CI 00 SC 0 P 0 L 0 # 21 COORDINATION, EDITORIAL

Comment Type GR Comment Status A

At the time of submission to the IEEE-SASB, or just prior to publication, you will need to supply email address for each member of the Working Group that worked on this standard. This will ensure that all members of the Working Group receive a complimentary PDF of the published standard.

Suggested Remedy

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Working group chair will update the list.

CI 00 SC 0 P 0 L 0 # 20

COORDINATION, EDITORIAL

Comment Type GR Comment Status A

Separate electronic files of figures shall be supplied in TIFF format (unless created in FrameMaker).

SuggestedRemedy

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Have been provided to Michelle Turner. Will also be posted to the .3 archive.

C/ **01** SC **1.4** P **12** L **46** # 35

TELLADO. JOSE Individual

Comment Type E Comment Status A

The checkerboard constellation generated from taking the maximally spaced M^2/2 points from 2D-PAM-M is called D\_2 in clasical literature. A more accurate description and a reference are included below.

# SuggestedRemedy

Replace1.4.xxx DSQ128: A 128 point double square (DSQ) constellation mapping. This constellation is obtained by taking a 2D constellation with 16-level pulse amplitude modulation (PAM16) on each dimension and eliminating half the points to create a checker board pattern. (See IEEE 802.3 Clause 55.)With: 1.4.xxx DSQ128: The 128 point double square (DSQ) constellation used in 10GBASE-T. This constellation is obtained by taking the 256 two-dimensional points generated by the Cartesian product of two one-dimensional 16-level pulse amplitude modulation (PAM16) constellations and eliminating every other point to create a checkerboard lattice. This checkerboard constellation is called D 2 in the literature. For further information on D\_2, see reference [BxD\_2]. (See IEEE 802.3 Clause 55.)[BxD 2] 'Coset Codes I', D. Forney, page 1132 IEEE Trans. Info. Theory Vol. 34, No 5, Sept 1988. Similarly in (SC 55.1.3.1, page 82, line 25) replace. The DSQ128 symbols are obtained by concatenating two time-adjacent 1D PAM16 symbols and retaining among the 256 possible combinations, 128 maximally spaced 2D symbols. With: The DSQ128 symbols are obtained by concatenating two time-adjacent 1D PAM16 symbols and retaining among the 256 possible Cartesian product combinations, 128 maximally spaced 2D symbols. The resulting checkerboard constellation is called D 2 in the literature (see reference [BxD 2]).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add the following reference to the bibliography section in the appropriate format:

[BxD\_2] 'Coset Codes I', G. D. Forney, page 1132 IEEE Trans. Info. Theory Vol. 34, No 5, Sept 1988.

Replace 1.4.xxx DSQ128: . . .

with the following text:

1.4xxx DSQ128: The 128 point double square (DSQ) constellation mapping used in 10GBASE-T. This constellation is obtained by taking a 2D constellation with 16-level pulse amplitude modulation (PAM16) on each dimension and eliminating half the points to create a checker board pattern. This constellation is called D\_2 in the literature. (See IEEE 802.3 Clause 55 and [BxD\_2].)

In 55.1.3.1, page 82, line 25 replace:

The DSQ128 symbols are obtained by concatenating two time-adjacent 1D PAM16 symbols and retaining among the 256 possible combinations, 128 maximally spaced 2D

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ **01** SC **1.4** 

Page 1 of 9 4/18/2006 10:32:02 AM symbols.

With:

The DSQ128 symbols are obtained by concatenating two time-adjacent 1D PAM16 symbols and retaining among the 256 possible Cartesian product combinations, 128 maximally spaced 2D symbols. The resulting checkerboard constellation is called D\_2 in the literature (see reference [BxD\_2]).

Based on checking the provided bibliographic reference, the editor replaced the phrase "is called D\_2" in the suggested remedy with the phrase "is based on a lattice called RZ^2". D\_2 and RZ^2 are identified as equivalent on page 1132 of the reference. The reference uses RZ^2 more frequently and RZ^2 is a lattice rather than a constellation. The editor also changed the page numbers in the bibliography entry to reflect the whole paper and not a specific page to be consistent with the IEEE style guidelines.

C/ 01 SC 1.4

P **12** 

L 47

# 34

TELLADO, JOSE

Individual

Comment Type E Comment Status A

The 128 point checkerboard constellation generated from a 2D-PAM16 has been labeled 128D\_2 in the literature (e.g. see clasic paper by Forney'88).

SuggestedRemedy

Replace all instances of DSQ128 to 128D\_2. This includes SC 1.4, SC30, SC44, SC 45 and SC 55

Response

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

On page 79, line 47, in Clause 55, at the first instance of the description of the constellation, add a footnote saying:

The DSQ128 symbols are obtained by concatenating two time-adjacent 1D PAM16 symbols and retaining among the 256 possible Cartesian product combinations, 128 maximally spaced 2D symbols. The resulting checkerboard constellation is called D\_2 in the literature (see reference [BxD\_2]).

Based on checking the provided bibliographic reference, the editor replaced the phrase "is called D\_2" in the suggested remedy with the phrase "is based on a lattice called RZ^2". D\_2 and RZ^2 are identified as equivalent on page 1132 of the reference. The reference uses RZ^2 more frequently and RZ^2 is a lattice rather than a constellation.

Cl 28B SC 28B.2

P 70 Individual L 6

5

LAW, DAVID J

Comment Type TR

Comment Status A

Subclause 28.2.1.2.2 'Technology Ability Field' now defines the technology ability field as only 7 bits, A0 through A6, with the A7 bit being removed and redefined as Extended Next Page (XNP) bit (see subclause 28.2.1.2.3). Based on this all mention of bit A7 should have been removed from Annex 28B.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove all mention of of bit A7 from this Annex.

Response

Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The commenter has sent email converting this comment from a TR to a T with comment and has switched is ballot to Approve with comment.

Make the following changes (See 28Bchange.pdf showing the proposed changes).

- Delete the two "new" paragraphs in 28B.2. (page 70, lines 9 through 18)
- Delete the change to Table 28B-1, that modified bit A7. (page 70, lines 20 through 28)
- Change text in 28B.2 (2005 edition page 596) to "The Technology bit field consists of bits D5 through D11 (A0-A6, respectively)..."
- Remove the row containing bit A7 from table 28B-1

These changes makes the definition of D12 consistent with the description in Clause 28. This change was overlooked in the resolution of a prior comment that changed clause 28.

C/ 45 SC 45.2.1

P **35** 

Individual

L 49

6

KASTURIA, SANJAY

Comment Type T Comment Status A

In Table 45.3 of 802.3an, which summarizes the PMA / PMD registers:PMA / PMD Control 2 is listed as register 1.6This should be 1.7

SuggestedRemedy

Change 1.6 to 1.7

------g- ---- ---

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Response

This is a correction to make the D3.2 text consistent with the published standard.

This change is editorial in nature and makes the table entry match the rest of the description in the text.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **45** SC **45.2.1** 

Page 2 of 9

4/18/2006 10:32:03 AM

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.10.3 P 41 L 8 # 1 Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.11.2 P 62 L 23 MARRIS. ARTHUR Individual BOOTH, MR BRAD J Individual Comment Type T Comment Status A Comment Type E Comment Status A This subclause should be deleted because it belongs in 802.3ap backplane Ethernet Change present tense to past tense in two locations. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Delete the 1000BASE-KX subclause Change text "mode of operation is selected" to "mode of operation has been selected" in both locations in the paragraph (one for master, one for slave). Response Response Status C Response Response Status U ACCEPT. ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. This deletion is to complete the implementation of a resolution from the previous ballot. The bit was marked reserved but the description was accidentally left in. Defer to the publications editor. Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.2 P 54 L 14 CI 45 SC 45.2.1.60 P 42 L 32 # 7 MARRIS, ARTHUR KASTURIA, SANJAY Individual Individual Comment Type T Comment Status A Comment Type E Comment Status A Is it appropriate to use 'shall' in 7.1.7 in Table 45-119? This is a status register after all. There is a typographical error. MDI/MD-X should read MDI/MDI-X. The same typo occurs on page 43 line 6 SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy Consider changing these two shalls back to wills. Change MDI/MD-X to MDI/MDI-X Response Response Status C Response Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. ACCEPT. Change text in table to say: "1 = Extended next page format is used" CI 45 SC 45.2.7 P **52** L 5 # 2 "0 = Extended next page is not allowed" MARRIS, ARTHUR Individual

Comment Type E Comment Status A

In Table 45-117 the crossed out sections should be removed from the table.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the crossed out rows from Table 45-117

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

These rows have been held for upcoming assignments in either .3ap or .3ag. Remove the strike outs and leave the text there.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

CI 45 SC 45.2.7.2

The description of 7.1.7 in 45.2.7.2.1 has the normative text.

Page 3 of 9 4/18/2006 10:32:03 AM

# 14

CI 45 SC 45.2.7.2 P 54 L 31 # 4 Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.2.3 P 54 L 56 # 13 MARRIS, ARTHUR Individual BOOTH, MR BRAD J Individual Comment Status A Comment Type E Comment Type E Comment Status R Delete R/W from bottom of table 45-119 because this condition is not used in the table. Incorrect register range. SuggestedRemedy SuggestedRemedy As above Change "7.19, 7.22 through 7.27" to be "7.19 through 7.27". Response Response Response Status U Response Status C ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. REJECT. This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter. R/W is used as a column header. Comment will be forwarded to the publication editor for consideration during preparation for The text is correct as is. publication. Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.6 P 57 L 12 # 8 Publications editor is requested to make it consistent with the rest of the standard. BOOTH, MR BRAD J Individual Comment Type E Comment Status A CI 45 SC 45.2.7.2.3 P 54 L 55 # 12 BOOTH, MR BRAD J Individual Missing period at end of sentence. SuggestedRemedy Comment Type E Comment Status R Incorrect register range. As per comment. Response Status C Response SuggestedRemedy ACCEPT. Change from "register 7.16 and 7.19" to "registers 7.16 through 7.21". Response Response Status C CI 45 SC 45.2.7.7 P 57 L 20 # 11 REJECT. BOOTH, MR BRAD J Individual This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter. Comment Type E Comment Status A Table 45-121 is in the middle of the paragraph. SuggestedRemedy Text is correct as is. Move table anchor to end of paragraph to take the table out of the paragraph. Response Response Status U

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Defer to publication editor.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ **45** SC **45.2.7.7**  Page 4 of 9 4/18/2006 10:32:03 AM

CI 55 SC 55.1 P78 L 24 # 28 UNGERBOECK, GOTTFRIED Individual Comment Type E Comment Status R Which management? SuggestedRemedy Write: The 10GBASE-T Management is specified in Clause 30. Response Response Status C REJECT.

The suggested remedy is incorrect. Management is not strictly 10GBASE-T. It could be a unified management layer for all ethernet.

CI 55 SC 55.1.1 P**78** L 28 UNGERBOECK, GOTTFRIED Individual

Comment Type E Comment Status A Bad sequence of words.

SuggestedRemedy Write: The objectives of 10GBASE-T are as follows.

Response Response Status U

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The comment is out of scope but will be referred to the publications editor for consideration during preparation for publication.

Cl 55 SC 55.1.1 P78 L 45 # 30 UNGERBOECK, GOTTFRIED Individual

Comment Type E Comment Status R

Support a BER?... for all supported distances and Classes?

SugaestedRemedy

Write: Achieve a BER of less than or equal to 10^-12 for the link-segment characteristics specified for 10GBASE-T.

Response Response Status C REJECT.

Out of scope and changes the agreed upon text for the objectives.

CI 55 SC 55.3.2.2.18 P101 L49 # 33 TELLADO, JOSE Individual

Comment Type E Comment Status A

DSQ128 has two dimensions/components which are labeled DSQ 1 and DSQ 2 which are PAM16 symbols.

SuggestedRemedy

Since each dimension of the DSQ128 are PAM16 symbols, replace all instances of DSQ128 1 for PAM16 1 and DSQ128 2 for PAM16 2 to indicate the first and second component of the DSQ128. Same with DSQ 1 and DSQ 2.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Change required for consistency in notation due to changes in notation in the THP section in Draft 3.2 as a result of resolution to previous ballot comments.

"for" -> "with"

P117 CI 55 SC 55.4.2.5.1 L36 # 31 UNGERBOECK, GOTTFRIED Individual

Comment Type E Comment Status R

It is not appropriate to define the eight PBO values under the heading "InfoField notation", and then again in 55.4.5.1 three times!

SuggestedRemedy

Delete 55.4.2.5.1 entirely unless more appropriate text can be provided under this heading.

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

Out of scope.

Subclause 55.4.2.5.1 is required since it defines Reseved bits and describes the ordering of bits and octets in the InfoField. The PBO bits are used in several fields and defining here reduces text

C/ 55 SC 55.4.2.5.14 P121 L39 # 32
UNGERBOECK, GOTTFRIED Individual

Comment Type E Comment Status R

The state names PMA\_Training\_Init\_M and PMA\_Training\_Init\_S are unnecessarily long.

SuggestedRemedy

Use PMA\_Training\_M and PMA\_Training\_S.

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

Out of scope.

The phrase 'lnit' is used to differentiate the Initial PMA training that occurs in this state vs the Fine training that occurs in state "PMA\_Fine\_Adjust".

C/ 55 SC 55.4.2.5.14 P122 L15 # 23
UNGERBOECK, GOTTFRIED Individual

Comment Type T Comment Status R

In Draft 3.2 the purpose of the transition counter has been reduced to the irrevocable announcement of state transitions. To announce a state transition it suffices to insert in the InfoFields a non-zero transition\_count, which is decreased by one in successive InfoFields. The three message-field bits trans\_to\_..., or an equivalent single bit trans\_to\_next\_state, are not needed. The state transition should be defined to occur immediately after the InfoField containing transition\_count = 1. The InfoField of the next PMA training frame should then exhibit the new PMA\_state bits and transition\_count should be zero and remain zero until the next state transition is announced (subtle distinction: transition\_counter is a state variable; transition\_count is a sub-field of the InfoFields; the two objects are not the same; transition\_counter always exists; transition\_count exists only within an InfoField).

# SuggestedRemedy

- (a) Eliminate trans\_to\_Coeff\_Exch, trans\_to\_Fine\_Adjust, and trans\_to\_PCS\_Test from the mes-sage field.
- (b) Define in 55.4.5.1 state variable transition\_counter as follows: transition\_counter

A 10-bit counter variable whose value is communicated to the remote PHY in the transition\_count subfield of InfoFields when in transition-counter format. To announce a state transition to the link partner, the PHY sets transition\_counter to a non-zero value. The value is decremented by one after each transmission of an InfoField until the value zero is reached. The announced state transition occurs immediately after transmission of the InfoField containing transition\_count = 1.

Values: 0 - 2^9? (See further comment).

Response Status C

REJECT.

The state transition occurs in the PMA Training frame immediately after the InfoField containing transition\_count = 0 (not =1 as indicated by the comment), as shown in page 122, line 20 and Figs 55-24, 55-25 and 55-26.

Eliminating the transition\_to\_ bit will also prevent the transition counter from being used for other purposes when transition to = 0 and thus prevents future use.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ **55** SC **55.4.2.5.14**  Page 6 of 9 4/18/2006 10:32:03 AM

CI 55 SC 55.4.2.5.4 P118 L12 # 27
UNGERBOECK, GOTTFRIED Individual

Comment Type T Comment Status R

In the now much simplified startup sequence only one PBO exchange can occur. Moreover, the link partner \*must\* change its current PBO setting to the requested PBO setting. There appears to be no logical necessity for sending 'Next transmitter settings' (next PBO). (Initially, this commenter thought that a link partner may be given more freedom in selecting the next PBO setting).

SuggestedRemedy

Remove 'Next transmitter settings' from the InfoField unless there is a good technical justification for keeping it. Keeping unnecessary provisions in a standard does not "break" a standard, but it breaks the confidence of others in the creators of the standard.

Response Response Status C REJECT.

The Next transmitter setting is used to confirm to the link partner the Next PBO to be used.

CI 55 SC 55.4.2.5.6 P118 L33 # 22
UNGERBOECK, GOTTERIED Individual

Comment Type T Comment Status R

The introduction of two PMA\_state bits in the message field of Draft 3.2 has made retention of three separate message-field bits trans\_to\_Coeff\_Exch, trans\_to\_Fine\_Adjust, and trans\_to\_PCS\_Test unnecessary. A single bit trans\_to\_next\_state is sufficient. The next state follows from the PMA state bits.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace trans\_to\_Coeff\_Exch, trans\_to\_Fine\_Adjust, and trans\_to\_PCS\_Test by one bit trans\_to\_next\_state. (Not even this bit is needed as will be seen in the next comment).

Response Status C

REJECT.

The transition bits are currently required to control transitions in the state diagrams PHY Control (55-24). Master transition counter (55-25) and Slave transition counter (55-26).

CI 55 SC 55.4.5.1 P126 L18 # 26 UNGERBOECK, GOTTFRIED Individual

Comment Type T Comment Status R

The variables loc\_rcvr\_status and loc\_SNR\_margin have similar meanings, indicating readiness of the local receiver for allowing PHY Control continue to the next sequential state. loc\_SNR\_margin is used only in states PMA\_Training\_Init\_M/S and is not communicated to the link partner. loc\_rcvr\_status is used only in state PCS\_Test and is communicated via message-field bit loc\_rcvr\_status to the link partner (remark: same name for a state variable and a bit-field in the InfoField). A more uniform concept should be adopted as given below. This not only simplifies the standard, but also improves testability and handling of error situations.

SuggestedRemedy

Retain only loc\_rcvr\_status and use the following definition.

loc rcvr status

This 1-bit variable indicates whether the local receiver operates correctly with sufficient SNR margin to continue to the next state or states. The variable is always communicated to the link partner in message-field bit loc\_rcvr\_status. When entering a new state, loc\_rcvr\_status shall be reset to NOT\_OK even if the local receiver operates correctly. Setting loc\_rcvr\_status to OK represents an affirmative action that confirms (or reconfirms) readiness of the local receiver for a transition to the next state.

Values: OK or NOT\_OK (simpler NOK).

Response Status C

REJECT.

These two variables have two distict functions.

Loc\_rcvr\_status is used to indicate the overall receive link is satisfactory for data operation (DSQ128). Loc\_SNR\_margin is used to indicate that the SNR margin is sufficient to transition to the next PMA training (PAM2) state

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ **55** SC **55.4.5.1**  Page 7 of 9 4/18/2006 10:32:03 AM

CI 55 SC 55.4.5.1 P128 L15 # 25 UNGERBOECK. GOTTFRIED Individual

Comment Type T Comment Status R

Transition\_counter is represented with 10 bits only to support the MASTER's initial value of 2^9 = 512. For an initial value of 511 9 bits would be sufficient. Such nasty little bit wastes can make joyful readers of a supposedly well conceived IEEE standard only angry.

SuggestedRemedy

Reduce transition\_counter and InfoField subfield transition\_count to 9 bits, hence: Values: 0 - 511. --- Alternatively, keep 10 bits and provide additional flexibility. Instead of a fixed initial value of 2^9 for the MASTER and a matching value of >2^6 for the responding SLAVE, let the values corresponding to 2^9 and 2^6 be determined during Auto Negotiation, with values up to 1023.

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

There is no need to make the initial value of transition\_counter value programmable and determined during Auto-Negotiation. Starting the counter at 2^9 is simpler then starting at 2^9-1. The extra bit would become Reserved and there are currently many reserved bits.

The value of saving one bit was considered and determined to be insufficient to merit this change.

 CI 55
 SC 55.4.5.1
 P128
 L7
 # 24

 UNGERBOECK, GOTTFRIED
 Individual

Comment Type E Comment Status R

The current definition of transition\_counter is loaded with details on the use of the transition counter by MASTER and SLAVE. This description should better be given elsewhere.

SuggestedRemedy

Describe how transition\_counter is employed by MASTER and SLAVE in section 55.4.2.5.14 Startup sequence.

Response Status C

REJECT.

The description of transition\_counter is included in 55.4.2.5.14: page 122, line 13

CI 55 SC 55.5.2 P 134 L 28 # 9 BOOTH, MR BRAD J Individual

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Table 55-8. Table text font is too large.

SuggestedRemedy

Reduce font size.

Response Status U

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Defer comment to publications editor.

Comment Type E Comment Status R

The explanation provided is unneeded, and the presence is in fact inconsistent: for other parameters the ratio of input and output is not discussed or shown. The text contains also the possible issue that peak voltage is not appropriate; instead signal power is to be used. The only equation that is needed is the one that computes the ELFEXT. There is no practical change in technical requirements or contents.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace lines 23 through 44 with: ELFEXT is defined in Equation (55-17) as ELFEXT(f) = FEXT\_loss(f) - SLS\_Loss(f) (dB) where FEXT\_loss(f) is the measured FEXT frequency response SLS Loss is the insertion loss of the disturbed channel in dB.

Response Status C

REJECT.

In favor of accepting the proposed response to reject the comment: 18

Opposed: 1 Abstaining: 12 Comment is rejected

The text is identical to 1000BASE-T and provides useful information on the ELFEXT parameter.

The commenter may consider submitting a maintenance request on 802.3 as similar text exists in Clause 40.

CI 55 SC 55.7.3.1.2 P 153 L 40 # 16 KOEMAN, HENRIECUS Individual

Comment Type E Comment Status R

The PS ANEXT constants depend on "length" and not on "distance".

SuggestedRemedy

Replace in the column header of Table 55-14 "distance" with "length".

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

Link segment distance is used consistently throughout and consistent with other 10GbE phys (e.g., operating distance for fiber).

The commenter may consider submitting a maintenance request on 802.3 as similar text exists in Clause 40 and this change would be just one change in isolation.

Cl 55 SC 55.7.3.2.1 P 155 L 10 # 17 KOEMAN, HENRIECUS Individual

Comment Type E Comment Status R

The scaling is based on length which is independent of frequency. All formulas show parameters with a frequency response property as having a "(f)". One such parameter is in fact IL in equation (55-29), which does not have such frequency dependency shown. It may in fact be simpler to take just one value @ 250 MHz to avoid slightly varying ratios. There is no practical change in requirements as a result of this proposed change.

SuggestedRemedy

Include in equation (55-29) the ratio of DisturbedILN@250MHz and CoupledLengthILi,j,N@250MHz. (I could not format using subscripting - I hope this is clear!)

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

In favor of accepting the proposed response to reject the comment: 22 Opposed: 2

Abstain: 9

Comment is rejected

During the WG discussion on comment resolution which resulted in this text, the WG decided not to include the IL at a specific frequency.

CI 55 SC 55.7.3.2.2 P 157 L 21 # 18 KOEMAN. HENRIECUS Individual

Comment Status R The PS AELFEXTEXT constants depend on "length" and not on "distance".

SuggestedRemedy

Comment Type E

Replace in the column header of Table 55-16 "distance" with "length".

Response Response Status C

REJECT.

See response to comment #16

Cl 55 SC 55.7.3.3 P 162 / 16 KOEMAN, HENRIECUS Individual

Comment Status A Equation (55-48) is the incorrect reference. (Oversight!) Should be (55-51).

SuggestedRemedy

Comment Type E

Instead of (55-48) use (55-51).

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

The reference will be changed to a hotlink.

CI 55 SC 55.8 P 164 L 1 # 10

BOOTH, MR BRAD J Individual

Comment Type E Comment Status A

Top of page break associated with 55.8.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to make text continuous.

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.