

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI **FM** SC **FM** P**0** L**27** # **40**
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** *EZ*
 Something happened with the formatting in FM, where blocks of text are adjusted to both left and right side, for example page 1, lines 27-30.
SuggestedRemedy
 Please re-apply proper formatting in FM text to left adjust the text
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **00** SC **0** P**0** L**0** # **44**
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** *EZ*
 Document name is shown currently as "IEEE Draft P802.3.xx"
SuggestedRemedy
 Change to "IEEE Draft P802.3.2a"
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **2** SC **2** P**15** L**23** # **181**
 Huber, Thomas Nokia
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** *EZ*
 The reference to 802.3.1 should be updated to the 2023 version (802.3.1b) that is being developed.
SuggestedRemedy
 Change 2013 to 2023.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add editorial note to update to correct date once project is completed

CI **2** SC **2** P**17** L**21** # **42**
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** *EZ*
 Potentially outdated reference to 802.3.1 standard
SuggestedRemedy
 Add editorial note to update reference to 802.3.1 from 2013 to 2024 when the work on that project is finished and the new standard is published.
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

CI **4** SC **4** P**18** L # **103**
 Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** *EZ*
 Abbreviations in general seems to be very short, compared to the "Ethernet SMIv2 Data Model" specification. Compared to this document, abbreviations like "ONU" (Page 131), "OLT" (Page 131), "TDM" (Page 131), "LLID" (Page 131), "TDMA" (Page 131), "MPCP" (Page 131), "WDM" (Page 131) should be included
SuggestedRemedy
 Include missing abbreviations for readers convenience
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add missing abbreviations to Chapter 4

CI **4** SC **4** P**18** L**11** # **101**
 Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** *EZ*
 Search for EFM indicates, that it is only mentioned in the abbreviations.
SuggestedRemedy
 Remove EFM from abbreviations
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 4 SC 4 P18 L22 # 102
 Schreiner, Stephan Rosenberger
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "PoE" is mentioned in the abbreviations, however "PoDL" isn't. Both appears on page 114 Line 15 in close proximity to each other
 SuggestedRemedy
 Include PoDL in abbreviations
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3 P37 L1 # 46
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Given the size of the some of the YANG trees, and how text breaks across lines, please consider changing page orientation for all YANG tree sections into horizontal
 SuggestedRemedy
 Per comment, applicable to all YANG tree sections
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.2 P19 L19 # 58
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Missing reference to table 5-2,5-3
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add reference to table 5-2 and 5-3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add missing yang and their respective Tables

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P53 L29 # 61
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 IEEE 802.3,
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update to reference IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3 P25 L # 59
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Green colour for text in table 5-6
 SuggestedRemedy
 Correct colour of font to black for Table 5-6
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P74 L74 # 65
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 30.14.1.3"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P75 L19 # 66
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.14.1.6";
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P75 L31 # 67
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 (see Figure 99?)
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3 figure 99-5
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P76 L50 # 71
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.14.1.2";
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P75 L34 # 68
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.14.1.7"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P77 L17 # 72
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.14.1.5"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P75 L65 # 69
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 30.14.1.1"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P77 L35 # 73
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.14.1.8"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P76 L12 # 70
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 The Verify State diagram (Figure 99?)
 SuggestedRemedy
 The Verify State diagram Figure 99-8 in IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P78 L2 # 74
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.14.1.10";
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P78 L15 # 75
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 30.14.1.11";
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P78 L29 # 76
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.14.1.12";
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P78 L40 # 77
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 30.14.1.13";
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update with reference to IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P79 L37 # 79
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.2.1.5 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022"
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.5
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.5"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P79 L58 # 80
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.2.1.9 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.9
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.9"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P80 L31 # 81
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 30.12.2.1.10 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.10
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.10"

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P81 L7 # 82
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.3.1.26 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.3.1.26
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.3.1.26"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P83 L9 # 85
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 30.12.2.1.16 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.16
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.16"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P82 L1 # 83
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.3.1.28 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022"
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.3.1.28
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.3.1.28"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P83 L63 # 86
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 30.12.2.1.15 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.15
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.15"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P82 L43 # 84
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 30.12.2.1.29 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.29
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.29"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P84 L23 # 87
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 30.12.2.1.23 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022"
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.23
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.23"

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P84 L48 # 88
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.2.1.24 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.24
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.24"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L20 # 91
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L9 # 89
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.2.1.25 of IEEE Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.2.1.25
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.2.1.25"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L25 # 92
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L13 # 90
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 802.3
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L31 # 93
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L36 # 94
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L52 # 97
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L42 # 95
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L60 # 98
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P85 L47 # 96
 Parkholm, Ulf Ericsson
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std 802.3-2022";
 SuggestedRemedy
 IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 30.12.1.1.1
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Use "IEEE Std 802.3, 30.12.1.1.1"

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P57 L50 # 112
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
 Typo
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change "once ..." to "once."
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.