Cl **01**   *SC* **1**   *P* **15**   *L* **16**   # 2

Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**

    Overview.

SuggestedRemedy

    Remove the full stop

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

    ACCEPT.

Cl **03**   *SC* **3.2**   *P* **16**   *L* **40**   # 3

Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**

    thatcontain

SuggestedRemedy

    insert a space

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

    ACCEPT.

Cl **03**   *SC* **3.21**   *P* **18**   *L* **6**   # 5

Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**

    This subclause ("switch") equates ISO/IEC 10038 to ANSI/IEEE 802.1D. 3.7 ("bridge", a synonym for "switch") equates ISO/IEC 15802-3: 1998 to ANSI/IEEE 802.1D. ISO/IEC 15802-3: 1998 says "This edition cancels and replaces ISO/IEC 10038: 1993.". There is no entry in the references to ISO/IEC 10038, nor to 802.1D under its own name. 802.3 has references to "IEEE Std 802.1F" and others but not to "ANSI/IEEE 802.1... except in the equivalents of these definitions, and I did not find 802.1D in the ANSI web store. Even though the document concerned calls itself "ISO/IEC 15802-3: 1998   ANSI/IEEE Std 802.1D, 1998 Edition"

SuggestedRemedy

    1. Change ISO/IEC 10038 to ISO/IEC 15802-3.   2. Date all four references or none. 3. Add "syn: switch." to 3.7.   4. Add reference for IEEE Std 802.1D (dated or not as item 1), cross-refer between entry for 802.1D and SO/IEC 15802-3. 5. Make agreed changes in 802.3 also.

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

    ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
    1. Add normative reference to IEEE Std 802.1D (undated).
    2. Delete reference to 15802-3.
    3. Search and replace references as appropriate.

Cl **03**   *SC* **3.7**   *P* **17**   *L* **13**   # 4

Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

    ISO/IEC 15802-3: 1998 [ANSI/IEEE 802.1D].

SuggestedRemedy

    If the ISO/IEC version is dated, shouldn't the ANSI/IEEE version be dated also? (as we can't know that the date is the same for the equivalent version). And see another comment.

Response   *Response Status*   **W**

    ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
    See comment #5

Cl **06**   *SC* **6.1.1**   *P* **87**   *L* **49**   # 6

Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**

    802.1AX Management

SuggestedRemedy

    802.1AX management (as above and D1.1#21)

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

    ACCEPT.

Cl **06**   *SC* **6.2.5**   *P* **92**   *L* **53**   # 8

Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **R**

    basic and mandatory packages

SuggestedRemedy

    Change to "Basic and Mandatory packages"

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

    REJECT.
    Should either be 'basic package' or 'Basic Package' (except when style requires first word capitalization). As an 802.1 standard, consistency of capitalization with 802.3 is not necessary and the lower case has been chosen to reduce the amount of capitalization in the document handed off to 802.1.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **06**
SC **6.2.5**

Page 1 of 2
9/13/2007 12:12:52 AM

Cl **06**   *SC* **6.2.5**   *P***93**   *L***22**   # 7

Dawe, Piers   Avago

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

Capitalisaton doesn't match 802.3 (draft) Table 30-1 and 30-2. This has "Basic package"
and so on, that has "Basic Package" (and so on). Text on the page before has "basic and
mandatory packages".

SuggestedRemedy

I don't have strong views on "Basic package" vs. "Basic Package" (but someone else
might).

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Basic package? (check with David for consistency with 802.3ay)

Cl **3**   *SC* **3.1**   *P***16**   *L***43**   # 1

Hajduczenia, Marek   Nokia Siemens Networ

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

Definition 3.3 reads as follows: "3.3 agent: A term used to refer to the managed nodes in a
network. Managed nodes are those nodes that contain" - space missing. Definition 3.3
should read as follows "3.3 agent: A term used to refer to the managed nodes in a network.
Managed nodes are those nodes that contain"

SuggestedRemedy

Insert space between the words "that" and "contain".

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
(Same as comment #3)

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **3**   Page 2 of 2
SC **3.1**   9/13/2007 12:12:52 AM