IEEE P802.3bf D3.0 comments

| | L 0 | # 23 | C/ 1 SC 1 Byrd, William | | P 1 PRIVACOM | | # 1 |
|--|--|---|---|---|--|---|---|
| Turner, Michelle | | | 3 | 0 | | VENTOR | |
| Comment Type ER Comment Status X This draft meets all editorial requirements. | | | Comment Type G | | nt Status X | anort this type of fo | ormat being submitted |
| SuggestedRemedy Proposed Response Response | | | for ballot. The Stan jumped directly into needs to limit any o existence. An aver document. This do | dard had an inc the data, which locuments that o age researcher o cument should b | omplete Introdu n was full of cros do not have a fu would be hard p be able to stand | ction, Scope, and s-outs and unexpl II and complete just ressed to make an | general description. It ained edits. The IEEE stification for their |
| C/ 0 SC 0 P14 | L1 | # 2 | other standards do <i>SuggestedRemedy</i> Add a complete Int | | - | on to this documer | nt. |
| Marris, Arthur Cadence Do Comment Type ER Comment Status X | esign Syst | | Proposed Response | • | e Status O | | |
| NOTEThe editing instructions contained in this < merge the material contained therein into the exist to form the comprehensive standard. The editing instructions are shown in bold italic. For delete, insert, and replace. Change is used to mal The editing instruction specifies the location of the changed by using strikethrough (to remove old ma material). Delete removes existing material. Insert existing material. Insertions may require renumber | ting base standard our editing instruction ke corrections in ex e change and descri- aterial) and undersco t adds new material ring. If so, renumbe o make changes in f | and its amendments ons are used: change, tisting text or tables. tibes what is being core to add new without disturbing the pring instructions are figures or equations by | SuggestedRemedy Recommend add a matter will disappe Proposed Response | reference to 158 trademark to th ar when merged | is reference to 1 | 1588 as previous r | contain a trademark? eferences in the front |
| given in the editing instruction. Replace is used to removing the existing figure or equation and repla instructions, change markings, and this NOTE will because the changes will be incorporated into the | I not be carried over | r into future editions | C/ 1 SC 1.3 Frazier, Howard M | C | Broadcom C | | # 33 |
| removing the existing figure or equation and repla instructions, change markings, and this NOTE will because the changes will be incorporated into the SuggestedRemedy | I not be carried over base standard.315 | r into future editions | Frazier, Howard M Comment Type TR | | Broadcom C | Corporation | |
| removing the existing figure or equation and repla instructions, change markings, and this NOTE will because the changes will be incorporated into the SuggestedRemedy Insert the required text as ewcribed in the commen | I not be carried over base standard.315 | r into future editions | Frazier, Howard M Comment Type TR I don't think that 15 hand when implem | 88 rises to the le | Broadcom C nt Status X evel of an indisp dard. I am all for | corporation ensible reference, including a mention | |
| removing the existing figure or equation and repla instructions, change markings, and this NOTE will because the changes will be incorporated into the SuggestedRemedy Insert the required text as ewcribed in the commen | I not be carried over base standard.315 | r into future editions | Frazier, Howard M Comment Type TR I don't think that 15 hand when implem that 802.3bf is inter | 88 rises to the le | Broadcom C nt Status X evel of an indisp dard. I am all for | corporation ensible reference, including a mention | which must be at on of 1588, and saying |
| removing the existing figure or equation and repla instructions, change markings, and this NOTE will because the changes will be incorporated into the SuggestedRemedy Insert the required text as ewcribed in the commen | I not be carried over base standard.315 | r into future editions | Frazier, Howard M Comment Type TR I don't think that 15 hand when implem that 802.3bf is inter bibliography. | 88 rises to the le enting this stand nded to provide | Broadcom C nt Status X evel of an indisp dard. I am all for | corporation ensible reference, including a mention | which must be at on of 1588, and saying |

C/ 1 SC **1.3**

IEEE P802.3bf D3.0 comments

| C/ 1 SC 1.3 | D.1.5 | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|--|--------------------|--|---|---|--|--|--------------------------|
| | P 15 L | . 5 | # 6 | C/ 1 | SC 1. | .4 | P 15 | L 19 | # 7 |
| Anslow, Peter | Ciena Corporation | | | Anslow, F | Peter | | Ciena Corp | oration | |
| Comment Type E | Comment Status X | | | Comment | t Type | Е | Comment Status X | | |
| | "Insert into the list at the appropriate loca cent published amendments | ation" is not ir | n the format used | | | | ert into the ordered list and aff in recent published ame | | ropriate" is not in the |
| SuggestedRemedy | | | | Suggeste | dRemedy | , | | | |
| Change to "Insert? | the following references in alphanumeric | al order:" | | | | ert the fo | bllowing new definition into | the definitions list | , in alphanumerical |
| Proposed Response | Response Status O | | | order | - | | | | |
| | | | | Proposed | Respons | е | Response Status O | | |
| C/ 1 SC 1.3 | P 15 L | .7 | # 38 | | | | | | |
| Booth, Brad | Applied Micro (AMC | C) | | C/ 1 | SC 1. | .4 | P 15 | L 21 | # 28 |
| Comment Type E | Comment Status X | | | Thaler, Pa | atricia | | Broadcom (| Corporation | |
| | iming and Synchronization for Time-Sen | | | Comment | | ER | Comment Status X | | |
| Local Area Networ be used. | rks, draft 7.5, published 2010.10.16 is ve | ry explicit in v | which draft should | This i | is not a de | finition - | just an acronym expansio | n | |
| | | | | Suggeste | | | | | |
| SuggestedRemedy | | | | Maka | onsister | ht with th | e other Interface description | | |
| Recommend striki | ng draft number and nublished date. Ch | anges to 802 | 1AS should not | | | | | | |
| Recommend strikit impact .3bf. | ng draft number and published date. Ch | anges to 802 | .1AS should not | acron | nym goes i | in paran | thesis after the full name. T d_ for". | | |
| impact .3bf. | ng draft number and published date. Ch Response Status 0 | anges to 802 | .1AS should not | acron | nym goes i ace betwe | in paran en _ an | thesis after the full name. T | | |
| impact .3bf. | | anges to 802 | .1AS should not | acror interfa | nym goes i ace betwe | in paran en _ an | thesis after the full name. T d_ for". | | |
| impact .3bf. Proposed Response | Response Status O | anges to 802 | .1AS should not | acror interfa | nym goes i ace betwe | in paran een _ ano e | thesis after the full name. T d_ for". | | |
| impact .3bf. Proposed Response Cl 1 SC 1.3 | Response Status O | .7 | | acror interfa Proposed | nym goes i ace betwe I Respons SC 1 | in paran een _ ano e | thesis after the full name. T d_ for". <i>Response Status</i> O | L 21 | nething líke "The |
| impact .3bf. Proposed Response Cl 1 SC 1.3 Frazier, Howard M | Response Status O P 15 L Broadcom Corporation | .7 | | acror interfa Proposed Cl 1 | nym goes i ace betwe I Respons SC 1. Peter | in paran een _ ano e | thesis after the full name. T d_ for". Response Status 0 P 15 | L 21 | nething líke "The |
| impact .3bf. Proposed Response Cl 1 SC 1.3 Frazier, Howard M Comment Type TR I don't think that 80 | Response Status O P 15 L Broadcom Corporation | . 7 on ble reference | # 34 | acror interfa Proposed Cl 1 Anslow, F Comment "Inter | nym goes i ace betwe I Respons SC 1. Peter t Type face, as s | in paran een _ and e .4 E pecified | thesis after the full name. T d_ for". <i>Response Status</i> 0 <i>P</i> 15 Ciena Corp | L 21 Doration | nething líke "The # 8 |
| impact .3bf. Proposed Response Cl 1 SC 1.3 Frazier, Howard M Comment Type TR I don't think that 80 hand when implerr saying that 802.3b | P 15 L Broadcom Corporation Comment Status X 22.1AS rises to the level of an indispension thenting this standard. I am all for includin of is intended to provide support for it (esp | . 7 on ble reference g a mention o becially since | # 34 | acror interfa Proposed Cl 1 Anslow, F Comment "Inter | nym goes i ace betwe I Respons SC 1. Peter t Type face, as s ences to th | in paran ee and e .4 E pecified ne amen | thesis after the full name. T d_ for". Response Status O P 15 Ciena Corp Comment Status X in IEEE P802.3bf, Clause | L 21 Doration | nething líke "The # 8 |
| impact .3bf. Proposed Response Cl 1 SC 1.3 Frazier, Howard M Comment Type TR I don't think that 80 hand when implem saying that 802.3b title of the standard | P 15 L Broadcom Corporation Comment Status X 02.1AS rises to the level of an indispensi nenting this standard. I am all for includin | . 7 on ble reference g a mention o becially since | # 34 | acron interfa Proposed Cl 1 Anslow, F Comment "Inter refere Suggeste | nym goes i ace betwe d Respons SC 1. Peter t Type face, as s ences to th edRemedy | in paran en _ an e .4 E pecified ne amen | thesis after the full name. T d_ for". Response Status O P 15 Ciena Corp Comment Status X in IEEE P802.3bf, Clause | <i>L</i> 21 <i>L</i> 21 oration 90" is not the form 2.3ba) | nething líke "The # 8 |
| impact .3bf. Proposed Response Cl 1 SC 1.3 Frazier, Howard M Comment Type TR I don't think that 80 hand when implem saying that 802.3b title of the standard SuggestedRemedy | P 15 L Broadcom Corporation Description Comment Status X D2.1AS rises to the level of an indispension Description Denting this standard. I am all for including fis intended to provide support for it (espide) Description Distribution However, I think it should be moved to be move | . 7 on ble reference g a mention o becially since | # 34 | acron interfa Proposed Cl 1 Anslow, F Comment "Inter refere Suggeste | nym goes i ace betwe d Respons SC 1 Peter t Type face, as s ences to the edRemedy age to "Inte | in paran een _ and e .4 E pecified ne amen erface. (\$ | thesis after the full name. T d_ for". Response Status O P 15 Ciena Corp Comment Status X in IEEE P802.3bf, Clause dment (see 802.3av or 802 | <i>L</i> 21 <i>L</i> 21 oration 90" is not the form 2.3ba) | nething líke "The # 8 |
| impact .3bf. Proposed Response Cl 1 SC 1.3 Frazier, Howard M Comment Type TR I don't think that 80 hand when implem saying that 802.3b title of the standard | P 15 L Broadcom Corporation Description Comment Status X D2.1AS rises to the level of an indispension Description Denting this standard. I am all for including fis intended to provide support for it (espide) Description Distribution However, I think it should be moved to be move | . 7 on ble reference g a mention o becially since | # 34 | acror interfa Proposed Cl 1 Anslow, F Comment "Inter refere Suggeste Chan | nym goes i ace betwe d Respons SC 1 Peter t Type face, as s ences to the edRemedy age to "Inte | in paran een _ and e .4 E pecified ne amen erface. (\$ | thesis after the full name. T d_ for". Response Status O P 15 Ciena Corp Comment Status X in IEEE P802.3bf, Clause dment (see 802.3av or 802 See IEEE Std 802.3, Clause | <i>L</i> 21 oration 90" is not the form 2.3ba) | nething líke "The # 8 |

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ 1 SC 1.4 Page 2 of 7 17/12/2010 06:15:33

IEEE P802.3bf D3.0 comments

| C/1 SC 1.5 | P 15 | L 25 | # 9 | C/ 30 SC 30.12. | I.3 <i>P</i> 19 | L 38 | # 17 |
|--|---|----------------|----------------------------|---|--|---|---|
| nslow, Peter | Ciena Corpora | tion | | Hajduczenia, Marek | ZTE Corpora | tion | |
| Comment Type E | Comment Status X | | | Comment Type T | Comment Status X | | |
| | nsert a new abbreviation to the lis EEE staff in recent published am n. | | | values stored in the | lowing instantiated MDIO regis following instantiated MDIO reg made to page 20, line 14; pag | jisters" | 0 |
| SuggestedRemedy | | | | SuggestedRemedy | | | |
| Change to "Insert the order:" | e following new abbreviations into | the abbreviati | ions list, in alphabetical | per comment | | | |
| Proposed Response | Response Status 0 | | | Proposed Response | Response Status O | | |
| C/ 30 SC 30.12 | P 19 | L3 | # 12 | C/ 30 SC 30.12.4 | | L 45 | # 24 |
| Anslow, Peter | Ciena Corpora | - | | Garner, Geoffrey Comment Type TR | Samsung Comment Status X | | |
| case amend the edit | od reason to insert this new text h ing instruction to say insert befor .13 inserted after 30.12.3.1.13 ac <i>Response Status</i> 0 | e 30.12 added | by IEEE Std 802.3bc) | that the transmit path xMII to its presentati However, 30.12.1.3 values, for the PMA/ explanation of what does not talk about of bottom of the MDI ar respective sublayer, | the bottom of the MDI and the t in delay is measured from the in on by the PHY to the MDI. then goes on to talk about multi PMD, WIS, PCS, PHY XS, DTE the individual values for each or delay values for these sublayers and top of the xMII. It appears the but no explicit description of the but no explicit description of the | put of the beginn iple maximum tra E XS, and TC. Bu f these sublayers s but only about to at each value is to is is given. It wou | ing of the SFD at the nsmit path delay it, there is no clear represents, as 90.7 otal delay between th he delay for the Id be useful to clarify |
| C/ 30 SC 30.12.1 Thompson, Geoffrey | I.1 P 19 Independent | L 22 | # 41 | use these values co | higher-layer TimeSync client (rectly. e sublayers are present for eve | - | |
| Comment Type G Grammar: "then the value store | Comment Status X | gical OR opera | ation over the values" | present, it is not clea present. It would be intended. | IT whether the respective value useful to clarify which of these applies to the aTimeSyncDelar | is zero, is undefin possiblities (or sc | ned, or is simply not ome other possibility) |
| SuggestedRemedy CHANGE TO: | | | | | max (30.12.1.5), and aTimeSyr | | |
| "then the value store | d in this attribute is equal to the l | ogical OR ope | ration over the values" | SuggestedRemedy | | | |
| (The same problem) Proposed Response | exists in 30.12.1.2, line 34) <i>Response Status</i> O | | | TC in 30.12.1.3, 30.1 minimum transmit ar | ndividual values for the PMA/PI I2.1.4, 30.12.1.5, and 30.12.1.6 nd receive delays for each subla dividual values represent). Clar | are respective n ayer (or, if this is | naximum and not correct, clearly |

present for a particular interface, whether the respective value for that sublayer is 0, is undefined, or is not present (or if something else is intended).

Proposed Response Response Status 0

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general

| TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general | CL 20 | |
|---|--------------|---------------------|
| COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn | C/ 30 | Page 3 of 7 |
| SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line | SC 30.12.1.3 | 17/12/2010 06:15:33 |

IEEE P802.3bf D3.0 comments

| C/ 30 SC 30.12.1.3 P 19 | L 47 | # 29 | CI 30 | SC 30.2.3 | | P 17 | L 12 | # 10 |
|--|---|--|--|---|--|--|--|----------------------------|
| Thaler, Patricia Broadcon | n Corporation | | Anslow, Peter | r | | Ciena Corpora | ation | |
| Comment Type TR Comment Status X | | | Comment Typ | pe E | Comment | Status X | | |
| "accounts for" is ambiguous. Does that mean th of the values,? This comment also applies to | | | Editing in IEEE Std | struction "Re 802.3av and | place Figure 30 IEEE Std 802. | 0-3 with that pre 3at):" would be | esented below (a clearer if re-arra | as last modified by anged. |
| SuggestedRemedy | | | SuggestedRe | emedy | | | | |
| Replace "accounts for" with an unambiguous state there is an explanation elsewhere, reference the | | llues are combined. If | | o "Replace F with that belo | | ast modified by | y IEEE Std 802.3 | Bav and IEEE Std |
| Proposed Response Response Status O | | | Proposed Re | sponse | Response S | Status O | | |
| C/ 30 SC 30.12.1.4 P 20 | L 13 | # 31 | C/ 30 | SC 30.2.5 | | P 17 | L 21 | # 11 |
| Frazier, Howard M Broadcon | n Corporation | | Anslow, Peter | r | | Ciena Corpora | ation | |
| Comment Type TR Comment Status X | | | Comment Typ | pe E | Comment | Status X | | |
| The phrase "the value stored in this attribute ac | | | The thick | border on th | e right hand sid | le of Table 30-6 | 6 is missing | |
| delay values, composed of the following" does implementer. Any delay associated with the TS_ accounted for as well, and this must be subtract | _SFD_Detect_TX func | tion must be | SuggestedRe Fix the bo | • | | | | |
| | • | | | | | | | |
| aTimeSyncDelayTXmin attribute. | | | Proposed Re | sponse | Response S | Status O | | |
| | | | Proposed Re | sponse | Response S | Status O | | |
| SuggestedRemedy Add to the end of BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS: " | | | | | Response S | | | " |
| SuggestedRemedy | d from the sum of the | | C/ 45 | SC 45.2.1 | Response S | P 23 | L 4 | # 3 |
| SuggestedRemedy Add to the end of BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS: " TS_SFD_Detect_TX function shall be subtracte path data delay values reported via the MMD re | d from the sum of the | | <i>Cl</i> 45 Marris, Arthur | SC 45.2.1 | | P 23 Cadence Des | - | # 3 |
| SuggestedRemedy Add to the end of BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS: " TS_SFD_Detect_TX function shall be subtracte path data delay values reported via the MMD re | d from the sum of the | | CI 45 Marris, Arthur Comment Typ | SC 45.2.1 | Comment | P 23 Cadence Des Status X | - | |
| SuggestedRemedy Add to the end of BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS: " TS_SFD_Detect_TX function shall be subtracte path data delay values reported via the MMD re Proposed Response Response Status O | d from the sum of the | | CI 45 Marris, Arthur Comment Typ | SC 45.2.1 | Comment | P 23 Cadence Des Status X | ign Syst | |
| SuggestedRemedy Add to the end of BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS: " TS_SFD_Detect_TX function shall be subtracte path data delay values reported via the MMD re Proposed Response Response Status Cl 30 SC 30.12.1.5 | d from the sum of the gisters." | minimum transmit | Cl 45 Marris, Arthur Comment Typ "Change" SuggestedRe | SC 45.2.1 be ER 'should be us | Comment s | P 23 Cadence Des Status X | ign Syst | |
| SuggestedRemedy Add to the end of BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS: " TS_SFD_Detect_TX function shall be subtracte path data delay values reported via the MMD re Proposed Response Response Status Cl 30 SC 30.12.1.5 | d from the sum of the gisters." | minimum transmit | Cl 45 Marris, Arthur Comment Typ "Change" SuggestedRe | SC 45.2.1 De ER ' should be use semedy 'modify" to "cl | Comment s | P 23 Cadence Des Status X 'Modify" in the e | ign Syst | |
| SuggestedRemedy Add to the end of BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS: " TS_SFD_Detect_TX function shall be subtracte path data delay values reported via the MMD re Proposed Response Response Status C/ 30 SC 30.12.1.5 P 20 Frazier, Howard M Broadcon | d from the sum of the gisters." <i>L</i> 33 n Corporation counts for maximum re s not provide enough i _SFD_Detect_RX func | # 32 ecceive path data information to the ction must be | CI 45 Marris, Arthur Comment Tyµ "Change" SuggestedRe Change " | SC 45.2.1 De ER ' should be use semedy 'modify" to "cl | Comment S sed instead of " nange" for all re | P 23 Cadence Des Status X 'Modify" in the e | ign Syst | |
| SuggestedRemedy Add to the end of BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS: " TS_SFD_Detect_TX function shall be subtracte path data delay values reported via the MMD re Proposed Response Response Status C/ 30 SC 30.12.1.5 Prazier, Howard M Broadcom Comment Type TR Comment Status The phrase "the value stored in this attribute accidelay values, composed of the following" does implementer. Any delay associated with the TS_accounted for as well, and this must be added to the following the model of the follo | d from the sum of the gisters." <i>L</i> 33 n Corporation counts for maximum re s not provide enough i _SFD_Detect_RX func | # <u>32</u> ecceive path data information to the ction must be | CI 45 Marris, Arthur Comment Tyµ "Change" SuggestedRe Change " | SC 45.2.1 De ER ' should be use semedy 'modify" to "cl | Comment S sed instead of " nange" for all re | P 23 Cadence Des Status X 'Modify" in the e | ign Syst | |
| SuggestedRemedy Add to the end of BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS: " TS_SFD_Detect_TX function shall be subtracted path data delay values reported via the MMD reproposed Response Proposed Response Response Status C/ 30 SC 30.12.1.5 Prazier, Howard M Broadcom Comment Type TR Comment Status X The phrase "the value stored in this attribute active delay values, composed of the following" does implementer. Any delay associated with the TS_accounted for as well, and this must be added to a TimeSyncDelayRXmax attribute. | d from the sum of the gisters." <i>L</i> 33 n Corporation counts for maximum re s not provide enough i _SFD_Detect_RX func o the value reported in The value of the delay | # 32 eceive path data information to the ction must be in the v associated with the | CI 45 Marris, Arthur Comment Tyµ "Change" SuggestedRe Change " | SC 45.2.1 De ER ' should be use semedy 'modify" to "cl | Comment S sed instead of " nange" for all re | P 23 Cadence Des Status X 'Modify" in the e | ign Syst | |

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

C/ **45** SC **45.2.1** Page 4 of 7 17/12/2010 06:15:33

IEEE P802.3bf D3.0 comments

| C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.100 Anslow, Peter | P 23 Ciena Corpor | L 22 | # 13 | C/ 45 SC 45.2.2.2 Anslow, Peter | 20 P 24 Ciena Co | L 50 | # 15 |
|--|---|---|--|---|---|-----------------------------|----------------------|
| | · | allon | | | | nporation | |
| | nment Status X | dod in IEEE Std 9 | 002 2ha 15 2 1." | Comment Type E | Comment Status X | H 902 2 2009 45 2 | 2." in unnoccontribu |
| Editing instruction ends "after which is difficult to understand | | | 502.30a, 45.2.1. | complicated. | e last subclause in IEEE St | lu 802.3-2008, 45.2. | .2. Is unnecessarily |
| SuggestedRemedy | | | | SuggestedRemedy | | | |
| Change to "after the last subc equivalent change to the editing | | | .3ba:". Make the | | ely after 45.2.2.19:" Make 5.10 to 12, 45.2.6.14 to 16 | | o instructions for |
| Proposed Response Resp | oonse Status O | | | Proposed Response | Response Status O | | |
| C/ 45 SC 45.2.1.100 | P 23 | L 22 | # 14 | C/ 90 SC 90.1 | P 35 | L 6 | # 25 |
| Anslow, Peter | Ciena Corpor | ation | | Barnette, James | Vitesse S | Semiconducto | |
| The headings for 45.2.1.100 tl | | missing a space | between the | Synchronisation is mi | sspelled | | |
| Correct the Autonumber forma | hrough 45.2.5.12 and at of the H4,1.1.1.1 sty | 45.2.6.14 through | | SuggestedRemedy Change to Synchroniz Proposed Response | zation Response Status O | | |
| through 45.2.4.12, 45.2.5.10 through 45.2.4.12, 45.2.5.10 the SuggestedRemedy Correct the Autonumber formation of | hrough 45.2.5.12 and | 45.2.6.14 through | | Change to Synchroniz | | L 32 | # 26 |
| through 45.2.4.12, 45.2.5.10 the SuggestedRemedy Correct the Autonumber formate Proposed Response Resp | hrough 45.2.5.12 and at of the H4,1.1.1.1 sty ponse Status O | 45.2.6.14 through | n 45.2.6.16 | Change to Synchroni: Proposed Response | Response Status O | L 32 Semiconducto | # [26 |
| through 45.2.4.12, 45.2.5.10 the SuggestedRemedy Correct the Autonumber formate Proposed Response Response CI 45 SC 45.2.1.100 | hrough 45.2.5.12 and at of the H4,1.1.1.1 sty ponse Status O | 45.2.6.14 through /le in clause 45 <i>L</i> 28 | | Change to Synchroni: Proposed Response | Response Status O | | # 26 |
| through 45.2.4.12, 45.2.5.10 th SuggestedRemedy Correct the Autonumber forma Proposed Response Resp Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.100 Thaler, Patricia | hrough 45.2.5.12 and at of the H4,1.1.1.1 sty bonse Status O P 23 Broadcom Cc | 45.2.6.14 through /le in clause 45 <i>L</i> 28 | n 45.2.6.16 | Change to Synchroni: Proposed Response Cl 90 SC 90.4 Barnette, James Comment Type E | Response Status 0 P 35 Vitesse S | Semiconducto | # <mark>26</mark> |
| through 45.2.4.12, 45.2.5.10 th SuggestedRemedy Correct the Autonumber forma Proposed Response Resp CI 45 SC 45.2.1.100 Thaler, Patricia Comment Type T Cor | hrough 45.2.5.12 and at of the H4,1.1.1.1 sty bonse Status O P 23 Broadcom Co mment Status X | 45.2.6.14 through /le in clause 45 <i>L</i> 28 prporation | # <u>30</u> | Change to Synchroni: Proposed Response Cl 90 SC 90.4 Barnette, James Comment Type E | Response Status O P 35 Vitesse S Comment Status X | Semiconducto | # 26 |
| through 45.2.4.12, 45.2.5.10 th SuggestedRemedy Correct the Autonumber format Proposed Response Resp Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.100 Thaler, Patricia Comment Type T Corr This comment applies to the T separate capabilities bits for th | hrough 45.2.5.12 and at of the H4,1.1.1.1 sty bonse Status O P23 Broadcom Co mment Status X FimeSync capability re he send and receive? | 45.2.6.14 through /le in clause 45 <i>L</i> 28 prporation gisters for all MM It seems that the | # 30 | Change to Synchroni: Proposed Response Cl 90 SC 90.4 Barnette, James Comment Type E "service interface" sho | Response Status O P 35 Vitesse S Comment Status X ould be capitalized as part | Semiconducto | # 26 |
| through 45.2.4.12, 45.2.5.10 th SuggestedRemedy Correct the Autonumber format Proposed Response Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.100 Thaler, Patricia Comment Type T Correct This comment applies to the T | hrough 45.2.5.12 and at of the H4,1.1.1.1 sty bonse Status O P23 Broadcom Co mment Status X TimeSync capability re he send and receive? directions and that im | 45.2.6.14 through /le in clause 45 <i>L</i> 28 prporation gisters for all MM It seems that the plementations are | # 30 | Change to Synchroniz Proposed Response Cl 90 SC 90.4 Barnette, James Comment Type E "service interface" shu SuggestedRemedy | Response Status O P 35 Vitesse S Comment Status X ould be capitalized as part | Semiconducto | # 26 |
| through 45.2.4.12, 45.2.5.10 th SuggestedRemedy Correct the Autonumber forma Proposed Response Resp Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.100 Thaler, Patricia Comment Type T Corr This comment applies to the T separate capabilities bits for th useful if it is provided for both the registers for one direction | hrough 45.2.5.12 and at of the H4,1.1.1.1 sty bonse Status O P23 Broadcom Co mment Status X TimeSync capability re he send and receive? directions and that im | 45.2.6.14 through /le in clause 45 <i>L</i> 28 prporation gisters for all MM It seems that the plementations are | # 30 | Change to Synchroni: Proposed Response Cl 90 SC 90.4 Barnette, James Comment Type E "service interface" sho SuggestedRemedy Capitalize "Service In | Response Status O P 35 Vitesse S Comment Status X ould be capitalized as part terface" | Semiconducto | # 26 |
| through 45.2.4.12, 45.2.5.10 th SuggestedRemedy Correct the Autonumber format Proposed Response Resy Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.100 Thaler, Patricia Comment Type T Cor This comment applies to the T separate capabilities bits for th useful if it is provided for both | hrough 45.2.5.12 and at of the H4,1.1.1.1 sty ponse Status O P 23 Broadcom Co mment Status X TimeSync capability re he send and receive? directions and that im without supporting the bility bit or respond to the | 45.2.6.14 through vle in clause 45 <i>L</i> 28 prporation rgisters for all MM It seems that the plementations are a other. | # 30 IDs. Why are their information is only e unlikely to support | Change to Synchroni: Proposed Response Cl 90 SC 90.4 Barnette, James Comment Type E "service interface" sho SuggestedRemedy Capitalize "Service In | Response Status O P 35 Vitesse S Comment Status X ould be capitalized as part terface" | Semiconducto | # 26 |

C/ 90 SC 90.4

IEEE P802.3bf D3.0 comments

| C/ 90 SC 90.4.1.2 | | L 51 | # 18 | | 90.4.3.1.1 | P 37 | L 30 | # 20 |
|---|--|--|--|--|--|---|-------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| Hajduczenia, Marek | ZTE Corpora | lion | | Hajduczenia, Mare | | ZTE Corpora | ation | |
| the TSSI" change to ' to the egress and ing | Comment Status X at can use the indication of egre "The TimeSync Client can use gress of packets provided by the lo not transmit time of such ever | the indication of TSSI" to make | event corresponding | | ing statement for ge 37, line 54 | ment Status X | vise, no primitive | is generated". Simila |
| SuggestedRemedy | | | | per comment | | | | |
| per comment | | | | Proposed Respon | se Resp | onse Status O | | |
| Proposed Response | Response Status O | | | | | | | |
| | | | | C/ 90 SC 9 Hajduczenia, Mare | 90.5.1 •k | P 38 ZTE Corpora | L 28 | # 21 |
| C/ 90 SC 90.4.1.2 | | L 1 | # 19 | • | | ment Status X | | |
| Hajduczenia, Marek Comment Type T | ZTE Corpora Comment Status X | tion | | • • | - | e moved to the end | of the sentence it | t is located in. That |
| indication in the conte use the indication of t | hould be modified to further cla ext of TSSI. Suggest to rewrite the event corresponding to the | the text to "The egress and ingre- | TimeSync Client can ress of packets at the | sentence SuggestedRemed | Ý | | | ned at the end of the |
| indication in the conte use the indication of t xMII provided by the transmit data delay a egress and ingress of | ext of TSSI. Suggest to rewrite the event corresponding to the TSSI, combined with the inform and TimeSync PHY receive data of packets at the MDI." ences to 30.12.1 definitions, wh | the text to "The egress and ingre- nation provided b a delay (see 30.1 | TimeSync Client can ress of packets at the by the TimeSync PHY 12.1), to determine the | sentence SuggestedRemed per comment Proposed Respon | se Resp | onse Status O | | |
| indication in the conte use the indication of t xMII provided by the transmit data delay as egress and ingress of Suggest to use refere definitions are option | ext of TSSI. Suggest to rewrite the event corresponding to the TSSI, combined with the inform and TimeSync PHY receive data of packets at the MDI." ences to 30.12.1 definitions, wh | the text to "The egress and ingre- nation provided b a delay (see 30.1 | TimeSync Client can ress of packets at the by the TimeSync PHY 12.1), to determine the | sentence SuggestedRemed per comment Proposed Respon Cl 90 SC 9 | se Resp 90.5.2 | onse Status O | L 37 | # <u>22</u> |
| indication in the conte use the indication of t xMII provided by the transmit data delay as egress and ingress of Suggest to use refere definitions are option | ext of TSSI. Suggest to rewrite the event corresponding to the TSSI, combined with the inform and TimeSync PHY receive data of packets at the MDI." ences to 30.12.1 definitions, wh | the text to "The egress and ingre- nation provided b a delay (see 30.1 | TimeSync Client can ress of packets at the by the TimeSync PHY 12.1), to determine the | sentence SuggestedRemed per comment Proposed Respon Cl 90 SC 9 Hajduczenia, Mare | se Resp 90.5.2 sk | onse Status O P 38 ZTE Corpora | L 37 | |
| indication in the conte use the indication of t xMII provided by the transmit data delay an egress and ingress of Suggest to use refere definitions are optional SuggestedRemedy per comment | ext of TSSI. Suggest to rewrite the event corresponding to the TSSI, combined with the inform and TimeSync PHY receive data of packets at the MDI." ences to 30.12.1 definitions, wh | the text to "The egress and ingre- nation provided b a delay (see 30.1 | TimeSync Client can ress of packets at the by the TimeSync PHY 12.1), to determine the | sentence SuggestedRemed per comment Proposed Respon Cl 90 SC 9 Hajduczenia, Mare Comment Type " (SFD=DETE sounds better | se Resp 20.5.2 sk T Com CTED)" should b | onse Status O P 38 ZTE Corpora Iment Status X e moved to the end | L 37 ation of the sentence it | # 22 |
| indication in the conte use the indication of t xMII provided by the transmit data delay an egress and ingress of Suggest to use refere definitions are options SuggestedRemedy per comment Proposed Response | ext of TSSI. Suggest to rewrite the event corresponding to the TSSI, combined with the inform and TimeSync PHY receive data of packets at the MDI." ences to 30.12.1 definitions, wh al. Response Status O | the text to "The egress and ingra- nation provided b a delay (see 30.1 nich are mandato | TimeSync Client can ress of packets at the by the TimeSync PHY 12.1), to determine the | sentence SuggestedRemed per comment Proposed Respon Cl 90 SC 9 Hajduczenia, Mare Comment Type " (SFD=DETE sounds better sentence | se Resp 90.5.2 ek T Corr CTED)" should b and more logical | onse Status O P 38 ZTE Corpora Iment Status X e moved to the end | L 37 ation of the sentence it | # 22t is located in. That |
| indication in the conte use the indication of t xMII provided by the transmit data delay a egress and ingress of Suggest to use refere definitions are option SuggestedRemedy per comment Proposed Response C/ 90 SC 90.4.1.2 Anslow, Peter | ext of TSSI. Suggest to rewrite the event corresponding to the TSSI, combined with the inform nd TimeSync PHY receive data of packets at the MDI." ences to 30.12.1 definitions, wh al. Response Status 0 | the text to "The egress and ingra- nation provided b a delay (see 30.1 nich are mandato | TimeSync Client can ress of packets at the by the TimeSync PHY 12.1), to determine the ory while the CLause 45 | sentence SuggestedRemed per comment Proposed Respon Cl 90 SC 9 Hajduczenia, Mare Comment Type " (SFD=DETE sounds better | se Resp 90.5.2 ek T Corr CTED)" should b and more logical | onse Status O P 38 ZTE Corpora Iment Status X e moved to the end | L 37 ation of the sentence it | # 22t is located in. That |
| indication in the conte use the indication of t xMII provided by the transmit data delay a egress and ingress of Suggest to use refere definitions are option SuggestedRemedy per comment Proposed Response C/ 90 SC 90.4.1.2 Anslow, Peter Comment Type T This says "determine | ext of TSSI. Suggest to rewrite the event corresponding to the TSSI, combined with the inform and TimeSync PHY receive data of packets at the MDI." ences to 30.12.1 definitions, what al. | the text to "The egress and ingra- nation provided b a delay (see 30.1 nich are mandato <i>L</i> 3 ation kets at the MDI." | TimeSync Client can ress of packets at the by the TimeSync PHY 12.1), to determine the ory while the CLause 45 # 16 | sentence SuggestedRemed per comment Proposed Respon CI 90 SC 9 Hajduczenia, Mare Comment Type " (SFD=DETE sounds better sentence SuggestedRemed | se Resp 20.5.2 ek T Corr CTED)" should b and more logical | onse Status O P 38 ZTE Corpora Iment Status X e moved to the end | L 37 ation of the sentence it | # 22t is located in. That |
| indication in the conte use the indication of t xMII provided by the transmit data delay an egress and ingress of Suggest to use refere definitions are option SuggestedRemedy per comment Proposed Response Cl 90 SC 90.4.1.2 Anslow, Peter Comment Type T This says "determine determine the egress the egress and ingres SuggestedRemedy | ext of TSSI. Suggest to rewrite the event corresponding to the TSSI, combined with the inform and TimeSync PHY receive data of packets at the MDI." ences to 30.12.1 definitions, what al. | the text to "The egress and ingra- nation provided b a delay (see 30.1 nich are mandato <i>L</i> 3 ation kets at the MDI." | TimeSync Client can ress of packets at the by the TimeSync PHY 12.1), to determine the ory while the CLause 45 # 16 ". Isn't the point to ays just to determine | sentence SuggestedRemed per comment Proposed Respon CI 90 SC 9 Hajduczenia, Mare Comment Type " (SFD=DETE sounds better sentence SuggestedRemed per comment | se Resp 20.5.2 ek T Corr CTED)" should b and more logical | <i>P</i> 38 <i>Z</i> TE Corpora <i>ment Status</i> X e moved to the end , since the detection | L 37 ation of the sentence it | # 22t is located in. That |

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl 90 SC 90.5.2 Page 6 of 7 17/12/2010 06:15:33

IEEE P802.3bf D3.0 comments

| C/ 90 SC 90.6 Barnette, James | P 39 Vitesse Semi | L 30 iconducto | # 27 | C/ 99 SC 99 Anslow, Peter | Р 1 Ciena Corpo | L 35 ration | # 4 |
|--|---|--------------------------|------|--|---|-------------------------|--------------------|
| Comment Type E "Management Feature | Comment Status X es" should not be capitalized | | | <i>Comment Type</i> E Says "for Working Gr | Comment Status X | | |
| SuggestedRemedy Remove capitalization | changing to "management fe | eatures" | | SuggestedRemedy Change to "for Spons | or ballot recirculation" (for D 3 | 3.1) | |
| roposed Response | Response Status O | | | Proposed Response | Response Status O | | |
| 6/ 90 SC 90.7 razier, Howard M | P 41 Broadcom Co | L 30 prporation | # 35 | C/ 99 SC 99 Anslow, Peter | P 4 Ciena Corpo | L 45 ration | # 5 |
| implied precision to the uggestedRemedy | Comment Status X ues are reported in units of ns e measurement, and this sho tence to the end of 90.7: "The ion of one ns." Response Status O | uld be stated. | | Comment Type E IEEE Std 802.3az ha SuggestedRemedy Change 201x to 2010 Proposed Response | Comment Status X s now been published Response Status 0 | | |
| | , - | L 34 | # 36 | C/ 99 SC 99 Booth, Brad | P 4 Applied Micro | L 45 o (AMCC) | # 37 |
| | P 1 Applied Micro | o (AMCC) | | Comment Type E | Comment Status X | | |
| ooth, Brad omment Type E D3.0 is not in Working uggestedRemedy Delete following sente | Applied Micro <i>Comment Status</i> X Group review. | | | 802.3az can be upda SuggestedRemedy | | d 802.3az(TM)-20 | 10. |
| ooth, Brad omment Type E D3.0 is not in Working uggestedRemedy Delete following sente Draft D3.0 is prepared | Applied Micro <i>Comment Status</i> X Group review. | et Support for the | | 802.3az can be upda SuggestedRemedy Update IEEE Std 802 Proposed Response | ted to be 2010. 2.3az(TM)-201X to be IEEE Sta <i>Response Status</i> O | | |
| ooth, Brad comment Type E D3.0 is not in Working uggestedRemedy Delete following sente Draft D3.0 is prepared Synchronization Proto | Applied Micro Comment Status X Group review. Ince from paragraph: I by the IEEE 802.3bf Etherne | et Support for the | | 802.3az can be upda SuggestedRemedy Update IEEE Std 802 | ted to be 2010. 2.3az(TM)-201X to be IEEE St | L 45 | 10. # <u>40</u> |
| both, Brad <i>comment Type</i> E D3.0 is not in Working <i>uggestedRemedy</i> Delete following sente Draft D3.0 is prepared Synchronization Proto | Applied Micro Comment Status X Group review. Ince from paragraph: I by the IEEE 802.3bf Etherne icol Task Force for Working G | et Support for the | | 802.3az can be upda SuggestedRemedy Update IEEE Std 802 Proposed Response C/ 99 SC 99 Booth, Brad Comment Type E | ted to be 2010. 2.3az(TM)-201X to be IEEE Sta <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 4 | L 45 | |
| booth, Brad <i>Comment Type</i> E D3.0 is not in Working <i>SuggestedRemedy</i> Delete following sente Draft D3.0 is prepared | Applied Micro Comment Status X Group review. Ince from paragraph: I by the IEEE 802.3bf Etherne icol Task Force for Working G | et Support for the | | 802.3az can be upda SuggestedRemedy Update IEEE Std 802 Proposed Response C/ 99 SC 99 Booth, Brad Comment Type E | ted to be 2010. 2.3az(TM)-201X to be IEEE Sta <i>Response Status</i> O <i>P</i> 4 Applied Micro <i>Comment Status</i> X | L 45 | |

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Page 7 of 7 17/12/2010 06:15:33

C/ 99

SC 99