IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/FM SC FM	P 0	L 27	# 40	C/ 00	SC 0	P 0	LO	# 44	
Hajduczenia, Marek	Charter Com	munication		Hajduczen	ia, Marek	Charter Com	nunication		
Comment Type E Comm	ent Status X			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X			
Something happened with the fo			are adjusted to both	Docum	nent name is sl	hown currently as "IEEE Draft I	P802.3.xx"		
left and right side, for example pa	age 1, lines 27-30.			Suggested	Remedy				
SuggestedRemedy				Chang	e to "IEEE Dra	ft P802.3.2a"			
Please re-apply proper formatting	g in FM text to left	adjust the text		Proposed I	Response	Response Status 0			
Proposed Response Respon	nse Status O								
C/FM SC FM	P 9	L17	# 00	CI 2	SC 2	P15	L 21	# 41	
	•		# 39	Hajduczen	ia, Marek	Charter Com	nunication		
Hajduczenia, Marek	Charter Com	imunication		Comment	Type E	Comment Status X			
51	ent Status X			Outdat	ed reference to	o 802.3 standard			
Missing list of participants				Suggested	Remedy				
SuggestedRemedy				Replac	e 2018 with 20)22			
Fill in the list of participants of the				Proposed I	Response	Response Status 0			
Proposed Response Respor	nse Status O								
	Р		# 470	CI 2	SC 2	P15	L 21	# 180	
C/ 00 SC 0		L	# 179	Huber, Tho	omas	Nokia			
Huber, Thomas	Nokia			Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X			
	ent Status X			The ref	ference to 802.	.3 should be to the 2022 version	n		
There appears to be a problem v file not being aligned with the tex oui (which appears on page 202	t of the PDF. As a	specific example	, the typedef vendor-	Suggested. Change	Remedy e 2018 to 2022	2			
module in the zip is a hex-string.	As another examp	ole, the leaf "out-in	nformation" in the PDF	Proposed I		Response Status 0			
(page 205) is named "information most of the files in the zip is 201 predating even the 2019 version	8-03-14, so perhap								
SuggestedRemedy				Cl 2	SC 2	P15	L 23	# 181	
Figure out what happened to cau	ise divergence bet	ween the text of t	he PDF 802.3.2a_D1.0	Huber, Tho	omas	Nokia			
and the YANG modules in the ZI				Comment	Type E	Comment Status X			
file. For the modules to be usefu Proposed Response Respon	i, they need to aliginate Status O	n with the hormat	ve text in the PDF.	The ref develo		.3.1 should be updated to the	2023 version (80	2.3.1b) that is being	
				Suggested	Remedy				
				Change	e 2013 to 2023	3.			

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SC 2 12/21/2023 8:22:15 AM SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

	P17	L 21	# 42	C/ 4 SC 4	P18	L 22	# 100
lajduczenia, Marek	Charter Comm		# 42	Schreiner, Stephan	Rosenberger		# 102
omment Type E	Comment Status X	iunication		Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
Potentially outdated r	reference to 802.3.1 standard				in the abbreviations, however "P	'oDL" isn't. Both	appears on page 114
uggestedRemedy	update reference to 802.3.1 fror	m 2013 to 2024	when the work on that	SuggestedRemedy			
	d the new standard is published			Include PoDL in abb	reviations		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
X 4 SC 4	P18	L	# 103	C/ 5 SC 5.1	P 19	L 4	# 57
Schreiner, Stephan	Rosenberger			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	eral seems to be very short, con			Yang Module structu	ire missing Mac Merge descripti	on	
"OLT" (Page 131), "T	Compared to this document, at DM" (Page 131), "LLID" (Page Page 131) should be included			SuggestedRemedy Add MAC Merge des	scription		
SuggestedRemedy				Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
Include missing abbr	eviations for readers convenien	се					
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			C/ 5 SC 5.2	P19	L 19	# 58
				Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
C/4 SC 4	P 18	L11	# 101	Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
Schreiner, Stephan	Rosenberger			Missing reference to	table 5-2,5-3		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			SuggestedRemedy			
Search for EFM indic	ates, that it is only mentioned ir	n the abbreviati	ons.	Add reference to tab	le 5-2 and 5-3		
SuggestedRemedy Remove EFM from a	bbreviations			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			C/ 5 SC 5.2	P 20	L1	# 43
				Hajduczenia, Marek	Charter Com	nunication	
				Comment Type ER No page numbers or	Comment Status X	er	
				SuggestedRemedy Please make sure th	nat pages and line numbers are s	shown on horizo	ontal pages

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/ 5
 Page 2 of 26

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SC 5.2
 12/21/2023 8:22:15 AM

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC 5.2
 12/21/2023 8:22:15 AM

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.2	P 25	<i>L</i> 1	# 45	C/ 5	SC 5.2.3.4	P 79	L 37	# 135
Hajduczenia, Marek	Charter Com	munication		Jones, Peter		Cisco		
Comment Type ER	Comment Status X			Comment Typ	be ER	Comment Status X		
0	Table 5-6 uses green color				-2022" from fo comment is a	bllowing referecnes to 802.3, in ccepted.	t's included in th	ne revision clause, if my
SuggestedRemedy Change to default of	color for normal text			SuggestedRe		E Std 802.3-2022" to "IEEE S	td 902 2" in ron	noindor of this VANC
Proposed Response	Response Status O			module		E 510 602.3-2022 10 TEEE 3		namuel of this FANG
				Proposed Res	sponse	Response Status O		
CI 5 SC 5.2.3.	4 P 79	L 12	# 133					
Jones, Peter	Cisco			C/ 5	SC 5.2.3.4	P 85	L11	# 136
Comment Type ER	Comment Status X			Jones, Peter		Cisco		
issue drafts.				Comment Typ Formattin	na issues on n	nany of the leaf descriptions in	n this augments	clause
SuggestedRemedy	een 8 {	draft, we can rem	ove them when we	Formattin SuggestedRe fix format Proposed Res	emedy ting sponse	nany of the leaf descriptions in Response Status O		
SuggestedRemedy Add new revision c publish the standar This should have b revision 2019-11-2 description "802.3" }	rd, e.g., een 8 {	draft, we can rem	ove them when we	Formattin SuggestedRe fix format Proposed Res	emedy ting		n this augments	# [<u>137</u>
SuggestedRemedy Add new revision c publish the standar This should have b revision 2019-11-20	rd, e.g., een 8 { TF review D1.0.";	draft, we can rem	ove them when we	Formattin SuggestedRe fix format Proposed Res	emedy ting sponse	Response Status O		
SuggestedRemedy Add new revision c publish the standar This should have b revision 2019-11-2 description "802.3" } Proposed Response	rd, e.g., een 8 { TF review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> O			Formattin SuggestedRe fix format Proposed Res CI 5	ermedy ting sponse SC 5.2.3.4	Response Status 0 P 92		
SuggestedRemedy Add new revision c publish the standar This should have b revision 2019-11-2 description "802.3" } Proposed Response	rd, e.g., een 8 { TF review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> O	draft, we can rem	ove them when we # 134	Formattin SuggestedRe fix format Proposed Res C/ 5 Jones, Peter Comment Typ	ermedy ting sponse SC 5.2.3.4 De TR the leafs use	Response Status 0 P 92 Cisco	L 13	# [137
SuggestedRemedy Add new revision c publish the standar This should have b revision 2019-11-2 description "802.3" } Proposed Response	rd, e.g., een 8 { TF review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> 0 4 <i>P</i> 79 Cisco			Formattin SuggestedRe fix format Proposed Res CI 5 Jones, Peter Comment Typ Some of t	ermedy ting sponse SC 5.2.3.4 De TR the leafs use it.	Response Status O P92 Cisco Comment Status X	L 13	# <u>137</u>
SuggestedRemedy Add new revision c publish the standar This should have b revision 2019-11-2i description "802.3" } Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.2.3. Jones, Peter Comment Type ER 802.3.2a reference	rd, e.g., een 8 { TF review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> 0 4 P79 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X			Formattin SuggestedRe fix format Proposed Res CI 5 Jones, Peter Comment Typ Some of f consisten SuggestedRe Change"/	ermedy ting sponse SC 5.2.3.4 De TR the leafs use tt. ermedy	Response Status O P 92 Cisco Comment Status X "A SET attribute"/"A GET attri A read-write" and change	L13	# [<u>137</u> e use "read-only". Be
SuggestedRemedy Add new revision c publish the standar This should have b revision 2019-11-2i description "802.3" } Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.2.3. Jones, Peter Comment Type ER	rd, e.g., een 8 { TF review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> 0 4 P79 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X is incorrect			Formattin SuggestedRe fix format Proposed Res CI 5 Jones, Peter Comment Typ Some of f consisten SuggestedRe Change"/	ermedy ting sponse SC 5.2.3.4 De TR the leafs use it. ermedy A SET" to " t the clause/n	Response Status O P 92 Cisco Comment Status X "A SET attribute"/"A GET attri A read-write" and change	L13	# [<u>137</u> e use "read-only". Be

C/ 5 SC **5.2.3.4**

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.3	P 25	L	# 59	CI 5 SC 5.3	.2 P4	9 L 10	# 47
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Hajduczenia, Marek	Char	ter Communication	
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	R Comment Status	X	
Green colour for text	in table 5-6				b.com/YangModels/yang/ti	ee/master/standard/ie	ee/published/802.3 lead
SuggestedRemedy					nd needs to be updated		
Correct colour of font	to black for Table 5-6			SuggestedRemedy			
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			https://github.cor https://github.cor	RLs to YANG modules fror n/YangModels/yang/tree/m n/YangModels/yang/tree/m y. Multiple locations in the o	aster/standard/ieee/pu ain/standard/ieee/pub	
C/ 5 SC 5.3	P 37	L 1	# 46	Proposed Response	Response Status	0	
Hajduczenia, Marek	Charter Com	munication					
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			C/ 5 SC 5.3	. 2 P4	9 <i>L</i> 10	# 48
Given the size of the	some of the YANG trees, and age orientation for all YANG tre	how text breaks	across lines, please	Hajduczenia, Marek		ter Communication	# 40
consider changing pa	ige one filation for all TANO the		10112011121	i lajuuczenia, marek	Cilai		
uggestedRemedy				Comment Type E	P Comment Status	Y	
	able to all YANG tree sections			21	R Comment Status		URL contains the 2019
Per comment, applica	able to all YANG tree sections Response Status O			All URLs should	R Comment Status be prefaces with editorial n odules right now and new v	ote to indicate that the	
Per comment, applica				All URLs should version of the mo	be prefaces with editorial n	ote to indicate that the	
Per comment, applica Proposed Response		L1	# 104	All URLs should version of the mo been approved SuggestedRemedy Per comment, ap	be prefaces with editorial n odules right now and new v oplicable to all YANG section	ote to indicate that the ersions will be publish	ed once the standard ha
Per comment, applica Proposed Response	Response Status O	L1	# 104	All URLs should version of the mo been approved SuggestedRemedy Per comment, ap We also need to	be prefaces with editorial n odules right now and new v oplicable to all YANG section push the existing "publishe	ote to indicate that the ersions will be publish ons ed" modules into 2019	ed once the standard ha
Proposed Response	Response Status O	L1	# 104	All URLs should version of the mo been approved SuggestedRemedy Per comment, ap We also need to	be prefaces with editorial n odules right now and new v oplicable to all YANG section	ote to indicate that the ersions will be publish ons ed" modules into 2019	ed once the standard ha
Per comment, applica Proposed Response 2/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Jones, Peter Comment Type T Need to pull some mi In 802.3.1 these com from IANA-MAU-MIB.	Response Status O P49 Cisco Comment Status X issing content from oPHYEntity e in as IANAifMauTypeListBits	y, at least_aPhy and ifMauType	Type and aPhyTypeList. (AutonomousType)	All URLs should version of the mo been approved SuggestedRemedy Per comment, ap We also need to and update the re	be prefaces with editorial n odules right now and new v oplicable to all YANG section push the existing "publishe	ote to indicate that the ersions will be publish ons d" modules into 2019 ge to make sure peop	ed once the standard ha
Per comment, applica Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 Jones, Peter Comment Type T Need to pull some mid In 802.3.1 these com from IANA-MAU-MIB, we need the equivale	Response Status O P49 Cisco Comment Status X issing content from oPHYEntity e in as IANAifMauTypeListBits	y, at least_aPhy and ifMauType	Type and aPhyTypeList. (AutonomousType)	All URLs should version of the mo been approved SuggestedRemedy Per comment, ap We also need to and update the ro is.	be prefaces with editorial n odules right now and new v oplicable to all YANG section push the existing "publishe eadme file on the github pa <i>Response Status</i>	ote to indicate that the ersions will be publish ons d" modules into 2019 ge to make sure peop O	ed once the standard ha
Per comment, applica Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 Jones, Peter Comment Type T Need to pull some mi In 802.3.1 these com from IANA-MAU-MIB we need the equivale SuggestedRemedy	Response Status O P49 Cisco Comment Status X issing content from oPHYEntity e in as IANAifMauTypeListBits nt definitions and attributes for	y, at least_aPhy and ifMauType	Type and aPhyTypeList. (AutonomousType)	All URLs should version of the mo been approved SuggestedRemedy Per comment, ap We also need to and update the re is. Proposed Response	be prefaces with editorial n odules right now and new v oplicable to all YANG section push the existing "publishe eadme file on the github pa <i>Response Status</i>	ote to indicate that the ersions will be publish ons ed" modules into 2019 ige to make sure peop O 0 L3	ed once the standard ha
Per comment, applica Proposed Response C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Jones, Peter Comment Type T Need to pull some mid In 802.3.1 these com from IANA-MAU-MIB. we need the equivale SuggestedRemedy Define new tables/lead This will need some w	Response Status O P49 Cisco Comment Status X issing content from oPHYEntity e in as IANAifMauTypeListBits nt definitions and attributes for	y, at least aPhy and ifMauType the YANG mod group.	Type and aPhyTypeList. (AutonomousType)	All URLs should version of the mo been approved SuggestedRemedy Per comment, ap We also need to and update the re is. Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3 Parkholm, Ulf Comment Type	be prefaces with editorial n odules right now and new v oplicable to all YANG section push the existing "publishe eadme file on the github par <i>Response Status</i> .2 P5 Erics	ote to indicate that the ersions will be publish ons d' modules into 2019 ge to make sure peop 0 0 <i>L</i> 3 son	ed once the standard ha
Per comment, applica Proposed Response C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Jones, Peter Comment Type T Need to pull some mid In 802.3.1 these com from IANA-MAU-MIB. we need the equivale SuggestedRemedy Define new tables/lead This will need some w	Response Status O P49 Cisco Comment Status X issing content from oPHYEntity e in as IANAifMauTypeListBits	y, at least aPhy and ifMauType the YANG mod group.	Type and aPhyTypeList. (AutonomousType)	All URLs should version of the mo been approved SuggestedRemedy Per comment, ap We also need to and update the re- is. Proposed Response CI 5 SC 5.3 Parkholm, Ulf Comment Type E Reference to IEE SuggestedRemedy	be prefaces with editorial n odules right now and new v oplicable to all YANG section push the existing "publishe eadme file on the github part <i>Response Status</i> .2 P5 Erics <i>Comment Status</i>	ote to indicate that the ersions will be publish ons od" modules into 2019 ige to make sure peop O 0 <i>L</i> 3 son X	ed once the standard ha

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.3.2	P 53	L 29	# 61	CI 5 SC 5.3.2	P 73	L61	# 64
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E IEEE 802.3,	Comment Status X			Comment Type E "IEEE Std 802.3-201	Comment Status X 18";		
SuggestedRemedy Update to reference II	EEE Std 802.3			SuggestedRemedy "IEEE Std 802.3-202	22";		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 67	L 26	# 62	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P74	L 74	# 65
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E "IEEE Std 802.3-2018	Comment Status X			Comment Type E 30.14.1.3"	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Update to "IEEE Std 8	802.3-2022, unless dated expl	icitly";		Update with reference	ce to IEEE Std 802.3		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
CI 5 SC 5.3.2	P 73	L 53	# 63	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 75	L 19	# 66
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
	cated, the references in this m	odel module are	to IEEE Std 802.3-	"30.14.1.6";			
2018.";				SuggestedRemedy			
SuggestedRemedy	es in this model module are to		2-2018 unless dated	Update with reference	ce to IEEE Std 802.3		
explicitly";		TEEE Std 802.3	-2010, unless ualeu	Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
Proposed Response	Response Status O						
				C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 75	L 31	# 67
				Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
				Comment Type E (see Figure 99?)	Comment Status X		
				SuggestedRemedy			
				Update with reference	ce to IEEE Std 802.3 figure 99-5)	

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SO

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SO
 SO
 SO

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Page 5 of 26 12/21/2023 8:22:15 AM

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P75	L 34	# 68	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P77	L17	# 72
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E "30.14.1.7"	Comment Status X			Comment Type E "30.14.1.5"	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Update with reference	e to IEEE Std 802.3			Update with reference	to IEEE Std 802.3		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
CI 5 SC 5.3.2	P 75	L 65	# 69	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 77	L 35	# 73
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E 30.14.1.1"	Comment Status X			<i>Comment Type</i> E "30.14.1.8"	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Update with reference	e to IEEE Std 802.3			Update with reference	to IEEE Std 802.3		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 76	L 12	# 70	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 78	L 2	# 74
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E The Verify State diagr	Comment Status X ram (Figure 99?)			<i>Comment Type</i> E "30.14.1.10";	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
The Verify State diagr	am Figure 99-8 in IEEE Std 8	02.3		Update with reference	to IEEE Std 802.3		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 76	L 50	# 71	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 78	L15	# 75
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E "30.14.1.2";	Comment Status X			Comment Type E 30.14.1.11";	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy Update with reference	to IEEE Std 802.3			SuggestedRemedy Update with reference	to IEEE Std 802.3		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/ 5

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SC 5.3.2

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC 5.3.2
 SC 5.3.2

l

Page 6 of 26 12/21/2023 8:22:15 AM

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.3.2	P 78	L 29	# 76	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 79	L 58	# 80
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E "30.14.1.12";	Comment Status X			Comment Type E "30.12.2.1.9 of IEEE St	Comment Status X d IEEE Std 802.3-2022";		
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Update with reference to	IEEE Std 802.3			IEEE Std 802.3, Clause	9 30.12.2.1.9		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
CI 5 SC 5.3.2	P 78	L 40	# 77	Cl 5 SC 5.3.2	P 80	L31	# 81
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
<i>Comment Type</i> E 30.14.1.13";	Comment Status X			Comment Type E 30.12.2.1.10 of IEEE St	Comment Status X ad IEEE Std 802.3-2022";		
SuggestedRemedy Update with reference to	IEEE Std 802.3			SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Clause	30.12.2.1.10		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 79	L 16	# 78	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P81	L 7	# 82
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E IEEE Std 802.3.2a, unles	Comment Status X s dated explicitly"			Comment Type E "30.12.3.1.26 of IEEE S	Comment Status X Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";		
SuggestedRemedy Update with IEEE Std 802	2.3-2022			SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Clause	30.12.3.1.26		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 79	L 37	# 79	Cl 5 SC 5.3.2	P82	L1	# 83
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E "30.12.2.1.5 of IEEE Std	Comment Status X IEEE Std 802.3-2022"			Comment Type E "30.12.3.1.28 of IEEE S	Comment Status X Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022"		
SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 3	0.12.2.1.5			SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Clause	30.12.3.1.28		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 CI

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SC

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Page 7 of 26 12/21/2023 8:22:15 AM

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P82	L 43	# 84	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P84	L 48	# 88
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E 30.12.2.1.29 of IEE	Comment Status X E Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";			Comment Type E "30.12.2.1.24 of IEEE Sto	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Cla	ause 30.12.2.1.29			SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 3	30.12.2.1.24		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 83	L 9	# 85	Cl 5 SC 5.3.2	P 85	L 9	# 89
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E 30.12.2.1.16 of IEEI	Comment Status X E Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";			Comment Type E 30.12.2.1.25 of IEEE Std	Comment Status X IEEE Std 802.3-2022";		
SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Cla	ause 30.12.2.1.16			SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 3	30.12.2.1.25		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 83	L 63	# 86	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 85	L13	# 90
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E 30.12.2.1.15 of IEE	Comment Status X E Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022";			Comment Type E 802.3	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Cla	ause 30.12.2.1.15			SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P84	L 23	# 87	Cl 5 SC 5.3.2	P 85	L 20	# 91
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E 30.12.2.1.23 of IEEI	Comment Status X E Std IEEE Std 802.3-2022"			Comment Type E "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE Std	Comment Status X 802.3-2022";		
SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Cla	ause 30.12.2.1.23			SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 3	30.12.1.1.1		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/ 5

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
 SC 5.3.2

 SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
 SC 5.3.2
 SC 5.3.2

Page 8 of 26 12/21/2023 8:22:15 AM

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.3.2	P 85	L 25	# 92	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 85	L 47	# 96
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE	Comment Status X Std 802.3-2022";			Comment Type E "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE S	Comment Status X Std 802.3-2022";		
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
IEEE Std 802.3, Cla	use 30.12.1.1.1			IEEE Std 802.3, Claus	se 30.12.1.1.1		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 85	L 31	# 93	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 85	L 52	# 97
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Comment Type E	Comment Status X		
"30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE	Std 802.3-2022";			"30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE S	Std 802.3-2022";		
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
IEEE Std 802.3, Cla	use 30.12.1.1.1			IEEE Std 802.3, Claus	se 30.12.1.1.1		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 85	L 36	# 94	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 85	L 60	# 98
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson			Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson		
Comment Type E "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE	Comment Status X Std 802.3-2022";			Comment Type E "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE S	Comment Status X Std 802.3-2022";		
SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Cla	use 30.12.1.1.1			SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Claus	se 30.12.1.1.1		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	P 85	L 42	# 95				
Parkholm, Ulf	Ericsson						
Comment Type E "30.12.1.1.1 of IEEE	Comment Status X Std 802.3-2022";						
SuggestedRemedy IEEE Std 802.3, Cla	use 30 12 1 1 1						
Proposed Response	Response Status 0						

CI 5 SC 5.3.2

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 5	SC 5.3.2.1	P 49	L 15	# 49	CI 5	SC 5.3.2.1	P 49	L 45	# 106
Hajducze	nia, Marek	Charter Com	munication		Jones, Pete	r	Cisco		
Commen	Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment T	vpe TR	Comment Status X		
		NG modules included in the	draft do not mate	ch the approved YANG	iana-if-t	ype reference i	is out of date		
	les published at	Models/yang/tree/main/stan	dard/ieee/nublish	ned/802 3 Not sure	SuggestedF	Remedy			
when		ened but the baseline modul				iana-if-type@2 and change for	2018-07-03.yang to iana-if-typ all modules	be@2023-01-26.y	yang
Suggeste	dRemedy				Proposed R	esponse	Response Status 0		
	n all existing YAN								
		Models/yang/tree/main/stan st changes (there are 4-5 lo			CI 5	SC 5.3.2.1	P 50	LO	# 51
Then	apply on top any o	changes per comments from	n this ballot. Make	e sure that the modules	Hajduczenia	a. Marek	Charter Com	munication	
		from a local txt file and keep es in a zip file as well to facil		lated as needed.	Comment T		Comment Status X		
Proposed	•	Response Status O	5		Insert a	new revision s	statement to cover the alignme	ont with 802 3-20)22 and any published
1 1000000	Response				amendr			Chi With 002.0 20	
	Response					nents			
	SC 5.3.2.1	P 49	L 24	# 105	amendr SuggestedF	nents Remedy	ble to all YANG	Sint With 602.3 20	
Cl 5	SC 5.3.2.1	· -	L 24	# 105	amendr SuggestedF	nents <i>Remedy</i> nment, applical	, i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i		
C/ 5 Jones, Pe	SC 5.3.2.1	P 49	L 24	# 105	amendr <i>SuggestedF</i> Per con	nents <i>Remedy</i> nment, applical	ble to all YANG		
CI 5 Jones, Pe Comment Most,	SC 5.3.2.1 eter <i>Type</i> ER	P 49 Cisco			amendr <i>SuggestedF</i> Per con	nents <i>Remedy</i> nment, applical	ble to all YANG	L3	# <u>50</u>
CI 5 Jones, Pe Comment Most, issue	SC 5.3.2.1 eter <i>Type</i> ER if not all, of the "	P 49 Cisco Comment Status X			amendr SuggestedF Per con Proposed R	nents Remedy Inment, applical esponse SC 5.3.2.1	ble to all YANG Response Status O	L 3	
C/ 5 Jones, Pe Comment Most, issue Suggeste Add r	SC 5.3.2.1 eter <i>Type</i> ER if not all, of the " drafts. dRemedy new revision clause	P 49 Cisco Comment Status X 'revision" clauses are out of e for each module for each o	date. These shou	uld be updated as we	amendr SuggestedF Per con Proposed R CI 5	nents Remedy Inment, applical esponse SC 5.3.2.1 a, Marek	ble to all YANG Response Status O P 50	L 3	
CI 5 Jones, Po Comment Most, issue Suggeste Add r publis	SC 5.3.2.1 eter <i>Type</i> ER if not all, of the " drafts. <i>dRemedy</i> new revision clause th the standard, e.	P 49 Cisco Comment Status X 'revision" clauses are out of e for each module for each o	date. These shou	uld be updated as we	amendr SuggestedF Per con Proposed R Cl 5 Hajduczenia Comment T	nents Remedy Inment, applical esponse SC 5.3.2.1 a, Marek ype ER	ble to all YANG <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 50 Charter Com	L 3	
CI 5 Jones, Po Comment Issue Suggeste Add r publis This revisi	SC 5.3.2.1 eter <i>Type</i> ER if not all, of the drafts. <i>dRemedy</i> new revision clause th the standard, e. should have been on 2019-11-28 {	P 49 Cisco Comment Status X 'revision" clauses are out of e for each module for each o g.,	date. These shou	uld be updated as we	amendr SuggestedF Per con Proposed R Cl 5 Hajduczenia Comment T	nents Remedy Inment, applical esponse SC 5.3.2.1 a, Marek ype ER all references	ble to all YANG <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 50 Charter Com <i>Comment Status</i> X	L 3	
Cl 5 Jones, Pe Comment Most, issue Suggeste Add r publis This revisi	SC 5.3.2.1 eter <i>Type</i> ER if not all, of the " drafts. <i>dRemedy</i> new revision clause th the standard, e. should have been	P 49 Cisco Comment Status X 'revision" clauses are out of e for each module for each o g.,	date. These shou	uld be updated as we	amendr SuggestedF Per con Proposed R CI 5 Hajduczenia Comment T Update SuggestedF	nents Remedy Inment, applical esponse SC 5.3.2.1 a, Marek ype ER all references	ble to all YANG <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 50 Charter Com <i>Comment Status</i> X for 802.3 from 2018 to 2022.	L 3	
Cl 5 Jones, Po Comment Most, issue Suggeste Add r publis This s revisi descr }	SC 5.3.2.1 eter <i>Type</i> ER if not all, of the drafts. <i>dRemedy</i> new revision clause th the standard, e. should have been on 2019-11-28 {	P 49 Cisco Comment Status X 'revision" clauses are out of e for each module for each o g.,	date. These shou	uld be updated as we	amendr SuggestedF Per con Proposed R CI 5 Hajduczenia Comment T Update SuggestedF	nents Remedy Inment, applical esponse SC 5.3.2.1 a, Marek ype ER all references Remedy oble to all YANG	ble to all YANG <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 50 Charter Com <i>Comment Status</i> X for 802.3 from 2018 to 2022.	L 3	

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI5 SC 5.	3.2.1	P 50	L3	# 107	C/ 5	SC	5.3.2.1	P 55	L 24	# 109
Jones, Peter		Cisco			Jones, P	eter		Cisco		
Comment Type	TR Comm	nent Status X			Commen	t Type	TR	Comment Status X		
802.3 reference	is out of date							to all objects in this contained		
SuggestedRemedy								level and don't repeat at the " text to container and remo		
	2018 to 802.3-20 nge for all module							" as example.		
	0				Suggeste	edRemea	ły			
Proposed Respons	e Respoi	nse Status O			Add "Diag	o o ti o u iti	aa in tha s	voluce of counters in this con	tainar ann annur	ot to initialization of
								values of counters in this con em, and at other times as inc		
CI 5 SC 5.	3.2.1	P 54	L 20	# 108			ined in the	e ietf-interfaces YANG modu	Ile (IETF RFC 83	343). ";
Jones, Peter		Cisco			Rem "Disc		as "tovi	from leaves unless it difffers	s from the contai	ner level behaviour
Comment Type	TR Comm	nent Status X			Proposed			Response Status O		
Define at the co repeated "Disco	ntainer level and ntinuities" tex		e leaf level.		C/ 5		5.3.2.1	P55	L 46	# 140
	nuities" text to frame { " as exan	container and remonstruction container and remon	ove from objects.		Jones, P		5.3.2.1	Cisco	L 40	# 110
SuggestedRemedy					Commen	t Type	TR	Comment Status X		
the manageme time' leaf defin Remove	ent system, and a ed in the ietf-inter	at other times as inc rfaces YANG modu	dicated by the value (IETF RFC 83	at re-initialization of ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). "; ner level behaviour.	PFC PFC 802.1 direc	functiona uses the IAC-2010 tly to the	ality is in o M_CON 6 13.1 Eth correspo	802.3.2 objects by reference defined in 802.1Q clause 36. IROL primitives defined in 8 hernet convergence function nding 802.3 MA_CONTROL ame handling in Clause 31,	02.1AC-2016 11 says that the pa primitives .	rameters are passed
Proposed Respons	e Respoi	nse Status O			Opco	des are		31.5 Annex 31A, and PFC handl 3 do not count the PFC mess		D. The state machines
					Suggeste	dRemea	ły			
							ames-pfc ause 30 c	& out-frames-pfc		

Proposed Response Response Status **0**

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P 57	L 43	# 111	C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P 57	L 59	# 114
Jones, Peter	Cisco			Jones, Peter	Cisco		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment Type ER	Comment Status X		
	ply to all objects in this containe			Should only refer to the	e MAC Client		
	ner level and don't repeat at the	leaf level.		SuggestedRemedy			
SuggestedRemedy				Change "the LLC " to "	the MAC Client"		
Remove "Also see the conform to this stand	he 'description' statement" tex dard.	t from objects ur	nless they do not	Proposed Response	Response Status O		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0						
				C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P 60	L17	# 115
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1	P 57	L 50	# 112	Jones, Peter	Cisco		
Jones, Peter	Cisco			Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
Comment Type E	Comment Status X			Poorly worded			
Туро				SuggestedRemedy			
SuggestedPeriody				replace			
Change "once" to	"once." Response Status O			"This count effectively added together." with "This counter is calcula aFrameCheckSequence	comprises aFrameCheckSec ated by summing the followin ceErrors +		0
SuggestedRemedy Change "once" to Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1	Response Status O	L 54	# 113	"This count effectively added together." with "This counter is calcula aFrameCheckSequenc aAlignmentErrors"	ted by summing the followin EFrrors +		0
Change "once" to Proposed Response	Response Status O	L 54	# [113	"This count effectively added together." with "This counter is calcula aFrameCheckSequence	ated by summing the followin		0
Change "once" to Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Jones, Peter Comment Type ER	Response Status O P 57 Cisco Comment Status X	L 54	# <u>113</u>	"This count effectively added together." with "This counter is calcula aFrameCheckSequenc aAlignmentErrors" Proposed Response	ated by summing the followin ceErrors + <i>Response Status</i> O	g IEEE Std 802.3	3, Clause 30 counter
Change "once" to Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Iones, Peter	Response Status O P 57 Cisco Comment Status X	L 54	# [113	"This count effectively added together." with "This counter is calcula aFrameCheckSequenc aAlignmentErrors" Proposed Response	ated by summing the followin ceErrors + Response Status O P60		0
Change "once" to Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Jones, Peter Comment Type ER Should only refer to SuggestedRemedy	Response Status O P57 Cisco Comment Status X the MAC Client	L 54	# [113]	"This count effectively added together." with "This counter is calcula aFrameCheckSequenc aAlignmentErrors" <i>Proposed Response</i> C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Jones, Peter	ated by summing the followin ceErrors + <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 60 Cisco	g IEEE Std 802.3	3, Clause 30 counter
Change "once" to Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Jones, Peter Comment Type ER Should only refer to SuggestedRemedy	Response Status O P 57 Cisco Comment Status X	L 54	# <u>113</u>	"This count effectively added together." with "This counter is calcula aFrameCheckSequence aAlignmentErrors" Proposed Response CI 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Jones, Peter Comment Type TR	ated by summing the followin ceErrors + <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 60 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X	g IEEE Std 802.3	3, Clause 30 counter # 116
Change "once" to Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Jones, Peter Comment Type ER Should only refer to SuggestedRemedy Change "LLC (or oth	Response Status O P57 Cisco Comment Status X the MAC Client	L 54	# <u>113</u>	"This count effectively added together." with "This counter is calcula aFrameCheckSequence aAlignmentErrors" <i>Proposed Response</i> <i>CI</i> 5 <i>SC</i> 5.3.2.1 Jones, Peter <i>Comment Type</i> TR We should not not be of RFC 2819 defines this "The total number of p framing bits, but includ	ated by summing the followin ceErrors + <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 60 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X defining objects that are not s	g IEEE Std 802.3 <i>L</i> 52 specified in 802.3 ss than 64 octets nerwise well form	# 116 # 116 B. clong (excluding led."
Change "once" to Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Jones, Peter Comment Type ER Should only refer to SuggestedRemedy Change "LLC (or oth	Response Status O P57 Cisco Comment Status X the MAC Client her MAC user)" to "MAC Client"	L 54	# [<u>113</u>	"This count effectively added together." with "This counter is calcula aFrameCheckSequence aAlignmentErrors" <i>Proposed Response</i> <i>CI</i> 5 <i>SC</i> 5.3.2.1 Jones, Peter <i>Comment Type</i> TR We should not not be of RFC 2819 defines this "The total number of p framing bits, but includ	ated by summing the followin ceErrors + Response Status O P60 Cisco Comment Status X defining objects that are not s as backets received that were let ing FCS octets) and were oth	g IEEE Std 802.3 <i>L</i> 52 specified in 802.3 ss than 64 octets nerwise well form	# 116 # slong (excluding
Change "once" to Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Jones, Peter Comment Type ER Should only refer to SuggestedRemedy	Response Status O P57 Cisco Comment Status X the MAC Client her MAC user)" to "MAC Client"	L 54	# [<u>113</u>]	"This count effectively added together." with "This counter is calcula aFrameCheckSequence aAlignmentErrors" Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 Jones, Peter Comment Type TR We should not not be constructed RFC 2819 defines this "The total number of p framing bits, but includ What is the equivalent SuggestedRemedy	ated by summing the followin ceErrors + Response Status O P60 Cisco Comment Status X defining objects that are not s as backets received that were let ing FCS octets) and were oth	g IEEE Std 802.3 <i>L</i> 52 specified in 802.3 ss than 64 octets nerwise well form his should be rem	# 116 # slong (excluding

Page 12 of 26 12/21/2023 8:22:15 AM

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

	.2.1 P63	L11	# 117	C/ 5	SC 5.3.2.2	P 66	L 46	# 119
ones, Peter	Cisco			Jones, Pete	r	Cisco		
omment Type T	R Comment Status X			Comment Ty	vpe ER	Comment Status X		
Define at the cor	apply to all objects in this containentainer level and don't repeat at the	e leaf level.		Most, if issue dr		"revision" clauses are out of c	ate. These sho	uld be updated as we
	uities" text to container and reme ame { " as example.	ove from objects.		SuggestedR	emedy			
the management time' leaf define Remove "Discontinuities .	n the values of counters in this cor nt system, and at other times as ind d in the ietf-interfaces YANG modu " text from leaves unless it difffer	dicated by the valuule (IETF RFC 834	ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). ";	publish t This sho revision	he standard, e ould have beer 2019-11-28 { on "802.3 TF	0,	art, we can rem	iove them when we
posed Response	Response Status O			C/ 5	SC 5.3.2.2	P67	L1	# 120
				Jones, Pete		Cisco	L I	# 120
5 SC 5.3	.2.1 P65	L 18	# 118	Comment Ty		Comment Status X		
nes, Peter	Cisco			,	pe reference i			
mment Type T	R Comment Status X					s out of date		
Define at the cor	apply to all objects in this containent ntainer level and don't repeat at the uities" text to container and rem	e leaf level.				2018-07-03.yang to iana-if-type all modules	e@2023-01-26.	yang
	rame { " as example.			Proposed Re	esponse	Response Status 0		
See "container fr								
See "container fr ggestedRemedy								
See "container fr ggestedRemedy Add "Discontinuities i	n the values of counters in this cor			C/ 5	SC 5.3.2.2	P67	L 26	# 121
See "container fr ggestedRemedy Add "Discontinuities i the managemen	nt system, and at other times as inc	dicated by the valu	ue of the 'discontinuity-	C/ 5 Jones, Pete		Р 67 Cisco	L 26	# 121
See "container fr ggestedRemedy Add "Discontinuities i the managemen time' leaf define Remove	nt system, and at other times as ind d in the ietf-interfaces YANG modu	dicated by the valuule (IETF RFC 834	ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). ";		r	-	L 26	# 121
See "container fr ggestedRemedy Add "Discontinuities i the managemen time' leaf define Remove "Discontinuities .	nt system, and at other times as ind d in the ietf-interfaces YANG modu " text from leaves unless it difffer	dicated by the valuule (IETF RFC 834	ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). ";	Jones, Pete Comment Ty	r	Cisco Comment Status X	L 26	# [121
See "container fr ggestedRemedy Add "Discontinuities i the managemen time' leaf define Remove "Discontinuities .	nt system, and at other times as ind d in the ietf-interfaces YANG modu " text from leaves unless it difffer	dicated by the valuule (IETF RFC 834	ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). ";	Jones, Pete Comment Ty	r <i>ipe</i> TR ference is out	Cisco Comment Status X	L 26	# [121
See "container fr ggestedRemedy Add "Discontinuities i the managemen time' leaf define Remove	nt system, and at other times as ind d in the ietf-interfaces YANG modu " text from leaves unless it difffer	dicated by the valuule (IETF RFC 834	ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). ";	Jones, Pete Comment Ty 802.3 re SuggestedR Change	r <i>ipe</i> TR ference is out	Cisco Comment Status X of date 802.3-2022	L 26	# 121

Page 13 of 26 12/21/2023 8:22:15 AM

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.3.	2.2	P 67	L 37	# 122	C/ 5	SC 5.3.2.2		P 69	L 29	# 124
Jones, Peter		Cisco			Jones, Pet	ter		Cisco		
Comment Type El	R Commer	t Status X			Comment	Type TR	Со	mment Status X		
Fix formatting								objects in this contai		
SuggestedRemedy								and don't repeat at th		l remove from objects
Change						ontainer fram				
"Only valid for Eth rates)	nernet interfaces o	perating at spee	eas (data		Suggested	IRemedy				
above 1000 Mb/s	",							to all objects in this o		in an endine in fail
to "Only valid for Eth	nernet interfaces o	perating at spee	eds			nese counter mode."	s do not il	ncrement when the E	thernet interface i	is operating in full-
(data rates) above		porating at opeo								occur at re-initialization
Proposed Response	Response	e Status O						and at other times a ed in the ietf-interfac		
					Remov	ve "This coun	er does r	not increment when t	he Ethernet interfa	ace is operating in full-
5 SC 5.3.	2.2	P68	L 22	# 123		mode" tex ve "Also see t		jects iption' statement" t	ext from objects u	nless they do not
		Cisco				m to this stan				
ones. Peter						D	D = =	-		
	R Commer				Proposed I	Response	Res	sponse Status O		
,		t Status X	in this augment c	lause	Proposed I	Response	Res	sponse Status O		
Formatting issues		t Status X	in this augment c	lause	Proposed F			-	L 29	# 125
Comment Type El		t Status X	in this augment c	lause	CI 5	SC 5.3.2.2		P72	L 29	# 125
Comment Type El Formatting issues SuggestedRemedy Fix formatting	s on many of the le	t Status X	in this augment c	lause	CI 5 Jones, Pet	SC 5.3.2. 2	2	-	L 29	# [125
Comment Type El Formatting issues SuggestedRemedy Fix formatting	s on many of the le	nt Status X eaf descriptions i	in this augment c	lause	Cl 5 Jones, Pet Comment	SC 5.3.2. 2 ter <i>Type</i> TR	2 Co	P 72 Cisco	-	# 125
Comment Type El Formatting issues SuggestedRemedy Fix formatting	s on many of the le	nt Status X eaf descriptions i	in this augment c	lause	CI 5 Jones, Pet <i>Comment</i> These Define	SC 5.3.2.2 ter <i>Type</i> TR behaviors ap at the contai	Co Co bly to all o her level a	P72 Cisco mment Status X objects in this contai and don't repeat at th	ner. e leaf level.	
omment Type El Formatting issues uggestedRemedy Fix formatting	s on many of the le	nt Status X eaf descriptions i	in this augment c	lause	CI 5 Jones, Pet <i>Comment</i> These Define Move "	SC 5.3.2.2 ter <i>Type</i> TR behaviors ap at the contai	Co ply to all o her level a " and "	P72 Cisco mment Status X objects in this contai and don't repeat at th Discontinuities" te	ner. e leaf level.	# [<u>125</u> I remove from objects
Comment Type El Formatting issues SuggestedRemedy Fix formatting	s on many of the le	nt Status X eaf descriptions i	in this augment c	lause	CI 5 Jones, Pet Comment These Define Move " See "co	SC 5.3.2.2 ter <i>Type</i> TR behaviors ap at the contain "This counter container fram	Co ply to all o her level a " and "	P72 Cisco mment Status X objects in this contai and don't repeat at th Discontinuities" te	ner. e leaf level.	
Comment Type El Formatting issues SuggestedRemedy Fix formatting	s on many of the le	nt Status X eaf descriptions i	in this augment c	lause	CI 5 Jones, Pet Comment These Define Move " See "co Suggested Add "T	SC 5.3.2.2 ter <i>Type</i> TR behaviors ap at the contain "This counter container fram <i>IRemedy</i> "hese behavio	Co bly to all o her level a " and " e { " as e rs apply t	P72 Cisco mment Status X objects in this contai and don't repeat at th Discontinuities" te xample. to all objects in this c	ner. e leaf level. xt to container and ontainer."	l remove from objects
Comment Type El Formatting issues SuggestedRemedy Fix formatting	s on many of the le	nt Status X eaf descriptions i	in this augment c	lause	CI 5 Jones, Pet Comment These Define Move " See "cr Suggested Add "T add "T	SC 5.3.2.2 ter <i>Type</i> TR behaviors ap at the contain "This counter container fram <i>IRemedy</i> "hese behavio hese counter	Co bly to all o her level a " and " e { " as e rs apply t	P72 Cisco mment Status X objects in this contai and don't repeat at th Discontinuities" te xample.	ner. e leaf level. xt to container and ontainer."	l remove from objects
omment Type El Formatting issues uggestedRemedy Fix formatting	s on many of the le	nt Status X eaf descriptions i	in this augment c	lause	CI 5 Jones, Pet Comment These Define Move " See "co Suggested Add "T add "T duplex	SC 5.3.2.2 ter <i>Type</i> TR behaviors ap at the contain "This counter container fram <i>IRemedy</i> These behavior hese counter mode."	Co bly to all of her level a " and " e { " as e rs apply to s do not in	P72 Cisco mment Status X objects in this contai and don't repeat at th Discontinuities" te xample. to all objects in this concrement when the E	ner. le leaf level. xt to container and ontainer." thernet interface i	d remove from objects
omment Type El Formatting issues uggestedRemedy Fix formatting	s on many of the le	nt Status X eaf descriptions i	in this augment c	lause	CI 5 Jones, Pet Comment These Define Move " See "cr Suggested Add "T add "T duplex Add "D	SC 5.3.2.2 ter <i>Type</i> TR behaviors ap at the contain "This counter container fram <i>IRemedy</i> hese behavior hese counter mode."	Co bly to all of her level a " and " e { " as e rs apply f s do not in in the va	P72 Cisco mment Status X objects in this contai and don't repeat at th Discontinuities" te xample. to all objects in this concrement when the E	ner. le leaf level. xt to container and ontainer." Ethernet interface i his container can c	I remove from objects is operating in full- occur at re-initializatior
omment Type El Formatting issues uggestedRemedy Fix formatting	s on many of the le	nt Status X eaf descriptions i	in this augment c	lause	CI 5 Jones, Pet Comment These Define Move " See "cr Suggested Add "T add "T add "T duplex Add "D of the 'discon	SC 5.3.2.2 ter <i>Type</i> TR behaviors ap at the contain "This counter container fram <i>IRemedy</i> "hese behavio hese counter mode." Discontinuities managemen ntinuity-time'	Co by to all o her level a " and " e { " as e rs apply t s do not in in the va system, eaf define	P72 Cisco mment Status X objects in this contai and don't repeat at th Discontinuities" te xample. to all objects in this c ncrement when the B lues of counters in th and at other times a ed in the ietf-interfac	ner. le leaf level. xt to container and ontainer." thernet interface i his container can c s indicated by the es YANG module	I remove from objects is operating in full- occur at re-initialization value of the (IETF RFC 8343). ";
Comment Type El Formatting issues SuggestedRemedy Fix formatting	s on many of the le	nt Status X eaf descriptions i	in this augment c	lause	CI 5 Jones, Pet Comment These Define Move " See "cr Suggested Add "T add "T add "T add "T duplex Add "D of the 'discon Remov	SC 5.3.2.2 ter <i>Type</i> TR behaviors ap at the contain "This counter container fram <i>IRemedy</i> "hese behavior hese counter mode." Discontinuities managemen ntinuity-time' live "This coun	Co by to all of her level a " and " e { " as e rs apply to s do not in in the va system, eaf define er does r	P72 Cisco mment Status X objects in this contai and don't repeat at th Discontinuities" te xample. to all objects in this c norement when the B lues of counters in th and at other times a ed in the ietf-interfac not increment when t	ner. le leaf level. xt to container and ontainer." thernet interface i his container can c s indicated by the es YANG module	I remove from objects is operating in full- occur at re-initializatior value of the
Comment Type El Formatting issues SuggestedRemedy Fix formatting	s on many of the le	nt Status X eaf descriptions i	in this augment c	lause	Cl 5 Jones, Pet Comment These Define Move " See "cr Suggested Add "T add "T add "D of the 'discon Remov duplex	SC 5.3.2.2 ter Type TR behaviors ap at the contain "This counter container fram <i>Remedy</i> These behavior hese counter mode." Discontinuities managemen ntinuity-time' live "This count we "This count mode" tex	Co objection of the second control of the se	P72 Cisco mment Status X objects in this contai and don't repeat at th Discontinuities" te xample. to all objects in this c norement when the B lues of counters in th and at other times a ed in the ietf-interfac not increment when t	ner. le leaf level. xt to container and ontainer." thernet interface i his container can c s indicated by the es YANG module he Ethernet interfa	I remove from objects is operating in full- occur at re-initialization value of the (IETF RFC 8343). "; ace is operating in full-
Comment Type El Formatting issues SuggestedRemedy	s on many of the le	nt Status X eaf descriptions i	in this augment c	lause	Cl 5 Jones, Pet Comment These Define Move " See "cr Suggested Add "T add "T add "T duplex Add "D of the 'discon Remov duplex Remov	SC 5.3.2.2 ter Type TR behaviors ap at the contain "This counter container fram <i>Remedy</i> These behavior hese counter mode." Discontinuities managemen ntinuity-time' live "This count we "This count mode" tex	Co objection of the control of the control of the c	P72 Cisco mment Status X objects in this contai and don't repeat at th Discontinuities" te xample. to all objects in this c norement when the E ilues of counters in th and at other times a ed in the ietf-interfac not increment when t	ner. le leaf level. xt to container and ontainer." thernet interface i his container can c s indicated by the es YANG module he Ethernet interfa	I remove from objects is operating in full- occur at re-initialization value of the (IETF RFC 8343). "; ace is operating in full-

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	2.3 P73	L 49	# 126	CI 5	SC 5.3.2.3	P 73	L61	# 52
lones, Peter	Cisco			Slavick, Jeff		Broadcom		
Comment Type EF	R Comment Status X			Comment Ty	rpe T	Comment Status X		
Formatting issue.				The curr	ent IEEE802.3	3 Std is 2022, why is this refer	nce to 2018?	
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedR	emedy			
Fix formatting				Change	2018 to 2022			
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Re	esponse	Response Status O		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2	2.3 P73	L 57	# 127	CI 5	SC 5.3.2.3	P 74	L11	# 129
Jones, Peter	Cisco			Jones, Pete		Cisco		
Comment Type EF	R Comment Status X			Comment Ty	pe ER	Comment Status X		
	of the "revision" clauses are out of	date. These show	uld be updated as we	Formatti	ng issues on r	many of the leaf descriptions i	n this container	clause
issue drafts.				SuggestedR	emedy			
SuggestedRemedy				Fix form	atting			
Add new revision	clause for each module for each	draft. we can rem	ove mem when we					
publish the standa This should have	ard, e.g., been			Proposed Re	esponse	Response Status O		
publish the standa This should have revision 2019-11-2	ard, e.g., been			Proposed Re	SC 5.3.2.3	Response Status O	L11	# [130
publish the standa This should have revision 2019-11-2 description "802.3 }	ard, e.g., been 28 { 3 TF review D1.0.";				SC 5.3.2.3	,	L11	# 130
publish the standa This should have revision 2019-11-2 description "802.3 }	ard, e.g., been 28 {			C/ 5	SC 5.3.2.3	P 74	L11	# [130
publish the standa This should have revision 2019-11-2 description "802.3 }	ard, e.g., been 28 { 3 TF review D1.0.";			CI 5 Jones, Pete Comment Ty These b	SC 5.3.2.3	P74 Cisco Comment Status X v to all objects in this containe	r.	# <u>130</u>
publish the standa This should have revision 2019-11-2 description "802.3 } Proposed Response	ard, e.g., been 28 { 3 TF review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> O	L 60	# 128	CI 5 Jones, Pete Comment Ty These b Define a	SC 5.3.2.3 pe TR shaviors apply t the containe	P74 Cisco Comment Status X v to all objects in this containe r level and don't repeat at the	r. leaf level.	
publish the standa This should have revision 2019-11-2 description "802.3 } Proposed Response	ard, e.g., been 28 { 3 TF review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> O			CI 5 Jones, Pete Comment Ty These b Define a Move "D	SC 5.3.2.3 pe TR ehaviors apply t the containe iscontinuities	P74 Cisco Comment Status X v to all objects in this containe	r. leaf level.	
publish the standa This should have revision 2019-11-2 description "802.3 } Proposed Response C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Jones, Peter	ard, e.g., been 28 { 3 TF review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> 0 2.3 <i>P</i> 73 Cisco			CI 5 Jones, Pete Comment Ty These b Define a Move "D	SC 5.3.2.3 pe TR ehaviors apply t the containe iscontinuities ntainer frame	P74 Cisco Comment Status X to all objects in this containe r level and don't repeat at the " text to container and remo	r. leaf level.	
publish the standa This should have revision 2019-11-2 description "802.3 } Proposed Response C/ 5 SC 5.3.2 Jones, Peter	ard, e.g., been 28 { 3 TF review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> 0 2.3 <i>P</i> 73 Cisco R <i>Comment Status</i> X			CI 5 Jones, Pete Comment Ty These b Define a Move "D See "cor SuggestedR Add	SC 5.3.2.3 pe TR ehaviors apply t the containe iscontinuities ntainer frame emedy	P74 Cisco Comment Status X to all objects in this containe r level and don't repeat at the " text to container and remo " as example.	r. leaf level. ve from objects.	
publish the standa This should have revision 2019-11-2 description "802.3 } Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 Jones, Peter Comment Type EF 802.3 reference is	ard, e.g., been 28 { 3 TF review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> O 2.3 P73 Cisco R <i>Comment Status</i> X s out of date 18 to 802.3-2022			Cl 5 Jones, Pete Comment Ty These b Define a Move "D See "cor SuggestedR Add "Discont the mar	SC 5.3.2.3 pe TR ehaviors apply t the containe iscontinuities ntainer frame emedy inuities in the hagement syst f defined in th	P74 Cisco Comment Status X to all objects in this containe r level and don't repeat at the " text to container and remo	r. leaf level. ve from objects. tainer can occur icated by the va	at re-initialization of lue of the 'discontinui
publish the standa This should have revision 2019-11-2 description "802.3 } Proposed Response CI 5 SC 5.3.2 Jones, Peter Comment Type EF 802.3 reference is SuggestedRemedy Change 802.3-20	ard, e.g., been 28 { 3 TF review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> O 2.3 P73 Cisco R <i>Comment Status</i> X s out of date 18 to 802.3-2022			Cl 5 Jones, Pete Comment Ty These b Define a Move "D See "cor SuggestedR Add "Discont the mar time' lea Remove	SC 5.3.2.3 pe TR ehaviors apply t the containe iscontinuities ntainer frame emedy inuities in the lagement syst f defined in th	P74 Cisco Comment Status X to all objects in this containe r level and don't repeat at the " text to container and remo " as example. values of counters in this cont em, and at other times as ind	r. leaf level. ve from objects. tainer can occur icated by the va le (IETF RFC 83	at re-initialization of lue of the 'discontinui 343). ";

Page 15 of 26 12/21/2023 8:22:15 AM

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

	P 74	L 38	# 54	CI 5	SC 5.3.2.4	P 79	L10	# 56
Slavick, Jeff	Broadcom			Slavick, J	eff	Broadcom		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment	Type TR	Comment Status X		
	of the leaf nodes on pages	74-78 only inclue	de a clause number.		modules contair or LLDP	a blanket use this version of	the standard un	less called out. Add
SuggestedRemedy	prior to each of the Clause 3	0 x x x toxt in th	a "reference" fielde	Suggeste	dRemedy			
Proposed Response	Response Status O					ne description for the organizates in this model module are to		
				Proposed	Response	Response Status 0		
C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.3	P 77	L 27	# 132					
lones, Peter	Cisco			C/ 5	SC 5.3.2.4	P 79	L37	# 53
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Slavick, J	eff	Broadcom		
	o all objects in this containe			Comment	Type ER	Comment Status X		
	evel and don't repeat at the " text to container and remo			IEEE	Std IEEE Std is	appearing in the text		
See "container frame { "				Suggeste	dRemedv			
				Cuggoolo				
SuggestedRemedy Add				Remo times		t IEEE Std from all occurances	s in the docume	ent (pages 79-112, 15
Add "Discontinuities in the va the management syster time' leaf defined in the	alues of counters in this cont m, and at other times as indi ietf-interfaces YANG modul	icated by the val	ue of the 'discontinuity-	times		t IEEE Std from all occurances <i>Response Status</i> 0	s in the docume	ent (pages 79-112, 1
Add "Discontinuities in the va the management syster time' leaf defined in the Remove	m, and at other times as indi	icated by the value (IETF RFC 83	ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). ";	times)		s in the docume	ent (pages 79-112, 19
Add "Discontinuities in the va the management syster time' leaf defined in the Remove "Discontinuities" text f	m, and at other times as indi ietf-interfaces YANG modul from leaves unless it difffers	icated by the value (IETF RFC 83	ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). ";	times Proposed) Response SC 5.3.2.4	Response Status O		
Add "Discontinuities in the va the management syster time' leaf defined in the Remove "Discontinuities" text f	m, and at other times as indi ietf-interfaces YANG modul	icated by the value (IETF RFC 83	ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). ";	times Proposed Cl 5) Response SC 5.3.2.4 eff	Response Status 0		
Add "Discontinuities in the va the management syster time' leaf defined in the Remove "Discontinuities" text f	m, and at other times as indi ietf-interfaces YANG modul from leaves unless it difffers	icated by the value (IETF RFC 83	ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). ";	times Proposed Cl 5 Slavick, J Comment The o) Response SC 5.3.2.4 eff Type TR	Response Status O P 79 Broadcom	L 37	# 55
Add "Discontinuities in the variation of the management system time' leaf defined in the Remove "Discontinuities" text for Proposed Response	m, and at other times as indi ietf-interfaces YANG modul from leaves unless it difffers <i>Response Status</i> O	icated by the val e (IETF RFC 83 from the contair	ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). "; ner level behaviour.	times Proposed Cl 5 Slavick, J Comment The o) Response SC 5.3.2.4 eff <i>Type</i> TR ther modules list Be consistent.	Response Status 0 P 79 Broadcom Comment Status X	L 37	# <u>55</u>
Add "Discontinuities in the va the management syster time' leaf defined in the Remove "Discontinuities" text f Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.3 Jones, Peter Comment Type ER	m, and at other times as indi ietf-interfaces YANG modul from leaves unless it difffers <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 77 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X	icated by the value (IETF RFC 83) from the contain	ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). "; her level behaviour. # 131	times Proposed Cl 5 Slavick, J Comment The o Std". Suggester Chan) Response SC 5.3.2.4 eff Type TR ther modules list Be consistent. dRemedy ge text of the refe	Response Status 0 P 79 Broadcom Comment Status X	L37 " while PSE is c	# <u>55</u> doing it "Clause of
Add "Discontinuities in the value the management system time' leaf defined in the Remove "Discontinuities" text f Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.3 Jones, Peter Comment Type ER Formatting issues on mage	m, and at other times as indi ietf-interfaces YANG modul from leaves unless it difffers <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 77 Cisco	icated by the value (IETF RFC 83) from the contain	ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). "; her level behaviour. # 131	times Proposed Cl 5 Slavick, J Comment The o Std". Suggeste Chan where) Response SC 5.3.2.4 eff Type TR ther modules list Be consistent. dRemedy ge text of the refe	Response Status O P79 Broadcom Comment Status X the reference as "Std, Clause erences to use the form "IEE S	L37 " while PSE is c	# <u>55</u> doing it "Clause of
Add "Discontinuities in the value the management system time' leaf defined in the Remove "Discontinuities" text f Proposed Response Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.3 Jones, Peter Comment Type ER	m, and at other times as indi ietf-interfaces YANG modul from leaves unless it difffers <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 77 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X	icated by the value (IETF RFC 83) from the contain	ue of the 'discontinuity- 43). "; her level behaviour. # 131	times Proposed Cl 5 Slavick, J Comment The o Std". Suggeste Chan where) Response SC 5.3.2.4 eff Type TR ther modules list Be consistent. dRemedy ge text of the refe e x is the existing	Response Status O P79 Broadcom Comment Status X the reference as "Std, Clause erences to use the form "IEE S sub-clause for that item	L37 " while PSE is c	# <u>55</u> doing it "Clause of

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 5 SC 5.3.2.4 Page 16 of 26 12/21/2023 8:22:15 AM

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

CI 6 SC 6.5.2	P 118	L 18	# 138	CI 6 SC	6.5.2	P 120	L17	# 140
Jones, Peter	Cisco			Jones, Peter		Cisco		
Comment Type ER	Comment Status X			Comment Type	TR	Comment Status X		
Most, if not all, of t issue drafts.	he "revision" clauses are out of o	late. These sho	uld be updated as we			wer class enums into into seps enumerations.	perate multipair-	power-class and
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemea	ly			
publish the standard This should have be revision 2019-11-28	en {	raft, we can rem	ove them when we	30.9.1.1.8 aP	erate mul SEPowe	Itipair-power-class and singlep rClassification goes from class EDetectedPDPowerClass goe	s 0 to class 8	
description "802.3 T	F review D1.0.";			Proposed Respon	ise	Response Status 0		
, Proposed Response	Response Status 0							
				CI6 SC	6.5.2	P 121	L14	# 141
C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P118	L 57	# 139	Jones, Peter		Cisco		
	F 118 Cisco	L 31	# 139	Comment Type	TR	Comment Status X		
Jones, Peter	Comment Status X			fix Clause 30	reference	e		
Comment Type ER 802.3.2a reference i				SuggestedRemea	ly			
	Sinconect			change .6 to .	8			
SuggestedRemedy Change 802.3-2018	to 802 2 2022			Proposed Respon	ise	Response Status 0		
-								
Proposed Response	Response Status O					D404	1.24	# 440
					6.5.2	P121	L 24	# 142
C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P 120	L 17	# 99	Jones, Peter		Cisco		
Schreiner, Stephan	Rosenberger			Comment Type	TR	Comment Status X		
Comment Type T	Comment Status X				•	clause 145 is 4 pair,		
	ses described from 0 to 11. Howe asses 0 to 15. Seems that they b		ntioned Reference	SuggestedRemed Change "mult		"two-pair"		
SuggestedRemedy	······································	5		Proposed Respon	ise	Response Status O		
Include the classes				,,		•		

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P 121	L 34	# 143	C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P 121	L 42	# 146
ones, Peter	Cisco			Jones, Peter	Cisco		
Comment Type TR add "four-pair" identity	Comment Status X			Comment Type ER language	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Add				Change "The signal pair	is in use." to "The signal pa	airs are in use."	
identity four-pair { base pse-type; description "PSE supp	oort IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 1	45.";		Proposed Response	Response Status O		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P 121	L 47	# 147
				Jones, Peter	Cisco		
C/ 6 SC 6.5.2 Jones, Peter	<i>P</i> 121 Cisco	L 36	# 144	Comment Type ER language	Comment Status X		
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			SuggestedRemedy			
Add "all-pairs" identity				•••	is in use." to "The signal pa	airs are in use."	
SuggestedRemedy add identity all {				Proposed Response	Response Status O		
base powering-pairs; description "All pairs a	ire in use.";			C/ 6 SC 6.5.2 Jones, Peter	P 122 Cisco	L 7	# 148
roposed Response	Response Status 0			Comment Type TR Doesn't include Clause	Comment Status X		
				SuggestedRemedy			
C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P 121	L 37	# 145	Change			
Jones, Peter	Cisco			"PSE may support IEEE to	Std 802.3, Clause 33 or IE	EE Std 802.3, Cl	ause 104."
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X				ore of IEEE Std 802.3 Clau	ise 33, Clause 10	4 or Clause 145."
Add an identity for 802	2.3bt when using all 4 pairs.			Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
SuggestedRemedy Add identity all { base powering-pairs; description "All fours p	pairs are in use.";						
}							

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P 122	L 31	# 149	C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P 123	L 24	# 152
ones, Peter	Cisco			Jones, Peter	Cisco		
omment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
This only app				Why don't we includ objects in the statisti	e the set of aPSE <name>COu ics container?</name>	nterA and aPSE	<name>COunterB</name>
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
				review need and add	d leaves if required		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P122	L 47	# 150				
Jones, Peter	Cisco			C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P 123	L 38	# 153
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Jones, Peter	Cisco		
leaf pairs-control-abil	ity only really applies to Clause	e 33.		Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy				fix Clause 30 referer	nce		
Add to description				SuggestedRemedy			
"This applies when p	owering-pairs is equal to two-p	air"		Change "30.9.1.1.8 aPSEPo	warDaniadCaustar"		
Proposed Response	Response Status O			to	werDemedCounter		
				"30.9.1.1.14 aPSEP	owerDeniedCounter"		
C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P122	L 60	# 151	Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
Jones, Peter	Cisco						
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P123	L 50	# 154
Missing aPSEPowerl	DetectionStatusA and aPSEPo	werDetectionSta	tusB.	Jones, Peter	Cisco		
SuggestedRemedy				Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
review need and add	leaves if required			fix Clause 30 referer	nce		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			SuggestedRemedy			
	·			Change			
				"30.9.1.1.7 aPSEInv to	alidSignatureCounter"		
				"30.9.1.1.11 aPSEIn	validSignatureCounter"		

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P123	L 64	# 155	C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P 124	L14	# 158
lones, Peter	Cisco			Jones, Peter	Cisco		
comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
fix Clause 30 reference	e			Remove "leaf short"	, 30.9.1.1.10 aPSEShortCount	er doesn't exist in	802.3-2022
SuggestedRemedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Change				Remove			
"30.9.1.1.11 aPSEMP	SAbsentCounter"			leaf short {			
to "30.9.1.1.20 aPSEMP	SAbsentCounter"						
Proposed Response	Response Status O			or add aPSEShortCo	ounter back into clause 30.		
				Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P124	L11	# 157				
Jones, Peter	Cisco		" 107	C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P124	L 54	# 159
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Jones, Peter	Cisco		
fix Clause 30 reference				Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
	•			fix Clause 30 referer	nce		
SuggestedRemedy Change				SuggestedRemedy			
"30.9.1.1.14 aPSECur	nulativeEnergy"			Change			
to				"30.9.1.1.12 aPSEA	ctualPower"		
"30.9.1.1.25 aPSECur				to "30.9.1.1.23 aPSEA	ctualPower"		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			Proposed Response	Response Status O		
				Froposed Response			
C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P 124	L11	# 156	C/ 6 SC 6.5.2	P125	L 2	# 160
Jones, Peter	Cisco				-	LZ	# 100
Comment Type TR	Comment Status X			Jones, Peter	Cisco		
fix Clause 30 reference	e			Comment Type TR	Comment Status X		
SuggestedRemedy				fix Clause 30 referer	ice		
Change				SuggestedRemedy			
"30.9.1.1.9 aPSEOver to	LoadCounter"			Change "30.9.1.1.13 aPSEP	owerAccuracy"		
"30.9.1.1.17 aPSEOve	erLoadCounter"			to	2		
Proposed Response	Response Status 0			"30.9.1.1.24 aPSEP	owerAccuracy"		
· ·	, -			Proposed Response	Response Status 0		

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

6	SC 6.5.2	P 125	L 41	# 161	C/6 SC 6.5	5.2 <i>P</i> 125	L63	# 162
ones, Pet	er	Cisco			Jones, Peter	Cisco		
omment 1	Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment Type	TR Comment Status X		
Add " F	PSE" to description	ns, and add typeE and type	F		Add Clause 30 r	refernce		
uggestedl	Remedy				SuggestedRemedy			
Change					Add			
enum t descrip	sypeA { ption "TypeA";				reference "IEEE Std 80	02.3, 30.15.1.1.4 aPoDLPSEType"		
}	5 (Proposed Response	Response Status O		
enum t descrip	sypeB { otion "TypeB";					·····		
} enum t	ypeC {				C/ 6 SC 6.5	5.2 P125	L 63	# 163
descrip	otion "TypeC";				Jones, Peter	Cisco		
} enum t	vpeD {				Comment Type	TR Comment Status X		
	otion "TypeD";				Change Clause	104 reference to Clause 30		
} To					SuggestedRemedy			
enum t	vpeA {				•• •	104.4.1" to "802.3 30.15.1.1.4 aPc	DLPSETvpe"	
	otion "TypeA PSE	".			Proposed Response		- 71 -	
} enum t	NDOR (
	otion "TypeB PSE	",						
} enum t								
	otion "Type PSEC	",						
enum t								
descrip ۱	otion "TypeD PSE	". ,						
enum t	ypeE {							
descrip }	otion "TypeE PSE	n. ,						
enum t descrip	typeF { otion "TypeF PSE	n.,						
}								

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

6 SC 6.5.2	P 126	L 9	# 164	C/ 6 SC 6.5.2 P126 L 62 # 165
ones, Peter	Cisco			Jones, Peter Cisco
omment Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment Type TR Comment Status X
·	ons, and add typeE and typeF			Add "Discontinuities" text to container See "container frame { " as example.
uggestedRemedy				
Change enum unknown { description "Unknown' } enum typeA {	" ,			SuggestedRemedy Add "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuit time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). ";
description "TypeA"; } enum typeB {				Proposed Response Response Status O
<pre>description "TypeB"; }</pre>				C/ 7 SC 7.4.2 P154 L1 # 166
enum typeC {				Jones, Peter Cisco
description "TypeC";				Comment Type TR Comment Status X
, enum typeD { description "TypeD";				Add "Discontinuities" text to container See "container frame { " as example.
}				SuggestedRemedy
To enum unknown { description "Unknown } enum typeA { description "TypeA PE }				Add "Discontinuities in the values of counters in this container can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of the 'discontinuit time' leaf defined in the ietf-interfaces YANG module (IETF RFC 8343). "; Remove "Discontinuities" text from leaves unless it difffers from the container level behaviour.
enum typeB { description "TypeB PD	ס";			Proposed Response Response Status O
enum typeC { description "TypeC PE	D";			
enum typeD { description "TypeD PD	D";			
<pre>/ enum typeE { description "TypeE PD }</pre>	D";			
enum typeF { description "TypeF PD })";			
roposed Response	Response Status 0			

C/ **7** SC **7.4.2**

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

	SC 7.4.2	P 160	L 45	# 167	Cl 7	SC 7	.4.2	P 167	L 39	# 169
Jones, F	eter	Cisco			Jones, Pe	eter		Cisco		
Commer	t Type TR	Comment Status X			Comment	t Type	TR	Comment Status X		
	Discontinuities	" text to container { " as example.				ainer statis reliable de		is not really statistics, change n??	container name	e/description and trx-
Suggeste	dRemedy				Suggeste	dRemedy	/			
Add					Fix na	aming - si	uggest "	monitoring-trx"		
the	nanagement sys leaf defined in t	values of counters in this cont stem, and at other times as indi he ietf-interfaces YANG modul	cated by the val	ue of the 'discontinuity-	Proposed	l Respons	se	Response Status O		
		xt from leaves unless it difffers	from the contain	ner level behaviour.	C/ 8	SC 8	3.4	P 190	L1	# 182
Propose	l Response	Response Status 0			Huber, Th	homas		Nokia		
					Comment	t Type	т	Comment Status X		
CI 7	SC 7.4.2	P166	L16	# 168		e 8-1 is mi clause 30		mapping for the attribute aOA	MRemotePDU	Configuration (802.3-
Jones, F	eter	Cisco			Suggeste	dRemedy	/	,		
Commer Lots	t Type TR	Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X pe int32; units 0.1 dBm", we sl	nould define a "r	power measurement"	Add a	an entry fo	or attribu	í ite aOAMRemotePDUConfigu iernet/link-oam/discovery-info/	ration, Referen remote, data no	ce 30.3.6.1.9, Container ode oammtu
Commer	t Type TR	Comment Status X	nould define a "p	power measurement"	Add a	an entry fo aces/inter	or attribu rface/eth	, ite aOAMRemotePDUConfigu ernet/link-oam/discovery-info/ <i>Response Status</i> 0	ration, Referen ′remote, data no	ce 30.3.6.1.9, Container ode oammtu
Commer Lots type Suggeste	t Type TR of leaves are "typ edRemedy	Comment Status X pe int32; units 0.1 dBm", we sl			Add a interfa	an entry fo aces/inter	or attribu rface/eth	hernet/link-oam/discovery-info/	ration, Referen /remote, data no	ce 30.3.6.1.9, Container ode oammtu
Commer Lots type Suggeste Add	t Type TR of leaves are "typ edRemedy	Comment Status X			Add a interfa	an entry fo aces/inter	or attribu rface/eth se	hernet/link-oam/discovery-info/	ration, Referen remote, data no L1	ce 30.3.6.1.9, Container ode oammtu # 184
Commer Lots type Suggeste Add type type	t Type TR of leaves are "typ od <i>Remedy</i> he following type lef power-level{ int32;	Comment Status X pe int32; units 0.1 dBm", we sl			Add a interfa Proposed Cl 8	an entry fo aces/inter d Respons SC 8	or attribu rface/eth se	nernet/link-oam/discovery-info/ Response Status O	remote, data no	ode oammtu
Commer Lots type Suggeste Add type type units	t Type TR of leaves are "typ odRemedy he following type lef power-level{ int32; "0.1 dBm";	Comment Status X pe int32; units 0.1 dBm", we sl			Add a interfa Proposed C/ 8 Huber, Th	an entry fo aces/inter I Respons SC 8	or attribu rface/eth se	nernet/link-oam/discovery-info/ Response Status O P190	remote, data no	ode oammtu
Commer Lots type Suggeste Add type units Desc "Pow in ur	t Type TR of leaves are "typ edRemedy he following type lef power-level{ int32; "0.1 dBm"; ription er level reflects t its of	Comment Status X pe int32; units 0.1 dBm", we sl	power measure	ement leaves.	Add a interfa Proposed C/ 8 Huber, Th Comment In the	an entry fo aces/inter I Respons SC 8 homas t Type e row for c	er attribu face/eth se 3.4 E DAMLoca	nernet/link-oam/discovery-info/ Response Status O P190 Nokia	/remote, data n	# <u>184</u>
Commer Lots type Suggeste Add type units Desc "Pow	t Type TR of leaves are "typ edRemedy he following type lef power-level{ int32; "0.1 dBm"; ription er level reflects t its of	Comment Status X pe int32; units 0.1 dBm", we sh edef and use it for any 0.1 dBm	power measure	ement leaves.	Add a interfa Proposed C/ 8 Huber, Th Comment In the	an entry fo aces/inter <i>I Respons</i> <i>SC</i> 8 homas <i>t Type</i> e row for c n 8.5.1 (lii	er attribu frace/eth se 3.4 E DAMLoca nk-oam/	ernet/link-oam/discovery-info/ Response Status O P190 Nokia Comment Status X alErr, the Container is refere	/remote, data n	# 184
type. Suggesta Add type type units Deso "Pow in un 0.1 c }	t Type TR of leaves are "typ edRemedy he following type lef power-level{ int32; "0.1 dBm"; ription er level reflects t its of	Comment Status X pe int32; units 0.1 dBm", we sh edef and use it for any 0.1 dBm	power measure	ement leaves.	Add a interfa Proposed C/ 8 Huber, Th Comment In the tree in Suggeste	an entry fo aces/inter d Respons SC 8 homas t Type e row for c n 8.5.1 (lin edRemedy	er attribu rface/eth se E pAMLoca nk-oam/	ernet/link-oam/discovery-info/ Response Status O P190 Nokia Comment Status X alErr, the Container is refere	/remote, data no L1 encing a branch	# <u>184</u>

CI 8 SC 8.4

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

	P 190	L1	# 185	CI 8	SC 8.5.1	P 195	L 25	# 186
uber, Thomas	Nokia			Huber, Th	iomas	Nokia		
omment Type T	Comment Status X			Comment	Туре Т	Comment Status X		
Table 8-1 is missir 30.3.6.1.13)	ng a mapping for the attribute aO	AMRemoteRevis	ion (802.3-2022 clause			ems related to the PME manag ged obects defined in clause 3		ed in clause 30.11.2
uggestedRemedy				Suggestee	dRemedy			
	ttribute aOAMRemoteRevision, R			See s	eparate file for d	letailed proposal for what to ac	dd.	
	e/ethernet/link-oam/discovery-info	b/remote, data no	Dde revision	Proposed	Response	Response Status 0		
roposed Response	Response Status O							
8 SC 8.4	P190	<i>L</i> 1	# 183	C/ 8	SC 8.5.2	P 197	L 22	# 170
		<i>L</i> I	# 163	Jones, Pe	eter	Cisco		
uber, Thomas	Nokia			Comment		Comment Status X		
mment Type E	Comment Status X the References and Container(s)	columns fo the	attributa			e "revision" clauses are out of o	date. These sho	uld be updated as w
	guration seem to be off - the first r				drafts.			
aOAMLocalConfig	guration in 802.3, but the containe			Suggestee	-			
	e/ethernet/link-oam/ note/functions-supported. The sec		i		h the standard,		iran, we can rem	love them when we
"aOAMLocalConfig	guration" rather than a pointer to a	a specific clause		This s	hould have beer	า		
	guration" rather than a pointer to	a specific clause		revisio	on 2019-11-28 {			
uggestedRemedy	guration" rather than a pointer to a sa appropriate. It is not clear if t		in 802.3-2022	revisio				
uggestedRemedy Update these rows referencing 30.3.6 Attribute(s) column		he first row is rea iguration should prrect. For the se	in 802.3-2022 ally intended to be also be listed in the	revisio descri }	on 2019-11-28 {			
uggestedRemedy Update these rows referencing 30.3.6 Attribute(s) column appear that maybe	s as appropriate. It is not clear if t 5.1.7 (and this aOAMRemoteConf n), or if the Container listed is inco	he first row is rea iguration should prrect. For the se	in 802.3-2022 ally intended to be also be listed in the	revisio descri } Proposed	on 2019-11-28 { iption "802.3 TF <i>Response</i>	review D1.0."; Response Status O	/ 43	# 171
uggestedRemedy Update these rows referencing 30.3.6 Attribute(s) column appear that maybe	s as appropriate. It is not clear if t 5.1.7 (and this aOAMRemoteConf n), or if the Container listed is inco e the Reference is supposed to be	he first row is rea iguration should prrect. For the se	in 802.3-2022 ally intended to be also be listed in the	revisio descri } Proposed C/ 8	on 2019-11-28 { iption "802.3 TF <i>Response</i> SC 8.5.2	review D1.0."; Response Status O P197	L 43	# <u>171</u>
uggestedRemedy Update these rows referencing 30.3.6 Attribute(s) column appear that maybe roposed Response	s as appropriate. It is not clear if t 6.1.7 (and this aOAMRemoteConf n), or if the Container listed is ince e the Reference is supposed to be <i>Response Status</i> O	he first row is rea iguration should orrect. For the se e 30.3.6.1.6.	in 802.3-2022 ally intended to be also be listed in the econd row, it would	revisio descri } Proposed C/ 8 Jones, Pe	on 2019-11-28 { iption "802.3 TF <i>Response</i> SC 8.5.2 eter	review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 197 Cisco	L 43	# <u>171</u>
UggestedRemedy Update these rows referencing 30.3.6 Attribute(s) column appear that maybe roposed Response	s as appropriate. It is not clear if t 6.1.7 (and this aOAMRemoteConfin), or if the Container listed is income the Reference is supposed to be <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 192	he first row is rea iguration should prrect. For the se a 30.3.6.1.6.	in 802.3-2022 ally intended to be also be listed in the	revisio descri } Proposed C/ 8 Jones, Pe Comment	on 2019-11-28 { iption "802.3 TF <i>Response</i> SC 8.5.2 eter <i>Type</i> TR	review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 197 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X	L 43	# <u>171</u>
UggestedRemedy Update these rows referencing 30.3.6 Attribute(s) column appear that maybe roposed Response	s as appropriate. It is not clear if t 5.1.7 (and this aOAMRemoteConf n), or if the Container listed is inco e the Reference is supposed to be <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 192 Rosenberger	he first row is rea iguration should prrect. For the se a 30.3.6.1.6.	in 802.3-2022 ally intended to be also be listed in the econd row, it would	revisio descri } Proposed CI 8 Jones, Pe Comment iana-it	on 2019-11-28 { iption "802.3 TF <i>Response</i> <i>SC</i> 8.5.2 eter <i>Type</i> TR f-type reference	review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 197 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X	L 43	# <u>171</u>
Update these rows referencing 30.3.6 Attribute(s) column appear that maybe roposed Response 8 SC 8.4 chreiner, Stephan comment Type E "variable-requeste	s as appropriate. It is not clear if t 6.1.7 (and this aOAMRemoteConfin), or if the Container listed is income the Reference is supposed to be <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 192	he first row is rea iguration should prrect. For the se a 30.3.6.1.6. <i>L</i> ing text. Howeve	in 802.3-2022 ally intended to be also be listed in the econd row, it would # 100 er, "in-variable-request"	revisio descri } Proposed Cl 8 Jones, Pe Comment iana-it Suggested Chang	on 2019-11-28 { iption "802.3 TF Response SC 8.5.2 eter Type TR f-type reference dRemedy ge iana-if-type@	review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 197 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X is out of date 2018-07-03.yang to iana-if-typ		
UggestedRemedy Update these rows referencing 30.3.6 Attribute(s) column appear that maybe roposed Response / 8 SC 8.4 chreiner, Stephan omment Type E "variable-requeste is mentioned. If thi	s as appropriate. It is not clear if t 5.1.7 (and this aOAMRemoteConf n), or if the Container listed is inco e the Reference is supposed to be <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 192 Rosenberger <i>Comment Status</i> X e-rx" is not mentioned in the follow	he first row is rea iguration should prrect. For the se a 30.3.6.1.6. <i>L</i> ring text. Howeve MVariableReque	in 802.3-2022 ally intended to be also be listed in the econd row, it would # 100 # 100 er, "in-variable-request" estTx (30.3.6.1.28)	revisio descri } Proposed C/ 8 Jones, Pe Comment iana-it Suggested Chang Check	on 2019-11-28 { iption "802.3 TF Response SC 8.5.2 eter Type TR f-type reference dRemedy	review D1.0."; <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 197 Cisco <i>Comment Status</i> X is out of date 2018-07-03.yang to iana-if-typ		
UggestedRemedy Update these rows referencing 30.3.6 Attribute(s) column appear that maybe roposed Response 7 8 SC 8.4 chreiner, Stephan comment Type E "variable-requeste is mentioned. If thi should be mention	s as appropriate. It is not clear if t 5.1.7 (and this aOAMRemoteConf n), or if the Container listed is inco e the Reference is supposed to be <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 192 Rosenberger <i>Comment Status</i> X e-rx" is not mentioned in the follow is is the correct connection, "aOA	he first row is rea iguration should prrect. For the se a 30.3.6.1.6. <i>L</i> ring text. Howeve MVariableReque	in 802.3-2022 ally intended to be also be listed in the econd row, it would # 100 # 100 er, "in-variable-request" estTx (30.3.6.1.28)	revisio descri } Proposed C/ 8 Jones, Pe Comment iana-it Suggested Chang Check	on 2019-11-28 { iption "802.3 TF Response SC 8.5.2 eter Type TR f-type reference dRemedy ge iana-if-type@ < and change for	review D1.0."; Response Status O P197 Cisco Comment Status X is out of date 2018-07-03.yang to iana-if-typ rall modules		
aggestedRemedy Update these rows referencing 30.3.6 Attribute(s) columinappear that maybe oposed Response 8 SC 8.4 chreiner, Stephan omment Type E "variable-requeste is mentioned. If this should be mention the following text. aggestedRemedy	s as appropriate. It is not clear if t 5.1.7 (and this aOAMRemoteConf n), or if the Container listed is inco e the Reference is supposed to be <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 192 Rosenberger <i>Comment Status</i> X e-rx" is not mentioned in the follow is is the correct connection, "aOA	he first row is rea iguration should prrect. For the se a 30.3.6.1.6. <i>L</i> ing text. Howeve MVariableReque variable-request	in 802.3-2022 ally intended to be also be listed in the econd row, it would # 100 # 100 er, "in-variable-request" estTx (30.3.6.1.28) " is also mentioned in	revisio descri } Proposed C/ 8 Jones, Pe Comment iana-it Suggested Chang Check	on 2019-11-28 { iption "802.3 TF Response SC 8.5.2 eter Type TR f-type reference dRemedy ge iana-if-type@ < and change for	review D1.0."; Response Status O P197 Cisco Comment Status X is out of date 2018-07-03.yang to iana-if-typ rall modules		

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general	CI 8
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn	SC 8.5.2
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line	

Page 24 of 26 12/21/2023 8:22:16 AM

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

C/8 SC 8.5	.2 <i>P</i> 198	L 7	# 172	CI 8 SC 8.5	.2 P 202	L 54	# 175	
ones, Peter	Cisco			Jones, Peter	Cisco			
omment Type T	R Comment Status X			Comment Type T	R Comment Status X			
802.3 reference i	is incorrect				referring to RFC definitions that t		302.3.	
uggestedRemedy					pen if we changed behavior and r define object behaviors in these		nent	
Change 802.3-20	018 to 802.3-2022			Comment applies	s to many of these references in	the draft.		
roposed Response	Response Status O				ase dot3OamOperStatus refers b d a half of text in the description.	ack to [802.3ah] fr	om 2004 and has	
				SuggestedRemedy				
8 SC 8.5	.2 P 198	L 16	# 173	Replace RFC ref	erences items defined in 802.3 to	with definitions a	nd references into 802	
ones, Peter	Cisco			Proposed Response	Response Status 0			
Comment Type T	R Comment Status X							
Lots of reference	es into clause 57, shouldn't these ol	ojects be defined	in Clause 30?	C/ 8 SC 8.5	.2 P 202	L65	# 176	
uggestedRemedy				Jones, Peter	Cisco			
remove cross-references to clause 57 from "references" clauses				Comment Type T				
Proposed Response Response Status O				The following description is out of date based on https://standards.ieee.org/products- programs/regauth/oui/ — Description "24-bit Organizationally Unique Identifier.";				
1 8 SC 8.5	.2 P 198	L 57	# 174	SuggestedRemedy		- ,		
D (Cisco				bit MAC addresses – large(MA– (OUI).";	L). Previously know	w as Organizationally	
,	R Comment Status X							
51	R Comment Status X hib-retrieval-initiate is badly names.	We are not deal	ing with a MIB.	Proposed Response	Response Status O			
<i>comment Type</i> T feature remote-m		We are not deal	ing with a MIB.	Proposed Response	Response Status O			
omment Type T feature remote-m	nib-retrieval-initiate is badly names.	We are not deal	ing with a MIB.	· ·		12	# 177	
comment Type T feature remote-m uggestedRemedy change "-mib-"- t	nib-retrieval-initiate is badly names.	We are not dea	ing with a MIB.	CI 8 SC 8.5	.2 P203	L 2	# 177	
comment Type T feature remote-m uggestedRemedy change "-mib-"- t	nib-retrieval-initiate is badly names.	We are not dea.	ing with a MIB.	C/ 8 SC 8.5. Jones, Peter	.2 P 203 Cisco	L2	# 177	
omment Type T feature remote-m uggestedRemedy change "-mib-"- t	nib-retrieval-initiate is badly names.	We are not dea	ing with a MIB.	CI 8 SC 8.5	.2 P 203 Cisco R Comment Status X	L 2	# [<u>177</u>	
omment Type T feature remote-m uggestedRemedy change "-mib-"- t	nib-retrieval-initiate is badly names.	We are not dea	ing with a MIB.	Cl 8 SC 8.5 Jones, Peter Comment Type T	.2 P 203 Cisco R Comment Status X	L 2	# 177	
Comment Type T feature remote-m cuggestedRemedy	nib-retrieval-initiate is badly names.	We are not dea	ing with a MIB.	Cl 8 SC 8.5. Jones, Peter Comment Type T incorrect reference SuggestedRemedy	.2 P 203 Cisco R Comment Status X			

C/ 8 SC **8.5.2**

IEEE P802.3.2a D1.0 YANG Rev Task Force Initial Working Group ballot comments

	SC 8.5.2	P 209	L 22	# 187	CI 8 SC	8.5.2	P 212	L 29	# 189
Huber, Thoma	as	Nokia			Huber, Thomas		Nokia		
Comment Type	e T	Comment Status X			Comment Type	т	Comment Status X		
The descri	iption for 'oa	mmtu' could be improved to b	etter reflect the r	neaning of the leaf	The descrip	tion for 'oa	mmtu' could be improved to be	etter reflect the	meaning of the leaf
SuggestedRen	nedy				SuggestedReme	edy			
OAM entiti	ies exchange	n to "The maximum OAMPDU e the maximum size they can imum OAMPDU sizes."			entities exch	ange the	n to "The maximum OAMPDU maximum size they can suppo MPDU sizes."		
Proposed Res	ponse	Response Status O			Proposed Respo	onse	Response Status O		
CI8 S	SC 8.5.2	P 209	L 37	# 188	C/ 8 SC	8.5.2	P 217	L1	# 190
Huber, Thoma	as	Nokia			Huber, Thomas		Nokia		
Comment Type	e T	Comment Status X			Comment Type	т	Comment Status X		
Description	n for 'mode'	could be improved to better re	flect the meanin	g of this leaf			s defind in clause 30.11.2 of 80		
SuggestedRen	nedy				requests pe should be a		7.1.2 item c 2. A YANG definiti	on for the mana	iged objects in 30.3.1.
		n to "This object configures the			SuggestedReme				
OAM peer	eneity, while	provides capabilities to initiate e passive mode waits for the p crementing the revision field of	peer to initiate ac	tions with it. Changing	See separat	e file for d	etailed proposal for what to ad eed further discussion wrt whe		
	12) and trigg	ers the OAM discovery proces ult value is implementation-de	ss if the operation		Proposed Respo	onse	Response Status O		
	al'. The defa	iuit value is implementation-ue							
operationa		Response Status O							
operationa			L 2	# [178					
operationa Proposed Resp Cl 8 S	ponse	Response Status O	L2	# 178					
[°] operationa Proposed Resp Cl 8 S Jones, Peter Comment Type	ponse SC 8.5.2 e TR	Response Status 0 P212		# [178					
¹ operationa Proposed Resp Cl 8 S Jones, Peter Comment Type mib-retriev	ponse SC 8.5.2 e TR val is badly n	Response Status 0 P212 Cisco Comment Status X		# [<u>178</u>]					
['] operationa Proposed Resp Cl 8 S Jones, Peter Comment Type mib-retriev SuggestedRen change "-n	ponse SC 8.5.2 e TR val is badly n <i>medy</i> mib-"- to "-da	Response Status O P 212 Cisco Comment Status X amed. We are not dealing wit	h a MIB.						

CI 8 SC 8.5.2