Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4**   *P* **160**   *L* **30**   # 10
Thompson, Geoff   Nortel

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**
Text is incorrect. the term "data frame" also appears (at least) in clauses 2 and 4

SuggestedRemedy
I'm not sure. I think that this is a definition for an old term that was pasted after a new label. This is a result of messing around with something that shouldn't have been fixed. The cure is worse than the disease.

Response   *Response Status* **W**
REJECT.

Unable to find 'data frame' in either Clause 2 or Clause 4.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4.142**   *P* **161**   *L* **1**   # 11
Thompson, Geoff   Nortel

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **R**
Definition is not fully correct. Differential Manchester is used several other places within 802.3 such as
AUI: Tx & Rcv
1BASE5   Tx & Rx
10BASE-T: Tx & Rx

SuggestedRemedy
Correct defintion

Response   *Response Status* **W**
REJECT.

AUI, 1BASE5 and 10BASE-T use Manchester encoding on differential pairs. This is different from Differential Manchester encoding.

Cl **01**   *SC* **1.4.155**   *P* **162**   *L* **52**   # 13
Thompson, Geoff   Nortel

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **R**
Definition limits context of EPD to Gig. According to (at least) 30.2.1.5 it is also used for 10G

SuggestedRemedy
Expand text to emcompass correct scope or generalize (if possible)

Response   *Response Status* **U**
REJECT.

Can't find any instance of EPD in 10Gb/s related clauses.

Cl **40**   *SC* **8.1.2.4**   *P* **219**   *L* **9**   # 7
Zimmerman, George   Solarflare Communica

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **A**
Allowing the distortion to be measured over ANY 30% of the UI would permit false passes, specifically, by allowing passes when the 30% is away from the eye opening. Based on http://www.ieee802.org/3/axay/public/may_07/sefidvash_1_0507.pdf , the desired measurement needs to be within the eye opening (see slide 7 of the above: "Appropriate place to apply test is after the rise/fall time where the waveform has settled to it's final value")

SuggestedRemedy
Add "centered on the eye opening" to the end of the sentence: "A PHY is considered to pass this test if the peak distortion is below 10mV for at least 30% of the UI." so it reads:
"A PHY is considered to pass this test if the peak distortion is below 10mV for at least 30% of the UI centered on the eye opening."

Response   *Response Status* **W**
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

A comment in the meeting stated that 30% is too restrictive and this value should be increased to 60%.

The new text will read: "A PHY is considered to pass this test if the peak distortion is below 10mV for at least 60% of the UI within the eye opening."

Cl **60**   *SC* **3.2**   *P* **130**   *L* **35**   # 6
Zimmerman, George   Solarflare Communica

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **A**
Table 60-5: (entry for Treceiver_setting)
Footnote c was deleted, but the mark referencing it was not

SuggestedRemedy
Delete footnote mark "c" next to Treceiver_setting in Table 60-5

Response   *Response Status* **W**
ACCEPT.

While this comment is out of scope as it does not relate to text that changed in the last draft, it does point out an editorial error in implementing the change request and will be accepted.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **60**
SC **3.2**

Page 1 of 1
23/08/2007 23:55:41