

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 0 SC 0 P0 L0 # [-1]

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications

Comment Type ER Comment Status D

MEC comment: Normative references; There are several references in that draft that do not appear to be needed to implement this standard and I suggest removing them or moving them to an informative bibliography.

The list follows:

IEEE Std 802, 802d, 802.1Q

RFC 2819, 3621, 3635, 6991, 8342, 8343

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to propped proposed Response

Moved the listed references to an informative bibliography

Cl 0 SC 0 P L # [-7]

Berger, Catherine Editorial Coordination

Comment Type GR Comment Status D

References listed in Clause 2 shall be cited in the normative text within the document so that their role and relationship are understood by the user for implementation of the standard. Several references in that draft do not appear to be needed to implement this standard, and I suggest removing them or moving them to an informative bibliography.

They are as follows:

□IEEE Std 802-2014: It seems like it is only used once as a reference in the YANG files, not attached to a shall statement.

□IEEE Std 802d

□IEEE Std 802.1Q: The only reference I can find is to IEEE Std 802.1Qcw frame preemption in 5.1, and it seems more like just a citation than a normative use.

□IETF RFC 8342

Please also look over the use of the RFCs in your draft. Although they are cited within the draft, it is not clear to me that all are necessary to have on hand to implement this standard.

SuggestedRemedy

Please review the normative references, especially those called out in my comment, and remove/move those as appropriate.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to propped proposed Response

Moved the following references to an informative annex. Under editorial license allow edito to move all other none normative reference to informative annex

IEEE Std 802, 802d, 802.1Q

RFC 2819, 3621, 3635, 6991, 8342, 8343

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 0 SC 0 P0 L0 # I-3

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications

Comment Type GR Comment Status D

There are multiple editorial notes encouraging contributions to specific models - draft is open for comments, no special encouragement is needed at this stage

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the editorial notes with the following text
 "Contributions to complete the ieee802-ethernet-pse is encouraged"
 "IEEE 802.3.2 task force is encouraged to provide contributions defining the missing Yang definitions"
 "IEEE 802.3.2 task force is encouraged to provide contributions defining the missing Yang definitions and module for Ethernet MAU"
 "MAC merge yang module is missing descriptions marked with "Missing description D1.2 2024-04-04""

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to propsed proposed Response

Cl 0 SC 0 P7 L63 # I-20

McClellan, Brett Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status D

change McClellan to McClellan

SuggestedRemedy

change McClellan to McClellan

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to propsed proposed Response

Cl 1 SC 1.4 P15 L1 # I-26

Parsons, Glenn Ericsson AB

Comment Type E Comment Status D

In 802.1 both the MIBs and the YANG are also attached to the PDF.

SuggestedRemedy

Consider also attaching the machine readable files to the PDF at publication. If so this should be also indicated in this clause.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to proposed Response

Attach YANG files to future 802.3.2 Drafts. In addition refer this request to IEEE SA Editorial staff for consideration during preparation for publication.

Cl 1 SC 1.4 P15 L20 # I-25

Parsons, Glenn Ericsson AB

Comment Type T Comment Status D

This only refers to formatting ... it does not indicate what to do if the github version differs from what is in the standard

SuggestedRemedy

Replace the last sentence with:

I case of any discrepancies between the machine-readable files for the YANG modules and this standard, this standard take precedence. However, in case of any formatting discrepancies, the published machine-readable files should be consulted.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to proposed Response

Treat the Github published modules as normative. Changed the last sentence to read: "In case of any discrepancies, the github published machine-readable files is the authoritative version."

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 3 SC 3.1 P19 L10 # I-8

Zalewski, Janusz Florida Gulf Coast University

Comment Type E Comment Status D

Definition of "data model" is incorrectly formulated. The defined term MUST NOT be repeated in the body of the definition. A correct definition may look like this: "model that describes how data are represented and accessed". Please also note that in IEEE publications the term "data" is plural, not singular. See, for example: <https://journals.ieeeauthorcenter.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/7/jsen.pdf>

SuggestedRemedy

data model. model that describes how data are represented and accessed

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to proposed Response

Cl 3 SC 3.2 P19 L12 # I-9

Zalewski, Janusz Florida Gulf Coast University

Comment Type E Comment Status D

Definition of "YANG module" is incorrectly formulated. The defined term MUST NOT be repeated in the body of the definition. A correct definition may look like this: "module that defines a hierarchy of nodes that can be used for NETCONF-based (see IETF RFC 7803) and RESTCONF-based (see IETF RFC 8040) operations.

SuggestedRemedy

YANG module. module that defines a hierarchy of nodes that can be used for NETCONF-based (see IETF RFC 7803) and RESTCONF-based (see IETF RFC 8040) operations

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to proposed Response

Cl 3 SC 3.2 P19 L13 # I-10

Zalewski, Janusz Florida Gulf Coast University

Comment Type E Comment Status D

A definition MUST BE a single sentence. All additional sentences shall appear preceded by a "Note" keyword.

SuggestedRemedy

In a definition of "YANG module", start the second sentence at a new paragraph and precede it by Note, to read as follows:

Note. With its definitions and the definitions it imports or includes from elsewhere, a module is self-contained and can be compiled.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to proposed Response

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P47 L1 # I-23

Parsons, Glenn Ericsson AB

Comment Type E Comment Status D

As there are multiple modules this heading should be plural

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "YANG modules"

Ans also in the text "In the following YANG module definitions..."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to proposed Response

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P47 L4 # I-24
 Parsons, Glenn Ericsson AB
 Comment Type T Comment Status D
 This is confusing, I cannot tell which takes precedence. I think it should be the YANG module.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to
 .. should any discrepancy between the text of the description for individual YANG nodes in the YANG modules of this clause and the corresponding definition in 5.2 through 5.3 of this clause occur, the definitions and mappings in the YANG modules in 5.3.2 shall take precedence.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to proposed Response
 Remove the paragraph altogether. Statement on precedence in 1.4, which is sufficient.
 Removed the first para in 5.3.2, 6.5.2, 7.4.2, and 8.5.2.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P47 L21 # I-2
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
 Comment Type E Comment Status D
 Multiple references to 802.3.1, when 802.3.2 is intended
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change any references of "IEEE 802.3.1-2019" to "IEEE 802.3.2-2019"
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to proposed Response
 Changed all instances of "IEEE 802.3.1-2019 version and will be updated at the publication time" to "IEEE 802.3.2-2019 version and will be updated at the publication time" contained in editors note.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P47 L44 # I-11
 Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D
 In module ieee802-ethernet-interface:
 White space changes.
 Simplify descriptions.
 Move "import iana-if-type" up in file
 import of new ieee802-ethernet-phy-type module
 Obsolete dynamic-rate-control objects
 Only used by obsolete 10GBASE-W, Clause 49 10 Gb/s 64B/66B and Clause 50
 WIS
 Simplify descriptions for PAUSE frame objects.
 Update description for augment "/if:interfaces/if:interface" to remove "P2P" restriction.
 Clean up "Discontinuities in the values of counters" in descriptions.
 Simplify descriptions for PAUSE frame objects.
 Simplify descriptions for LPI counters.
 Add
 Leaves
 phy_type.
 pmd_type.
 Containers
 pause.
 Obsolete
 Leaves
 speed – already in interfaces objects.
 Containers
 flow-control
 SuggestedRemedy
 Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-interface as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-interface.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.
 Also replace the text in 5.3.1.1 ieee802-ethernet-interface with the text in ieee802-ethernet-interface.tree.
 Proposed Response Response Status W
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 In module ieee802-ethernet-interface, implemented the following changes:
 - Moved "import iana-if-type" up in file
 - Obsoleted dynamic-rate-control objects.
 - Updated description for augment "/if:interfaces/if:interface" to remove "P2P" restriction.
 - Added:
 Leaves
 phy_type.
 Pmd_type.
 Containers

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

- pause.
- Obsoleted
- Leaves
- speed – already in interfaces objects.
- Containers
- flow-control

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.2 P62 L55 # I-12

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status D

In module ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex:
 Change module description given 10BASE-T1S/M are half-duplex
 Obsolete dynamic-rate-control objects
 Only used by obsolete 10GBASE-W, Clause 49 10 Gb/s 64B/66B and Clause 50 WIS
 White space changes

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.
 Also replace the text in 5.3.1.2 ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex with the text in ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex.tree.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In module ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex, implemented the following changes:
 - Changed module description given 10BASE-T1S/M are half-duplex
 - Obsoleted dynamic-rate-control objects

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P67 L22 # I-13

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status D

In module ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge:
 description simplification and cleanups
 add typedef enable-disable to avoid copy/paste definitions
 add "Discontinuities in the values of counters" boilerplate for statistics container

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.
 Also replace the text in 5.3.1.3 ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge with the text in ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge.tree.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In module ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge, implemented the following changes:
 - added typedef enable-disable to avoid copy/paste definitions
 - added "Discontinuities in the values of counters" boilerplate for statistics container

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P68 L12 # I-4

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications

Comment Type TR Comment Status D

Change the "if-feature "mac-merge";" description to read "Defines the MAC Merge extensions for Ethernet interfaces"

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P68 L15 # I-5

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications

Comment Type TR Comment Status D

Change the "container mac-merge" description to read "Defines the container for the MAC Merge extensions for Ethernet interfaces"

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 **SC 5.3.2.3** **P68** **L19** # **I-6**
 Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications
Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **D**
 Change the "container admin-control" description to read "Defines the admin control container for the MAC Merge extensions for Ethernet interfaces"
SuggestedRemedy
 Per comment
Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 5 **SC 5.3.2.4** **P73** **L60** # **I-14**
 Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.
Comment Type **GR** **Comment Status** **D**
 In module ieee802-ethernet-ldp:
 import of new ieee802-ethernet-phy-type module
 add "config false" to " augment "/lldp:lldp/port" {"
 description cleanups
 remove unneeded "config false;" for leaves in augment "/lldp:lldp/port/lldp:remote-systems-data" {
 Add
 Comments for "leaf block" functional areas
 Leafs
 auto-negotiation-cap-bits
 operational-pmd-type
 local-max-frame-size
 Link Aggregation leaves
 Obsolete
 Leafs
 auto-negotiation-cap – PHY/PMD types now defined.
 auto-negotiation-cap-bits – PHY/PMD types now defined
SuggestedRemedy
 Incorporate changes to D3.0 module module ieee802-ethernet-ldp as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in module ieee802-ethernet-ldp.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.
 Also replace the text in 5.3.1.4 ieee802-ethernet-ldp with the text in ieee802-ethernet-ldp.tree.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In module ieee802-ethernet-ldp:
 - add "config false" to " augment "/lldp:lldp/port" {"
 - removed unneeded "config false;" for leaves in augment "/lldp:lldp/port/lldp:remote-systems-data" {
 - Added
 Comments for "leaf block" functional areas
 Leafs
 auto-negotiation-cap-bits
 operational-pmd-type
 local-max-frame-size
 Link Aggregation leaves
 - Obsoleted
 Leafs
 auto-negotiation-cap – PHY/PMD types now defined.
 Auto-negotiation-cap-bits – PHY/PMD types now defined

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.4 P107 L35 # I-15

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status D

Add new subclause after 5.3.2.4 for new ieee802-ethernet-phy-type module based on IANA-MAU-MIB REVISION 202309070000Z

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate new module ieee802-ethernet-phy-type as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-phy-type.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.
 Also incorporate the text in ieee802-ethernet-phy-type.tree into new subclause after 5.3.1.4 ieee802-ethernet-ldp.
 In "5.1 YANG module structure", add "ieee802-ethernet-phy-type YANG module contains definitions including PHY type, PMD type, etc" after the paragraph starting "ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge YANG module contains..."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Amend MAU-MIB YANG, indicating it is correct as of date of writing. Additionally add note regarding MAU-MIB may in future be maintained by an external organization (IANA).

The latest IANA MAU MIB is located here <https://www.iana.org/assignments/ianamau-mib/ianamau-mib>, and the latest version is 202404020000Z. Task Force discussion is needed to address the problem of building a YANG module for a MIB that is maintained by an external organization (IANA).

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.4 P107 L35 # I-16

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status D

Add new subclause after 5.3.2.4 for new ieee802-ethernet-phy module based on IEEE8023-MAU-MIB

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate new module ieee802-ethernet-phy as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-phy.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering. Also incorporate the text in ieee802-ethernet-phy.tree into new subclause after 5.3.1.4 ieee802-ethernet-ldp.
 In "5.1 YANG module structure", add "ieee802-ethernet-phy YANG module contains definitions for managing IEEE Std 802.3 PHY devices after the paragraph starting "ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge YANG module contains..."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Amend MAU-MIB YANG, indicating it is correct as of date of writing. Additionally add note regarding MAU-MIB may in future be maintained by an external organization (IANA).

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P113 L33 # I-17

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status D

In module ieee802-ethernet-pse:
 obsolete ieee802-ethernet-pse.yang from 802.3.2-2019

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-pse as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-pse.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Accept change in principle of moving PSE function in a new namespace, consult YANGSTERS on how to handle deprecation of module

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P124 L1 # I-18

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status D

Add new subclause after 6.5.1.1 ieee802-ethernet-pse for new ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024 module based on 802.3.2-2019 ieee802-ethernet-pse.yang

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate new module ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024 as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.

Also incorporate the text in ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024.tree into new subclause after

6.5.1.1 ieee802-ethernet-pse.

In "6.2 YANG module structure", change

"The ieee802-ethernet-pse YANG module of this clause is focused on the configuration and monitoring of the Power over Ethernet (PoE) function defined in IEEE Std 802.3, including power via MDI, as well as Power over Data Line which can also be considered as the single pair PoE. The module augments the ieee802-ethernet-interface YANG module with attributes for the PoE function. The module is partitioned into two major containers.

The PoE PSE container describes a multi-pair PSE, while the PoDL PSE describes a single-pair PSE." to

"The ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024 YANG module of this clause is focused on the configuration and monitoring of Power over Ethernet (PoE) functions defined in IEEE Std 802.3, including:

Clause 33: Power over Ethernet over 2 Pairs

Clause 104: Power over Data Lines (PoDL) of Single-Pair Ethernet

Clause 145: Power over Ethernet

The module augments the ieee802-ethernet-interface YANG module with attributes for PoE.

The PoE PSE container has two sub-containers for Multi-Pair PoE (Clauses 33 and 145) and Single-Pair PoE (Clause 104).

The ieee802-ethernet-pse YANG module has been deprecated."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Move functionality of PSE into the namespace. Work with YANGSTERS with namespace suggestion

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P185 L28 # I-19

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status D

In module ieee802-ethernet-link-oam: add "master" to loopback-status enum descriptions. Whitespace cleanup for "leaf threshold" description.

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-link-oam as described in P802.3.2_D3.0_peter_jones_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-link-oam.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.

Also replace the text in 8.5.1.1 ieee802-ethernet-link-oam with the text in ieee802-ethernet-link-oam.tree.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In module ieee802-ethernet-link-oam, added "master" to loopback-status enum descriptions.

Proposed Responses

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P191 L18 # I-22

Thomas, Angela RAC Coordination

Comment Type T Comment Status D

8.5.2 indicates that an ASCII text version of the YANG module is available, and gives a link to where it can be found. However, the YANG module that follows in 8.5.2 has many non-ASCII characters. For example, there are many instance of the characters:

aÂ€

As another example, p.191, lines 18 and 19 have the following:

"24-bit MAC addresses aÂ€" large(MAaÂ€"L). Previously know as Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI).";

It is not clear how these non-ASCII characters can be part of an ASCII text file.

SuggestedRemedy

Either provide a YANG file that does not contain non-ASCII characters, or do not indicate in 8.5.2 that the YANG module is ASCII.

Note that "Must Be Satisfied" is set to "No" for this comment because this is not a RAC issue.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to proposed Response

Removed all non-ASCII characters from YANG modules.

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P191 L18 # I-21

Thomas, Angela RAC Coordination

Comment Type ER Comment Status D

The description of 'vendor-oui' includes "24-bit MAC addresses - large(MA-L). Previously know as Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI).", citing IEEE Std 802-2014, Clause 8.2.2. The description of OUI therein was corrected and clarified in IEEE Std 802c-2017, and a new revision, nearing completion, will supersede the 2014 revision. The current description is inaccurate.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the description to "Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI) as assigned to vendor by the IEEE Registration Authority" and the reference to "IEEE Std 802, subclause 8.2.2". Delete "-2014" from "IEEE Std 802(R)-2014" in Clause 2.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Note: CRG group meet on Thursday 19/9-2024 agreed to proposed Response