

CI 04 SC 4.4 P 41 L 47 # 1
Umnov, Alexander Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status D

In Figure 40, CAGR for cable is given as 50%, with reference to Figure 18. But Figure 18 does not have this information. Figure 19 mentions 50% as "maximum permitted bandwidth for modems", which is different from actual bandwidth used by user. I think we should determine CAGR from Figure 20 in D1.1. My calculations from Figure 20 show that CAGR is 45% if calculated from 2004 to 2012.

SuggestedRemedy

To change reference in Figure 40 from Figure 18 to either Figure 19 or Figure 20. If editor agrees with the comment and believes that Figure 20 should be used, he can decide to change the number to 45%

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
The figures referenced in Figure 40 are all one lower than the correct number due to the insertion of Figure 1 after Figure 40 was created.

In Figure 40 change the referenced figures from : 1, 12, 14 and 38 to 2, 13, 15 and 39.

For the cable growth rate, the best source seems to be Figure 20 as this is consumption rather than permitted rate. The curve for Figure 20 goes through 1E14 in 2005 and 1.7E15 in 2012 which is a 50% CAGR.

In Figure 40 change the cable reference from Figure 18 to Figure 20.