

IEEE P802.3av Task Force Meeting Minutes
New Orleans, LA USA
January 13-15, 2009

Recorded by Eric Lynskey, Teknovus, Inc.

Tuesday, January 13, 2009

Meeting started at 9:05am. At this time, there are 20 Task Force members in the room.

Eric Lynskey graciously volunteered, once again, to be the recording secretary.

The Chair reviewed Bylaws and Rules. Chair emphasized to TF the importance of declaring affiliation.

The Chair reviewed the IEEE Patent Policy (four slides). Chair made call for patents at 9:12am. At this time, no response was received.

The Chair reviewed where the Task Force is in the standardization process.

Chair mentioned the reflector, URL, and private area password. Currently there are 410 subscribers on our reflector.

Motion #1:

Approve the minutes of November 2008 meeting as recorded in 3av_0811_minutes_unapproved.pdf. Post the approved minutes on the TF website as 3av_0811_minutes_approved.pdf.

Moved: Duane Remein
Second: Marek Hajduczenia
(Procedural > 50%)

Passed by voice vote without opposition.

IEEE 802.3 WG has received liaison communications from ITU-T SG15/Q3 titled “SG15 OTNT Standardization Work Plan”. Chair asked TF members to review the document and be prepared to discuss on Wednesday how to or whether to respond to the letter.

Chair reviewed the current timeline as approved in November 2007. A number of other timelines were presented that showed what happens if we do not go to sponsor ballot coming out of this meeting.

Straw Poll #1

We should keep currently approved timeline (as shown on slide 20 of 3av_0901_agenda.pdf)

- Make no technical changes to D2.2
- Start Sponsor Ballot after January 2009 meeting
- Target Standard approval – September 2009

8

We should adopt a new timeline (as shown on slide 21 of 3av_0901_agenda.pdf)

- Create and recirculate D2.3
- Start Sponsor Ballot after March 2009 meeting
- Target standard approval – December 2009

7

We should adopt a new timeline (as shown on slide 24 of 3av_0901_agenda.pdf)

- Create and recirculate D2.3
- Start Sponsor Ballot after March 2009 meeting
- Hold additional interim meeting in June 2009
- Target standard approval – September 2009

2

Continued discussion on timeline and possible schedule slips. There was some discussion on the ramification of withdrawing/rejecting comments now versus making changes now.

A break was taken at 10:20 am with intent to resume at 10:40 am.

Meeting resumes at 10:47 am.

Straw Poll #2

I prefer to (vote for one):

- Make no technical changes to D2.2 7
- Create and recirculate D2.3 12

Motion #2:

Approve the agenda for January 2009 meeting as presented in 3av_0901_agenda.pdf on slide 27.

Moved: Duane Remein

Second: Marek Hajduczenia

(Procedural > 50%)

Passed by voice without opposition.

Straw Poll #3:

Will you be attending the March 2009 802 Plenary in Vancouver, Canada?

- Yes: 11
- No: 0
- Not sure: 8

Straw Poll #4: (Chicago rules)

Will you attend the May 2009 802.3 Interim if it is held in:

- North America: 13
- Europe: 13
- Asia: 15

Straw Poll #5: (Chicago Rules)

Will you attend the September 2009 802.3 Interim if it is held in:

- North America: 12
- Europe: 10
- Asia: 15

For these three straw polls there were 20 in the room.

Comment resolution begins 11:34 am., starting with the TR comments.

Break for lunch at 12:13pm, to resume at 1:45pm.

Meeting resumes at 1:50pm.

Comment resolution continues.

Break at 3:05pm, to resume at 3:30pm.

Meeting resumes at 3:36pm.

Comment resolution continues.

Chair asked if there were any objections to allow Frank Chang to present his post-deadline presentation relating to his pre-deadline comment. No objections were raised.

Break at 5:18pm, to resume at 5:28pm

Meeting resumes at 5:48pm.

Motion #3:

Accept post-deadline comments recorded in 3av_0901_comments_d2_2_late.pdf for consideration at the January 2009 meeting.

Moved: Ryan Hirth

Second: Duane Remein

(Technical $\geq 75\%$ needed)

Y: 18 N: 0 A: 0

Motion passed

There was a discussion on how best to move forward. After discussing with 802.3 Chair, it was decided that comment resolution will continue. At the end of the week a motion will be made to reconsider and reject all comments that were accepted. These comments will then be resubmitted during Sponsor ballot by the editors. An email will be issued to the Task Force to say that comments against D2.2 will be reviewed and considered at this meeting. Comments the TF agrees with will be rejected, but will be re-submitted as comments against D3.0 by the editors. The primary purpose behind this is to advance to Sponsor Ballot coming out of this meeting so that the schedule is not negatively impacted and so the March meeting will be a productive meeting.

Immediately following the recess, the email mentioned above will be crafted by anyone that wishes to contribute and will be sent out later tonight.

Meeting recesses at 6:03pm until Wednesday morning at 9am.

Wednesday January 14, 2009

Meeting starts at 9:08am. At this time, there are 20 Task Force members in the room.

Chair reviews the email that was sent out last night.

Comment resolution continues.

Break at 10:17am to resume at 10:45am.

Meeting resumes at 10:51am.

Chair asks Chief Editor Duane Remein to assume chairmanship for duration of MPCP discussion at 11:25am.

Duane asks if there are objections to reviewing post-deadline presentation by Glen. There are no objections.

Break for lunch at 12:12pm to resume at 1:45pm.

Meeting resumes at 1:48pm.

MPCP discussion ends. Glen resumes chairmanship at 2:37pm.

Chair asks if there is any objection to let Kozaki-san present his post-deadline presentation. There are no objections.

The TF was about to break at 3:05pm, but Marek requested that two more comments were closed before the break. The chair asked for objections but none were voiced.

Break at 3:15pm to resume at 3:47pm.

Meeting resumes at 3:52pm.

Comment resolution ends at 5:30pm. There is one more comment to be addressed in the morning.

Chair asks everyone to review intermediate comment responses and to decide if any of the comments are important enough to fix now or if they can wait until sponsor ballot. A decision will be made tomorrow.

Frank Effenberger goes over ITU liaison letters. After some discussion it is determined that no response is necessary until at least March.

Meeting recesses at 5:55pm until Thursday 9am.

Thursday January 15, 2009

Meeting starts at 9:05am. At this time there are 16 people in the room.

Comment resolution begins.
Last comment is resolved at 9:27am.

Motion #4:

Move that Task Force reconsider all comments with a resolution of ACCEPT or ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Moved: Duane Remein
Second: Marek Hajduczenia
(Technical $\geq 75\%$)
Y: N: A:

Amendment proposed by Alan Brown accepted as friendly to add “individually”.

Move that Task Force reconsider all comments individually with a resolution of ACCEPT or ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Moved: Duane Remein
Second: Marek Hajduczenia
(Technical $\geq 75\%$)
Y: 15 N: 0 A: 0

Motion passed

Comment resolution restarts at 9:40am.

Break at 10:11am, to resume at 10:30am.
Meeting resumes at 10:38am.

Motion #5:

The Task Force instructs the Editors to produce draft 3.0 based from current draft 2.2 by incorporating changes as instructed per comment resolution 3av_0901_comments_d2_2_accepted.pdf.

Moved: Duane Remein
Second: Marek Hajduczenia
(Technical \geq 75%)
Y: 15 N: 0 A: 1

Motion passed

Motion #6:

The 802.3av Task Force affirms that all changes made between draft 2.2 and draft 3.0 are editorial in nature and non-substantive. The Task Force requests that the 802.3 Working Group Chair to initiate Sponsor Ballot on P802.3av/D3.0.

Moved: Duane Remein
Second: Marek Hajduczenia
(Technical \geq 75%)
Y: 17 N: 0 A: 0

Motion passed

Motion #7:

Move to adjourn.

Moved: Jeff Mandin
Second: Duane Remein

Passed by voice without opposition.

Meeting adjourns at 12:31pm.

Attendance List

First Name	Affiliation	Attendance		
		Tuesday, 13 Jan 2009	Wednesday, 14 Jan 2009	Thursday, 15 Jan 2009
Haim Ben Amram	PMC Sierra	x	x	
Alan Brown	Enablance Technologies	x	x	x
Paul Dixin	Hisilicon	x	x	x
Frank Effenberger	Huawei	x	x	x
Marek Hajduczenia	ZTE	x	x	x
Ryan Hirth	Teknovus, Inc.	x	x	x
Mitsunobu Kimura	Hitachi Communications Tech.	x	x	x
Seiji Kozaki	Mitsubishi Electric	x	x	x
Glen Kramer	Teknovus, Inc.	x	x	x
Yasuyuki Kuroda	OF Networks	x	x	x
Toshihiko Kusano	PMC Sierra	x	x	x
Eric Lynskey	Teknovus, Inc.	x	x	x
Jeff Mandin	PMC Sierra	x	x	x
Duane Remein	Alacatel-Lucent	x	x	x
Ricardo Saad	Teknovus, Inc.		x	
Ken-Ichi Suzuki	NTT	x	x	x
Akio Tajima	NEC	x	x	x
Motoyuki Takizawa	Fujitsu Telecom Networks	x	x	x
Keiji Tanaka	KDDI R&D Labs	x	x	x
Shinji Tsuji	Sumitomo Electric	x	x	x