Comment ID 4318
Cl 01 SC 1.1 P 28 L 10 # 4318
Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status X 802.1AS Fmt
Wrong format for IEEE 802.1AS

Proposed Response
Response Status O

Comment ID 4319
Cl 01 SC 1.1 P 28 L 4 # 4319
Hajduczenia, Marek

Comment Type E Comment Status X
Wrong subclause

Proposed Response
Response Status O

Comment ID 4320
Cl 01 SC 1.4.331 P 29 L 16 # 4320
Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type TR Comment Status X
There are issues with the new definition of P2MP

Proposed Response
Response Status O

Comment ID 4321
Cl 01 SC 1.4.331 P 29 L 19 # 4321
Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status X
Extra “and” in “Clause 64 and Clause 65”

SuggestedRemedy
mark this “and” as strikethrough and replace with underlined “,”

Proposed Response
Response Status O

Comment ID 4322
Cl 30 SC 30.3.5.1.3 P 32 L 10 # 4322
Hajduczenia, Marek

Comment Type TR Comment Status X OLT/CLT
Changes to 30.3.5.1.3 make no sense - Clause 103 does not define OLT and ONU

SuggestedRemedy
Enumeration for aMPCPMode should be extended to include CLT and CNU
Then behavior description “An interface that can provide the Multipoint MAC Control sublayer functions specified in Clause 64 and Clause 77 operates as an OLT when this attribute has the enumeration “OLT”. When this attribute has the enumeration “ONU”, the interface acts as an ONU.” should be augmented to read as follows:

An interface that can provide the Multipoint MAC Control sublayer functions specified in Clause 64 and Clause 77 operates as an OLT when this attribute has the enumeration “OLT”. An interface that can provide the Multipoint MAC Control sublayer functions specified in Clause 103 operates as an CLT when this attribute has the enumeration “CLT”. When this attribute has the enumeration “CNU”, the interface acts as an CNU.

Proposed Response
Response Status O

Comment ID 4323
Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.149 P 42 L 1 # 4323
Hajduczenia, Marek

Comment Type E Comment Status X
“NW = Multi-word” does not exist in Table 45–98s

SuggestedRemedy
Change "NW = Multi-word" to "MW = Multi-word"

Proposed Response
Response Status O

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Draft 2.2 IEEE 802.3bn EPON Protocol over Coax (EPoC) TF 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Received

Proposed Response

12/8/2015 11:52:13 AM
Cl/100 SC 100.3.4.2 P 90 L 33 # 4324
Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type E Comment Status X
Incorrect format of NOTE

SuggestedRemedy
It should be "NOTE—" and not "NOTE:"

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl/100 SC 100.3.6.2 P 110 L 20 # 4325
Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type TR Comment Status X
Per "3.2.7 MAC Client Data field", "Ethernet implementations shall support at least one of three maximum MAC Client Data field sizes defined as follows", but it does not guarantee that envelope frame is supported. Is it implied that EPoC requires the support of envelope frames?

SuggestedRemedy
Add statement on what types of frames are required by EPoC, or alternatively list all possible frame sizes supports by 3.2.7
Similar change on line 34 would be required
Similar changes in 100.3.7.2 as well

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl/101 SC 101.3.3.1 P 166 L 16 # 4327
Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type ER Comment Status X
Different font styles in SEND_OUT BLOCK state in Figure 101–17
Also, figure 101-17 is visually different from 101-16 for some reason (boxes are thicker, font is larger, etc.) - please fix style in Figure 101-17

SuggestedRemedy
Per comment
Similar issue with multiple other SDs in the draft - some have thick lines (seems like these are drawn in Framemaker) and some have thick lines (I suspect these are drawn in Visio and imported into Frame)

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl/103 SC 103.2.2.3 P 312 L 11 # 4328
Hajduczenia, Marek Bright House Networks

Comment Type T Comment Status X
Is there any reason for tqSizeC to be marked as Integer?

SuggestedRemedy
Change to "unsigned integer" - it is always positive

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl/FM SC FM P 1 L 30 # 4329
Anslow, Pete Ciena

Comment Type E Comment Status X
"IEEE P802.3bn Working Group review." should be "IEEE P802.3bn Working Group ballot recirculation."

SuggestedRemedy
Change "IEEE P802.3bn Working Group review." to "IEEE P802.3bn Working Group ballot recirculation."

Proposed Response Response Status O
In "IEEE Std 802.1ASTM-2011", the "TM" is for Trademark, so should be a superscripted TM symbol.

**Suggested Remedy**

In "IEEE Std 802.1ASTM-2011", make the "TM" a superscripted TM symbol as per page 13, line 13.

**Comment Type** E

**Comment Status** X

**Proposed Response**

Response Status O

"as modified by P802.3by as follows:" should be "as modified by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows:"

**Suggested Remedy**

change "as modified by P802.3by as follows:" to "as modified by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows:"

**Comment Type** E

**Comment Status** X

**Proposed Response**

Response Status O

In "(See IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 64 and Clause 65, Clause 77, Clause 101, and Clause 103)", there are two instances of "and" and "Clause 103" should be underlined.

**Suggested Remedy**

Show "Clause 64 and Clause 65" as being changed to "Clause 64, Clause 65"

Underline "Clause 103"

**Comment Type** E

**Comment Status** X

**Proposed Response**

Response Status O

In the editing instruction, "Behaviour Defined As" should be "BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS" to match the text below.

**Suggested Remedy**

Make the same change in the editing instruction for 30.3.5.1.3

**Comment Type** E

**Comment Status** X

**Proposed Response**

Response Status O

Clauses 103 has devices operating as a CLT not as an OLT. Similarly, Clauses 103 has devices operating as a CNU not as an ONU.

**Suggested Remedy**

Show "... operates as an OLT when..." changing to "... operates as an OLT or a CLT when...

Also, show "... the interface acts as an ONU," changing to "... the interface acts as an ONU or a CNU."

**Comment Type** T

**Comment Status** X

**Proposed Response**

Response Status O
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment ID</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>L</th>
<th>Comment Status</th>
<th>Response Status</th>
<th>Proposed Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4336</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>Anslow, Pete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4337</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>Anslow, Pete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4338</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>Anslow, Pete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4340</td>
<td>100A</td>
<td>354</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>Anslow, Pete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4341</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>ER</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>Mark, Laubach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4342</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>ER</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>Mark, Laubach</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comment Type: E = editorial, ER = editorial required
Response Status: O = open, W = written, C = closed, U = unsatisfied, Z = withdrawn

Comment Status: D = dispatched, A = accepted, R = rejected

As the P802.3by amendment is very likely to complete before P802.3bn, that amendment will have to show bit 1.4.10 as Reserved.

A comment has been submitted against P802.3by D3.0 to make this change.

Change the editing instruction to: “Change the reserved row for 1.4.10 in Table 45–6 as inserted by IEEE Std 802.3by-201x as follows (unchanged rows not shown):”

Show the Name entry as changing from "Reserved"
Show the Description entry as changing from "Value always 0"

Delete the "

The editing instruction needs to include more information.

Make it so.

As per comment.
Cl 100 SC 100.3.4.2 P 91 L 19 # 4343
Mark, Laubach Broacom
Comment Type ER Comment Status X
In Table 100-3, lower case "Format"
Suggested Remedy
As per comment.
Proposed Response
Response Status O

Cl 100 SC 100.3.5.2 P 99 L 15 # 4344
Mark, Laubach Broacom
Comment Type ER Comment Status X
In Equation 100-10, put a mult symbol between "10" and \(\log_{10}\). Do the same for Equation 100-11, Line 48.
Suggested Remedy
As per comment
Proposed Response
Response Status O

Cl 100 SC 100.3.7.2 P 113 L 10 # 4345
Mark, Laubach Broacom
Comment Type ER Comment Status X
Make "2000-byte" no breaking.
Suggested Remedy
As per comment
Proposed Response
Response Status O

Cl 100 SC 100.4.4 P 118 L 23 # 4346
Mark, Laubach Broacom
Comment Type ER Comment Status X
Paragraph is of wrong type, change to T.text
Suggested Remedy
As per comment
Proposed Response
Response Status O
Comment ID 4350

Cl: 100  SC: 100.3.4.5.1  P: 92  L: 16
Mark, Laubach
Broacom

Comment Type: E  Comment Status: X

Look for occurrences of "X db" in paragraph text and change the space to a non-breaking space here and elsewhere as appropriate.

Suggested Remedy:
As per comment.

Proposed Response  Response Status: O

Comment ID 4351

Cl: 100  SC: 100.3.5.6  P: 99  L: 49
Mark, Laubach
Broacom

Comment Type: E  Comment Status: X

Remove period for this "See Table 100-2." entry for "Modulation format" row. Editor to check for consistency of "see <xref>" entries in tables.

Suggested Remedy:
As per comment.

Proposed Response  Response Status: O

Comment ID 4352

Cl: 100  SC: 100.3.7.3  P: 114  L: 35
Mark, Laubach
Broacom

Comment Type: T  Comment Status: X

Use of "10xlog10" in RxMER subclauses and Page 115, Line 17, Figure 100-4 change to "10xlog<sub>10</sub>".

Suggested Remedy:
In RxMER subclauses, change any occurrences as per comment.

Proposed Response  Response Status: O

Comment ID 4353

Cl: 100  SC: 100.3.5.4.3  P: 104  L: 2
Mark, Laubach
Broacom

Comment Type: T  Comment Status: X

Change "10xlog10" to "10xlog<sub>10</sub>".

Suggested Remedy:
As per comment.

Proposed Response  Response Status: O

Comment ID 4354

Cl: 100  SC: 100.3.7.1  P: 105  L: 35
Mark, Laubach
Broacom

Comment Type: T  Comment Status: X

In Table 100-14, Use of "10xlog(24)" change to "10xlog<sub>10</sub>(24)". I checked with the technical author of this material.

Suggested Remedy:
As per comment.

Proposed Response  Response Status: O

Comment ID 4355

Cl: 100  SC: 100.3.7.3  P: 106  L: 27
Mark, Laubach
Broacom

Comment Type: E  Comment Status: X

In equation 100-19, change "10xlog<sub>10</sub>" to "10xlog<sub>10</sub>"; i.e. add the explicit multiplication sign for consistency.

Suggested Remedy:
As per comment.

Proposed Response  Response Status: O
In Equation 100-9, add a multiplication symbol between "10" and "log".
Page 99, Line 15, same for 100-10, line 48, same for Equestion 100-11.

Suggested Remedy
As per comment.

Comment Status: X
Response Status: O
Comment ID 4362

Proposed Response

Cl 101 SC 101.3.2.5.7 P 154 L 37 # 4362
Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type ER Comment Status X

In other places, function pseudo code begin with the word "function" and the font size is a little smaller. Make all function code blocks look consistent.

Suggested Remedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Comment ID 4363

Proposed Response

Cl 101 SC 101.4.3.2 P 173 L 45 # 4363
Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Change **"** characters to multiplication symbols. Change "log" to "log<sub>10</sub>" in both occurrences.

Suggested Remedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Comment ID 4364

Proposed Response

Cl 101 SC 101.4.3.4.5 P 176 L 28 # 4364
Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Make "DS_ModTypeSC(1)" non breaking

Suggested Remedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Comment ID 4365

Proposed Response

Cl 101 SC 101.4.3.8.3 P 185 L 8 # 4365
Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type E Comment Status X

The super script A(k) trespasses to line above it. See if can fix line spacing or similar to prevent the overlap.

Suggested Remedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Comment ID 4366

Proposed Response

Cl 101 SC 101.4.3.10 P 193 L 53 # 4366
Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Consider doing a "keep with next 2", to keep it with next two lines on same page.

Suggested Remedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Comment ID 4367

Proposed Response

Cl 101 SC 101.4.3.12 P 198 L 13 # 4367
Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type E Comment Status X

The "t" of "output" is running into the vertical dashed line. Consider providing a little bit of space to avoid overrun.

Suggested Remedy
As per comment.

Proposed Response Response Status O
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment ID</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Proposed Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4368</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>In Table 101-12 resize &quot;Item&quot; column a little larger to prevent the &quot;cy&quot; hyphenation.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>As per comment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4369</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>sentence missing ending period, add it.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>As per comment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4370</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>&quot;show&quot; should be &quot;shown&quot;. Consider changing &quot;below.&quot; to &quot;below.&quot;</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>As per comment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4371</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>Paragraph indention looks odd after the first line. Fix if needed.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>As per comment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4372</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>Do a keep with next for the heading and the following table.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>As per comment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4373</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>Sentence missing terminating period, add it.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>As per comment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4374</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>&quot;Clause 45&quot; needs to be an xref.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>As per comment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4375</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>Dashed lines should be set to &quot;send to back&quot; or what is need to avoid the visual overlap.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>As per comment.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Comment Type: E  Comment Status: X

Missing ending period on lines 7, 12, 18, 22, 28. (Note there is a period ending line 37, 41, 45, and 51.)

Suggested Remedy:
As per comment.

Proposed Response: 0

Comment Type: E  Comment Status: X

"LEN( PhyTxFifo ) = 0" needs a little separate from the horizontal line above.

Suggested Remedy:
As per comment.

Proposed Response: 0
Proposed Response

Comment ID: 4382

Mark, Laubach
Broacom

Comment Type: E
Comment Status: X

Please a return between "CNU_ID" and "Allocation" to avoid hyphenation.

Suggested Remedy: As per comment.

Comment ID: 4383

Mark, Laubach
Broacom

Comment Type: E
Comment Status: X

Needs period at end of sentence.

Suggested Remedy: As per comment.

Comment ID: 4384

Mark, Laubach
Broacom

Comment Type: E
Comment Status: X

Font is size 9 on lines 4 through 7, reset to size 10. Line 25 and 30, put a period at end of sentence.

Suggested Remedy: As per comment.

Comment ID: 4385

Mark, Laubach
Broacom

Comment Type: E
Comment Status: X

Change from parenthetical to type note.

Suggested Remedy: As per comment.

Comment ID: 4386

Mark, Laubach
Broacom

Comment Type: E
Comment Status: X

Superscripts are running into text of line above. Increase line spacing slightly on this or something else to prevent the overlap.

Suggested Remedy: As per comment.

Comment ID: 4387

Mark, Laubach
Broacom

Comment Type: ER
Comment Status: X

4 Lines 34 through 38 are font size 9, set to font size 10.

Suggested Remedy: As per comment.

Comment ID: 4388

Mark, Laubach
Broacom

Comment Type: ER
Comment Status: X

Remove period from end of sentence for consistency.

Suggested Remedy: As per comment.
Comment ID 4389

Proposed Response

Cl 30 SC 30.3.2.1.2
Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type E
Comment Status X

Convert to non-breaking spaces in "10 Gb/s" and "1.6 Gb/s". Do same on line 27.

Suggested Remedy
As per comment.

Response Status O

Comment ID 4390

Proposed Response

Cl 56 SC 56.1
Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type E
Comment Status X

Add non-breaking spaces to numbers and units for "10 Gb/s" and "1 Gb/s" (four places)

Suggested Remedy
As per comment

Response Status O

Comment ID 4391

Proposed Response

Cl 56 SC 56.1.2.2
Mark, Laubach Broacom

Comment Type E
Comment Status X

Convert to non-breaking space in "100 Mb/s"

Suggested Remedy
As per comment

Response Status O