

Received Comments

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 0 SC 0 P 0 L 0 # I-1

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications

Comment Type ER Comment Status X

MEC comment: Normative references; There are several references in that draft that do not appear to be needed to implement this standard and I suggest removing them or moving them to an informative bibliography.

The list follows:

- IEEE Std 802, 802d, 802.1Q
RFC 2819, 3621, 3635, 6991, 8342, 8343

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 0 SC 0 P L # I-7

Berger, Catherine Editorial Coordination

Comment Type GR Comment Status X

References listed in Clause 2 shall be cited in the normative text within the document so that their role and relationship are understood by the user for implementation of the standard. Several references in that draft do not appear to be needed to implement this standard, and I suggest removing them or moving them to an informative bibliography.

They are as follows:

- IEEE Std 802-2014: It seems like it is only used once as a reference in the YANG files, not attached to a shall statement.
IEEE Std 802d
IEEE Std 802.1Q: The only reference I can find is to IEEE Std 802.1Qcw frame preemption in 5.1, and it seems more like just a citation than a normative use.
IETF RFC 8342

Please also look over the use of the RFCs in your draft. Although they are cited within the draft, it is not clear to me that all are necessary to have on hand to implement this standard.

SuggestedRemedy

Please review the normative references, especially those called out in my comment, and remove/move those as appropriate.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 0 SC 0 P 0 L 0 # I-3

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications

Comment Type GR Comment Status X

There are multiple editorial notes encouraging contributions to specific models - draft is open for comments, no special encouragement is needed at this stage

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the editorial notes with the following text

- "Contributions to complete the ieee802-ethernet-pse is encouraged"
"IEEE 802.3.2 task force is encouraged to provide contributions defining the missing Yang definitions"
"IEEE 802.3.2 task force is encouraged to provide contributions defining the missing Yang definitions and module for Ethernet MAU"
"MAC merge yang module is missing descriptions marked with "Missing description D1.2 2024-04-04""

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 0 SC 0 P 7 L 63 # I-20

McClellan, Brett Marvell Semiconductor, Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status X

change McClellan to McClellan

SuggestedRemedy

change McClellan to McClellan

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 1 SC 1.4 P 15 L 1 # I-26

Parsons, Glenn Ericsson AB

Comment Type E Comment Status X

In 802.1 both the MIBs and the YANG are also attached to the PDF.

SuggestedRemedy

Consider also attaching the machine readable files to the PDF at publication. If so this should be also indicated in this clause.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Received Comments

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 1 SC 1.4 P15 L20 # I-25  
 Parsons, Glenn Ericsson AB  
 Comment Type T Comment Status X  
 This only refers to formatting ... it does not indicate what to do if the github version differs from what is in the standard  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace the last sentence with:  
 In case of any discrepancies between the machine-readable files for the YANG modules and this standard, this standard take precedence. However, in case of any formatting discrepancies, the published machine-readable files should be consulted.  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 3 SC 3.1 P19 L10 # I-8  
 Zalewski, Janusz Florida Gulf Coast University  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 Definition of "data model" is incorrectly formulated. The defined term MUST NOT be repeated in the body of the definition. A correct definition may look like this: "model that describes how data are represented and accessed". Please also note that in IEEE publications the term "data" is plural, not singular. See, for example: <https://journals.ieeeauthorcenter.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/7/jsen.pdf>  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 data model. model that describes how data are represented and accessed  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 3 SC 3.2 P19 L12 # I-9  
 Zalewski, Janusz Florida Gulf Coast University  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 Definition of "YANG module" is incorrectly formulated. The defined term MUST NOT be repeated in the body of the definition. A correct definition may look like this: "module that defines a hierarchy of nodes that can be used for NETCONF-based (see IETF RFC 7803) and RESTCONF-based (see IETF RFC 8040) operations."  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 YANG module. module that defines a hierarchy of nodes that can be used for NETCONF-based (see IETF RFC 7803) and RESTCONF-based (see IETF RFC 8040) operations  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 3 SC 3.2 P19 L13 # I-10  
 Zalewski, Janusz Florida Gulf Coast University  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 A definition MUST BE a single sentence. All additional sentences shall appear preceded by a "Note" keyword.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 In a definition od "YANG module", start the second sentence at a new paragraph and precede it by Note, to read as follows:  
 Note. With its definitions and the definitions it imports or includes from elsewhere, a module is self-contained and can be compiled.  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P47 L1 # I-23  
 Parsons, Glenn Ericsson AB  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 As there are multiple modules this heading should be plural  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to "YANG modules"  
 Ans also in the text "In the following YANG module definitions..."  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2 P47 L4 # I-24  
 Parsons, Glenn Ericsson AB  
 Comment Type T Comment Status X  
 This is confusing, I cannot tell which takes precedence. I think it should be the YANG module.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to  
 .. should any discrepancy between the text of the description for individual YANG nodes in the YANG modules of this clause and the corresponding definition in 5.2 through 5.3 of this clause occur, the definitions and mappings in the YANG modules in 5.3.2 shall take precedence.  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Received Comments

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

CI 5 SC 5.3.2 P47 L21 # [redacted]

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Multiple references to 802.3.1, when 802.3.2 is intended

SuggestedRemedy

Change any references of "IEEE 802.3.1-2019" to "IEEE 802.3.2-2019"

Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 5 SC 5.3.2.1 P47 L44 # [redacted]

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

In module ieee802-ethernet-interface:

- White space changes.
- Simplify descriptions.
- Move "import iana-if-type" up in file
- import of new ieee802-ethernet-phy-type module
- Obsolete dynamic-rate-control objects
  - Only used by obsolete 10GBASE-W, Clause 49 10 Gb/s 64B/66B and Clause 50

WIS

- Simplify descriptions for PAUSE frame objects.
- Update description for augment "/if:interfaces/if:interface" to remove "P2P" restriction.
- Clean up "Discontinuities in the values of counters" in descriptions.
- Simplify descriptions for PAUSE frame objects.
- Simplify descriptions for LPI counters.

Add

- Leaves
  - phy\_type.
  - pmd\_type.
- Containers
  - pause.
- Obsolete
  - Leaves
    - speed – already in interfaces objects.
  - Containers
    - flow-control

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-interface as described in P802.3.2\_D3.0\_peter\_jones\_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-interface.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.

Also replace the text in 5.3.1.1 ieee802-ethernet-interface with the text in ieee802-ethernet-interface.tree.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Received Comments

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.2 P62 L55 # I-12

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

In module ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex:
Change module description given 10BASE-T1S/M are half-duplex
Obsolete dynamic-rate-control objects
Only used by obsolete 10GBASE-W, Clause 49 10 Gb/s 64B/66B and Clause 50 WIS
White space changes

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex as described in
P802.3.2\_D3.0\_peter\_jones\_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-interface-
half-duplex.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white
space and numbering.
Also replace the text in 5.3.1.2 ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex with the text in
ieee802-ethernet-interface-half-duplex.tree.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P67 L22 # I-13

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

In module ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge:
description simplification and cleanups
add typedef enable-disable to avoid copy/paste definitions
add "Discontinuities in the values of counters" boilerplate for statistics container

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge as described in
P802.3.2\_D3.0\_peter\_jones\_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-mac-
merge.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space
and numbering.
Also replace the text in 5.3.1.3 ieee802-ethernet-mac-merge with the text in ieee802-
ethernet-mac-merge.tree.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P68 L12 # I-4

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

Change the "if-feature "mac-merge";" description to read "Defines the MAC Merge
extensions for Ethernet interfaces"

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P68 L15 # I-5

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

Change the "container mac-merge" description to read "Defines the container for the MAC
Merge extensions for Ethernet interfaces"

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.3 P68 L19 # I-6

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communications

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

Change the "container admin-control" description to read "Defines the admin control
container for the MAC Merge extensions for Ethernet interfaces"

SuggestedRemedy

Per comment

Proposed Response Response Status O

Received Comments

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.4 P73 L 60 # I-14

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type GR Comment Status X

In module ieee802-ethernet-lldp:  
 import of new ieee802-ethernet-phy-type module  
 add "config false" to " augment "/lldp:lldp:port" {"  
 description cleanups  
 remove unneeded "config false;" for leaves in augment "/lldp:lldp:port/lldp:remote-  
 systems-data" {  
 Add  
     Comments for "leaf block" functional areas  
     Leafs  
         auto-negotiation-cap-bits  
         operational-pmd-type  
         local-max-frame-size  
         Link Aggregation leaves  
 Obsolete  
     Leafs  
         auto-negotiation-cap – PHY/PMD types now defined.  
         auto-negotiation-cap-bits – PHY/PMD types now defined

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate changes to D3.0 module module ieee802-ethernet-lldp as described in  
 P802.3.2\_D3.0\_peter\_jones\_changes.docx and contained in module ieee802-ethernet-  
 lldp.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and  
 numbering.  
 Also replace the text in 5.3.1.4 ieee802-ethernet-lldp with the text in ieee802-ethernet-  
 lldp.tree.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.4 P107 L 35 # I-15

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

Add new subclause after 5.3.2.4 for new ieee802-ethernet-phy-type module based on IANA-  
 MAU-MIB REVISION 202309070000Z

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate new module ieee802-ethernet-phy-type as described in  
 P802.3.2\_D3.0\_peter\_jones\_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-phy-  
 type.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and  
 numbering.  
 Also incorporate the text in ieee802-ethernet-phy-type.tree into new subclause after 5.3.1.4  
 ieee802-ethernet-lldp.  
 In "5.1 YANG module structure", add "ieee802-ethernet-phy-type YANG module contains  
 definitions including PHY type, PMD type, etc" after the paragraph starting "ieee802-  
 ethernet-mac-merge YANG module contains...".

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.3.2.4 P107 L 35 # I-16

Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

Add new subclause after 5.3.2.4 for new ieee802-ethernet-phy module based on IEEE8023-  
 MAU-MIB

SuggestedRemedy

Incorporate new module ieee802-ethernet-phy as described in  
 P802.3.2\_D3.0\_peter\_jones\_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-phy.yang as  
 submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.  
 Also incorporate the text in ieee802-ethernet-phy.tree into new subclause after 5.3.1.4  
 ieee802-ethernet-lldp.  
 In "5.1 YANG module structure", add "ieee802-ethernet-phy YANG module contains  
 definitions for managing IEEE Std 802.3 PHY devices after the paragraph starting "ieee802  
 -ethernet-mac-merge YANG module contains...".

Proposed Response Response Status O

Received Comments

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

**Cl 6**      **SC 6.5.2**                      **P113**      **L33**                      # **[-17]**  
 Jones, Peter                                      Cisco Systems, Inc.  
**Comment Type**    **TR**                      **Comment Status**    **X**  
 In module ieee802-ethernet-pse:  
     obsolete ieee802-ethernet-pse.yang from 802.3.2-2019  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
     Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-pse as described in  
     P802.3.2\_D3.0\_peter\_jones\_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-pse.yang as  
     submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and numbering.  
*Proposed Response*                      **Response Status**    **O**

**Cl 6**      **SC 6.5.2**                      **P124**      **L1**                      # **[-18]**  
 Jones, Peter                                      Cisco Systems, Inc.  
**Comment Type**    **TR**                      **Comment Status**    **X**  
 Add new subclause after 6.5.1.1 ieee802-ethernet-pse for new ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024  
 module based on 802.3.2-2019 ieee802-ethernet-pse.yang  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
     Incorporate new module ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024 as described in  
     P802.3.2\_D3.0\_peter\_jones\_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-pse-  
     2024.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space  
     and numbering.  
     Also incorporate the text in ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024.tree into new subclause after  
     6.5.1.1 ieee802-ethernet-pse.  
     In “6.2 YANG module structure”,  
     change  
     “The ieee802-ethernet-pse YANG module of this clause is focused on the configuration  
     and monitoring of the Power over Ethernet (PoE) function defined in IEEE Std 802.3,  
     including power via MDI, as well as Power over Data Line which can also be considered as  
     the single pair PoE. The module augments the ieee802-ethernet-interface YANG module  
     with attributes for the PoE function. The module is partitioned into two major containers.  
     The PoE PSE container describes a multi-pair PSE, while the PoDL PSE describes a  
     single-pair PSE.”  
     to  
     “The ieee802-ethernet-pse-2024 YANG module of this clause is focused on the  
     configuration and monitoring of Power over Ethernet (PoE) functions defined in IEEE Std  
     802.3, including:  
     Clause 33: Power over Ethernet over 2 Pairs  
     Clause 104: Power over Data Lines (PoDL) of Single-Pair Ethernet  
     Clause 145: Power over Ethernet  
     The module augments the ieee802-ethernet-interface YANG module with attributes for  
     PoE.  
     The PoE PSE container has two sub-containers for Multi-Pair PoE (Clauses 33 and 145)  
     and Single-Pair PoE (Clause 104).  
     The ieee802-ethernet-pse YANG module has been deprecated.”  
*Proposed Response*                      **Response Status**    **O**

Received Comments

IEEE P802.3.2a D3.0 Yang Rev Task Force Initial Sponsor ballot comments

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P185 L28 # I-19  
 Jones, Peter Cisco Systems, Inc.  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X  
 In module ieee802-ethernet-link-oam:  
 add "master" to loopback-status enum descriptions.  
 Whitespace cleanup for "leaf threshold" description.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Incorporate changes to D3.0 module ieee802-ethernet-link-oam as described in  
 P802.3.2\_D3.0\_peter\_jones\_changes.docx and contained in ieee802-ethernet-link-  
 oam.yang as submitted to the Task Group chair with editorial license to fix white space and  
 numbering.  
 Also replace the text in 8.5.1.1 ieee802-ethernet-link-oam with the text in ieee802-ethernet-  
 link-oam.tree.  
 Proposed Response Response Status

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P191 L18 # I-21  
 Thomas, Angela RAC Coordination  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X  
 The description of 'vendor-oui' includes "24-bit MAC addresses - large(MA-L). Previously  
 know as Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI).", citing IEEE Std 802-2014, Clause 8.2.2.  
 The description of OUI therein was corrected and clarified in IEEE Std 802c-2017, and a  
 new revision, nearing completion, will supersede the 2014 revision. The current description  
 is inaccurate.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Change the description to "Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI) as assigned to vendor  
 by the IEEE Registration Authority" and the reference to "IEEE Std 802, subclause 8.2.2".  
 Delete "-2014" from "IEEE Std 802(R)-2014" in Clause 2.  
 Proposed Response Response Status

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P191 L18 # I-22  
 Thomas, Angela RAC Coordination  
 Comment Type T Comment Status X  
 8.5.2 indicates that an ASCII text version of the YANG module is available,  
 and gives a link to where it can be found. However, the YANG module that follows  
 in 8.5.2 has many non-ASCII characters. For example, there are many instance of the  
 characters:  
 a€  
 As another example, p.191, lines 18 and 19 have the following:  
 "24-bit MAC addresses a€" large(MAa€"L). Previously know as Organizationally Unique  
 Identifier (OUI).";  
 It is not clear how these non-ASCII characters can be part of an ASCII text file.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Either provide a YANG file that does not contain non-ASCII characters, or do not indicate in  
 8.5.2 that the YANG module is ASCII.  
 Note that "Must Be Satisfied" is set to "No" for this comment because this is not a RAC  
 issue.  
 Proposed Response Response Status