IEEE 802.3ab TASK FORCE PLENARY MEETING

Hyatt Regency, Irvine, CA, March 9-11, 1998

MAIN RESULTS OF THIS MEETING:
- Most comments to Draft 2.0 were discussed and resolved.
- A line-by-line review of Draft 2.0 was conducted thru page 28.
- Eliminated the 3 dB coding gain option.
- Modified the PHY control diagram by eliminating BYPASS=TRUE
- We decided not to go to Working Group ballot in March. The target date is July.

NEXT INTERIM MEETING: April 27-28, 1998. Merrimack Hotel & Conference Center, New Hampshire.
NEXT PLENARY MEETING: July 6-8, 1998, Hyatt Regency, La Jolla, CA.

***MINUTES (Approved 4/28/98)

***MONDAY, MARCH 9, 1998

The meeting was called to order by George Eisler, Chairman, at 9:05 am. The list of the 85 attendees is part of these minutes.

The minutes for the Interim Meeting in San Jose, February 12-13, 1998 were approved by acclamation as posted on the reflector on 2/14/98 and with a correction posted by Dan Dove on 2/17/98. The approved minutes were posted on the reflector on 3/9/98.

George Eisler discussed the agenda for the meeting, which is part of these minutes.

Colin Mick, editor, led all morning the discussion of comments received for Draft 2.0. A paper copy of the 50 comments is enclosed with these minutes.

Several presentations were made in support of the existing Draft 2.0.

PRESENTATION 1: "802.3ab Signal Detect Reliability" by Andrew Castellano (paper copy is attached to these minutes).

PRESENTATION 2: "Further Simulation Results for the Startup Protocol Approved in Montreal" by Oscar Agazzi et al. (paper copy is attached to these minutes).

Jaime Kardontchik withdrew his comments #1, 2, 3, 4, 5, and 50.

COMMENT RESOLUTION MOTION (technical---failed): "Move to adopt the resolution of comment #7"
Moved by Mick, seconded by Eisler. In favor: 1; Against: 9; Abstain: 22. Motion failed.

Discussion of other comments to the draft followed.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:00 noon.

During the afternoon, an informal group met to review the 1000 Base-T tutorial to be presented to the 802.3 Working Group on Tuesday evening.

***TUESDAY, MARCH 10, 1998

During the morning, George Eisler gave a status report to the 802.3 Working Group (paper copy is attached to these minutes). During that meeting, the Working Group gave direction to the 802.3ab Task Force in the form of a strawpoll of registered voters. In this vote, 63 members preferred only one solution for the startup and 2 members voted for two solution startup. The Working Group also requested that the Task Force decides which solution to implement.

In the afternoon, the meeting of the 802.3ab Task Force was called to order by George Eisler, Chairman, at 2:00 pm.

MOTION 1 (technical---approved): "Make 6 dB FEC the only channel coding"
Moved by Gladstone, seconded by Mick.
In favor: 22; Nobody against; Abstain: 27. Motion 1 passed.

Discussion proceeded about the startup protocol.

MOTION 2 (technical---tabled): "To remove BYPASS = TRUE option from the PHY control state diagram and associated text"
Moved by McConnell, seconded by Fisher.

MOTION 3 (procedural---approved): "Move to table"
Moved by Jover, seconded by Nobakht. In favor: 28; Against: 14; Abstain: 18. Motion 3 passes, so Motion 2 was tabled.

COMMENT RESOLUTION MOTION (technical---failed): "Move to adopt the resolution of comment #38"
Moved by Mick, seconded by Eisler. In favor: 1; Against: 13; Abstain: 29. Motion failed.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:30 pm.

From 6:30 pm to 8:00 pm a tutorial about 1000Base-T was presented to 802.3 by Colin Mick, Chris DiMinico, Sreen Raghavan, Sailesh Rao and Mehdi Hatamian (paper copy attached to these minutes).

***WEDNESDAY, MARCH 11, 1998

The meeting of the 802.3ab Task Force was called to order by George Eisler, Chairman, at 8:50 am.

Discussion of comments to the Draft 2.0 continued all morning.

PRESENTATION 3: Alien NEXT: "Best Case Cable Hybrid Construction" by Chris Di Minico.

Bill Quackenbush from Cisco addressed the issue of the startup by emphasizing that all devices must have guaranteed interoperability and minimum complexity.

COMMENT RESOLUTION MOTION (technical---postponed): "Move to accept the text proposed by Bob Campbell in replacement of the text in 40.8.3.2."
Moved by Campbell, seconded by Flatman. There was a motion to postpone until after lunch. Moved by Gladstone, seconded by Raghavan, In favor: 26; Against: 0; Abstain: 1. Motion was postponed.

LUNCH BREAK from 11:50 am until 1:50 pm.

A line-by-line review of D2.0 was conducted thru page 28.

COMMENT RESOLUTION MOTION (technical---passed): "Move to accept the new text proposed by Bob Campbell and Chris Di Minico in replacement of the text in 40.8.3.2."
Moved by Campbell, seconded by Flatman. In favor: 22; Against: 0; Abstain: 7. Motion passes.

STRAWPOLL: Which startup solution do you favor?
One vote only (first column by individual, second by company).
- Present State Machine   0   0
- Delete Bypass=True (aka "Sequenced" or 3 Phases startup)   32   13
- Delete Bypass=False (aka "Blind" or 1 Phase startup)   13   6
- Either of the last two solutions   12   N/A

COMMENT RESOLUTION MOTION (technical---failed): "Move to accept comment #6 and its resolution."
Moved by Dove, seconded by Castellano. In favor: 2; Against: 20; Abstain: 10. Motion fails.

Having no objections, Motion 2 was taken from the table and discussed again:

MOTION 2 (technical---passes): "To remove BYPASS = TRUE option from the PHY control state diagram and associated text"

Moved by McConnell, seconded by Fisher. In favor: 27; Against: 9; Abstain: 7. Motion 2 passes.

COMMENT RESOLUTION MOTION (technical---passed): "Move to approve the comment resolutions as per votes and direct the editor to make editorial corrections as required to produce a new draft."
Moved by Castellano, seconded by Hatamian. In favor: 32; Against: 0; Abstain: 1. Motion passes.

MOTION 4 (technical---failed): "Ask 802.3 to authorize Working Group Ballot for D2.0, with resolved comments."
Moved by Eisler, seconded by Dove. Rao called the question; having objections to call the question, it was voted 10 in favor to call the question, 19 against, 9 abstained. Discussion on Motion 4 continued. Vote on Motion 4: In favor: 18; Against: 18; Abstain: 6. Motion 4 failed.

Colin Mick agreed to publish Draft 2.1 by March 27, 1998.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:45 pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Juan Jover
Level One Communications, Inc.
Secretary

***ADDENDUM 1: PRELIMINARY AGENDA (as proposed by George Eisler)

Monday, March 9, 1998
9:00AM - 12Noon   Consideration of comments on D2.0
Evening   Tutorial Rehearsal

Tuesday, March 10, 1998
1:00PM - 5:00PM   Technical matters and final Tutorial refinement
6:30PM - 8:00PM   Tutorial

Wednesday, March 11, 1998
8:30AM - 5:00PM   Polishing of Draft and fielding questions from 802.3

Thursday, March 12, 1998
Most of the day   802.3 Plenary considering 802.3z and 802.3ab matters,
including approval of ballotting
Evening   802 Executive Committee meeting

***ADDENDUM 2: ALPHABETICAL LIST OF THE 85 ATTENDEES

Agazzi, Oscar, Broadcom, 714-450-8700, oea@broadcom.com
Amer, Khaled, Rockwell, 714-221-3610, khaled.amer@rss.rockwell.com
Andersson, Ralph, TDK Semiconductor, 530-478-8400, ralpandersson@tsc.tdk.com
Bohbot, Michel, NORDX/CDT, 514-822-7028, michel.bohbot@nordx.com
Bunch, Bill, NSC, 408-721-7274, bill@lan.nsc.com
Campbell, Bob, Lucent, 732-957-2669, rcampbell@lucent.com
Castellano, Andy, Broadcom, 714-450-8700, ajc@broadcom.com
Chen, Michael, Rockwell, 714-221-4844
Chen, Shiang-Ru, Accton, 886-35770270-532, drchen@accton.com.tw
Christ, Chris, Level One, 916-855-5000, chris@level1.com
Cobb, Terry, Lucent
Coleman, Jim, Valor, 619-537-2623, jcoleman@valorinc.com
Coffey, Kelly, Broadcom, 714-450-8700, kcoffey@broadcom.com
Copeland, Greg, IDT, 408-654-6745, copeland@idt.com
Coshin, Simon, 3Com, +44-1442-8032, simon.coshin@3com.com
Creigh, John, Broadcom, 714-450-8700, jcreigh@broadcom.com
Crow, Jim Gye, HRI
Dabiri, Darius, LSI Logic, 408-954-3431, dabiri@lsil.com
Di Minico, Chris, Cabletron, 978-506-6983, diminico@mail.dec.com
Dove, Dan, HP, 916-785-4187, dan_dove@hp.com
Eisler, George, Rockwell, 310-459-9225, geisler@aol.com
Feuerstraeter, Mark, Level One, 916-854-2817, mark@level1.com
Fisher, David, Broadcom, 714-450-8700, fisher@broadcom.com
Flatman, Alay, LAN Technologies, +44-1260-297966, a-flatman@compuserve.com
Fritz, Scott, TDK Semiconductor, 530-478-8271, scott.fritz@tsc.tdk.com
Froke, Rich, Picazo Communications, 408-232-9121, rfroke@picazonet.com
Gladstone, Bruce, ComCore, 818-880-5192, bruce@comcore.com
Hanna, G.Y., Broadcom, 714-450-8700, gyhanna@broadcom.com
Hasley, Lloyd, Motorola, 512-895-3294, lloyd@oakhill.sps.mot.com
Hatamian, Mehdi, Broadcom, 714-450-8700, mehdi@broadcom.com
Heaton, Robert, Rockwell, 714-363-7592, rh@ot1.com
Hinrichs, Henry, Pulse, 619-674-8208, henryhinrichs@pulseeng.com
Jensen, Ernie, Magcon, 619-513-2140, ejensen@magconinc.com
Jin, Robert, SEEQ, 510-226-7400, jin@seeq.com
Joergensen, Thomas, Intel, +95-44886595, thomas_joergensen@ccm.idk.intel.com
Jonsson, Ragnar H., Rockwell, 359-561-0444, ragnar.jonsson@rss.rockwell.com
Jover, Juan, Level One, 305-674-8880, juan@level1.com
Kardontchik, Jaime, AMD, 408-749-5103, jaime.kardontchik@amd.com
Khuu, Tuan, Datatronics, 909-928-7700, tuan.khuu@datatronics.com
Kidwell, Gary, XACT, Inc., 977-242-6252, garyk@xactinc.com
Koenig, Christine, Magcon, 619-513-2140, ckoenig@magconinc.com
Konda, Kishan, Level One, 916-855-5000, kishan@level1.com
Kruse, Dave, Broadcom, 714-450-8700, kruse@broadcom.com

Lackner, Hans, Hilan, +49-721-625180, hans.lackner@hilan.de
Lam, DU-Tuan, Silicon Dynamics, 408-328-3245, dutuan@sidynamics.com
Law, David, 3Com, +44-1442-438060, davel@pdd.3Com.com
Leing, Fred, Acer Lab, 408-467-7449, fre-leing@acer.com
Li, Liang, Rockwell, 714-221-7813, liang@nb.rockwell.com
Lin, Chan-De, Macronix, 886-3-5788888 x4008, cdlin@mxic.com.tw
Lomelino, Larry, Level One, 916-855-5000, llomelino@level1.com
Lynch, Jeffrey, IBM, 919-254-4454, jjlynch@us.ibm.com
Makarem, Rabih, ADMtek, 714-707-2422, makarem@admtek.com
McConnell, Mike, Broadcom, 714-450-8700, mikem@broadcom.com
Madisetti, Avi, Broadcom, 714-450-8700, madisett@broadcom.com
Miao, Tremont, ADI, 781-937-1222, tremont.miao@analog.com
Mick, Colin, The Mick Group, 650-856-3666, ckm@mickgroup.com
Mills, Andy, Rockwell, 714-221-5462, andy.mills@rss.rockwell.com
Monarski, Peter, Transition Networks, 612-941-7600, peterm@transition.com
Murphy, Denis, Pulse, 619-674-8317, denismurphy@pulseeng.com
Naganuma, Ken, Toko America, 847-635-3246, knaganuma@tokoam.com
Nobakht, Ramin, Rockwell, 714-221-6862, ramin.nobakht@rss.rockwell.com
Nootbaar, Mike, TDK Semiconductor, 530-478-8593, mike.nootbaar@tsc.tdk.com
Oh, Stephen, NSC, 408-721-2326, stephen.oh@nsc.com
Pieters, Robert A.J., TD, 530-478-8262, robert.pieters@tsc.tdk.com
Proffit, John, Motorola, 770-729-7112, john.proffit@email.mot.com
Pryor, Steve, Compaq, 972-929-6910, steve.pryor@compaq.com
Raghavan, Sreen, ComCore, 619-535-0074, sreen@comcore.com
Rao,Sailesh, Level One, 732-972-0707 x11, sailesh@level1.com
Rees, Huw, GEC Plessey Semi, +44-1793-518759@huw.v.rees@gpsemi.com
Rizk, Ramez, Nano Pulse, 714-435-0522, rrizk@att.mail.com
Rocheleau, Alain, Plaintree System, 613-831-8300, arocheleau@plaintree.com
Rose, Bonnie, Amphenol, 416-291-4401, bonnier@amphenolcanada.com
Ross, Tam, Level One, 916-856-5177, tross@level1.com
Sarkar, Arindam, NEC, 408-588-6713, asarkar@asic.mtvmnec.com
Sendelback, Lee, IBM, 507-253-1039, lsendelback@unet.ibm.com
Takuya, Ura, Fuji Electric Cable, +81-463-94-3721, uratakuya@wics.or.jp
Thomson, Dave, OTI, 714-752-1028
Troulis, Markos, Rockwell, 714-221-7882, markos.troulis@rss.rockwell.com
Verheggen, Bill, Intel, 503-264-8594, william.c.verheggen@ccm.intel.com
Wang, Eric, Davicom, 408-579-8800, eric.wang@davicom.com.tw
Wang, Greg, Delta Products, 570-668-5163, gwang@ca.us.delta.com
Warren, Jeff, IBM, 919-543-7698, jeff1@vnet.ibm.com
Williams, Peter, Scope Communications, 508-786-9600, peter.williams@scope.com
Yousefi, Nariman, Broadcom, 714-450-8700, yousefi@broadcom.com
Yu, Mark, Lucent, 732-949-2185, my@lucent.com