

IEEE 802.3bk Extended EPON TF 1st Sponsor recirculation ballot comments

Cl 00 SC 0 P 0 L 0 # r01-4
Turner, Michelle

Comment Type ER Comment Status D

This draft meets all editorial requirements.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl 30 SC 30.5.1.1.17 P 24 L 44 # r01-3
Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D

The text has been modified to say "The counters does not increment for other PHY types."
This should be "The counters do not increment for other PHY types."
The same issue in 30.5.1.1.18

SuggestedRemedy

Change "does" to "do" here and in 30.5.1.1.18

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The comment will be supplied to the publications Editor for consideration during preparation for publication.

Cl 60 SC 60.4a.1 P 38 L 22 # r01-2
Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D

Footnote c has been applied to the descriptions "Side Mode Suppression Ratio" and "RMS spectral width (max)", but it only affects these parameters for the 1000BASE-PX30-U column and not the 1000BASE-PX30-D column.

The value 30 for the SMSR is straddled across both columns, but this is the only value common to both columns that is straddled.

Note: Footnote c is shown as applied to "RMS spectral width (max)" in the clean version, but not in the CMP version. Also, the value "see Table 60-8b" is straddled across both columns in the CMP version, but not the clean version. This comment is written assuming the clean version is correct.

SuggestedRemedy

Un-straddle the 30 value for SMSR and add a separate 30 for the second column.

Apply the "c" footnote to the value 30 and "see Table 60-8b" in the 1000BASE-PX30-U column rather than the description text.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The clean version of the document is used as the base for implementation of this comment. Comment i-04 from ballot on D3.0 was not implemented entirely correctly.

The comment will be supplied to the publications Editor for consideration during preparation for publication.

Cl 60 SC 60.4a.1 P 38 L 23 # r01-1
Anslow, Peter Ciena Corporation

Comment Type E Comment Status D

In Table 60-8a RMS spectral width (max) is given as "N/A" for 1000BASE-PX30-D. However, the title of Table 60-8b is "1000BASE-PX30-D and 1000BASE-PX30-U transmitter spectral limits" which implies these RMS spectral width limits do apply.

Note: the title of Table 60-8b is different in the clean and CMP files. The above is from the clean version.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the title of Table 60-8b to "1000BASE-PX30-U transmitter spectral limits"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Restore the correct format of the Table 60-8b caption, as shown in CMP version.

The comment will be supplied to the publications Editor for consideration during preparation for publication.