Cl **99**   *SC*   *P*   *L*   # 3
Grow, Bob

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
Insufficient front matter
WG participant box needs to be expanded, something I don't remember how
to do.

SuggestedRemedy
See attached file

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft. It does though fulfill
a D1.0 accepted comment not implemented in D1.1. Add and properly format front matter

---

Cl **99**   *SC* **99**   *P* **1**   *L* **11**   # 14
Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **R**
Metropolitan Area Networks

SuggestedRemedy
metropolitan area networks

Response   *Response Status* **C**
REJECT.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft. This is consistent
with other 802.1 standards and a form of the unabreivated name of the Sponsor, thus the
present capitalization was used on the PAR title.

Cl **6A**   *SC*   *P* **125**   *L* **1**   # 6
Booth, Brad

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
Is all of 6A being deleted?

SuggestedRemedy
If yes, strike the heading and (normative) sub-heading. Otherwise, 6C sub-headings
should be 6A.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
With deletion of other annexes, the headings should all be 6A.

Cl **99**   *SC*   *P* **134**   *L*   # 2
Reintjes, Maurice   Mindspeed

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **R**

SuggestedRemedy
Replace the 86 occurances of "Behaviour" with "Behavior". Both British and American
Elglish spelling is acceptable, however brevity should trump word choice. Please use the
one which has a shorter length to save paper and storage space

Response   *Response Status* **C**
REJECT.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft.

In IEEE Std 802.3 the spelling 'behaviour' is used throughout MIB clauses and their
associated Annexes, and in any references to the behaviours defined there. Since ISO/IEC
10165-4:1991 is an ISO standard it uses the spelling 'behaviour' and to meet this externally
defined template we need to use the same spelling. In all other instances the spelling
'behavior' is used.

Cl **3**   *SC* **3.2**   *P* **14**   *L* **36**   # 1
Anslow, Pete   Nortel Networks

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
Clause 3.2 appears to define an agent with the same text as for clause 3.12 for "frame".
This seems to be either totally spurious or a placeholder for some other definition which is
missing.

SuggestedRemedy
Either delete the definition or replace it with the intended one.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
See comment #9

Cl **03**   *SC* **3.2**   *P* **14**   *L* **36**   # 9
Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
agent is not frame

SuggestedRemedy
?

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
There is an editorial error that has two definitions for agent. The incorrect (cut and paste,
partially edited) definition will be deleted.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **14**
Li **36**

Page 1 of 4
8/23/2007 5:21:31 PM

Cl **03**   *SC* **3.8**   *P* **15**   *L* **12**   # 10
Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**
conforms to the ISO/IEC 15802-3: 1998 [ANSI/IEEE 802.1D, 1998 Edition].

SuggestedRemedy
conforms to ISO/IEC 15802-3: 1998 [ANSI/IEEE 802.1D-1998]. Note that dates here and in reference list do not match: which do you want?

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add missing reference to 15802-3.

Cl **03**   *SC* **3.22**   *P* **16**   *L* **6**   # 11
Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**
conforms to the ISO/IEC 10038 [ANSI/IEEE 802.1D-1998]

SuggestedRemedy
Remove the "the". Date both references or neither. Add references to reference list (dated or not).

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Remove the date from 802.1D, remove the, "the"

Cl **05**   *SC* **5.1.3**   *P* **20**   *L* **37**   # 13
Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **R**   *BRC*
"LLC (LOGICAL LINK CONTROL) OR OTHER MAC CLIENT" is in 7 point while rest of figure is 8 point. ALL CAPS is not good style

SuggestedRemedy
Please change to 8 point or larger, upper and lower case as appropriate

Response   *Response Status* **C**
REJECT.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft. The risks of introducing an error outweigh any benefit.

Cl **5**   *SC* **5.2.1**   *P* **24**   *L* **1**   # 4
Booth, Brad

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **R**
Figure 5-4 and 5-5 are in the middle of text. Same also seems to apply to Figures 5-10 to 5-13.

SuggestedRemedy
Change formatting to move out of the text.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
REJECT.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft. See comment #5.

Cl **99**   *SC* **99**   *P* **3**   *L* **12**   # 12
Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
Please don't split URLs

SuggestedRemedy
Keep on one line: two URLs on this page

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

Cl **99**   *SC* **99**   *P* **3**   *L* **3**   # 8
Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
Standard fo Local and Metropolitan Area Networks,Link Aggregationr

SuggestedRemedy
Standard for Local and Metropolitan Area Networks, Link Aggregation (3 changes)

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **3**
Li **3**

Page 2 of 4
8/23/2007 5:21:31 PM

Cl **06** *SC* **6.2.5** *P* **304** *L* **12** # 17

Dawe, Piers Avago

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A**

Object Name Object Type Operations Supported

SuggestedRemedy

Object name Object type Operations supported

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft.

Cl **5** *SC* **5.5.3.2** *P* **81** *L* **14** # 5

Booth, Brad

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **R**

Formatting issue. Bullet h) on a separate page

SuggestedRemedy

Fix formatting to keep bullet h) with related text and Figures 5-32 and 5-33 after the list.

Response *Response Status* **C**

REJECT.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft. The commentor is not commenting on the non compare document, the page breaks and figure locations look just fine in the non-compare document and if not, the publication editor will fix during publication preparation.

Cl **06** *SC* **6.1** *P* **87** *L* **13** # 21

Dawe, Piers Avago

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A**

"IEEE 802.1AX Management": I didn't find a definition for this so why the capital M?

SuggestedRemedy

IEEE 802.1AX management (or add to definitions)

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft, but will be accepted.

Cl **06** *SC* **6.1** *P* **87** *L* **15** # 7

Dawe, Piers Avago

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A** BRC

"Layer Management": in ISO/IEC 7498-1:1994 this term is in lower case. There is a definition but it's not very specific nor does it contradict the natural meaning of the words.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to lower case

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft.

Cl **06** *SC* **6.2.5** *P* **91** *L* **11** # 16

Dawe, Piers Avago

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A**

Mandatory and Optional...

SuggestedRemedy

... should not take capitals

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft.

Cl **06** *SC* **6.2.5** *P* **91** *L* **25** # 15

Dawe, Piers Avago

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **A**

oAggregator (6.3.1) seems to be in bold while other similar items are not

SuggestedRemedy

Response *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft. Editor will check FrameMaker source.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **91**
Li **25**

Page 3 of 4
8/23/2007 5:21:31 PM

Cl **06**   *SC* **6.2.5**   *P* **91**   *L* **5**   # 20

Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

Link Aggregation Capabilities

SuggestedRemedy

Link aggregation capabilities

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft.

Cl **06**   *SC* **6.2.5**   *P* **91**   *L* **7**   # 19

Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **R**

Why are the package columns headed "DTE"?

SuggestedRemedy

Would "Package" be more useful?

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

REJECT.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft. The packages are
related to a DTE, rather than to other possible devices defined in Std 802.3. The table may
grow in the future to include other devices than DTE.

Cl **06**   *SC* **6.2.5**   *P* **91**   *L* **9**   # 18

Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **R**

The package columns don't have to be so cramped

SuggestedRemedy

Resize to contents?

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

REJECT.
This text is out of scope as it is not related to the changes in the draft. These tables tend
to grow with addition of other packages, the more compact format also reduces problems
with paralax.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Page, Line

Pa **91**
Li **9**

Page 4 of 4
8/23/2007 5:21:31 PM