arris, Arthur       Cadence         ormment Type       T       Comment Status X         'It provides an accurate indication of the transmission and reception initiation times of certain packets as required to support IEEE Std P802.1AS-201X."       Comment Status X         Uggested/Remedy       Change:       'To:         'To:       'To:       Cadence         'To:       'To:       'To:         'To:       'To:       'To:         'To:       'To:       Cadence         'To:       'To:       Cadence         'To:       'To:       Cadence         'To:       Cadence       Cadence         'To:       Cadence       Cadence         'To:       'To:       Cadence       Cadence         'To:       'To:       Cadence       Cadence         'To:       'To:       'To:       Cadence         'To:       'To:       Cadence       Cadence <tr< th=""><th>Comments received</th><th>IEEE P802.3</th><th>Bbf Ethernet S</th><th>upport for the IEEE P8</th><th>302.1AS Ti</th><th>me Syno</th><th>chroniza</th><th>ation Protocol commer</th><th>nts</th><th>D0.3</th></tr<>	Comments received	IEEE P802.3	Bbf Ethernet S	upport for the IEEE P8	302.1AS Ti	me Syno	chroniza	ation Protocol commer	nts	D0.3
"It provides an accurate indication of the transmission and reception initiation times of certain packets as required to support IEEE Std P802.1AS-201X."       Make date a placeholder         SuggestedRemedy       Change:       "Us powdes an accurate indication of the transmission and reception initiation times of certain packets as required to support IEEE Std P802.1AS-201X."       Make date a placeholder         Tc:       "The row synchronization service interface to indicate when frames cross the medium independent interface and PHV management objects to report the latency in passing frames between the MDI and medium independ interface. This is required to support IEEE Std P802.1AS-201X."       Response Status <b>O</b> Also change 'abstract on page II.       Conserved to accence       Conserved to accence         or Sto O       PVII       L2       #Edite         artis, Arthur       Cadence       SuggestedRemedy         Change:       "Conserved to accence       Comment Status X         martis, Arthur       Cadence       SuggestedRemedy         Change:       Conserved to transmit and receive paths"       To:         This should be referring to the IEEE 802.3 working group ballot. P802.3bt is a task force.       SuggestedRemedy       Change:         "The following individuals were difficers and members of the IEEE 802.3 working group at the beginning of the working group ballot."       To:       To:         "The following individuals were difficers and members of the IEEE 802.3 working group at	C/ 00 SC 0 Marris, Arthur		L <b>30</b>	# 69		-			L 16	# 60
Is not an entirely accurate description of what the amendment is doing. Uggested/Remedy Change: ''It defines the Time Synchronization service interface to indicate when frames cross the medium independent interface and PHY management objects to report the latency in passing frames between the MDI and medium independent interface. This is required to support IEEE Std P802.1AS-201X.'' Also change 'abstract on page II. roposed Response Response Status O (00 SC 0 PVII L2 # 64 arris, Arthur Cadence comment Type ER Comment Status X This should be referring to the IEEE 802.3 working group ballot. P802.3bf is a task force. uggested/Remedy Change: ''The following individuals were members of the IEEE 802.3 working group at the beginning of the P802.3bf working group ballot.''	"It provides an accurate indic	ation of the transmissio		nitiation times of	Make	e date a pla				
"It defines the Time Synchronization service interface to indicate when frames cross the medium independent interface and PHY management objects to report the latency in passing frames between the MDI and medium independ interface. This is required to support IEEE Std P802.1AS-201X."   Also change 'abstract' on page II.   roposed Response   Response Status   O   (10 SC 0 PVII L2 # 64 Tris, Arthur Cadence Comment Status X This should be referring to the IEEE 802.3 working group ballot. P802.3bf is a task force. uggestedRemedy Change: "The following individuals were members of the IEEE 802.3 working group at the beginning of the working group ballot." Also make Valerie Maguire the treasurer. Change: "The following individuals were officers and members of the IEEE 802.3 working group at the beginning of the working group ballot." Also make Valerie Maguire the treasurer.	SuggestedRemedy Change: "It provides an accurate indica	ation of the transmissio	on and reception i	-	Char "15 S To: "XX 2	ge: eptember (XXX 201)	<b>K</b> "	Response Status 0		
Also change 'abstract' on page II. roposed Response Response Status O 100 SC 0 PVI L2 # 64 arris, Arthur Cadence comment Type ER Comment Status X This should be referring to the IEEE 802.3 working group ballot. P802.3bf is a task force. uggestedRemedy Change: "indicates the capability of the PHY to report the transmit and receive latency between the MII and MDI" Proposed Response Status O Change: "indicates the capability of the PHY to report the transmit and receive latency between the MII and MDI" Proposed Response Response Status O The following individuals were members of the IEEE 802.3 working group at the beginning of the P802.3bf working group ballot." To: "The following individuals were officers and members of the IEEE 802.3 working group at the beginning of the vorking group ballot." Also make Valerie Maguire the treasurer.	"It defines the Time Synchror medium independent interfac passing frames between the l	e and PHY manageme MDI and medium inden	nt objects to repo	ort the latency in	Marris, A Commen	rthur t Type	E	Cadence	L 38	# [61
arris, Arthur Cadence MII and MDI" omment Type ER Comment Status X This should be referring to the IEEE 802.3 working group ballot. P802.3bf is a task force. uggestedRemedy Change: "The following individuals were members of the IEEE 802.3 working group at the beginning of the P802.3bf working group ballot." To: "The following individuals were officers and members of the IEEE 802.3 working group at the beginning of the working group ballot." Also make Valerie Maguire the treasurer.	Proposed Response Res	sponse Status <b>O</b>	L <b>2</b>	# 64	Suggeste Char "iden To:	dRemedy ge: tifies the ca	apability	0		
UggestedRemedy Change: "The following individuals were members of the IEEE 802.3 working group at the beginning of the P802.3bf working group ballot." To: "The following individuals were officers and members of the IEEE 802.3 working group at the beginning of the working group ballot." Also make Valerie Maguire the treasurer.	Marris, Arthur Comment Type ER Co	Cadence mment Status X			MII a	nd MDI"				e latency between the
	SuggestedRemedy Change: "The following individuals were of the P802.3bf working group To: "The following individuals were	re members of the IEEF p ballot." re officers and member	E 802.3 working g	group at the beginning						
	0									

C/ **45** SC **45.2.1.100**  Page 1 of 6 13/04/2010 22:31:26

Comments received IEEE P802.3bf Ethernet Support for the IEEE P	802.1AS Time Synchronization Protocol comments D0.3
C/         45         SC         45.2.1.101         P 6         L 6         # 70           Marris, Arthur         Cadence         Cadence	C/         90         SC         90.4.2.3         P 11         L 15         # 57           Anslow, Peter         Ciena
Comment Type <b>T</b> Comment Status <b>X</b> It might help to define 'link is estabilished' as when bit 2 in PMA/PMD status register 1 is high. SuggestedRemedy Consider changing: "The values contained in these registers are valid when the link is established." To:	Comment Type       E       Comment Status       X         In "The TS service interface support the exchange" "support" should be "supports"         SuggestedRemedy         Change "support" to "supports"         Proposed Response       Response Status       O
"The values contained in these registers are valid when the link is established as indicated by bit 2 in register 1.1 (see 45.2.1.2.2)."	C/         90         SC         90.4.3.1         P 11         L 24         # [72]           Marris, Arthur         Cadence         Cadence
make similar change for the receive latency registers.Proposed ResponseResponse StatusO	Comment Type <b>T</b> Comment Status <b>X</b> This does not read right.
Cl 90       SC 90.4.1       P 9       L 44       # 71         Marris, Arthur       Cadence         Comment Type       T       Comment Status       X         Isn't the MAC control layer defined in Clause 31 a client of the MAC?       SuggestedRemedy	SuggestedRemedy         Change:         "This primitive defines the transfer of a indication of an event between gRS and the TimeSync Client."         To:         "This primitive is used to indicate the event of a transmit frame passing through the gRS."         Proposed Response       Response Status       O
Delete: "definition of the MAC Client is outside of scope of IEEE Std 802.3" Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>	C/         90         SC         90.4.3.1         P 11         L 24         # 58           Anslow, Peter         Ciena
C/ 90 SC 90.4.1 P 9 L 52 # 56 Anslow, Peter Ciena	Comment Type E Comment Status X In "This primitive defines the transfer of a indication of an event" "a indication" should be "the indication" Same in 90.4.3.2
Comment Type E Comment Status X In "any type of IEEE Std 802.3 media independent interfaces", "interfaces" should be "interface"	SuggestedRemedy Change "a indication" to "the indication" here and in 90.4.3.2 Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>
SuggestedRemedy Change "interfaces" to "interface"	
Proposed Response Response Status O	

C/ 90 SC 90.4.3.1 Page 2 of 6 13/04/2010 22:31:32

C/ 90 SC 90.4.3.1.1 Marris, Arthur	P <b>11</b> Cadence	L <b>24</b>	# 73	C/ 90 SC Marris, Arthur	90.4.3.2	P 11 Cadence	L <b>50</b>	# 74
	Comment Status X			Comment Type	т	Comment Status X		
Please use 'NOT DETECTE		e resolution to cor	nment 31 against the	This could be				
last draft.				SuggestedReme	dv			
uggestedRemedy				Change:	ay .			
Change: "UNDETECTED" To:				0		ne transfer of a indication of a	an event betwee	n gRS and the
"NOT DETECTED"					ve is used to	o indicate the event of a rece	ive frame passir	ng through the gRS.
and elsewhere in the docu	nent.			Proposed Respo	nse	Response Status O		
Also change: "any of the following two va To:				C/ <b>90</b> SC Marris, Arthur	90.4.3.2.1	P 12 Cadence	L <b>3</b>	# 62
"either of the following two	values"			Comment Type	Е	Comment Status X		
roposed Response R	esponse Status O			Change 'any				
				SuggestedReme	dy			
X 90 SC 90.4.3.1.1	<i>P</i> 11	L <b>32</b>	# 65	Change 'any	' to 'either'			
nslow, Peter	Ciena			Proposed Respo	nse	Response Status 0		
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	Comment Status X							
Since in 90.5.1 we have: "T TS_TX.indication is genera				C/ 90 SC	90.5	P 12	L 32	# 63
signals. Otherwise, the stat	us of TS_TX.indication is	s undefined." what		Marris, Arthur		Cadence		
defining the SFD parameter Same issue for TS_RX.indi		<u>)</u> ?		Comment Type	Е	Comment Status X		
uggestedRemedy				Change:				
Remove the value "UNDET Same in 90.4.3.2.1	ECTED" or use it for sor	mething				ion of the TS_TX.indication a across the TS service interfa		
Proposed Response R	esponse Status O					or generation of the TS_TX.i d in 90.4"	ndication and TS	S_RX.indication
				SuggestedReme	dy			
				Change: "responsible	for generat	ion of the TS_TX.indication a	and TS_RX.indic	cation service
				primitives, re To:	spectively,	across the TS service interfa	ace defined in 90	).4"
				primitives, re To:	espectively, esponsible f	across the TS service interfa or generation of the TS_TX.i		

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general	C/ 90	Dage 2 of 6
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn	C/ 90	Page 3 of 6
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line	SC 90.5	13/04/2010 22:31:32

Comments received	IEEE P802.3bf Ethernet Support for the IEEE P802.1AS Time Synchronization Protocol comments
-------------------	---

C/ 90 SC 90.5.1 Anslow, Peter	P <b>12</b> Ciena	L <b>40</b>	# 59	C/ 90 SC 90.6 Marris, Arthur	P 13 Cadence	L <b>31</b>	# 77
,							
Comment Type E "instantied" isn't a word same in 90.5.2	Comment Status X			Comment Type <b>T</b> Should not say chang	Comment Status X ges as this will be meaningless	s once the standa	ard is published.
				SuggestedRemedy			
SuggestedRemedy	"instantiated" and also in OO (	5.0		Change:			
0	"instantiated" and also in 90.	5.2		"Changes to Clause : below:"	30 for the optional support of T	imeSync capabi	ity are summarized
Proposed Response	Response Status <b>O</b>			To:	lause 30 for the optional supp	ort of TimeSync	capability are
C/ 90 SC 90.5.1 Marris, Arthur	P <b>12</b> Cadence	L <b>44</b>	# 75	Proposed Response	Response Status 0		
Comment Type T	Comment Status X						
TS_TX.indication is not	undefined otherwise.			C/ 90 SC 90.7 Marris, Arthur	P 13 Cadence	L <b>45</b>	# 78
				Marins, Arthur	Cadence		
SuggestedRemedy							
Change:				Comment Type T	Comment Status X		
Change: "The service primitive ad	cross the TS service interfac				Comment Status X ad remove the word changes.		
Change: "The service primitive at only when the SFD sequ TS_TX.indication is und	uence is detected on the trar			Put a table in here ar SuggestedRemedy			
Change: "The service primitive ad only when the SFD sequ TS_TX.indication is und To: "On detection of SFD by DETECTED otherwise it	uence is detected on the trar defined." y the TS_SFD_Detect_TX fu it signals NOT DETECTED."	nsmit signals. Oth	nerwise, the status of	Put a table in here ar SuggestedRemedy Change: "Clause 45 describes IEEE Std 802.3 comp			
Change: "The service primitive ac only when the SFD sequ TS_TX.indication is und To: "On detection of SFD by DETECTED otherwise in Make similar change in	uence is detected on the trar defined." y the TS_SFD_Detect_TX fu it signals NOT DETECTED."	nsmit signals. Oth	nerwise, the status of	Put a table in here an SuggestedRemedy Change: "Clause 45 describes IEEE Std 802.3 comp TimeSync capability To: "The optional MDIO of TimeSync status info	the Management Data Input/o bliant PHYs. Changes to Claus	45 defines sever	onal support of al variables that provid t will map MDIO
Change: "The service primitive ac only when the SFD sequ TS_TX.indication is und To: "On detection of SFD by DETECTED otherwise in Make similar change in Proposed Response	uence is detected on the trar defined." y the TS_SFD_Detect_TX fu it signals NOT DETECTED." 90.5.2.	nsmit signals. Oth	nerwise, the status of	Put a table in here ar SuggestedRemedy Change: "Clause 45 describes IEEE Std 802.3 comp TimeSync capability To: "The optional MDIO of TimeSync status info TimeSync status vari	the Management Data Input/ bliant PHYs. Changes to Claus are summarized below:" capability described in Clause rmation for the PMD. If MDIO ables to PMD status variables	se 45 for the option 45 defines sever is implemented, as shown in Tab	onal support of al variables that provid t will map MDIO le 90-X."
Change: "The service primitive are only when the SFD sequ TS_TX.indication is und To: "On detection of SFD by DETECTED otherwise in Make similar change in Proposed Response	uence is detected on the tran defined." y the TS_SFD_Detect_TX fu it signals NOT DETECTED." 90.5.2. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	nsmit signals. Oth	nerwise, the status of dication(SFD) signals	Put a table in here ar SuggestedRemedy Change: "Clause 45 describes IEEE Std 802.3 comp TimeSync capability To: "The optional MDIO of TimeSync status info TimeSync status varion Insert table called "M	the Management Data Input/ bliant PHYs. Changes to Claus are summarized below:" capability described in Clause rmation for the PMD. If MDIO ables to PMD status variables DIO/PMD status variable map	se 45 for the option 45 defines sever is implemented, as shown in Tab	onal support of al variables that provid t will map MDIO le 90-X."
Change: "The service primitive ad only when the SFD sequ TS_TX.indication is und To: "On detection of SFD by DETECTED otherwise in Make similar change in Proposed Response Cl 90 SC 90.6 Anslow, Peter	uence is detected on the tran defined." y the TS_SFD_Detect_TX fu it signals NOT DETECTED." 90.5.2. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>13</b>	nsmit signals. Oth	nerwise, the status of dication(SFD) signals	Put a table in here ar SuggestedRemedy Change: "Clause 45 describes IEEE Std 802.3 comp TimeSync capability To: "The optional MDIO of TimeSync status info TimeSync status vari	the Management Data Input/ bliant PHYs. Changes to Claus are summarized below:" capability described in Clause rmation for the PMD. If MDIO ables to PMD status variables	se 45 for the option 45 defines sever is implemented, as shown in Tab	onal support of al variables that provid t will map MDIO le 90-X."
Change: "The service primitive ar only when the SFD sequ TS_TX.indication is und To: "On detection of SFD by DETECTED otherwise it Make similar change in Proposed Response C/ 90 SC 90.6 Anslow, Peter Comment Type E	uence is detected on the tran defined." y the TS_SFD_Detect_TX fu it signals NOT DETECTED." 90.5.2. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>13</b> Ciena	nsmit signals. Oth nction TS_TX.inc	dication(SFD) signals	Put a table in here ar SuggestedRemedy Change: "Clause 45 describes IEEE Std 802.3 comp TimeSync capability To: "The optional MDIO of TimeSync status info TimeSync status vari Insert table called "M Proposed Response	ad remove the word changes. the Management Data Input/ bliant PHYs. Changes to Claus are summarized below:" capability described in Clause rmation for the PMD. If MDIO ables to PMD status variables DIO/PMD status variable map <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	se 45 for the option 45 defines sever is implemented, as shown in Tab ping" and delete	onal support of al variables that provid t will map MDIO le 90-X." 90.8.
Change: "The service primitive ar only when the SFD sequ TS_TX.indication is und To: "On detection of SFD by DETECTED otherwise it Make similar change in Proposed Response C/ 90 SC 90.6 Anslow, Peter Comment Type E	uence is detected on the tran defined." y the TS_SFD_Detect_TX fu it signals NOT DETECTED." 90.5.2. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>13</b> Ciena <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b>	nsmit signals. Oth nction TS_TX.inc	dication(SFD) signals	Put a table in here ar SuggestedRemedy Change: "Clause 45 describes IEEE Std 802.3 comp TimeSync capability To: "The optional MDIO of TimeSync status info TimeSync status varii Insert table called "M Proposed Response C/ 90 SC 90.8	the Management Data Input/ bliant PHYs. Changes to Clause are summarized below:" capability described in Clause rmation for the PMD. If MDIO ables to PMD status variables DIO/PMD status variable map <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> 14	se 45 for the option 45 defines sever is implemented, as shown in Tab	onal support of al variables that provid t will map MDIO le 90-X."
Change: "The service primitive ad only when the SFD sequ TS_TX.indication is und To: "On detection of SFD by DETECTED otherwise in Make similar change in Proposed Response C/ 90 SC 90.6 Anslow, Peter Comment Type E The two references to "O the draft.	uence is detected on the tran defined." y the TS_SFD_Detect_TX fu it signals NOT DETECTED." 90.5.2. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>13</b> <i>Ciena</i> <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> Clause 30" should be black a	nsmit signals. Oth nction TS_TX.inc	dication(SFD) signals	Put a table in here ar SuggestedRemedy Change: "Clause 45 describes IEEE Std 802.3 comp TimeSync capability To: "The optional MDIO of TimeSync status info TimeSync status vari Insert table called "M Proposed Response	ad remove the word changes. the Management Data Input/ bliant PHYs. Changes to Claus are summarized below:" capability described in Clause rmation for the PMD. If MDIO ables to PMD status variables DIO/PMD status variable map <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b>	se 45 for the option 45 defines sever is implemented, as shown in Tab ping" and delete	onal support of al variables that provid t will map MDIO le 90-X." 90.8.
Change: "The service primitive ar only when the SFD sequ TS_TX.indication is und To: "On detection of SFD by DETECTED otherwise in Make similar change in Proposed Response C/ 90 SC 90.6 anslow, Peter Comment Type E The two references to "O the draft. Same for Clause 45 in 9	uence is detected on the tran defined." y the TS_SFD_Detect_TX fu it signals NOT DETECTED." 90.5.2. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>13</b> <i>Ciena</i> <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> Clause 30" should be black a	nsmit signals. Oth nction TS_TX.inc	dication(SFD) signals	Put a table in here ar SuggestedRemedy Change: "Clause 45 describes IEEE Std 802.3 comp TimeSync capability To: "The optional MDIO TimeSync status info TimeSync status vari Insert table called "M Proposed Response C/ 90 SC 90.8 Marris, Arthur Comment Type T	the Management Data Input/ bliant PHYs. Changes to Clause are summarized below:" capability described in Clause rmation for the PMD. If MDIO ables to PMD status variables DIO/PMD status variable map <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> 14	se 45 for the option 45 defines sever is implemented, as shown in Tab ping" and delete	onal support of al variables that provid t will map MDIO le 90-X." 90.8.
Change: "The service primitive are only when the SFD sequ TS_TX.indication is und To: "On detection of SFD by DETECTED otherwise in Make similar change in Proposed Response C/ 90 SC 90.6 Anslow, Peter Comment Type E The two references to "O the draft. Same for Clause 45 in 9 SuggestedRemedy	uence is detected on the tran defined." y the TS_SFD_Detect_TX fu it signals NOT DETECTED." 90.5.2. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>13</b> Ciena <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> Clause 30" should be black a 90.7	nction TS_TX.inc	herwise, the status of dication(SFD) signals # <u>55</u> lause 30 is included in	Put a table in here ar SuggestedRemedy Change: "Clause 45 describes IEEE Std 802.3 comp TimeSync capability To: "The optional MDIO TimeSync status info TimeSync status vari Insert table called "M Proposed Response Cl 90 SC 90.8 Marris, Arthur	the Management Data Input/ bliant PHYs. Changes to Clause are summarized below:" capability described in Clause mation for the PMD. If MDIO ables to PMD status variables DIO/PMD status variable map <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> 14 Cadence	se 45 for the option 45 defines sever is implemented, as shown in Tab ping" and delete	onal support of al variables that provid t will map MDIO le 90-X." 90.8.
Change: "The service primitive are only when the SFD sequ TS_TX.indication is und To: "On detection of SFD by DETECTED otherwise in Make similar change in Proposed Response C/ 90 SC 90.6 Anslow, Peter Comment Type E The two references to "O the draft. Same for Clause 45 in 9 SuggestedRemedy Change the two instance	uence is detected on the tran defined." y the TS_SFD_Detect_TX fu it signals NOT DETECTED." 90.5.2. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>13</b> <i>Ciena</i> <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> Clause 30" should be black a	nction TS_TX.inc	herwise, the status of dication(SFD) signals # <u>55</u> lause 30 is included in m links.	Put a table in here ar SuggestedRemedy Change: "Clause 45 describes IEEE Std 802.3 comp TimeSync capability To: "The optional MDIO TimeSync status info TimeSync status vari Insert table called "M Proposed Response C/ 90 SC 90.8 Marris, Arthur Comment Type T	the Management Data Input/ bliant PHYs. Changes to Clause are summarized below:" capability described in Clause mation for the PMD. If MDIO ables to PMD status variables DIO/PMD status variable map <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> 14 Cadence	se 45 for the option 45 defines sever is implemented, as shown in Tab ping" and delete	onal support of al variables that provid t will map MDIO le 90-X." 90.8.
"The service primitive ad only when the SFD sequ TS_TX.indication is und To: "On detection of SFD by DETECTED otherwise it Make similar change in Proposed Response C/ 90 SC 90.6 Anslow, Peter Comment Type E The two references to "O the draft. Same for Clause 45 in 9 SuggestedRemedy Change the two instance	uence is detected on the tran defined." y the TS_SFD_Detect_TX fu it signals NOT DETECTED." 90.5.2. <i>Response Status</i> <b>O</b> <i>P</i> <b>13</b> Ciena <i>Comment Status</i> <b>X</b> Clause 30" should be black a 90.7 ees of "Clause 30" to black fo	nction TS_TX.inc	herwise, the status of dication(SFD) signals # <u>55</u> lause 30 is included in m links.	Put a table in here ar SuggestedRemedy Change: "Clause 45 describes IEEE Std 802.3 comp TimeSync capability To: "The optional MDIO of TimeSync status info TimeSync status varii Insert table called "M Proposed Response C/ 90 SC 90.8 Marris, Arthur Comment Type T Delete 90.8 SuggestedRemedy	the Management Data Input/ bliant PHYs. Changes to Clause are summarized below:" capability described in Clause mation for the PMD. If MDIO ables to PMD status variables DIO/PMD status variable map <i>Response Status</i> <b>0</b> <i>P</i> 14 Cadence	45 for the option 45 defines sever is implemented, as shown in Tab ping" and delete	al variables that provid t will map MDIO le 90-X." 90.8. # <u>76</u>

 TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
 C/ 90

 COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected
 RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

 SORT ORDER:
 Clause, Subclause, page, line

Page 4 of 6 13/04/2010 22:31:32

Comments received IEEE P802.3bf Ethernet Support for the IEEE P	P802.1AS Time Synchronization Protocol comments D0.3
C/ 90         SC 90.9         P 14         L 16         # 80           Marris, Arthur         Cadence	C/         90         SC         90.9         P 14         L 17         # 79           Marris, Arthur         Cadence         Cadence         Cadence         Cadence         Cadence
Comment Type T Comment Status X Why not just call MP2 the MDI?	Comment Type <b>T</b> Comment Status <b>X</b> Just because the register can report 1 ns precision does not mean the PHY has to.
SuggestedRemedy	SuggestedRemedy
Delete the note at the top of page 15 as it is confusing and unnecessary. Replace the note	Delete "measurement of the PHY latency shall be conducted with 1 ns precision, while the"
with : "MP2 is at the MDI."	Proposed Response Response Status O
Also change: "namely a minimum and a maximum PHY latency values, observed over the number of conducted PHY latency measurements" To:	C/ 90         SC 90.9         P 14         L 51         # 66           Anslow, Peter         Ciena
no. "namely a minimum and a maximum PHY latency value"	Comment Type T Comment Status X
Proposed Response Response Status <b>O</b>	Since "the method used for the PHY latency measurement is outside the scope of this specification" the title of Figure 90-3 should not be "PHY latency measurement methodology"
C/ 90 SC 90.9 P14 L17 # 68	SuggestedRemedy
Anslow, Peter Ciena	Change the title to "PHY latency measurement points"
Comment Type T Comment Status X	Proposed Response Response Status O
This says "The measurement of the PHY latency shall be conducted with 1 ns precision"	
To achieve this level of precision (0.1 UI for 100 Mbit/s), the definition of the two events needs to be much more precise than currently defined.	C/ 90 SC 90.9 P 15 L 1 # 67
	Anslow, Peter Ciena
Presumably one event is the assertion of TS_TX.indication or TS_RX.indication by the gRS. What is the definition of the other event? This must define which edge passing the	Comment Type T Comment Status X
MDI starts or stops the delay measurement	This says "MP2 is located at the bottom of the MDI," but the MDI does not have a top and
SuggestedRemedy	bottom, it is an interface point. See for instance Figure 52-2.
Define the two times precisely. At MP1 this is the assertion of TS_TX.indication or	SuggestedRemedy
TS_RX.indication. At MP2 define which edge passing the MDI defines the start or stop time.	Change this to "MP2 is located at the MDI,"
Also, in Figure 90-3 it would be better to show MP1 at the TS service interface since this is	Also, in Figure 90-3 show the dotted line for MP2 going through the centre of the MDI box to bring it in to line with the architecture diagrams such as Figures 21-1, 34-1, 44-1 etc.
where the event of the assertion of TS_TX.indication or TS_RX.indication is observable.	Proposed Response Response Status O
Proposed Response Response Status O	·

CI 90 SC 90.9 Page 5 of 6 13/04/2010 22:31:32

## Comments received IEEE P802.3bf Ethernet Support for the IEEE P802.1AS Time Synchronization Protocol comments

C/ 90	SC 99.10	P 16	<i>L</i> 1	# 54
Anslow, P	eter	Ciena		
Comment	Туре Е	Comment Status X		
	umbering still cl comment 52 aga	nanges to 99 part way througl iinst D 0.21	h clause 90.	
Suggeste	dRemedy			
99.10	onwards should	d be re-numbered 90.10 etc.		

Proposed Response Response Status **0**