

IEEE P802.3bc D2.1 Ethernet LLDP TLVs comments

CI 79	SC 79.1	P 22	L 5	# 44
-------	---------	------	-----	------

Dawe, Piers Avago Technologies

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A**

Need more information in the overview to relate this clause to the rest of 802.3. Response to D2.0 comment 40 said that IEEE Std 802.1AB covers the various items such as the architectural overview in Clause 6, the principles of operation in Clause 7 and a description of the protocol in Clause 10.

But a very quick review did not answer my questions (I found an MSAP but no proper layer diagram showing the MAC).

SuggestedRemedy

Please add text and diagram as necessary to address these questions:

Where does this clause fit into the layer diagram that is Figure 1 of most clauses?

Is this clause related to MAC Control? If not, what is it related to?

How are these TLVs send and received? Is it via the mechanism in Clause 57?

Which sublayer sends and receives these TLVs? Where does LLDP sit in relationship to

the ISO/IEC Open Systems Interconnection (OSI) reference model and IEEE 802.3

CSMA/CD LAN model?

If some of these questions are answered in 802.1AB, could use references to specific points in it if appropriate.

Response Response Status **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

LLDP is a MAC Client protocol, therefore resides in the MAC Client layer shown in most of the IEEE 802.3 layer diagrams. Will change the 79.1 text '.. IEEE Std 802.1AB-20XX allows stations attached ..' to read '.. IEEE Std 802.1AB-20XX is a MAC Client protocol that allows stations attached ..'.

CI 79	SC 79.1.1	P 22	L 25	# 40
-------	-----------	------	------	------

Dawe, Piers Avago Technologies

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**

GRATUITOUS CAPITALS

The vast majority of figures in 802.3 use mixed upper and lower case.

The reader can't be expected to know that some figures don't follow the house style because they are like other very old figures, while others do follow the house style. It looks unprofessional.

Even if we don't change old figures we should not keep digging a hole.

SuggestedRemedy

Change OCTETS to octets and so on.

Response Response Status **W**

REJECT.

This figure exactly matches the capitalization of the original found in IEEE Std 802.3-2008 Figure 3-1.