Re: Pre-ballot Mandatory Editorial Coordination (Pre-ballot MEC)

Dear Sanjay:

I have reviewed Draft 2.1 of IEEE P802.3an™, and I have the following comments. Please note that this review has been organized into two sections and uses the "language of standards" to communicate necessary requirements (shall) of the IEEE-SA standards process versus those issues that are voluntary (should) in nature.

Section I: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the ballot begins

The draft cannot be balloted or recirculated until these issues are resolved. Your Staff Liaison will review the updated draft for compliance prior to upload of the PDF for ballot.

Section II: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the final recirculation

These issues have to be resolved and viewed by balloters. The items will be checked for completion by the Project Editor during the Sponsor ballot, then checked by the Review Committee (RevCom) of the IEEE-SA Standards Board (IEEE-SASB), and will impact approval unless rectified.

Working groups who wish to have a draft that is very close to the published document may want to implement these changes. However, the comments should not affect the approval of the standard.

The following comments are derived from the *IEEE Standards Style Manual*. The complete *IEEE Standards Style Manual*, in viewable/downloadable format, can be found at:

http://standards.ieee.org/guides/style/index.html

SECTION I: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the ballot begins:

Copyright

• If applicable all copyright permission for excerpted text, tables, and figures shall be submitted to the IEEE prior to the start of ballot. If there are missing permission letters, please submit them immediately to your Staff Liaison. Sample permission letters are available in Annex D of the IEEE Standards Style Manual

http://standards.ieee.org/guides/style/index.html.

• The correct copyright line shall appear on the bottom of every page, including the body of the standard (I noticed that the information is on the bottom of each page of the body, but this should also be placed on the cover page.)

Copyright © 2005 IEEE. All rights reserved. This is an unapproved IEEE Standards Draft, subject to change.

.....

SECTION II: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the final recirculation

Trademarks or service marks

- Please review the use of trademarks in the draft, if applicable. References to commercial equipment or products in a standard shall be generic and shall not include trademarks or other proprietary designations. Where a sole source exists for essential equipment or materials, it is permissible to supply the name of the trademark owner in a footnote. The proper use guidelines for trademarks shall be determined by the trademark owner. Trademark owners must grant written permission before their trademarks may be referenced in a standard.
- Trademarks or other proprietary designations that are not commercial equipment or products should be avoided in standards. If used however, all trademarks shall be credited to the trademark owner in the front matter of the standard. The following text shall introduce any mention of specific trademark information:

The following information is given for the convenience of users of this standard and does not constitute an endorsement by the IEEE of these products. Equivalent products may be used if they can be shown to lead to the same results.

Front matter

Please provide an abstract and keyword.

Graphics

• Separate electronic files of figures shall be supplied in TIFF format (unless created in FrameMaker).

.....

Additional Note:

There are a few additional editorial issues in this draft that I noticed on my way through—some inconsistent capitalization, periods outside of parentheses, etc. However, once approved, this draft will be copyedited for grammar, punctuation, syntax, English usage, and style according to the IEEE Standards Style Manual.

Please note that the following are next steps for this project.

- a) After you have implemented this review, create the pdf that will be used for ballot (remember that the draft number shall be rolled to reflect that changes have been made to this document, e.g., P802.3anTM/Dx+1).
- b) Upon completion of the invitation to ballot, upload the pdf that will be used for ballot to http://standards.ieee.org/eprocess/upload balloting file.
- c) Note that compliance with items in Section I will be reviewed by the Staff Liaison when you upload the pdf to the URL in item b). The Project Editor will not review your draft until the Ballot MEC, which occurs during the Sponsor ballot.
- d) The RevCom MEC will occur after you submit the final balloted draft to RevCom. At that time you will also be required to submit the document source file. If the figures are not native FrameMaker graphics, each graphic shall be submitted as a separate TIFF file following the requirements outlined in Clause 16 of the IEEE Standards Style Manual.

http://standards.ieee.org/guides/style/index.html

Thank you for the opportunity to review this draft. If you have any queries about the comments in this mandatory editorial coordination, please contact Michelle Turner via email (m.d.turner@ieee.org).

cc: Andrew Ickowicz