022
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolved by #133

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P120 L17 # 99
 Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger
 Comment Type T Comment Status R
 There a power classes described from 0 to 11. However, for the mentioned Reference 30.15.1.1.6 have classes 0 to 15. Seems that they be missing
 SuggestedRemedy
 Include the classes
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 Resolution according to #140

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P120 L17 # 140
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R
 We should split the power class enums into into seperate multipair-power-class and singlepair-power-class enumerations.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update enumeration.
 Split into seperate multipair-power-class and singlepair-power-class enumerations.
 30.9.1.1.8 aPSEPowerClassification goes from class 0 to class 8
 30.15.1.1.6 aPoDLPSEDetectedPDPowerClass goes from class0 to class15.
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Several comments made towards PSE reagrdng missing objects and classes, will add editorial note requesting contributions to complete PSE Yang model

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P121 L14 # 141
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 fix Clause 30 reference
 SuggestedRemedy
 change .6 to .8
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P121 L24 # 142
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 Clause 33 is two pair, clause 145 is 4 pair,
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "multi-pair" to "two-pair"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P121 L34 # 143
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**
 add "four-pair" identity
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add
 identity four-pair {
 base pse-type;
 description "PSE support IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 145.";
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P121 L36 # 144
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**
 Add "all-pairs" identity
 SuggestedRemedy
 add
 identity all {
 base powering-pairs;
 description "All pairs are in use.";
 }
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P121 L37 # 145
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **R**
 Add an identity for 802.3bt when using all 4 pairs.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add
 identity all {
 base powering-pairs;
 description "All fours pairs are in use.";
 }
 Response Response Status **C**
 REJECT.
 The suggested remedy overlaps with #144.

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P121 L42 # 146
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A**
 language
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "The signal pair is in use." to "The signal pairs are in use."
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P121 L47 # 147
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A**
 language
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "The signal pair is in use." to "The signal pairs are in use."
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change "The spare pair is in use." to "The spare pairs are in use."

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P122 L7 # 148
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**
 Doesn't include Clause 145.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change
 "PSE may support IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 33 or IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 104."
 to
 "PSE supports one or more of IEEE Std 802.3 Clause 33, Clause 104 or Clause 145."
 Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Editorial nit - missing ", " before Clause 145.
 Change
 "PSE may support IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 33 or IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 104."
 to
 "PSE supports one or more of IEEE Std 802.3 Clause 33, Clause 104, or Clause 145."

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P122 L31 # 149
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R
 This only app
 SuggestedRemedy
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Comment is not clear

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P122 L47 # 150
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 leaf pairs-control-ability only really applies to Clause 33.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add to description
 "This applies when powering-pairs is equal to two-pair"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Add editorial note "Request contibution for using conditional construct with Yang Syntax for this variable"

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P122 L60 # 151
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R
 Missing aPSEPowerDetectionStatusA and aPSEPowerDetectionStatusB.
 SuggestedRemedy
 review need and add leaves if required
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Several comments made towards PSE reagrding missing objects and classes, will add editorial note to fro contributions to complete PSE Yang modele

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P123 L24 # 152
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R
 Why don't we include the set of aPSE<name>COUNTERA and aPSE<name>COUNTERB objects in the statistics container?
 SuggestedRemedy
 review need and add leaves if required
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT. Several comments made towards PSE reagrding missing objects and classes, will add editorial note to fro contributions to complete PSE Yang modele

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P123 L38 # 153
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 fix Clause 30 reference
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change
 "30.9.1.1.8 aPSEPowerDeniedCounter"
 to
 "30.9.1.1.14 aPSEPowerDeniedCounter"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change
 "30.9.1.1.8 aPSEPowerDeniedCounter"
 to
 "30.9.1.1.14"

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P123 L 50 # 154
Jones, Peter Cisco
Comment Type TR Comment Status A
fix Clause 30 reference
SuggestedRemedy
Change
"30.9.1.1.7 aPSEInvalidSignatureCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.11 aPSEInvalidSignatureCounter"
Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change
"30.9.1.1.7 aPSEInvalidSignatureCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.11"

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P124 L 11 # 157
Jones, Peter Cisco
Comment Type TR Comment Status A
fix Clause 30 reference
SuggestedRemedy
Change
"30.9.1.1.14 aPSECumulativeEnergy"
to
"30.9.1.1.25 aPSECumulativeEnergy"
Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change
"30.9.1.1.14 aPSECumulativeEnergy"
to
"30.9.1.1.25"

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P123 L 64 # 155
Jones, Peter Cisco
Comment Type TR Comment Status A
fix Clause 30 reference
SuggestedRemedy
Change
"30.9.1.1.11 aPSEMPSAbsentCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.20 aPSEMPSAbsentCounter"
Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change
"30.9.1.1.11 aPSEMPSAbsentCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.20"

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P124 L 11 # 156
Jones, Peter Cisco
Comment Type TR Comment Status A
fix Clause 30 reference
SuggestedRemedy
Change
"30.9.1.1.9 aPSEOverLoadCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.17 aPSEOverLoadCounter"
Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change
"30.9.1.1.9 aPSEOverLoadCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.17"

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P124 L14 # 158
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 Remove "leaf short", 30.9.1.1.10 aPSEShortCounter doesn't exist in 802.3-2022
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove
 leaf short {

 }
 or add aPSEShortCounter back into clause 30.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Yang object is deprecated
 Add descriptive text that counter is not present in base standard

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P125 L2 # 160
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 fix Clause 30 reference
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change
 "30.9.1.1.13 aPSEPowerAccuracy"
 to
 "30.9.1.1.24 aPSEPowerAccuracy"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change
 "30.9.1.1.13 aPSEPowerAccuracy"
 to
 "30.9.1.1.24"

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P124 L54 # 159
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 fix Clause 30 reference
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change
 "30.9.1.1.12 aPSEActualPower"
 to
 "30.9.1.1.23 aPSEActualPower"
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change
 "30.9.1.1.12 aPSEActualPower"
 to
 "30.9.1.1.23"

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P125 L41 # 161

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**
 Add " PSE" to descriptions, and add typeE and typeF

SuggestedRemedy

```
Change
enum typeA {
description "TypeA";
}
enum typeB {
description "TypeB";
}
enum typeC {
description "TypeC";
}
enum typeD {
description "TypeD";
}
To
enum typeA {
description "TypeA PSE";
}
enum typeB {
description "TypeB PSE";
}
enum typeC {
description "Type PSEC";
}
enum typeD {
description "TypeD PSE";
}
enum typeE {
description "TypeE PSE";
}
enum typeF {
description "TypeF PSE";
}
```

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P125 L63 # 162

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**
 Add Clause 30 reference

SuggestedRemedy

```
Add
reference
"IEEE Std 802.3, 30.15.1.1.4 aPoDLPSEType"
```

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

```
Add
reference
"IEEE Std 802.3, 30.15.1.1.4"
```

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P125 L63 # 163

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**
 Change Clause 104 reference to Clause 30

SuggestedRemedy

```
Change "802.3, 104.4.1" to "802.3 30.15.1.1.4 aPoDLPSEType"
```

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

```
Change "802.3, 104.4.1" to "802.3, 30.15.1.1.4"
```


Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P126 L9 # 164

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**
 Add " PD" to descriptions, and add typeE and typeF

SuggestedRemedy

```
Change
enum unknown {
description "Unknown";
}
enum typeA {
description "TypeA";
}
enum typeB {
description "TypeB";
}
enum typeC {
description "TypeC";
}
enum typeD {
description "TypeD";
}
To
enum unknown {
description "Unknown PD type";
}
enum typeA {
description "TypeA PD";
}
enum typeB {
description "TypeB PD";
}
enum typeC {
description "TypeC PD";
}
enum typeD {
description "TypeD PD";
}
enum typeE {
description "TypeE PD";
}
enum typeF {
description "TypeF PD";
}
```

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P126 L62 # 165

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**
 Add "Discontinuities ..." text to container
 See "container frame { " as example.

SuggestedRemedy

Add
 "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P154 L1 # 166

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**
 Add "Discontinuities ..." text to container
 See "container frame { " as example.

SuggestedRemedy

Add
 "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
 Remove
 "Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it differs from the container level behaviour.

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P160 L45 # 167

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**

Add "Discontinuities ..." text to container
 See "container frame { " as example.

SuggestedRemedy

Add
 "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343).";
 Remove
 "Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it differs from the container level behaviour.

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P166 L16 # 168

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**

Lots of leaves are "type int32; units 0.1 dBm", we should define a "power measurement" type.

SuggestedRemedy

Add the following typedef and use it for any 0.1 dBm power measurement leaves.

```
typedef power-level{
  type int32;
  units "0.1 dBm";
  Description
  "Power level reflects the value of power, as measured at the optical transceiver, expressed in units of 0.1 dBm."
}
```

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Cl 7 SC 7.4.2 P167 L39 # 169

Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**

container statistics-trx is not really statistics, change container name/description and trx-data-reliable description??

SuggestedRemedy

Fix naming - suggest "monitoring-trx"

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT.

Consult Yangsters on how to handle name change

Cl 8 SC 8.4 P190 L1 # 182

Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type **T** Comment Status **A**

Table 8-1 is missing a mapping for the attribute aOAMRemotePDUConfiguration (802.3-2022 clause 30.3.6.1.9)

SuggestedRemedy

Add an entry for attribute aOAMRemotePDUConfiguration, Reference 30.3.6.1.9, Container interfaces/interface/ethernet/link-oam/discovery-info/remote, data node oammtu

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add row with content

aOAMRemotePDUConfiguration	30.3.6.1.9	oammtu	R
aOAMRemoteRevision	30.3.6.1.13	revision	R

Cl 8 SC 8.4 P190 L1 # 184

Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **A**

In the row for oAMLocalErr..., the Container is referencing a branch that doesn't exist in the tree in 8.5.1 (link-oam/link-monitor/event-type)

SuggestedRemedy

Align the Containers in the table and the tree in 8.5.1

Response Response Status **C**
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Regenerate all Yang Tree after updates to yang files for consistency

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 8 SC 8.4 P190 L1 # 185

Huber, Thomas

Nokia

Comment Type T Comment Status A

Table 8-1 is missing a mapping for the attribute aOAMRemoteRevision (802.3-2022 clause 30.3.6.1.13)

SuggestedRemedy

Add an entry for attribute aOAMRemoteRevision, Reference 30.3.6.1.13, Container interfaces/interface/ethernet/link-oam/discovery-info/remote, data node revision

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add row with content

aOAMRemotePDUConfiguration	30.3.6.1.9	oammtu	R
aOAMRemoteRevision	30.3.6.1.13	revision	R

Cl 8 SC 8.4 P190 L1 # 183

Huber, Thomas

Nokia

Comment Type E Comment Status A

The information in the References and Container(s) columns fo the attribute aOAMLocalConfiguration seem to be off - the first row points to 30.3.6.1.6, which is aOAMLocalConfiguration in 802.3, but the container is listed as interfaces/interface/ethernet/link-oam/discovery-info/remote/functions-supported. The second reference is "aOAMLocalConfiguration" rather than a pointer to a specific clause in 802.3-2022

SuggestedRemedy

Update these rows as appropriate. It is not clear if the first row is really intended to be referencing 30.3.6.1.7 (and this aOAMRemoteConfiguration should also be listed in the Attribute(s) column), or if the Container listed is incorrect. For the second row, it would appear that maybe the Reference is supposed to be 30.3.6.1.6.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 8 SC 8.4 P192 L # 100

Schreiner, Stephan

Rosenberger

Comment Type E Comment Status R

"variable-requeste-rx" is not mentioned in the following text. However, "in-variable-request" is mentioned. If this is the correct connection, "aOAMVariableRequestTx (30.3.6.1.28) should be mentioned in the table too, because "out-variable-request" is also mentioned in the following text.

SuggestedRemedy

Adapt the data node column entry. Add aOAMVariableRequestTx to the table.

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

Incompoete proposal - please re-submit with highlighted specific changes.

Cl 8 SC 8.5.1 P195 L25 # 186

Huber, Thomas

Nokia

Comment Type T Comment Status A

The tree is missing items related to the PME managed objects defined in clause 30.11.2 and MAC entity managed oboects defined in clause 30.3.1.1

SuggestedRemedy

See separate file for detailed proposal for what to add.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Regenerate Yang with example

<https://www.ieee802.org/3/2/a/comments/D1.0/proposalsForComments13and17.pdf>

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P197 L22 # 170
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A revision
 Most, if not all, of the "revision" clauses are out of date. These should be updated as we issue drafts.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add new revision clause for each module for each draft, we can remove them when we publish the standard, e.g.,
 This should have been
 revision 2019-11-28 {
 description "802.3 TF review D1.0";
 }
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 See comment #133

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P197 L43 # 171
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A 2018
 iana-if-type reference is out of date
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change iana-if-type@2018-07-03.yang to iana-if-type@2023-01-26.yang
 Check and change for all modules
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P198 L7 # 172
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A 2018
 802.3 reference is incorrect
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 802.3-2018 to 802.3-2022
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Resolved by #133

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P198 L16 # 173
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R
 Lots of references into clause 57, shouldn't these objects be defined in Clause 30?
 SuggestedRemedy
 remove cross-references to clause 57 from "references" clauses
 Response Response Status U
 REJECT.
 Lack of consensus in the comment resolution group

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P198 L57 # 174
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 feature remote-mib-retrieval-initiate is badly names. We are not dealing with a MIB.
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "-mib-" to "-data-"
 Response Response Status U
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Aling with Yangsters how to handle changed name of object

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P202 L54 # 175
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 I really don't like referring to RFC definitions that then refer back to 802.3.
 What would happen if we changed behavior and no-one checked?
 I think we should define object behaviors in these module/this document.
 Comment applies to many of these references in the draft.
 In this specific case dot3OamOperStatus refers back to [802.3ah] from 2004 and has about a page and a half of text in the description.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace RFC references items defined in 802.3 to with definitions and references into 802.3
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Remove "IETF RFC 4878, dot3OamOperStatus;"

Approved Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 8 SC 8.5.2 P202 L 65 # 176
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 The following description is out of date based on https://standards.ieee.org/products-programs/regauth/oui/Description "24-bit Organizationally Unique Identifier."
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace with "24-bit MAC addresses – large(MA–L). Previously know as Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI).";
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 8 SC 8.5.2 P203 L 2 # 177
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 incorrect reference
 SuggestedRemedy
 replace IEEE Std 802-2014, Clause 9" with "IEEE Std 802-2014, Clause 8.2.2";
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 replace IEEE Std 802-2014, Clause 9" with "IEEE Std 802-2014, 8.2.2";

CI 8 SC 8.5.2 P209 L 22 # 187
 Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type T Comment Status A
 The description for 'oammtu' could be improved to better reflect the meaning of the leaf
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the description to "The maximum OAMPDU size for the remote node. The peer OAM entities exchange the maximum size they can support and negotiate to use the smaller of the two maximum OAMPDU sizes."
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.

CI 8 SC 8.5.2 P209 L 37 # 188
 Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type T Comment Status A
 Description for 'mode' could be improved to better reflect the meaning of this leaf
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change the description to "This object configures the mode of OAM operation as active or passive. Active mode provides capabilities to initiate monitoring activities with the remote OAM peer enity, while passive mode waits for the peer to initiate actions with it. Changing this value results in incrementing the revision field of locally generated OAM PDUs (30.3.6.1.12) and triggers the OAM discovery process if the operational state was alraedy 'operational'. The default value is implementation-dependent."

Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Change the description to "This object configures the mode of OAM operation as active or passive. Active mode provides capabilities to initiate monitoring activities with the remote OAM peer enity, while passive mode waits for the peer to initiate actions with it. Changing this value results in incrementing the revision field of locally generated OAMPDUs (see IEEE Std 802.3, 30.3.6.1.12) and triggers the OAM discovery process if the operational state was already 'operational'. The default value is implementation-dependent."

CI 8 SC 8.5.2 P212 L 2 # 178
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A
 mib-retrieval is badly named. We are not dealing with a MIB.
 SuggestedRemedy
 change "-mib-" to "-data-"
 Change "MIB variable retrieval support." to "Variable retrieval support."
 Response Response Status U
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Need to align with yangsters on how to handle object name change

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P212 L29 # 189

Huber, Thomas Nokia

Comment Type T Comment Status A

The description for 'oammtu' could be improved to better reflect the meaning of the leaf

SuggestedRemedy

Change the description to "The maximum OAMPDU size for the local node. The peer OAM entities exchange the maximum size they can support and negotiate to use the smaller of the two maximum OAMPDU sizes."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P217 L1 # 190

Huber, Thomas Nokia

Comment Type T Comment Status R

PME managed objects defined in clause 30.11.2 of 802.3 can be retrieved as variable requests per clause 57.1.2 item c 2. A YANG definition for the managed objects in 30.3.1.1 should be added.

SuggestedRemedy

See separate file for detailed proposal for what to add. Note that the proposal has several open questions that need further discussion wrt whether some leaves are ro or rw.

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

Commenter is encouraged to submit contribution showing specific changes needed and build consensus