*Cl* **FM** *SC* **FM** *P* **0** *L* **27** # 40

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Something happened with the formatting in FM, where blocks of text are adjusted to both left and right side, for example page 1, lines 27-30.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Please re-apply proper formatting in FM text to left adjust the text

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **FM** *SC* **FM** *P* **9** *L* **17** # 39

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

Missing list of participants

*SuggestedRemedy*

Fill in the list of participants of the WG ballot

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **00** *SC* **0** *P* *L* # 179

Huber, Thomas Nokia

*Comment Type* **T** *Comment Status* **D**

There appears to be a problem with the ieee802-ethernet-link-oam.yang module in the ZIP file not being aligned with the text of the PDF. As a specific example, the typedef vendor-oui (which appears on page 202 of the PDF) is identified as a string in the PDF, but in the module in the zip is a hex-string. As another example, the leaf "out-information" in the PDF (page 205) is named "information-tx" in the module in the zip. The modification date on most of the files in the zip is 2018-03-14, so perhaps these are all old versions of modules, predating even the 2019 version of 802.3.2a?

*SuggestedRemedy*

Figure out what happened to cause divergence between the text of the PDF 802.3.2a_D1.0 and the YANG modules in the ZIP file, and create an updated/corrected version of the ZIP file. For the modules to be useful, they need to align with the normative text in the PDF.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Align existing YANG modules with modules published in the official GIT repository (URL here) with necessary changes per previous draft versions. Update ZIP file once completed

*Cl* **00** *SC* **0** *P* **0** *L* **0** # 44

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Document name is shown currently as “IEEE Draft P802.3.xx"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change to “IEEE Draft P802.3.2a”

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **2** *SC* **2** *P* **15** *L* **21** # 41

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ 2018*

Outdated reference to 802.3 standard

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace 2018 with 2022

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **2** *SC* **2** *P* **15** *L* **21** # 180

Huber, Thomas Nokia

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ 2018*

The reference to 802.3 should be to the 2022 version

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change 2018 to 2022.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **2** *SC* **2** *P* **15** *L* **23** # 181

Huber, Thomas Nokia

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

The reference to 802.3.1 should be updated to the 2023 version (802.3.1b) that is being developed.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change 2013 to 2023.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add editorial note to update to correct date once project is completed

*Cl* **2** *SC* **2** *P* **17** *L* **21** # 42

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Potentially outdated reference to 802.3.1 standard

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add editorial note to update reference to 802.3.1 from 2013 to 2024 when the work on that project is finished and the new standard is published.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **4** *SC* **4** *P* **18** *L* # 103

Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Abbreviations in general seems to be very short, compaired to the "Ethernet SMIv2 Data Model" specification. Compared to this document, abbreviations like "ONU" (Page 131), "OLT" (Page 131), "TDM" (Page 131), "LLID" (Page 131), "TDMA" (Page 131), "MPCP" (Page 131), "WDM" (Page 131) should be included

*SuggestedRemedy*

Include missing abbreviations for readers convenience

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add missing abbriviations to Chapter 4

*Cl* **4** *SC* **4** *P* **18** *L* **11** # 101

Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Search for EFM indicates, that it is only mentioned in the abbreviations.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Remove EFM from abbreviations

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **4** *SC* **4** *P* **18** *L* **22** # 102

Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"PoE" is mentioned in the abbreviations, however "PoDL" isn't. Both appears on page 114 Line 15 in close proximity to each other

*SuggestedRemedy*

Include PoDL in abbreviations

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.1** *P* **19** *L* **4** # 57

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D**

Yang Module structure missing Mac Merge description

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add MAC Merge description

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add the missing Yang modules and description to 5.1

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.2** *P* **19** *L* **19** # 58

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Missing reference to table 5-2,5-3

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add reference to table 5-2 and 5-3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add missing yang and their respective Tables

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.2** *P* **20** *L* **1** # 43

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

No page numbers on horizontal pages. No lines either

*SuggestedRemedy*

Please make sure that pages and line numbers are shown on horizontal pages

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.2** *P* **25** *L* **1** # 45

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

Text formatting in Table 5-6 uses green color

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change to default color for normal text

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.2.3.4** *P* **79** *L* **12** # 133

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *revision*

Most, if not all, of the "revision" clauses are out of date. These should be updated as we issue drafts.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add new revision clause for each module for each draft, we can remove them when we publish the standard, e.g.,
This should have been
revision 2019-11-28 {
description "802.3 TF review D1.0.";
}

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Make sure each YANG module has the following revision statement

revision 2024-xx-xx {
description
"Updates under IEEE Std 802.3.2-202x";
reference
"IEEE Std 802.3.2-202x, unless dated explicitly";
}

Prepended with an editorial note indicated that the revision date is to be updated at publication date and also publication year for the standard.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.2.3.4** *P* **79** *L* **17** # 134

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *2018*

802.3.2a reference is incorrect

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change 802.3-2018 to 802.3-2022

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change 802.3.2a to 802.3-2022

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.2.3.4** *P* **79** *L* **37** # 135

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

remove "-2022" from following referecnes to 802.3, it's included in the revision clause, if my previous comment is accepted.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022" to "IEEE Std 802.3" in remainder of this YANG module

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
For LLDP Yang module will add
reference
"IEEE Std 802.3-2022, unless dated explicitly";

and remove explicit dated from all leaf description

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.2.3.4** *P* **85** *L* **11** # 136

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

Formatting issues on many of the leaf descriptions in this augments clause

*SuggestedRemedy*

fix formatting

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Suggested remedy not clear on the chanages needed. Propose submitter to clarify suggested remedy

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.2.3.4** *P* **92** *L* **13** # 137

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Some of the leafs use "A SET attribute"/"A GET attribute", and some use "read-only". Be consistent.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change"A SET ..." to "A read-write ..." and change"A GET ..." to "A read-only ..." thoughout the clause/module

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3** *P* **25** *L* # 59

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Green colour for text in table 5-6

*SuggestedRemedy*

Correct colour of font to black for Table 5-6

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3** *P* **37** *L* **1** # 46

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Given the size of the some of the YANG trees, and how text breaks across lines, please consider changing page orientation for all YANG tree sections into horizontal

*SuggestedRemedy*

Per comment, applicable to all YANG tree sections

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **49** *L* **1** # 104

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **T** *Comment Status* **D**

Need to pull some missing content from oPHYEntity, at least aPhyType and aPhyTypeList. In 802.3.1 these come in as IANAifMauTypeListBits and ifMauType(AutonomousType) from IANA-MAU-MIB.
we need the equivalent definitions and attributes for the YANG model.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Define new tables/leaves/types etc.
This will need some work, and presentations to the group.
Add editor's note calling for contrubutiuons in the mean time?

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add Editorial note with request for contributions on additions needed

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **49** *L* **10** # 47

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

URL https://github.com/YangModels/yang/tree/master/standard/ieee/published/802.3 leads to 404 location and needs to be updated

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change all the URLs to YANG modules from https://github.com/YangModels/yang/tree/master/standard/ieee/published/802.3 to https://github.com/YangModels/yang/tree/main/standard/ieee/published/802.3, which resolves correctly. Multiple locations in the draft

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **49** *L* **10** # 48

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

All URLs should be prefaces with editorial note to indicate that the URL contains the 2019 version of the modules right now and new versions will be published once the standard has been approved

*SuggestedRemedy*

Per comment, applicable to all YANG sections
We also need to push the existing “published” modules into 2019 version for bookeeping and update the readme file on the github page to make sure people are aware where what is.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **50** *L* **3** # 60

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *2018*

Reference to IEEE Std 802.3-2018

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update to reference IEEE Std 802.3-2022 and IEEE Std 802.3.1-2013

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add an editorial note indicating that 802.3.1 is currently under revision and its year date should be updated when it is released, prior to this standard being finished.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **53** *L* **29** # 61

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

IEEE 802.3,

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update to reference IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **67** *L* **26** # 62

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ 2018*

"IEEE Std 802.3-2018, unless dated explicitly";

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update to "IEEE Std 802.3-2022, unless dated explicitly";

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **73** *L* **53** # 63

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ 2018*

Unless otherwise indicated, the references in this model module are to IEEE Std 802.3-2018.";

*SuggestedRemedy*

"Update "the references in this model module are to IEEE Std 802.3-2018, unless dated explicitly";

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **73** *L* **61** # 64

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ 2018*

"IEEE Std 802.3-2018";

*SuggestedRemedy*

"IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **74** *L* **74** # 65

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

30.14.1.3"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **75** *L* **19** # 66

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.14.1.6";

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **75** *L* **31** # 67

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

(see Figure 99?)

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3 figure 99-5

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **75** *L* **34** # 68

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.14.1.7"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **75** *L* **65** # 69

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

30.14.1.1"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **76** *L* **12** # 70

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

The Verify State diagram (Figure 99?)

*SuggestedRemedy*

The Verify State diagram Figure 99-8 in IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **76** *L* **50** # 71

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.14.1.2";

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **77** *L* **17** # 72

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.14.1.5"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **77** *L* **35** # 73

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.14.1.8"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **78** *L* **2** # 74

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.14.1.10";

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **78** *L* **15** # 75

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

30.14.1.11";

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **78** *L* **29** # 76

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.14.1.12";

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **78** *L* **40** # 77

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

30.14.1.13";

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **79** *L* **16** # 78

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D**

IEEE Std 802.3.2a, unless dated explicitly"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update with IEEE Std 802.3-2022

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change reference from 802.3.2a to IEEE Std 802.3-2022

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **79** *L* **37** # 79

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.12.2.1.5 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022"

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.5

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

use “IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.5”

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **79** *L* **58** # 80

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.12.2.1.9 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.9

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.9"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **80** *L* **31** # 81

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

30.12.2.1.10 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.10

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.10"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **81** *L* **7** # 82

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.12.3.1.26 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.3.1.26

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.3.1.26"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **82** *L* **1** # 83

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.12.3.1.28 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022"

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.3.1.28

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.3.1.28"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **82** *L* **43** # 84

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

30.12.2.1.29 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.29

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.29"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **83** *L* **9** # 85

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

30.12.2.1.16 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.16

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.16"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **83** *L* **63** # 86

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

30.12.2.1.15 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.15

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.15"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **84** *L* **23** # 87

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

30.12.2.1.23 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022"

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.23

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.23"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **84** *L* **48** # 88

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.12.2.1.24 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.24

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.24"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **85** *L* **9** # 89

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

30.12.2.1.25 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.25

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.25"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **85** *L* **13** # 90

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

802.3

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **85** *L* **20** # 91

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **85** *L* **25** # 92

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **85** *L* **31** # 93

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **85** *L* **36** # 94

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **85** *L* **42** # 95

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **85** *L* **47** # 96

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **85** *L* **52** # 97

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2** *P* **85** *L* **60** # 98

Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

"30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";

*SuggestedRemedy*

IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **49** *L* **15** # 49

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

It seems all existing YANG modules included in the draft do not match the approved YANG modules published at https://github.com/YangModels/yang/tree/main/standard/ieee/published/802.3. Not sure when the change happened but the baseline module versions must be aligned with what was previously published

*SuggestedRemedy*

Roll in all existing YANG modules from https://github.com/YangModels/yang/tree/main/standard/ieee/published/802.3 and apply any maintenance request changes (there are 4-5 locations where changes are needed). Then apply on top any changes per comments from this ballot. Make sure that the modules are pulled into FM files from a local txt file and keep the text files updated as needed. Publish updated text files in a zip file as well to facilitate testing

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. A new ZIP contaning correct baseline with addition added in upuntil D1.0 with testing facilitated. Frame maker is not able to correctly Diff current frame maker text Yang and Yang import from the yang files

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **49** *L* **24** # 105

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *revision*

Most, if not all, of the "revision" clauses are out of date. These should be updated as we issue drafts.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add new revision clause for each module for each draft, we can remove them when we publish the standard, e.g.,
This should have been
revision 2019-11-28 {
description "802.3 TF review D1.0.";
}

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #133

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **49** *L* **45** # 106

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D** *2018*

iana-if-type reference is out of date

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change iana-if-type@2018-07-03.yang to iana-if-type@2023-01-26.yang
Check and change for all modules

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **50** *L* **0** # 51

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *revision*

Insert a new revision statement to cover the alignment with 802.3-2022 and any published amendments

*SuggestedRemedy*

Per comment, applicable to all YANG

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #133

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **50** *L* **3** # 50

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *2018*

Update all references for 802.3 from 2018 to 2022.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Applicable to all YANG modules

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **50** *L* **3** # 107

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D** *2018*

802.3 reference is out of date

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change 802.3-2018 to 802.3-2022
Check and change for all modules

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **54** *L* **20** # 108

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
repeated "Discontinuities …" text in the leaves.
Move "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
See "container frame { " as example.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add
"Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
Remove
"Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it difffers from the container level behaviour.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **55** *L* **24** # 109

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
Move "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
See "container frame { " as example.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add
"Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
Remove
"Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it difffers from the container level behaviour.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **55** *L* **46** # 110

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Should not be defining 802.3.2 objects by reference to 802.3.1.
PFC functionality is in defined in 802.1Q clause 36.
PFC uses the M_CONTROL primitives defined in 802.1AC-2016 11.4.
802.1AC-2016 13.1 Ethernet convergence function says that the parameters are passed directly to the corresponding 802.3 MA_CONTROL primitives .
802.3 defines control frame handling in Clause 31, and "Opcode-independent MAC Control sublayer operation" in 31.5
Opcodes are defined in Annex 31A, and PFC handling in Annex 31D. The state machines in 31D.4.4 and 31D.6.3 do not count the PFC messages

*SuggestedRemedy*

Remove in-frames-pfc & out-frames-pfc
or add new clause 30 objects

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
The YANG modules included in this standard provide YANG versions of attributes defined in
IEEE Std 802.3TM-2022, Clause 30, as well as derivative attributes defined in other management information
bases (e.g., SNMP attributes included in IEEE Std 802.3.1, YANG versions of IETF Etherlike MIB
attributes, etc.).

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **57** *L* **43** # 111

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Remove "Also see the 'description' statement..." text from objects unless they do not conform to this standard.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Suggested remedy is not clear on which object that shall have statement remove or not

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **57** *L* **50** # 112

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ*

Typo

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "once …" to "once."

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **57** *L* **54** # 113

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

Should only refer to the MAC Client

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "LLC (or other MAC user)" to "MAC Client"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **57** *L* **59** # 114

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

Should only refer to the MAC Client

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "the LLC " to "the MAC Client"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **60** *L* **17** # 115

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Poorly worded

*SuggestedRemedy*

replace
"This count effectively comprises aFrameCheckSequenceErrors and aAlignmentErrors added together."
with
"This counter is calculated by summing the following IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30 counters:
aFrameCheckSequenceErrors +
aAlignmentErrors"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **60** *L* **52** # 116

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

We should not not be defining objects that are not specified in 802.3.
RFC 2819 defines this as
"The total number of packets received that were less than 64 octets long (excluding framing bits, but including FCS octets) and were otherwise well formed."
What is the equivalent in 802.3? If there isn't one, this should be removed

*SuggestedRemedy*

Reference to existing or new clause 30 object(s), or remove this.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. The YANG modules included in this standard provide YANG versions of attributes defined in
IEEE Std 802.3TM-2022, Clause 30, as well as derivative attributes defined in other management information
bases (e.g., SNMP attributes included in IEEE Std 802.3.1, YANG versions of IETF Etherlike MIB
attributes, etc.).

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **63** *L* **11** # 117

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
Move "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
See "container frame { " as example.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add
"Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
Remove
"Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it difffers from the container level behaviour.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.1** *P* **65** *L* **18** # 118

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
Move "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
See "container frame { " as example.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add
"Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
Remove
"Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it difffers from the container level behaviour.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.2** *P* **66** *L* **46** # 119

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *revision*

Most, if not all, of the "revision" clauses are out of date. These should be updated as we issue drafts.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add new revision clause for each module for each draft, we can remove them when we publish the standard, e.g.,
This should have been
revision 2019-11-28 {
description "802.3 TF review D1.0.";
}

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

See comment #133

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.2** *P* **67** *L* **1** # 120

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D** *2018*

iana-if-type reference is out of date

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change iana-if-type@2018-07-03.yang to iana-if-type@2023-01-26.yang
Check and change for all modules

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.2** *P* **67** *L* **26** # 121

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D** *2018*

802.3 reference is out of date

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change 802.3-2018 to 802.3-2022
Check and change for all modules

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.2** *P* **67** *L* **37** # 122

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

Fix formatting

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change
"Only valid for Ethernet interfaces operating at speeds (data rates)
above 1000 Mb/s.";
to
"Only valid for Ethernet interfaces operating at speeds (data rates) above 1000 Mb/s.";

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.2** *P* **68** *L* **22** # 123

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

Formatting issues on many of the leaf descriptions in this augment clause

*SuggestedRemedy*

Fix formatting

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Suggested remedy is not clear on the scope of change, propose submitter to clarify

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.2** *P* **69** *L* **29** # 124

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
Move "This counter …" and "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
See "container frame { " as example.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add "These behaviors apply to all objects in this container."
add "These counters do not increment when the Ethernet interface is operating in full-duplex mode."
Add "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
Remove "This counter does not increment when the Ethernet interface is operating in full-duplex mode ..." text from objects
Remove "Also see the 'description' statement..." text from objects unless they do not conform to this standard.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.2** *P* **72** *L* **29** # 125

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
Move "This counter …" and "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
See "container frame { " as example.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add "These behaviors apply to all objects in this container."
add "These counters do not increment when the Ethernet interface is operating in full-duplex mode."
Add "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
Remove "This counter does not increment when the Ethernet interface is operating in full-duplex mode ..." text from objects
Remove "Also see the 'description' statement..." text from objects unless they do not conform to this standard.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.3** *P* **73** *L* **49** # 126

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

Formatting issue.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Fix formatting

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Scope of suggested changes is not clear,

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.3** *P* **73** *L* **57** # 127

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *revision*

Most, if not all, of the "revision" clauses are out of date. These should be updated as we issue drafts.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add new revision clause for each module for each draft, we can remove them when we publish the standard, e.g.,
This should have been
revision 2019-11-28 {
description "802.3 TF review D1.0.";
}

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #133

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.3** *P* **73** *L* **60** # 128

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *2018*

802.3 reference is out of date

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change 802.3-2018 to 802.3-2022
Check and change for all modules

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.3** *P* **73** *L* **61** # 52

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom

*Comment Type* **T** *Comment Status* **D** *EZ 2018*

The current IEEE802.3 Std is 2022, why is this refernce to 2018?

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change 2018 to 2022

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.3** *P* **74** *L* **11** # 129

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

Formatting issues on many of the leaf descriptions in this container clause

*SuggestedRemedy*

Fix formatting

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Suggested remedy is not clear on the change needed

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.3** *P* **74** *L* **11** # 130

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
Move "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
See "container frame { " as example.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add
"Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
Remove
"Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it difffers from the container level behaviour.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.3** *P* **74** *L* **38** # 54

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

The references on each of the leaf nodes on pages 74-78 only include a clause number.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add "IEEE Std 802.3, " prior to each of the Clause 30.x.x.x text in the "reference" fields

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.3** *P* **77** *L* **27** # 132

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

These behaviors apply to all objects in this container.
Define at the container level and don't repeat at the leaf level.
Move "Discontinuities ..." text to container and remove from objects.
See "container frame { " as example.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add
"Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
Remove
"Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it difffers from the container level behaviour.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.3** *P* **77** *L* **27** # 131

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

Formatting issues on many of the leaf descriptions in this container clause

*SuggestedRemedy*

Fix formatting

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Suggested remedy is not clear on scope of change

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.4** *P* **79** *L* **10** # 56

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Other modules contain a blanket use this version of the standard unless called out. Add that for LLDP

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add this sentence to the description for the organization member "Unless otherwise indicated, the references in this model module are to IEEE Std 802.3-2022."

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Use same text as other modules "IEEE Std 802.3-2022, unless dated explicitly";

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.4** *P* **79** *L* **37** # 53

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

IEEE Std IEEE Std is appearing in the text

*SuggestedRemedy*

Remove the redundant IEEE Std from all occurances in the document (pages 79-112, 152 times)

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **5** *SC* **5.3.2.4** *P* **79** *L* **37** # 55

Slavick, Jeff Broadcom

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

The other modules list the reference as "Std, Clause" while PSE is doing it "Clause of Std". Be consistent.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change text of the references to use the form "IEE Std 802.3, 30.x" on pages 79-112 where x is the existing sub-clause for that item

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **118** *L* **18** # 138

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *revision*

Most, if not all, of the "revision" clauses are out of date. These should be updated as we issue drafts.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add new revision clause for each module for each draft, we can remove them when we publish the standard, e.g.,
This should have been
revision 2019-11-28 {
description "802.3 TF review D1.0.";
}

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #133

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **118** *L* **57** # 139

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D** *2018*

802.3.2a reference is incorrect

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change 802.3-2018 to 802.3-2022

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **120** *L* **17** # 99

Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger

*Comment Type* **T** *Comment Status* **D**

There a power classes described from 0 to 11. However, for the mentioned Reference 30.15.1.1.6 have classes 0 to 15. Seems that they be missing

*SuggestedRemedy*

Include the classes

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Several comments made towards PSE reagrding missing objects and classes, will add editorial note to for contributions to complete PSE Yang modele

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **120** *L* **17** # 140

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **X**

We should split the power class enums into into seperate multipair-power-class and singlepair-power-class enumerations.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update enumeration.
Split into seperate multipair-power-class and singlepair-power-class enumerations.
30.9.1.1.8 aPSEPowerClassification goes from class 0 to class 8
30.15.1.1.6 aPoDLPSEDetectedPDPowerClass goes from class0 to class15.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Several comments made towards PSE reagrding missing objects and classes, will add editorial note to for contributions to complete PSE Yang modele

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **121** *L* **14** # 141

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

fix Clause 30 reference

*SuggestedRemedy*

change .6 to .8

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **121** *L* **24** # 142

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Clause 33 is two pair, clause 145 is 4 pair,

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "multi-pair" to "two-pair"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **121** *L* **34** # 143

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

add "four-pair" identity

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add
identity four-pair {
base pse-type;
description "PSE support IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 145.";

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **121** *L* **36** # 144

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Add "all-pairs" identity

*SuggestedRemedy*

add
identity all {
base powering-pairs;
description "All pairs are in use.";
}

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **121** *L* **37** # 145

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Add an identity for 802.3bt when using all 4 pairs.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add
identity all {
base powering-pairs;
description "All fours pairs are in use.";
}

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Seems that the suggested remedy overlaps with #144.

Add
identity four-pairs {
base powering-pairs;
description "All fours pairs are in use.";
}

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **121** *L* **42** # 146

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

language

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "The signal pair is in use." to "The signal pairs are in use."

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **121** *L* **47** # 147

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **ER** *Comment Status* **D**

language

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "The signal pair is in use." to "The signal pairs are in use."

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Row 47 dosent contain the suggested remedy, is this for Row 42 where remedy should be applied

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **122** *L* **7** # 148

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Doesn't include Clause 145.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change
"PSE may support IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 33 or IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 104."
to
"PSE supports one or more of IEEE Std 802.3 Clause 33, Clause 104 or Clause 145."

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editorial nit - missing "," before Clause 145.

Change
"PSE may support IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 33 or IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 104."
to
"PSE supports one or more of IEEE Std 802.3 Clause 33, Clause 104, or Clause 145."

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **122** *L* **31** # 149

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

This only app

*SuggestedRemedy*

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Comment is not clear

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **122** *L* **47** # 150

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

leaf pairs-control-ability only really applies to Clause 33.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add to description
"This applies when powering-pairs is equal to two-pair"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **122** *L* **60** # 151

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Missing aPSEPowerDetectionStatusA and aPSEPowerDetectionStatusB.

*SuggestedRemedy*

review need and add leaves if required

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Several comments made towards PSE reagrding missing objects and classes, will add editorial note to fro contributions to complete PSE Yang modele

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **123** *L* **24** # 152

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Why don't we include the set of aPSE<name>COunterA and aPSE<name>COunterB objects in the statistics container?

*SuggestedRemedy*

review need and add leaves if required

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Several comments made towards PSE reagrding missing objects and classes, will add editorial note to fro contributions to complete PSE Yang modele

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **123** *L* **38** # 153

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

fix Clause 30 reference

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change
"30.9.1.1.8 aPSEPowerDeniedCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.14 aPSEPowerDeniedCounter"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change
"30.9.1.1.8 aPSEPowerDeniedCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.14"

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **123** *L* **50** # 154

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

fix Clause 30 reference

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change
"30.9.1.1.7 aPSEInvalidSignatureCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.11 aPSEInvalidSignatureCounter"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change
"30.9.1.1.7 aPSEInvalidSignatureCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.11"

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **123** *L* **64** # 155

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

fix Clause 30 reference

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change
"30.9.1.1.11 aPSEMPSAbsentCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.20 aPSEMPSAbsentCounter"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change
"30.9.1.1.11 aPSEMPSAbsentCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.20"

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **124** *L* **11** # 157

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

fix Clause 30 reference

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change
"30.9.1.1.14 aPSECumulativeEnergy"
to
"30.9.1.1.25 aPSECumulativeEnergy"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change
"30.9.1.1.14 aPSECumulativeEnergy"
to
"30.9.1.1.25"

---

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **124** *L* **11** # 156

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

fix Clause 30 reference

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change
"30.9.1.1.9 aPSEOverLoadCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.17 aPSEOverLoadCounter"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change
"30.9.1.1.9 aPSEOverLoadCounter"
to
"30.9.1.1.17"

---

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **124** *L* **14** # 158

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Remove "leaf short", 30.9.1.1.10 aPSEShortCounter doesn't exist in 802.3-2022

*SuggestedRemedy*

Remove
leaf short {
……
}
or add aPSEShortCounter back into clause 30.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Remove leaf short

---

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **124** *L* **54** # 159

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

fix Clause 30 reference

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change
"30.9.1.1.12 aPSEActualPower"
to
"30.9.1.1.23 aPSEActualPower"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change
"30.9.1.1.12 aPSEActualPower"
to
"30.9.1.1.23"

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **125** *L* **2** # 160

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

fix Clause 30 reference

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change
"30.9.1.1.13 aPSEPowerAccuracy"
to
"30.9.1.1.24 aPSEPowerAccuracy"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change
"30.9.1.1.13 aPSEPowerAccuracy"
to
"30.9.1.1.24"

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **125** *L* **41** # 161

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Add " PSE" to descriptions, and add typeE and typeF

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change
enum typeA {
description "TypeA";
}
enum typeB {
description "TypeB";
}
enum typeC {
description "TypeC";
}
enum typeD {
description "TypeD";
}
To
enum typeA {
description "TypeA PSE";
}
enum typeB {
description "TypeB PSE";
}
enum typeC {
description "Type PSEC";
}
enum typeD {
description "TypeD PSE";
}
enum typeE {
description "TypeE PSE";
}
enum typeF {
description "TypeF PSE";
}

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **125** *L* **63** # 162

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Add Clause 30 refernce

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add
reference
"IEEE Std 802.3, 30.15.1.1.4 aPoDLPSEType"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add
reference
"IEEE Std 802.3, 30.15.1.1.4"

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **125** *L* **63** # 163

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Change Clause 104 reference to Clause 30

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change "802.3, 104.4.1" to "802.3 30.15.1.1.4 aPoDLPSEType"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change "802.3, 104.4.1" to "802.3, 30.15.1.1.4"

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **126** *L* **9** # 164

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Add " PD" to descriptions, and add typeE and typeF

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change
enum unknown {
description "Unknown";
}
enum typeA {
description "TypeA";
}
enum typeB {
description "TypeB";
}
enum typeC {
description "TypeC";
}
enum typeD {
description "TypeD";
}
To
enum unknown {
description "Unknown PD type";
}
enum typeA {
description "TypeA PD";
}
enum typeB {
description "TypeB PD";
}
enum typeC {
description "TypeC PD";
}
enum typeD {
description "TypeD PD";
}
enum typeE {
description "TypeE PD";
}
enum typeF {
description "TypeF PD";
}

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **6** *SC* **6.5.2** *P* **126** *L* **62** # 165

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Add "Discontinuities ..." text to container
See "container frame { " as example.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add
"Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **7** *SC* **7.4.2** *P* **154** *L* **1** # 166

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Add "Discontinuities ..." text to container
See "container frame { " as example.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add
"Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
Remove
"Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it difffers from the container level behaviour.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **7** *SC* **7.4.2** *P* **160** *L* **45** # 167

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Add "Discontinuities ..." text to container
See "container frame { " as example.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add
"Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuity-time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
Remove
"Discontinuities ..." text from leaves unless it difffers from the container level behaviour.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **7** *SC* **7.4.2** *P* **166** *L* **16** # 168

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Lots of leaves are "type int32; units 0.1 dBm", we should define a "power measurement" type.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add the following typedef and use it for any 0.1 dBm power measurement leaves.
typedef power-level{
type int32;
units "0.1 dBm";
Description
"Power level reflects the value of power, as measured at the optical transceiver, expressed in units of
0.1 dBm."
}

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **7** *SC* **7.4.2** *P* **167** *L* **39** # 169

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

container statistics-trx is not really statistics, change container name/description and trx-data-reliable description??

*SuggestedRemedy*

Fix naming - suggest "monitoring-trx"

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.4** *P* **190** *L* **1** # 182

Huber, Thomas Nokia

*Comment Type* **T** *Comment Status* **D**

Table 8-1 is missing a mapping for the attribute aOAMRemotePDUConfiguration (802.3-2022 clause 30.3.6.1.9)

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add an entry for attribute aOAMRemotePDUConfiguration, Reference 30.3.6.1.9, Container interfaces/interface/ethernet/link-oam/discovery-info/remote, data node oammtu

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.

Incomplete proposal at this time. The Editor will not be producing actual text to be added to the draft.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.4** *P* **190** *L* **1** # 184

Huber, Thomas Nokia

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D**

In the row for oAMLocalErr…, the Container is referencing a branch that doesn't exist in the tree in 8.5.1 (link-oam/link-monitor/event-type)

*SuggestedRemedy*

Align the Containers in the table and the tree in 8.5.1

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Regenerate all Yang Tree after upates to yang files for consistency

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.4** *P* **190** *L* **1** # 185

Huber, Thomas Nokia

*Comment Type* **T** *Comment Status* **D**

Table 8-1 is missing a mapping for the attribute aOAMRemoteRevision (802.3-2022 clause 30.3.6.1.13)

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add an entry for attribute aOAMRemoteRevision, Reference 30.3.6.1.13, Container interfaces/interface/ethernet/link-oam/discovery-info/remote, data node revision

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.

Incomplete proposal at this time. The Editor will not be producing actual text to be added to the draft.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.4** *P* **190** *L* **1** # 183

Huber, Thomas Nokia

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D**

The information in the References and Container(s) columns fo the attribute aOAMLocalConfiguration seem to be off - the first row points to 30.3.6.1.6, which is aOAMLocalConfiguration in 802.3, but the container is listed as interfaces/interface/ethernet/link-oam/ discovery-info/remote/functions-supported. The second reference is "aOAMLocalConfiguration" rather than a pointer to a specific clause in 802.3-2022

*SuggestedRemedy*

Update these rows as appropriate. It is not clear if the first row is really intended to be referencing 30.3.6.1.7 (and this aOAMRemoteConfiguration should also be listed in the Attribute(s) column), or if the Container listed is incorrect. For the second row, it would appear that maybe the Reference is supposed to be 30.3.6.1.6.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.4** *P* **192** *L* # 100

Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger

*Comment Type* **E** *Comment Status* **D**

"variable-requeste-rx" is not mentioned in the following text. However, "in-variable-request" is mentioned. If this is the correct connection, "aOAMVariableRequestTx (30.3.6.1.28) should be mentioned in the table too, because "out-variable-request" is also mentioned in the following text.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Adapt the data node column entry. Add aOAMVariableRequestTx to the table.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.

Incompolete proposal - please re-submit with highlighted specific changes.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.1** *P* **195** *L* **25** # 186

Huber, Thomas Nokia

*Comment Type* **T** *Comment Status* **D**

The tree is missing items related to the PME managed objects defined in clause 30.11.2 and MAC entity managed obects defined in clause 30.3.1.1

*SuggestedRemedy*

See separate file for detailed proposal for what to add.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Regenerate Yang tree per
https://www.ieee802.org/3/2/a/comments/D1.0/proposalsForComments13and17.pdf

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **197** *L* **22** # 170

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D** *revision*

Most, if not all, of the "revision" clauses are out of date. These should be updated as we issue drafts.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Add new revision clause for each module for each draft, we can remove them when we publish the standard, e.g.,
This should have been
revision 2019-11-28 {
description "802.3 TF review D1.0.";
}

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See comment #133

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **197** *L* **43** # 171

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D** *2018*

iana-if-type reference is out of date

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change iana-if-type@2018-07-03.yang to iana-if-type@2023-01-26.yang
Check and change for all modules

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **198** *L* **7** # 172

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D** *2018*

802.3 reference is incorrect

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change 802.3-2018 to 802.3-2022

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **198** *L* **16** # 173

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

Lots of references into clause 57, shouldn't these objects be defined in Clause 30?

*SuggestedRemedy*

remove cross-references to clause 57 from "references" clauses

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.

There is nothing wrong with references to clause 57.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **198** *L* **57** # 174

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

feature remote-mib-retrieval-initiate is badly names. We are not dealing with a MIB.

*SuggestedRemedy*

change "-mib-"- to "-data- "

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **202** *L* **54** # 175

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

I really don't like referring to RFC definitions that then refer back to 802.3.
What would happen if we changed behavior and no-one checked?
I think we should define object behaviors in these module/this document.
Comment applies to many of these references in the draft.
In this specific case dot3OamOperStatus refers back to [802.3ah] from 2004 and has about a page and a half of text in the description.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace RFC references items defined in 802.3 to with definitions and references into 802.3

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. The YANG modules included in this standard provide YANG versions of attributes defined in
IEEE Std 802.3TM-2022, Clause 30, as well as derivative attributes defined in other management information
bases (e.g., SNMP attributes included in IEEE Std 802.3.1, YANG versions of IETF Etherlike MIB
attributes, etc.).

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **202** *L* **65** # 176

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

The following description is out of date based on https://standards.ieee.org/products-programs/regauth/oui/
Description "24-bit Organizationally Unique Identifier.";

*SuggestedRemedy*

replace with "24-bit MAC addresses – large(MA–L). Previously know as Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI).";

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **203** *L* **2** # 177

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

incorrect reference

*SuggestedRemedy*

replace IEEE Std 802-2014, Clause 9" with "IEEE Std 802-2014, Clause 8.2.2";

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

replace IEEE Std 802-2014, Clause 9" with "IEEE Std 802-2014, 8.2.2";

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **209** *L* **22** # 187

Huber, Thomas Nokia

*Comment Type* **T** *Comment Status* **D**

The description for 'oammtu' could be improved to better reflect the meaning of the leaf

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change the description to "The maximum OAMPDU size for the remote node. The peer OAM entities exchange the maximum size they can support and negotiate to use the smaller of the two maximum OAMPDU sizes."

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **209** *L* **37** # 188

Huber, Thomas Nokia

*Comment Type* **T** *Comment Status* **D**

Description for 'mode' could be improved to better reflect the meaning of this leaf

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change the description to "This object configures the mode of OAM operation as active or passive. Active mode provides capabilities to initiate monitoring activities with the remote OAM peer eneity, while passive mode waits for the peer to initiate actions with it. Changing this value results in incrementing the revision field of locally generated OAM PDUs (30.3.6.1.12) and triggers the OAM discovery process if the operational state was alraedy 'operational'. The default value is implementation-dependent."

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **212** *L* **2** # 178

Jones, Peter Cisco

*Comment Type* **TR** *Comment Status* **D**

mib-retrieval is badly named. We are not dealing with a MIB.

*SuggestedRemedy*

change "-mib-"- to "-data- "
Change "MIB variable retrieval support." to "Variable retrieval support."

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **212** *L* **29** # 189

Huber, Thomas Nokia

*Comment Type* **T** *Comment Status* **D**

The description for 'oammtu' could be improved to better reflect the meaning of the leaf

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change the description to "The maximum OAMPDU size for the local node. The peer OAM entities exchange the maximum size they can support and negotiate to use the smaller of the two maximum OAMPDU sizes."

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

*Cl* **8** *SC* **8.5.2** *P* **217** *L* **1** # 190

Huber, Thomas Nokia

*Comment Type* **T** *Comment Status* **D**

PME managed objects defind in clause 30.11.2 of 802.3 can be retrieved as variable requests per clause 57.1.2 item c 2. A YANG definition for the managed objects in 30.3.1.1 should be added.

*SuggestedRemedy*

See separate file for detailed proposal for what to add. Note that the proposal has several open questions that need further discussion wrt whether some leaves are ro or rw.

*Proposed Response* *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See https://www.ieee802.org/3/2/a/comments/D1.0/proposalsForComments13and17.pdf for reference. Discussion needed at the TF.