

Minutes, 802.3an Plenary Meeting, Atlanta GA, March15-17, 2005

Tuesday, March 15, 2005

The meeting was opened at 8:45am by the Chair, Brad Booth. George Eisler volunteered to serve as recording secretary. A round of introductions followed and the proposed agenda was presented.

Motion to approve the Agenda as posted.

M: G Zimmerman S: M McConnell

Procedural

Approved by voice.

Motion to approve the minutes of the January 2005 interim meeting as posted.

M: P Thaler S: A Flatman

Procedural

Approved by voice

Motion to approve the minutes of the February 2005 interim meeting as posted.

M: S Muller S: P Thaler

Procedural

Y 32 N 2 A 12

Passes

The Chair then reviewed the Ground Rules for the Task Force. At 9:10am, the Chair read the IEEE-SA Bylaws on Patents in Standards as follows:

6. Patents

IEEE standards may include the known use of essential patents and patent applications provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents whose infringement is, or in the case of patent applications, potential future infringement the applicant asserts will be, unavoidable in a compliant implementation of either mandatory or optional portions of the standard [essential patents]. This assurance shall be provided without coercion and prior to approval of the standard (or reaffirmation when a patent or patent application becomes known after initial approval of the standard). This assurance shall be a letter that is in the form of either:

a) A general disclaimer to the effect that the patentee will not enforce any of its present or future patent(s) whose use would be required to implement either mandatory or optional portions of the proposed IEEE standard against any person or entity complying with the standard; or

b) A statement that a license for such implementation will be made available without compensation or under reasonable rates, with reasonable terms and conditions that are demonstrably free of any unfair discrimination.

This assurance shall apply, at a minimum, from the date of the standard's approval to the date of the standard's withdrawal and is irrevocable during that period.

The Chair next reviewed topics inappropriate for discussion during IEEE meetings, as follows:

Don't discuss licensing terms or conditions

Don't discuss product pricing, territorial restrictions or market share

Don't discuss ongoing litigation or threatened litigation

Don't be silent if inappropriate topics are discussed Do formally object

The process for advancing the Draft to Working Group ballot was then described by the Chair.

Future meetings were then announced:

- Interim during the week of May 16, 2005 in Austin, TX
- Plenary during the week of July 18, 2005 in San Francisco, CA
- Tentative Interim in September, possibly in Madrid, Spain, date and exact location to be announced.

A. Flatman presented a liaison report from the January meeting of ISO/IEC JTC 1 / SC 25 / WG 3 in Ixtapa, Mexico.

The Chief Editor, S Kasturia, reported on the state of draft D1.4, including the items required for completion and the general characterization of comments to be resolved during the meeting.

Resolution of comments received on Draft 1.4, led by the Chief Editor, commenced after a break and resumed again after lunch. The results of the comment resolution process are recorded by the Chief Editor and are available as comments_2_0305.pdf on the Task Force website.

Contribution halder_1_0305 was next presented in conjunction with a comment relating to Power Back Off (POB). POB is to be considered further at this meeting.

Comment resolution resumed after a break.

Contribution alexander_1_0305 was presented in conjunction with comments.

Comment resolution continued until recess for the day at 6:30pm.

Wednesday, March 16 2005

The meeting resumed at 8:30am, continuing with the comment resolution process.

Contribution zimmerman_2_0305 was presented in conjunction with comments concerning the power back off function, which had been previously postponed.

Comment resolution resumed after a break. Contribution ungerboek_1_0305 was presented in connection with comments.

Contribution adriaenssens_1_0305 was presented in connection with comments.

The meeting resumed at 1:45pm after lunch recess with further comment resolution. Contribution kota_1_0305 on Precoding was presented in conjunction with comments.

After a break comment resolution resumed. All technical comments were resolved on draft D1.4.

Motion:

Task Force grant editorial license to the 802.3an editors to respond to unresolved editorial comments as they see fit.

M: J Tellado S: A Flatman

Technical

Approved by voice without opposition

The Chair then reviewed the time line for P802.3an, including limitations on adding new features. In this context it is noted that the Task Force, without opposition, agreed that Programmable Precoding is not considered a new feature.

The Chair further stated that in his opinion that the technical comments that were deferred at the March meeting for resubmission at Working Group ballot by the editor are offering technical changes, not new technical features.

The Chair remarked that there was a large influx of individuals from a specific company into the meeting room and requested that those individuals not vote.

Motion that Draft D1.4 plus resolution of comments to D1.4 be used as the basis for the generation of Draft 2.0.

M: B Woodruff S: J Tellado

Technical

TF Y 37 N 0 A 7

802.3 voters Y 34 N 0 A 4

Passes

Motion that Task Force request that 802.3 circulate IEEE P802.3an Draft 2.0 for 802.3 Working Group Ballot and comment, and conduct recirculations as necessary.

M: G Eisler S: J Tellado

Technical

TF Y 31 N 11 A 3

802.3 Y 28 N 9 A 1

Fails

It was requested that the recording secretary note for the record that the Chair mentioned that “a specific company” brought in 5-6 people prior to the motions on the draft and going to Working Group ballot, and that the Chair mentioned that block voting was noted.

A suggestion for a straw poll by company was made from the floor. The Chair performed a straw poll, by company (one vote per company), on the previous motion was conducted.

Y 22 N 5 A 2

The meeting recessed at approximately 6pm.

Thursday, March 17, 2005

The meeting resumed at 10am.

Identical draft liaison letters to ISO and TR42 were presented.

Motion that the TF approve tia_1_0305 liaison letter.

M G Zimmerman S: A Flatman

Approved by voice

Motion that the TF approve iso_1_0305 liaison letter.

M: G Eisler S: C DiMinico

Approved by voice.

Motion that TF request that 802.3 approve and forward the two liaison letters, with appropriate edits by the Chair (or his appointed agents), to TIA TR-42 and ISO/IEC 11801 JTC 1/SC 25/WG 3.

M: G Zimmerman S: P Kish

Approved by voice.

Motion to adjourn.

M J Jover S A Flatman

Approved by voice.

The meeting adjourned at 10:19am.

George Eisler

Attendees

Last name	First Name
Adriaenssens	Luc
Alexander	Jan
Babanezhad	Joseph N.
Booth	Brad
Bublil	Baruch
Cobb	Terry
Delveaux	Bill
DiMinico	Chris
Dinh	Thuyen
Dove	Dan
Dupuis	Joe
Eisler	George
Flatman	Alan
Griggs	Brian
Halder	Bijit
Jones	William
Jover	Juan
Kasturia	Sanjay
Kish	Paul
Kwentus	Alan
Lapak	Jeff
Law	David
McClellan	Brett
McConnell	Mike
Muller	Shimon
Powell	Scott
Qian	Haoli
Rabinovich	Rick
Rao	Sailesh
Reviriego	Pedro
Rybinski	Valerie
Savi	Olindo
Seki	Katsutoshi
Sigmon	Ned
Sparrowhawk	Bryan
Tazebay	Mehmet

Last name	First Name
Tellado	Jose
Thaler	Pat
Tolley	Bruce
Ungerboeck	Gottfried
Vaden	Sterling
Valliappan	Magesh
Van Bavel	Nick
Vareljian	Albert
Wartski	Dan
Woodruff	Bill
Yair	Darshan
Zimmerman	George